

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Listening to the Land: Native American Literary Responses to the Landscape. By Lee Schweningen.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4f7462t5>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Nelson, Robert M.

Publication Date

2010-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

lifetime (and, following the same logic, today) held and practiced identical religious, cultural, and societal beliefs as observed and recorded by Densmore and Kohl. The vast and populous Ojibwe Nation extends across at least five northern states and into Canada; those practices as well as societal and spiritual views and teachings can vary from community to community, and even from family and to family.

To this Ojibwe reader and reviewer, the outstanding feature of this book is the struggle and endurance of the north-shore Ojibwe against the backdrop of federal Indian policy, Indian-white relations, and regional history of the time. The collective story of Beargrease's life, as well as that of the community, reservation, and tribal entity, is told in a series of linked vignettes that, although in written form, bring to this reviewer's mind the shapes and patterns of the oral tradition that is the gift and legacy of our grandparents. We hear (read) in Lancaster's unobtrusive and considerate (written) voice those parts of the story that many non-Indian readers may not: the wrenching stress of the times; choices and compromises; maintenance of the language, culture, and worldview; and sheer courage and dignity of a people surviving while reeling from tremendous loss.

Linda LeGarde Grover

University of Minnesota–Duluth

Listening to the Land: Native American Literary Responses to the Landscape.

By Lee Schweninger. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2008. 256 pages. \$59.95 cloth; \$24.95 paper.

Lee Schweninger's *Listening to the Land* is a welcome addition to the growing body of criticism taking as its premise that, in Native American worldviews generally, place matters, and that in the story of Native survival and survivance there is, as Linda Hogan puts it, "always the land."

Chapter 1 is devoted to defending the proposition that "mainstream America continues to stereotype American Indians as symbols of environmentalism" and ecological rectitude (19). His argument is reasonable enough: New Age romanticism holds up the Indian as the model of ecological wisdom and ethical relationship to the land and, in so doing, requires all Indians to exist for no other purpose than to serve as role models for non-Indians, a sort of spiritual colonialism no less genocidal than the other varieties of colonialism practiced by these romantics' forefathers. To his credit, Schweninger candidly acknowledges that his argument is in its way every bit as reductive as the one he opposes because he too deploys the categorical (and hence essentializing) terms *Indian*, *Native American*, and *American Indian* interchangeably in order to imply a distinctive quality not shared by non-Natives—his argument proceeds from a stereotype of non-Natives as sorely in need of the "American Indian Wisdom" they seek in such works as T. C. McLuhan's *Touch the Earth: Self-Portrait of an Indian Existence* (1988), Joseph Bruchac's *Native Wisdom* (1994), and Running Press's *Native American Wisdom* (1994). But on the strengths of

the extended argument that follows and the subsequent rewarding analyses of the work of several important Native writers, I am willing to forgive the occasional exaggeration and hyperbole that characterize some of his arguments in this chapter and others.

Chapter 2 reviews the controversy raised by Shepard Krech III's *The Ecological Indian: Myth and History* (1999). Schweninger begins by highlighting the irony that the non-Native Krech (representative of a category he labels "iconoclasts") works to dismantle the stereotype of the environmentalist Indian while Winona LaDuke (and other Native writers in a category he labels "romantics") works to reinforce it. Having given Krech's argument its due, he then draws attention to the insidious rhetorical gambit Krech deploys in his chapter on the near-extinction of the North American bison, in which Krech characterizes precontact, and by extension postcontact, Indian hunting practices as ecologically wasteful and irresponsible. As Schweninger points out, a more egregious instance of the pot calling the kettle black has probably never existed; here too he lays the groundwork for an ethical quarrel regarding hunting in general that resurfaces in several of the subsequent chapters.

Following these two overview chapters, Schweninger devotes nine chapters to compiling and interrogating what one of eight well-known Native writers has claimed or implied about American Indians'—and/or more narrowly his or her own—relationship to the land. In the first of these, he contrasts Luther Standing Bear's relatively assimilated stance in *My People the Sioux* (1975) with his decidedly more nationalistic or separatist one in *Land of the Spotted Eagle* (1978) in order to argue that the Lakota land ethic espoused in *Land of the Spotted Eagle* predates contact with the European Mother Earth mythos. In the chapter on John Joseph Mathews's autobiographical *Talking to the Moon* (2000), he generates a distinction between Mathews the author and Mathews the narrative persona in order to account for the persona's apparent inability to live in ethical balance with the land. He then takes on Louise Erdrich's birthing memoir, *The Blue Jay's Dance* (1996), to argue that the antidote to the author's "inexplicable depression" turns out to be her Ojibwe-derived interaction with the natural world around her, an interaction that allows her to recognize the natural value of self-sacrifice and both personal and cultural survival (108). His chapter on Louis Owens focuses on Owens's first novel, *Wolfson* (1995), and its protagonist, Tom, who must jettison his derived Western attitudes in order to fulfill his role as a carrier of Snohomish identity with the land. He then surveys N. Scott Momaday's prose work (touching on the novels and *The Way to Rainy Mountain* [1976] but paying particular attention to the essays), querying the implications of Momaday's constantly coupled insistence on the need for a land ethic and "the close relation between language and place" (147). The chapter on Vine Deloria Jr. reviews Deloria's career-long critique of Western parochialism and its tendency to categorize and stereotype into triviality all things Indian, including Native American attitudes toward the land. Next he takes on Gerald Vizenor, navigating through the sea of false leads and contradictory voices in order to tease out a recurring theme of environmentalism in Vizenor's prose

work and show how Vizenor works to subvert stereotypes of Native American reverence toward the land while insisting, as do Momaday and Deloria, that some such regard is necessary to human survival. He also begins in this chapter to foreground the issue of hunting, a concern that permeates the next two chapters, which are devoted to Hogan's writing. In the first of these, he wrestles with a seeming contradiction between Hogan's own regard for the sacredness of all life and the killing of the Florida puma in *Power* (1999), while in the second he uses Brenda Peterson and Hogan's *Sightings: The Gray Whales' Mysterious Journey* (2003) as a pretext for reviewing the controversy surrounding the hunt conducted by Makah people in 1999 that resulted in the killing of a gray whale.

But as a whole this book is much more coherent than I've probably made it sound. As implied in the subtitle to his introduction, "An Ethical Regard for the Land," Schweninger submits the works he treats to an ethical reading, homing in wherever the writers raise ethical issues regarding human relations to the land, particularly human treatment of the land and of the other life-forms that the land supports. Throughout, Schweninger's prose is consistently crisp and precise (though page 24 of the text seems to have evaded proofreading), and the reasoning that characterizes his arguments is relentlessly persuasive. The scholarship throughout is impeccable. As is often the case in such studies, the subject sometimes becomes less the land and more one or another of the life-forms occupying the land; this is especially the case in the final three chapters, in which a tendency toward preoccupation with the ethics of hunting threatens to displace rather than reinforce his thesis about human relationship to the land. A second thread that ties this book neatly together is the concern with stereotyping that is sounded and grounded in the first chapter—and not only the stereotype of Indian-as-environmentalist but also any other stereotypes that crop up in the works he examines. Especially valuable, I think, is the attention Schweninger pays to how such stereotypes may become internalized by those upon whom they are imposed, as, for example, in the Owens chapter, in which he points out how the Plains Indian stereotype comes to interfere with the northwestern Native protagonist's ethical and spiritual development.

Overall, this book is to be commended for its breadth of coverage and precision of argument; what makes it all the more impressive is the considerable tact and skill Schweninger displays throughout in unpacking and sorting out for examination the etically imposed land-ethic stereotypes that these representative writers oppose even as they unanimously insist on the primacy of the land.

Robert M. Nelson

University of Richmond