

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Confronting Race: Women and Indians on the Frontier, 1815-1915. By Glenda Riley.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4js9z6d5>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Krauthamer, Barbara

Publication Date

2006-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

It is important to note that those who are in search of an overarching historical account of the California Mission system's impact on California Indians might be disappointed with this book. Though the author does capture much of the historical circumstances surrounding missionization, he does not walk the reader through a chronological history of the construction of and life at the missions. Rather, what Hackel achieves is exactly what he set out to accomplish: a very telling, intellectual, cogent account—arguably the best yet—on the negotiated relationship between the Spanish missionaries and the Indians. The glossary, appendices, and index are also most helpful, though noticeably missing is an annotated bibliography, which would have served the scholar who reads this book. Overall this work is a landmark achievement in the field of California Indian history.

Thomas Maxwell-Long
University of La Verne

Confronting Race: Women and Indians on the Frontier, 1815–1915. By Glenda Riley. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2004. 326 pages. \$39.95 cloth; \$21.95 paper.

Twenty years ago, the publication of Glenda Riley's *Women and Indians on the Frontier*, in considering the ways in which gender and racial identity informed white people's interactions with Indians, marked the beginning of a new emphasis in historical studies of the American West. In *Confronting Race*, Riley offers a revised version that reflects new historical and theoretical approaches to gender analysis and women's history, but remains wholly accessible to nonspecialists. Indeed, teachers and students alike will welcome *Confronting Race* as a lively introduction to the history of white women's westward migration in the nineteenth century.

It should be noted, however, that this is not a work that concentrates on both sides of the interactions between white women and Indians in the West. Instead, it provides a survey of white women's perceptions of those interactions. Consequently, "Indians" appear almost exclusively as the undifferentiated objects of white women's fear and fascination.

Drawing mainly on diaries and journals written by white women settlers, army wives, and missionaries, Riley traces their journeys through the trans-Mississippi West, from Kansas to California. These sources offer a window on white women's ideas and perceptions about Indians and about themselves, and reveal both the changes and continuities in their attitudes as they moved westward.

The book begins with a chapter that discusses the prevailing early-nineteenth-century discourses on gender that shaped the roles and expectations of middle-class white women. Prescriptive literature from the writings of Catherine Beecher and Sarah Josepha Hale's *Godey's Lady's Book* to depictions of Annie Oakley defined white womanhood as delicate and competent, dependent and resourceful. Parallel to these "enigmatic visions of themselves" were the images

of Indian men and women—made popular in newspapers, captivity narratives, and dime-store novels—that depicted either dirty savages or noble peacemakers (47). A chapter on European attitudes to American expansion shows similarly negative representations of Indians, but there is also an emphasis on the weight of white women’s “civilizing” influence in colonial ventures. Here, Riley certainly provides a lively and wide-ranging survey of nineteenth-century writings on Indians that should capture the attention of newcomers to the field.

The remaining five chapters are devoted to illuminating the scope of white women’s interactions with and ideas about Indians in the American West. Westward-bound women “were well versed in frontier ideology, notably regarding American Indians” and thus set out on their journeys in fearful anticipation of what lay ahead (95). Uninformed about the Indian peoples they encountered and alarmist in their reactions, white women, Riley suggests, reiterated anti-Indian sentiments. At the same time, however, Riley points to instances in which white women’s assessments of Indians shifted as a result of female migrants reevaluating the conditions of their own lives on the frontier.

Having detailed the range of white women’s perceptions of the Indians they encountered in the West, Riley moves on to the question of gender, considering white women’s reactions in relation to those of white men. Although she contends that white women and men had decidedly different interactions with and ideas about Indians, Riley also acknowledges a greater complexity rather than a straightforward and perhaps overdetermined male/female dichotomy. Unfortunately, this work does not probe the complicating factors in depth. A discussion of women’s domestic labor, for example, notes that sometimes the exigencies of migration and life in the West required men to take up work such as cooking and laundry—women’s work—but does not move far beyond noting the aberration from the traditional gendered division of labor. How these shifts informed either male or female migrants’ ideas about themselves, each other, and Western life are questions that remain only partially answered. The literature in this field is continually growing; Susan Lee Johnson’s *Roaring Camp: The Social World of the California Gold Rush* (2000) stands out as a significant contribution with its use of gender theory and analysis. Nonetheless, it is safe to say that recent studies stand on the foundation established by the original publication of Riley’s work.

The most compelling analysis in this work is in the last chapter. Riley’s discussion of white Americans’ “colonialism,” their appropriation of Indians’ territories and political subordination of Indian peoples, clearly identifies the interconnections among race, gender, and power. In the mid-to-late nineteenth century, growing numbers of white women moved beyond the familiar images of savage Indians and adopted a “gracious, kindhearted, and benevolent” position precisely because the colonial venture confirmed their own social and political dominance (221). A brief discussion of migrants’ interactions with Mormons, furthermore, suggests the interrelated dynamics of gender, race, and racism as Riley notes that gentile women regarded Salt Lake City and its Mormon inhabitants as degenerates, not unlike their assessment of Indians. White female migrants honed in on Mormon gender relations, specifically

plural marriage, as the marker of their difference and inferiority. Gender and race/racism were mutually constitutive in white women's understandings of themselves and those they encountered in the West. Riley's careful attention to the issues of power at work in particular interactions and the larger project of America's westward expansion offers an important analytical framework for the material presented in the rest of the book.

Barbara Krauthamer
New York University

Converting California: Indians and Franciscans in the Missions. By James A. Sandos. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2004. 272 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

One can sympathize with historian James A. Sandos's honorable impulse to launch his ambitious overview of the California mission system, which consisted of twenty-one missions built and operated from 1769 to 1836, upon a level playing field. This subject may be described more aptly as a minefield that, lamentably, has intimidated most contemporary historians so much that it is still astonishingly underwritten. Yet Sandos gamely tries to steer a balanced course between what his colleague David Weber has termed "Christophilic Triumphalist" and "Christophobic Nihilist" perspectives. In the former view (still dominating travelogues on California public television), Franciscans are evoked as selfless guides to submissive, even grateful, pagans in romantic settings, helping them transit into the coming world of capitalist labor and enlightened "civilization." In the latter opinion, missions are evoked as concentration camps in Spain's genocidal campaign to exploit, fragment, and ultimately wipe out traditional California Indian societies.

Through ten chapters Sandos tries to avoid taking sides, remaining more concerned with analytically cracking the mission system open through such themes as comparative worldviews (his chapters on "Indians at Contact" and "Serra and Franciscan Evangelization" nicely parallel each other), passive resistance by Indians to forced acculturation, the importance of the Catholic catechism and confessional as conscious devices to undermine Indian culture, the targeted assault on the traditional status of Indian women, a fresh interpretation of the role of venereal disease (often transmitted, Sandos suggests, through the traditional practice of tattooing) in the missions' skyrocketing mortality rate, a fascinating discussion on the relative success of choir participation as a conversion strategy, and a review of the still little-known frequency of armed Indian rebellions—nearly a dozen from 1769 through 1829—that bedeviled missionization from San Diego to San Luis Obispo.

Guided by what he calls a "theohistorical" approach that benefits from training in ethnohistory and religious studies, Sandos strives to provide "a balanced picture of both sides of the frontier of Indian-Spanish contact" by juggling Spanish and Indian historical behaviors in the light of their respective cosmologies and religious values. Opening with the Spanish side to the story,