

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Cornplanter: Chief Warrior of the Allegany Senecas. By Thomas S. Abler.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4kx4f460>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Parmenter, Jon

Publication Date

2008

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

description of a complex comparison. And when Jung ends with a discussion of Black Hawk's supposed path to glory, the larger point remains unclear. In short, the concluding chapter's emphasis does not always mesh well with the points laid out in Jung's introduction.

Overall, this account of the Black Hawk War is well written and clearly reasoned. Jung delves into the intricacies of intratribal politics and the nuances of troop movements and in the process provides a comprehensive picture of the events that unfolded over the course of 1832. Yet the book does not necessarily rise to the challenge Jung offers in its opening pages. Although there is little about which to complain in terms of the details he provides and the argument he outlines, neither is there much to substantiate any claims of a new interpretation or perspective. Jung's book is a solid, if not groundbreaking, addition to the historiography of the Black Hawk War.

John P. Bowes

Eastern Kentucky University

Cornplanter: Chief Warrior of the Allegany Senecas. By Thomas S. Abler. Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Press, 2007. 200 pages. \$45.00 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

This thoroughly researched and engaging study of the life of Cornplanter by longtime student of Seneca culture and history Thomas S. Abler makes an important contribution to the growing body of new scholarship on late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Native American history. Abler updated and revised much existing literature on this Seneca leader, and his study provides valuable insight into the dramatic changes experienced by Iroquois people during Cornplanter's lifetime (circa 1753–1836). The author successfully balances detailed discussions of evidence (and pauses occasionally to correct questionable readings of sources by earlier scholars) and analysis of the broader context in which Cornplanter lived and acted.

Born to a Wolf Clan Seneca mother and a Dutch-American fur trader from Albany named John Abeel, Cornplanter (whose name may actually translate more accurately from the Seneca language as "where it is planted") grew up in a matrilineal family with a number of prominent senior male relatives (2). Abler's effort to locate the sources of Cornplanter's eventual leadership represents one of the book's most fascinating and provocative aspects. By 1775, Cornplanter emerged as "Chief Warrior" of the Senecas, then a recognized "position" that obligated its holder to "represent the views and feelings of the warriors in council" (2–3). Abler's analysis makes clear that this role, hitherto assumed to have been one that individual men achieved during their lifetimes (rather than a hereditary title), devolved on Cornplanter as a result of his ties to male Wolf Clan relatives. This finding raises important questions about the nature of Iroquois leadership during the pre-Revolutionary War era, as historians and anthropologists have long assumed that a new class of "self-made" leaders of achieved status gradually submerged the authority of the hereditary

Iroquois League titleholders over the course of the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, with an attendant decline in social power for the senior women of Iroquois clans who appointed (and occasionally removed) league leaders from positions of power. Abler's careful assessment of Cornplanter's personal history and the "intricacies" associated with his status suggests that these long-held assumptions about the nature of Iroquois leadership warrant substantial rethinking (124).

Abler takes pains to incorporate the views of contemporary Senecas on Cornplanter, which in the main characterize him negatively: an "appeaser" remembered primarily for his role in various land surrenders to the United States (11). Yet Abler, who argues from a copious body of evidence, suggests that Cornplanter realized sooner than many of his contemporaries the degree to which a "necessary reformulation" of fundamental Seneca "ideas and values" would be needed as his nation passed from independent status before 1783 to "reservation communities" after 1783 (12). This is a provocative thesis, and not all will agree; yet Abler deserves credit for sticking to his guns and offers detailed explanations for the difficult decisions Cornplanter made during his lifetime.

Throughout *Cornplanter* Abler demonstrates that American authorities in the post-Revolutionary War era regarded Cornplanter as the Seneca leader on whom "the principal weight of the Business" seemed to rest in the difficult and contentious negotiation of terms of peace and territorial boundaries between the United States and the Iroquois after 1783 (116). This is not surprising, given Cornplanter's status as Chief Warrior and his active opposition to the Americans during the Revolutionary War. Noteworthy, however, are the number of occasions Abler documents in which American offers of personal land grants or individual annuities elicited not only Cornplanter's signature but also that of many other Seneca leaders on treaty documents that either acknowledged American claims to Seneca homelands or alienated even more of the Seneca land base.

Abler paints a picture of the decline of Cornplanter's popularity and authority among the Senecas over time. Although many Senecas appreciated the "peace policy" he advocated in the immediate aftermath of the Revolutionary War, as more American settlers, surveyors, and speculators closed in on Seneca homelands by the turn of the nineteenth century, the "extensive nature of the concessions made by Cornplanter and his fellow chiefs" became readily apparent to increasing numbers of Senecas (197, 97). Cornplanter never lived on a treaty-based Seneca Reservation after 1783 and preferred to reside with his family and varying numbers of Senecas on a personal land grant on the Allegheny River in the state of Pennsylvania. Abler asserts that this represented Cornplanter's preference to avoid the prospect of having his land "sold out from beneath him by the actions of a council of chiefs" (195). Yet the author indicates that even on Cornplanter's own privately held land, the Seneca leader's personal economic ventures (especially a sawmill) prompted many of his co-residents to relocate after 1800 to the Allegheny Reservation (152-53). Removed from his "office" for a time thereafter, Cornplanter appears to have regained his status between

1807 and 1809 (154). Late in life (about 1819) a series of visions similar to those his half-brother Handsome Lake experienced two decades earlier moved Cornplanter to a more resistance-oriented stance toward the inroads of settler society, but by that time his social authority had passed to his nephew Governor Blacksnake. Cornplanter lived out the remainder of his days in relative isolation on his Pennsylvania land grant, while the majority of Senecas fought tenaciously to preserve their reservation lands from advocates of removal and allotment during the remainder of the nineteenth century.

Abler acknowledges that his perspective on Cornplanter will never satisfy those Senecas “who dwell on the vastness of land surrendered and the pittance received as compensation” (11). He prefers to cite the persistence of Seneca homelands into the twenty-first century (however truncated) as the legacy of the “hard-won diplomatic achievements of Cornplanter and his fellow Seneca leaders in the closing decades of the eighteenth century” and constructs a valid and largely convincing argument to this effect (197). In Abler’s view, the annual August gathering of Cornplanter “heirs and attached family members” for a picnic in the Jimersontown relocation area on the Allegany Reservation (flooding from the Kinzua Dam project eliminated a viable site for such a gathering on the original Cornplanter Grant in 1964) represents a triumph of persistence against overwhelming odds (11, 193).

Yet although we acknowledge such triumphs, we forget at our peril the “vastness of land surrendered and the pittance received as compensation.” Historians of North American settler colonialism might do well to recall that their subject of study is not wholly a matter of the past. Patterns of colonial thought and ideology persist in North America today, and historical studies have the power to play a vital role in their perpetration or in dismantling such perspectives. In Cornplanter’s case, we need not libel him as “the Marshal Pétain of his day” or gloss over the difficult times in which he lived in order to acknowledge that his “strong sense of private property,” evident in his decision to abandon residency on communally held Seneca homelands and in his willingness to accept personal payment for his role in the alienation of portions of those homelands, marked a significant departure from the practices of previous Seneca leaders and contributed to radical changes in the Senecas’ historical circumstances for all time (193, 195).

Jon Parmenter
Cornell University

History Is in the Land: Multivocal Tribal Traditions in Arizona’s San Pedro Valley. By T. J. Ferguson and Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2006. 336 pages. \$60.00 cloth; \$35.00 paper.

A book that attempts an intellectual- and practice-based rapprochement between Native American and archaeological approaches to the past in the American Southwest is long overdue. Such is the very lacuna filled by Ferguson and Colwell-Chanthaphonh’s innovative work. Recognizing that archaeologists