

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Phantom Past, Indigenous Presence: Native Ghosts in North American Culture and History. Edited by Colleen E. Boyd and Coll Thrush.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4q2070pz>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

O'Brien, Suzanne Crawford

**Publication Date**

2013-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**Phantom Past, Indigenous Presence: Native Ghosts in North American Culture and History.** Edited by Colleen E. Boyd and Coll Thrush. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2011. 360 pages. \$35.00 paper.

*Phantom Past, Indigenous Presence* takes up the question of the role of American Indian ghosts within colonial fantasy throughout the history of the United States and Canada. This worthwhile volume makes a valuable contribution to previous scholarship that has focused on the role of Indian ghosts in American literature. These scholars have interpreted such stories as examples of Foucauldian resistance or of Freudian ambivalence, expressing the conflicted sensibilities of colonial guilt, remorse, and satisfaction at the removal of Native people from the landscape, such as Renee Bergland's *The National Uncanny: Indian Ghost and American Subjects* (2000) and Kathleen Brogan's *Cultural Haunting: Ghosts and Ethnicity in Recent American Literature* (1998). These earlier studies focused on how ghost stories can be useful for helping us think through colonial rhetoric, the creation of colonial identities, and the ways in which Euro-Americans wrestled with the original sin of displacing Native people.

The authors in this study build on these previous works and take this conversation further, asking readers and scholars to consider the ways in which Native ghosts challenge our normative histories and our fixed categories of space and time. This book also sets itself apart by asking its contributors to contextualize such stories, locating them in their particular social, political, historical, geographical, and cultural contexts. Its interdisciplinary approach includes anthropology, history, Native studies, and literary studies, and helps the volume make connections between discrete ghost stories and the actual processes and techniques of removing Native people from their land. Perhaps most importantly, the text makes an important contribution by reintroducing Native agency to these stories, discussing how Native people themselves employ stories as challenges to colonial aggression. Native people are presented in this book as active participants, using ghost stories to resist colonialism and to declare their own endurance. The authors make the case that hauntings are political stories, tied to moments of social change, providing an anchor for the historical past in the present.

Beyond all this, the book is remarkable in its thoughtful approach to the fundamental question: "Do places have spirits?" (54). As many of the authors in this collection point out, contemporary indigenous communities in North America continue to maintain traditions of ghosts and ancestors. When present-day Native authors tell ghost stories, they are claiming "one of the most powerful North American narrative tropes and [using] it for their own ends, replacing settler guilt with Indigenous mourning, and imagined spectral

ancestries with actual genealogies embedded in the land" (xx). These stories remain vital pieces of living cultural and religious practices and part of the lived experience of many present-day indigenous people.

Part 1 of the book, "Methodologies," works to set literary ghost stories in their particular historical and geographical contexts. By focusing on material objects, physical spaces, and local histories, these essays challenge the notion that these are "just stories" but instead argue that they are evidence of political engagement and resistance on the part of Native people. The emphasis here is on how Native people represent *themselves*, rather than simply how they are portrayed in the colonial imagination. In her essay, Michelle Burnham takes on Sherman Alexie's novel *Indian Killer*, arguing that it is an example of "indigenous gothic," an "anti-liberal" story that challenges readers' expectations of the Indian ghost. Readers are refused an opportunity to appropriate "the Indian" as they mourn his passing. Instead, Alexie offers them menacing darkness, a state of unknowing, anger, and an indigenous response to a colonial history gone septic. By contrast, Geneva Gano's analysis of Robinson Jeffers' poem "Tamar" provides an example of Indian ghosts created by a non-Native author, ghosts who are expressions of vengeance against California settlers. Coll Thrush turns his historian's eye toward an analysis of urban Indian ghosts in Seattle. While various scholars have reflected on the sentient nature of natural landscapes, urban landscapes raise a different set of challenges. And yet, as Thrush makes clear, urban spaces are the locus of a great deal of indigenous history. Thrush argues that ghost stories are clues to local histories, working as a kind of historical evidence. Particular Seattle stories reveal key issues in the city's history: longings for a romantic pre-industrial past, questions of urban disorder and vice and of how sacred places should be used, and contemporary calls for Native sovereignty and federal recognition. He brings his narrative to the present, providing examples of how contemporary indigenous people have used the discovery of human remains or the telling of ghost stories to express their continuing claims to the urban landscape.

Part 2, "Historical Encounters," examines the role of ghost stories and burial sites within the histories of colonial encounters. Adam John Wasterman's essay reflects upon the remains and grave of Black Hawk (Sauk), whose body was stolen and sold to phrenologists before eventually being returned to his widow. Lisa Philips and Allan McDougall examine the "Baldoon Mystery," reading the story backward in time from the generic piece of Canadian folklore it has become, and reconnecting it to its specific context to show how actual histories of particular Native people can come to be displaced by more generalizable, and perhaps more palatable, "Indian ghosts." And Sara Kavanagh examines the history of the consecration of Indian Hill Cemetery in Middletown, Connecticut, after Native

remains have been exhumed and removed. All of the authors highlight the ways in which Native burial sites and human remains shape colonial identities.

Part 3, "The Past in the Present," calls attention to the presence of the ancestral dead in contemporary indigenous communities in North America, and the ways in which the celebration of ancestral spirits challenges Euro-American understandings of time, space, and knowledge. In her piece Colleen Boyd discusses how ghosts are part of everyday life for the Lower Elwha Klallam community, particularly in light of the discovery of Tse-whit-zen, the two-thousand-year-old Klallam village recently unearthed on the Port Angeles waterfront, together with three hundred burials. Boyd's essay challenges assumed dichotomies between fact and belief, rational and irrational, self and other, dichotomies that relegate others' ways of knowing to mere belief, while privileging scientific knowledge. Both Victoria Freeman's and Cynthia Landrum's essays reflect upon the portability of ghosts and the ways in which spirits can be transported across continents, and so collapse both time and space. Freeman's essay is based upon interviews with First Nations people in Toronto, and discusses how indigenous people, most of whom are from elsewhere, speak about ancestral spirits that dwell within the urban landscape. Here "ancestry" becomes expressed through and engages with ghost stories, pointing to a sense of history built on cyclical return that challenges the linear historical tale of the colonizer. Landrum's piece considers the artifacts from the site of the Wounded Knee massacre, currently housed in the Smithsonian. Here, objects become the means by which spiritual power moves from one place to another, challenging accepted boundaries of time, place, and culture. Jill Grady's essay joins in Boyd's reflections on scholarship and methodology, as she reflects on the challenges of bringing anthropological fieldwork into line with indigenous ways of knowing and encountering the dead, in this case digital mapping of traditional cultural properties. Grady insists we take indigenous stories on their own terms, not reducing them to Freudian or Foucauldian expressions of anxiety or resistance.

Grady's piece is a fine conclusion to the work because it brings us back to the big questions that are both explicit and implicit throughout this excellent book: Can places have spirits and agency that act upon the people that inhabit them? Might the non-living have agency? Is the past in the past, or does it continue on in the present? Do these stories challenge our sense of linear history? The authors here are not afraid to grapple with perhaps controversial questions, though they do not necessarily come to any clear conclusions. What *do* scholars do with ghosts? Should we take these beliefs seriously, and how? What are the risks, both professionally and personally? While previous scholars have tended to dismiss ghost stories, describing them as colonial metaphors or expressions of repressed anxiety and ambivalence, such conclusions are at odds

with what the editors of this volume describe as “the increasingly compelling consensus regarding the need for academic scholarship to take Indigenous epistemologies and ways of knowing and being seriously” (xxxii). People *have* transformative experiences, and encounters with the dead. And scholars who are committed to postcolonial scholarship that takes indigenous epistemology as valuable and authoritative need to take these experiences seriously. The editors do not advocate for the belief in ghosts, but they do insist “a new kind of humility is in order” (xxxiii).

*Suzanne Crawford O'Brien*  
Pacific Lutheran University

**Reimagining Indian Country: Native American Migration and Identity in Twentieth-Century Los Angeles.** By Nicolas G. Rosenthal. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press. 2012. 288 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

Nicolas G. Rosenthal theorizes that the concept of “Indian Country,” in place and use since the American colonial period, was reimagined in the twentieth century. His assertion is based upon the development, over the past century, of the vibrant, multitribal Native American community in Los Angeles—hence the subtitle of his book. However, Rosenthal quickly and additionally states that though his reference community is Los Angeles, the contemporary and expanded notion of Indian country now includes not only tribally held lands, but also all American cities with Native American populations that increased exponentially throughout the twentieth century. The author therefore presents historical community development processes of American Indian activities in Portland, Minneapolis, San Francisco, Chicago, and a dozen other US cities that have had visible and growing American Indian presences for a hundred years or more.

Rosenthal does modern American Indian history a major service by underscoring the fact that the movement of American Indians from tribal lands into urban centers actually did not begin in 1948, nor was the introduction of federally funded urban relocation programs in the 1950s the sole cause of that urban migration. Rather, and starting with world travel in various wild west shows, Native Americans had begun to leave their reservation homes in significant numbers to avail themselves of the economic opportunities urban centers offered by the end of the nineteenth century. Urban exposure increased in the early twentieth century because of the film industry and its manufacture and promotion of films about a mythic western frontier. Major movement to