

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Lanterns on the Prairie: The Blackfeet Photographs of Walter McClintock. Edited by Steven L. Grafe with contributions by William E. Farr, Sherry L. Smith, and Darrell Robes Kipp.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4vf7p3g0>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Watkins, Marie

**Publication Date**

2011

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

many Ojibwes embrace the Christian component of the hymn-singing practice, or if it is the fact that the hymns are sung in the Ojibwe language and thus are a vehicle for language recovery, that is more important. The decolonization of indigenous cultures often presents Native peoples with dilemmas of this sort, as the strategies of the past sometimes appear too accommodationist to meet the needs of today. McNally touches briefly on this latter issue but does not offer the more sustained discussion that would place the cultural work of present-day Ojibwe elders in the context of an often-contradictory modern reality.

The book also contains some unfortunate factual errors. In discussing the beginnings of the assimilationist boarding-school movement, McNally states that the movement's architect, Richard Henry Pratt, commenced his educational experiments in forcibly imposing Anglo-American culture onto Native youth with "Apache prisoners of war" incarcerated at the notorious Fort Marion prison in Florida (147). The prisoners were from several southern Plains tribes, including Southern Cheyennes, Kiowas, and Comanches—but no Apaches (see Frederick Hoxie, *A Final Promise*, 1986, 54–55). Similarly, he identifies the Afro-Ojibwe fur trader, George Bonga, as a runaway slave, a characterization that found its way into missionary publications toward the end of the Reconstruction era in spite of ample evidence of Bonga's parentage, freeborn status, and employment by the American Fur Company dating back to the 1830s (343n103; also see Kenneth W. Porter, "Negroes and the Fur Trade," *Minnesota History*, 1934).

Despite these caveats, this is an important book on a topic little analyzed in such depth before.

*Rebecca Kugel*

University of California, Riverside

**Lanterns on the Prairie: The Blackfeet Photographs of Walter McClintock.** Edited by Steven L. Grafe with contributions by William E. Farr, Sherry L. Smith, and Darrell Robes Kipp. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, published in cooperation with the National Cowboy and Western Heritage Museum, 2009. 336 pages. \$60.00 cloth; \$34.95 paper.

During the early twentieth century, Walter McClintock (1870–1949) became an internationally acclaimed authority on the Blackfeet and a popular personality on the scientific and the lay lecture circuits. Despite his prolific and historically significant output of nearly 2,500 photographs; fifty Graphophone wax-cylinder recordings of Blackfeet prayers, songs, and

speeches by eminent Blackfeet, including Running Carne, James White Calf, Jack Big Moon, Shorty White Grass, Mountain Chief, Cream Antelope, and Mad Wolf (who adopted McClintock in 1898); two popular books, *The Old North Trail* (1910) and *Old Indian Trails* (1923); and publications in *Harper's Monthly*, the *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie*, and the Southwest Museum's periodicals, McClintock and his work have received scant attention among scholars. When examining anthologies and compendia of photographers of Native Americans, McClintock is glaringly omitted from the company of his well-researched contemporaries such as Edward S. Curtis, Frederick Monsen, Carl Moon, Roland Reed, Richard Throssel, and Adam Clark Vroman. Falling into obscurity upon his death in the mid-twentieth century, except among a select number of academics and aficionados of turn-of-the-twentieth-century Blackfeet life and culture, McClintock returns to the spotlight that he keenly sought throughout his life in the sixth volume of the University of Oklahoma Press' Western Legacy series.

In this first book devoted to McClintock, the four distinguished authors of Native American history, culture, and art provide a compelling look at the photographer and impresario, his work, and the culture in which he lived in an amply illustrated set of five biographical and interpretative essays. Each author critically considers McClintock's motivations for recording the Blackfeet. A stunning collection of ninety reproduced photographs, juxtaposed with McClintock's commentary, follows the essays. These relatively unknown photographs, many published for the first time, inform the viewer about ceremonies, celebrations, family life, cultural practices, and numerous individuals between 1898 and 1912. The images also tell us what McClintock chose to have us see. As Steven L. Grafe clearly demonstrates, McClintock took the greater part of the photographs during summer visits between 1903 and 1912 during Sun Dance encampments—a time when many Blackfeet celebrated their heritage—often dressed in traditional rather than modern-day clothes. McClintock selected to present the romantic old ways to the public, not the onerous contemporaneous setting of a fragile economy rife with politics, as by this time many farming and ranching Blackfeet attempted to make meager ends meet through government rations.

During the late nineteenth century, McClintock joined the ranks of other affluent young Easterners who went west for a lark, for their health, to find themselves, or to escape from the daily grind, often of the family business. McClintock's path to become a photographer of the Blackfeet took a circuitous route paralleling fellow Yalie Frederic Remington's passage to famed painter of the Wild West a decade earlier. He, too, prefigured McClintock as a depicter of the Blackfeet in illustrations and paintings in 1887, when he traveled to Canada. No record that the two were acquaintances exists, but at least

McClintock knew of Remington's experiences from accounts and illustrations published in *Harper's*.

McClintock certainly made the most of his other Yale contacts, as William E. Farr concluded in his thorough investigation of McClintock's access to Blackfeet society. Former classmates and luminaries, including Gifford Pinchot, George Bird Grinnell, and Clark Wissler, appear throughout his life's endeavors. He ended his career as curator of the Walter McClintock Indian Collection in the Yale University Library, a position that may have been granted with self-serving motives. The Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library (at Yale University) is the recipient of the greater part of McClintock's negatives, lantern slides, color prints, correspondence, and manuscript material. The Yale associations bear further examination not only in McClintock's work but also in the depiction of the Blackfeet.

Farr maintains that McClintock wanted to be considered the first, if not the only, authority of Blackfeet culture and to put forward that privileged knowledge to the public. He zealously guarded his territory by omitting most references to other ethnographers and documenters' writings, which possibly extended to portrayals of the Blackfeet. Similarly, Remington was also known to take vitriolic umbrage with fellow artists who dared to paint "his" action-packed western narratives.

Nonetheless, the Blackfeet Reservation during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was teeming with artists, photographers, and ethnographers who readily knew one another. McClintock photographed the artist Joseph Henry Sharp painting two Blackfeet chiefs in 1905; as reproduced in this volume, it is a photograph that would not make it into his slide-illustrated lectures and publications. Sharp acknowledged McClintock in his letters, writing of pleasant interactions while at the reservation. Upon examining the works of McClintock and Sharp, one finds that they share similar compositions of nostalgic glowing tipis, an image that has practically become a trademark of the two men.

Close to 1905, Sharp became occupied with the manipulation of light sources. Often he would place lamplight in a tipi from his collection of Native American material culture in order to paint its romantic effects. A savvy businessman, Sharp knew that the landscapes of firelight tipis would sell. In his investigation of McClintock's photographic techniques, Grafe ascertains that McClintock developed an interest in color during 1905 and 1906, turning his negatives into colored lantern slides. An examination of mutual influence and a shared consciousness of the public's interest should prove meaningful. The collaboration of the slide colorists Charlotte Blazer (née Pinkerton) and Annette Karge is also an avenue for future research. Beyond the scope of this book, comparative studies of McClintock's Blackfeet photographs with

those by photographers, such as Curtis, Reed, and James Willard Schultz, and paintings by artists, including Sharp, Remington, Charles M. Russell, Julius Seyler, and E. W. Deming, would provide provocative analysis and discussion of the privileging of subjects and themes, the similarities and differences in intentions, illusions, and compositional styles that have characterized attitudes toward the Blackfeet.

Remington's career was peaking by the time McClintock first entered the Blackfeet Reservation in 1896. McClintock returned in 1898 to make field sound recordings with the long-term goal to create an opera based on Blackfeet mythology and music. Grafe deftly combines biographical detail with an overview of McClintock's photographic legacy, illustrating that this musical undertaking proved to be the key to his career as an ethnographic lecturer and photographer. This narrative unfolds like a 1930s Hollywood melodrama with the reader eagerly awaiting the next episode: McClintock wants to produce the opera *Poia* in Germany with composer and fellow Pittsburghian Arthur Nevin. After a slide-illustrated lecture-recital at the White House in April 1907, President Theodore Roosevelt gives McClintock his blessing. McClintock learns from his networking that Andrew Carnegie, a contact he urgently wants to make, is sailing to Europe on the White Star Line under an assumed name in May. McClintock purchases a ticket and the two chance to meet on board. Happening to have two cases of colored lantern slides and Indian objects with him, McClintock presents a lecture in Carnegie's staterooms; thereupon Carnegie sagely advises McClintock regarding how to meet his goals. More networking ensues. The American ambassador to Berlin, along with other diplomats and dignitaries, befriends McClintock in Germany. The photographer meets and lectures for Kaiser Wilhelm and his entourage and is well received by the German scientific community, giving more lectures on popular demand. Jealous rifts develop between Nevin and McClintock, who is not part of McClintock's social swirl. Finally, the opera is performed and disappoints the German critics. In the meantime, McClintock has made his reputation as an expert on the Blackfeet with lectures filled with his slides and performances of Indian songs. McClintock always kept himself center stage in writing, lecturing, or performing.

It was the romance of the vanishing American, a belief to which McClintock and most of his generation subscribed, that captivated both ethnologist and layperson. Sherry L. Smith adeptly places McClintock in the cultural context of an antimodernist of his era. By the time of the publication of his second book, *Old Indian Trails*, a rehash of his *The Old North Trail*, it would seem that McClintock, with his intermittent travels to the reservation, would have recognized that the Blackfeet were surviving; they were an active part of the modern world. Yet McClintock's account, as Smith points out, has become

even more nostalgic than his first publication in 1910. In 1929, Wissler invited McClintock to write about the contemporary conditions of the Blackfeet. Wissler, however, was dissatisfied with the results: McClintock's treatise was primarily anecdotes prior to 1920 accompanied by pre-1912 photographs. McClintock would continue to derive his ongoing publications from his earlier experiences among the Blackfeet. One is left conjecturing, did he prefer to rest on his past laurels as his ambition diminished? Or was he market-driven, recognizing the continuing value of the romantic and nostalgic Indian? Darrell Robes Kipp acknowledges that whatever McClintock's motives, his imagery has now come full circle. He maintains that McClintock and other portrayers of the Blackfeet were not chronicling for the tribe, but "ironically, their subjects are slowly becoming their primary audience" (102).

*Lanterns on the Prairie: The Blackfeet Photographs of Walter McClintock* introduces McClintock and his chronicling of the Blackfeet to a new generation. It is a long-awaited contribution to Native American studies, art history, and American cultural history.

Marie Watkins  
Furman University

**Native Americans at Mission San Jose.** By Randall Milliken. Banning, CA: Malki-Ballena Press, 2008. 112 pages. \$32.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

Through an examination of ecclesiastical records, unpublished Franciscan linguistic notebooks, travelers' diaries, and the strengths of early-twentieth-century ethnographic reports, Randal Milliken's *Native Americans at Mission San Jose* presents readers with a multitribal history of the individual and collective realities of encroachment and cultural change experienced by the descendants of the fifty-five local tribes and nine different language groups that made up the Mission San Jose Indian community. His chronologically arranged discussion illustrates the conditions of mission life and how Ohlone, Miwok, Yokut, and other San Francisco Bay Area and Central Valley Native Americans perceived their situations over time. This multitribal historical approach is central because it allows for the discussion of a shared history among the diverse group of Native Americans at Mission San Jose that is seldom made evident in the language group-based studies commonly found in anthropology. Milliken expands on the anthropological analytical norms of early-twentieth-century ethnographers and ethnologists by highlighting the documented—individual and collective—instances of cultural diffusion and cultural change that take place among the different American Indians