Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
Recent Work

Title
Translation of Ligand-Centered Hydrogen Evolution Reaction Activity and Mechanism of a Rhenium-Thiolate from Solution to Modified Electrodes: A Combined Experimental and Density Functional Theory Study

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4zm5v9m6

Journal
Inorganic Chemistry, 56(4)

ISSN
0020-1669

Authors
Zhang, Wuyu
Haddad, Andrew Z
Garabato, Brady D
et al.

Publication Date
2017-02-20

DOI
10.1021/acs.inorgchem.6b02829

Peer reviewed
Translation of Ligand-Centered Hydrogen Evolution Reaction Activity and Mechanism of a Rhenium-Thiolate from Solution to Modified Electrodes: A Combined Experimental and Density Functional Theory Study

Wuyu Zhang, Andrew Z. Haddad, Brady D. Garabato, Pawel M. Kozlowski, Robert M. Buchanan, and Craig A. Grapperhaus

ABSTRACT: The homogeneous, nonaqueous catalytic activity of the rhenium-thiolate complex ReL₃ (L = diphenylphosphinobenzenethiolate) for the hydrogen evolution reaction (HER) has been transferred from nonaqueous homogeneous to aqueous heterogeneous conditions by immobilization on a glassy carbon electrode surface. A series of modified electrodes based on ReL₃ and its oxidized precursor [ReL₃][PF₆] were fabricated by drop-cast methods, yielding catalytically active species with HER overpotentials for a current density of 10 mA/cm², ranging from 357 to 919 mV. The overpotential correlates with film resistance as measured by electrochemical impedance spectroscopy and film morphology as determined by scanning and transmission electron microscopy. The lowest overpotential was for films based on the ionic [ReL₃][PF₆] precursor with the inclusion of carbon black. Stability measurements indicate a 2 to 3 h conditioning period in which the overpotential increases, after which no change in activity is observed within 24 h or upon reimmersion in fresh aqueous, acidic solution. Electronic spectroscopy results are consistent with ReL₃ as the active species on the electrode surface; however, the presence of an undetected quantity of catalytically active degradation species cannot be excluded. The HER mechanism was evaluated by Tafel slope analysis, which is consistent with a novel Volmer–Heyrovsky–Tafel-like mechanism that parallels the proposed homogeneous HER pathway. Proposed mechanisms involving traditional metal-hydride processes vs ligand-centered reactivity were examined by density functional theory, including identification and characterization of relevant transition states. The ligand-centered path is energetically favored with protonation of cis-sulfur sites culminating in homolytic S–H bond cleavage with H₂ evolution via H atom coupling.

INTRODUCTION

Use of hydrogen as an energy carrier offers a potential carbon-free alternative to fossil fuels. Estimates suggest a hydrogen-based economy would require as much as 150 million tons of H₂ annually, fueling the need for efficient electrolytic and/or photochemical catalysts. Development of heterogeneous and homogeneous catalysts for the hydrogen evolution reaction (HER), 2H⁺ + 2e⁻ → H₂, and the hydrogen oxidation reaction (HOR), its reverse, has received significant attention. The initial catalyst is Pt; however, its application in large-scale hydrogen production is limited by the cost and scarcity. This has prompted the development of new earth-abundant electrocatalysts, including transition-metal phosphides, selenides, and sulfides. Molybdenum sulfides have shown great promise as an economical alternative to Pt. The high activity of MoS₂ arises in large part from the location and number of cis-sulfur edge sites.

Recently, we reported the homogeneous electrocatalytic HER/HOR activity of ReL₃ (L = diphenylphosphinobenzene-thiolate). The ReL₃ complex contains three thiolate donors with cis-thiolates similar to the S edges of MoS₂. The HER mechanism of ReL₃ is proposed to follow a unique ligand-centered mechanism that avoids metal hydrides. This reactivity deviates from most homogeneous systems which operate via crucial metal-hydride intermediates, with several displaying low overpotentials, high turnover frequencies, and faradaic efficiencies >90%. The ReL₃ system is one of only a few examples of ligand-centered HER/HOR reactions reported to date as well as one of the only ligand-centered homogeneous systems employing a cis-sulfur active site, affording a unique opportunity to correlate ligand-centered homogeneous catalytic and mechanistic studies with heterogeneous studies.

The current study involves fabrication of surface modified electrodes through simple physisorption, which avoids...
modification of the molecular ReL₃ catalyst while retaining solution HER activity of ReL₃. This approach has previously been employed for other HER catalysts.²⁸⁻³³ Notable examples include Fontecave and co-workers’ multiwalled carbon nanotube [Ni(P₆₋₆,N₆₋₆)₃]modified electrodes, which display high catalytic activity for both HER and HOR in acetonitrile.²⁸ Pantani and co-workers observed HER activity with Co-(dmgBF₂)₂(CH₃CN)₂)/carbon black (CB)/Nafton coated glassy carbon (GC) electrodes,²⁹ while Peters and co-workers modified GC electrodes with cobaloximes as HER catalysts with low overpotentials in aqueous solutions (pH < 4.5).³⁰ Other electrode surfaces modified with cobalt porphyrin,³¹ metal-phthalocyanine,³²–³⁵ and an organometallic Rh complex³⁶ have also been reported as HER electrocatalysts but at higher overpotentials.

To this end, we translated the homogeneous HER activity of ReL₃ in nonaqueous solution to a series of four modified GC electrodes (Scheme 1) for heterogeneous application in an acidic aqueous environment along with density functional theory (DFT) computations which confirm the ligand-centered HER mechanism. Additionally, we followed a recent protocol by Jaramillo and co-workers for benchmarking the efficiency and long-term stability of HER electrocatalysts.³⁷

**EXPERIMENTAL SECTION**

**Materials and Reagents.** Chemicals and reagents were purchased from commercial sources and used without further purification unless otherwise noted. Carbon black was purchased from Columbian Chemicals Company (Marietta, GA). All solvents were purified using an MBraun solvent purification system prior to use. The catalyst ReL₃⁴⁰ and the catalyst precursor [ReL₃][PF₆]⁴¹ were prepared according to previously reported literature methods.

**Electrode Fabrication.** GC electrodes of model number MF-2012 with a 3.0 mm diameter were purchased from Bioanalytical Systems (West Lafayette, IN). Electrodes were polished with alumina slurry (0.5 µm) before use and then sonicated in acetone, isopropanol, and deionized water for 15 min, separately.

**GC-ReL₃ Electrodes.** Catalyst solutions for ReL₃ were typically prepared by dissolving 3.0 mg (2.5 μmol) of ReL₃ in 1.00 mL of dichloromethane (DCM). Aliquots of the catalyst solution were then carefully drop-cast onto the clean glassy carbon electrodes (area = 0.071 cm²) using a micropipette, ensuring that all of the solution remained on the electrode until evaporation. Loading amounts ranged from 10 to 160 nmol of catalyst. Optimal loading conditions were determined by voltammetric methods. The GC-ReL₃ electrodes were stored open to air prior to use.

**GC-[ReL₃][PF₆] Electrodes.** The GC-[ReL₃][PF₆] electrodes were prepared in an argon filled glovebox from a freshly prepared stock solution of 2.5 mM [ReL₃][PF₆] in dry, degassed DCM. The drop-casting method, catalyst loadings, and optimization procedure were the same as that described for GC-ReL₃. The GC-[ReL₃][PF₆] electrodes were stored open to air.

**GC-CB-[ReL₃] and GC-CB-[ReL₃][PF₆].** The CB modified electrodes GC-CB-[ReL₃] and GC-CB-[ReL₃][PF₆] were prepared as follows. A 1.0 mg portion of CB was added to 1.0 mL of dimethylformamide (DMF), and the mixture was sonicated for 30 min. Then, 12 μL of the CB solution was transferred to the surface of a clean GC electrode and heated under an infrared heating lamp for ~15 min to evaporate the solvent. The resulting CB film evenly covered the electrode surface. Next, 60 nmol of either ReL₃ or [ReL₃][PF₆] was carefully deposited on top of the CB layer by drop-casting of DCM solutions as noted above. After evaporation of the solvent, a 5.0 μL portion of a 5.0% w/w Nafton solution was added via micropipette. The electrode was dried under an infrared heating lamp. Electrodes were stored in air prior to use.

**Physical Methods.** Voltammetry and coulometry measurements were performed using a Gamry Interface 1000 potentiostat with a three-electrode cell employing a [ReL₃][PF₆] (n = 0 or 1) modified GC electrode as the working electrode, a platinum wire as the counter electrode, and Ag/AgCl saturated in 3.5 M KCl as the reference electrode. For all of the measurements, the sample was purged for 15 min with N₂ and then kept under an N₂ atmosphere. Polarization curves and electrochemical impedance spectra (EIS) were collected on a CHI 660 electrochemical workstation. All reported potentials are scaled versus the reversible hydrogen electrode (RHE) according to eq 1 using a value of +0.205 V for E°Ag/AgCl.

\[
E_{\text{RHE}} = E_{\text{Ag/AgCl}} + 0.059 \text{pH} + E^{\circ}_{\text{Ag/AgCl}}
\]

Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) images were obtained using a LEOM 1550 field emission SEM. Transmission electron microscopy (TEM) images were generated using a FEI Tecnai G2 F20 electron microscope operating at 200 kV. UV-vis absorbance spectra were recorded on a UV-3600 Shimadzu UV-vis–near infrared (NIR) spectrophotometer. A Gow-Mac series 400 GC-TCD with a molecular sieve column was used to identify the hydrogen gas that was generated after electrolysis. The column was heated to 130 °C under N₂ gas flow, and 250 μL samples were drawn from the headspace of the electrolysis cell and then injected into the column using a gastight syringe.

**Electrochemical HER Measurements.** Cyclic voltammetric (CV) measurements were carried out at room temperature in 0.5 M H₂SO₄ at a scan rate of 200 mV/s. Current densities were normalized based on the surface area (0.071 cm²) of the GC electrode. Polarization data were collected under the same conditions but at a scan rate of 20 mV/s. Initial evaluation of electrode stability was conducted by continuous scanning over 300 CV cycles. Extended stability was assessed by recording the required overpotential to maintain a current density of 10 mA/cm² over a 24 h period. To determine Faradaic efficiency, the reaction was conducted in a H cell that separated the anode and cathode. The volume of H₂ gas collected above the cathode was quantified and compared to the measured charge.

**Electrochemical Impedance Spectroscopy Methods.** EIS was measured over a frequency range from 10⁻² to 10⁻¹ Hz under an amplitude of 10 mV. Nyquist curves were recorded for the HER processes. The experimental complex-plane plots for GC-[ReL₃][PF₆] (n = 0 or 1) and GC-CB-[ReL₃][PF₆] (n = 0 or 1) were recorded at an applied overpotential of 1.3 V (see Supporting Information). Data were fit to a model (Figure 1) with a resistor (Rₓ) in series with a module comprised of a second resistor (Rₓ) in parallel with a constant phase element (CPE), where Rₓ represents the contact resistance between electrolyte and electrode surface, Rₓ reflects the charge
transfer resistance within the catalyst film, and CPE is a constant phase element representing the capacitive behavior of the electrodes.

Computational Methods. All reported calculations were performed in the gas phase using DFT employing the M06 exchange correlation functional and the LANL2DZ basis set for all atoms, as implemented in the Gaussian09 suite of programs. Initially, the restricted formalism using an RHF wave function was invoked, and subsequently unrestricted calculations based on a UHF-type wave function were carried out for complexes with even electron counts. Furthermore, the B3LYP functional was used to obtain broken symmetry solutions. Frequency calculations were performed for all optimized stationary points to ensure they were true minima. Transition states (TS) were determined using the Berny algorithm with GEDIS and verified by intrinsic reaction coordinate (IRC) calculations with forward and reverse step sizes of 40. TS structures were constructed manually based on their optimized reactants and products under tight constraints with no symmetry imposed. Chemcraft software was used for graphics visualization.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Electrode Modification. A series of four modified GC electrodes were prepared based on the homogeneous HER catalysts ReL3 (Scheme 1). The ReL3 complex and its oxidized derivative [ReL3][PF6] are readily soluble in DCM but insoluble under aqueous conditions, attributable to the large number of phenyl rings in the structure. As such, evaporation of dichloromethane solutions of ReL3 or [ReL3][PF6] on GC surfaces yield water-stable films due to adhesive dispersion forces and/or ion-induced dipole interactions. Once prepared, all modified electrodes were stable under ambient conditions and upon submersion in aqueous solution over a pH range of 0.25–13 as determined by voltammetry over a period of several days.

The simplest electrode, GC-ReL3, consists of a GC surface coated with an electroactive film of ReL3. The film was fabricated by drop-casting a controlled volume of a 2.5 M DCM solution of ReL3 which leaves a known molar quantity of catalyst on the electrode upon solvent evaporation. Similar methodology was employed to prepare GC-[ReL3]+, which has a film of formal Re(II) catalyst precursor [ReL3][PF6]. A key difference between GC-ReL3 and GC-[ReL3]+ is that the former has a charge neutral catalyst film, while the latter has an ionic catalyst film. Diffuse reflectance spectra confirm the presence of ReL3 (∼44 nm) and [ReL3]+ (∼80 nm) on the surface of GC-ReL3 and GC-[ReL3]+, respectively.

Multilayer modified electrodes GC-CB-ReL3 and GC-CB-[ReL3]+ were prepared to enhance conductivity and promote substrate binding. These electrodes consist of a GC surface with an initial CB layer, followed by a catalyst film of ReL3 or [ReL3][PF6] and topped with a layer of Nafion. The CB, added to improve conductivity between the GC surface and the catalyst, was drop-cast as a DMF slurry followed by drying upon an infrared heat lamp. After incorporation of the catalyst film, addition of the ionic polymer Nafion to promote film stability and proton binding was done by drop-casting an [ReL3] and topped with a layer of Na solution with a maximum turnover frequency of 32 ± 3 s⁻¹. To evaluate the HER activity of ReL3 under heterogeneous aqueous conditions, polarization curves were recorded for the modified electrodes in 0.5 M H2SO4 under ambient conditions (Figure 2). Results are summarized in Table 1, which compares the overpotential required to obtain a current density of 10 mA/cm² for the 4 electrodes at 60 nmol catalyst loading. The charge neutral film of GC-ReL3 exhibits the largest overpotential of 0.919 V, whereas incorporation of the ionic, oxidized catalyst precursor [ReL3]+ lowers the overpotential of GC-[ReL3]+ by as much as 0.192 V. Notably, the optimized loading of GC-[ReL3]+ (10 nmol catalyst) is substantially lower than that of GC-ReL3 (60 nmol catalyst). Overpotential decreases by an additional 0.43–0.47 V in the multilayered electrodes. Thus, overpotentials as low as 0.357 V are observed for GC-CB-[ReL3]+, which is 0.290 V lower than cobaloxime modified GC electrodes. As detailed below, the overpotential of ReL3 modified electrodes correlates with film morphology and resistance.

To evaluate the Faradaic efficiency, controlled potential coulometry at −1.48 V versus RHE was applied for a fixed time. Electrolysis was performed in a two-compartment cell with the evolved H2 collected in the headspace above the cathode. To calculate the Faradaic efficiency, the molar quantity of H2 as determined from the volume of the collected gas and compared to the quantity of charge passed. Faradaic efficiencies of GC-[ReL3] and GC-[ReL3]+ were calculated as 97 and 98%, respectively, over 160 s. For the CB modified electrodes, Faradaic efficiencies of 87 and 90% were measured for GC-CB-[ReL3] and GC-CB-[ReL3]+, respectively, over 100 s.

Electrode Stability. Initial assessment of the electrode stability of GC-[ReL3] and GC-[ReL3]+ was conducted by CV. Continuous scanning over 500 cycles ranging from +0.32 to −1.48 V versus RHE at a scan rate of 200 mV/s resulted in an increase of overpotential by 300 and 350 mV for GC-[ReL3] and GC-[ReL3]+, respectively (see Supporting Information).

![Figure 2](image.png)

**Table 1. HER Overpotentials (η) and Tafel Slopes of the ReL3 Modified Electrodes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Electrode</th>
<th>Loading (nmol)</th>
<th>η (mV)</th>
<th>Tafel Slope (mV/dec)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GC-ReL3</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>919</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-[ReL3]+</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-[ReL3]+</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>727</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-CB-ReL3</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>487</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-CB-[ReL3]+</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Converted to RHE from values measured versus Ag/AgCl using E_RHE = E_AgAgCl + 0.059 pH + 0.205 V.*
The long-term stability of GC-[ReL$_3$]$^{+}$ (n = 0 or 1) was benchmarked through chronopotentiometry at a fixed catalytic current density of 10 mA/cm$^2$ over 24 h. For GC-[ReL$_3$], the overpotential increases by 510 mV over the first 3 h but then remains constant over the remainder of the experiment, consistent with initial conditioning of the electrode. For GC-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$, the increase in overpotential is slightly less, 430 mV, over the first 2 h with a good stability for the remainder of the experiment (see Supporting Information). The initial increase in overpotential can be attributed to a decrease in the number of active sites on the surface (see Figure S4), which would increase the potential required to maintain the same current density. For both GC-[ReL$_3$] and GC-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$, no further increase in overpotential was observed upon placing the conditioned electrode in a fresh 0.5 M H$_2$SO$_4$ solution and applying a potential.

The stability of CB modified electrodes was similarly evaluated. The initial CV studies revealed an increase in overpotential of 340 and 400 mV for GC-CB-[ReL$_3$] and GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$, respectively, after 500 cycles. Chronopotentiometry measurements of GC-CB-[ReL$_3$] required an increase in overpotential of 1.0 V during the first 1.5 h to maintain a current density of 10 mA/cm$^2$. Notably, the final overpotential of 1.53 V is statistically equivalent to the value observed for GC-[ReL$_3$], indicating that the benefits of CB do not persist over prolonged electrolysis. The GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$ electrodes behave similarly with an increase in overpotential of 1.0 V to a final value consistent with GC-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$.

**Microscopy Studies.** Microscopy studies reveal distinct differences in the morphology of the charge neutral film of GC-ReL$_3$ and the ionic film of GC-[ReL$_3$]+$^+$. The SEM image of GC-ReL$_3$ (Figure 3a) shows a porous multilayer structure distributed with uneven surface coverage. This is consistent with a preference for cohesive interactions between ReL$_3$ molecules over adhesive interactions between ReL$_3$ and the GC surface. The TEM image (Figure 3b) reveals that the ReL$_3$ film is comprised of randomly arranged plate-shaped nanoparticles approximately 10 nm in diameter. In contrast, the SEM image of GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$ (Figure 3c) displays more highly uniform film coverage, although substantial cracking is evident. The uniformity is attributed to stronger adhesive interactions between the complex ions and the GC surface. The TEM image of the [ReL$_3$]$^+$ film (Figure 3d) finds larger dendritic shaped nanoparticles aligned in two dimensions.

The differences in film morphology correlate with the optimal catalyst loading. For GC-ReL$_3$, catalytic current steadily increases upon addition of catalyst up to 60 nmol as the porous structure of small nanoplates provides a pathway for substrate/electrolyte transfer deeper into the film. In contrast, the uniform dendritic film of GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$ displays optimal HER activity at lower loading (10 nmol). Decreased activity at higher loading suggests an increased charge transfer resistance through thicker layers as confirmed by electron impedance spectroscopy (Table 2). For GC-ReL$_3$ and GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$, SEM images (Supporting Information) collected after H$_2$ evolution reveal film degradation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>electrode/load (nmol)</th>
<th>$R_\Omega$ (Ω)</th>
<th>$R_\sigma$ (MΩ)</th>
<th>CPE-T ($sP/\mu\Omega$)</th>
<th>CPE-P ($sP/\Omega$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GC-ReL$_3$/10</td>
<td>43.3</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-ReL$_3$/60</td>
<td>41.1</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-ReL$_3$/120</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$/10</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$/60</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$/120</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]/60</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]$^+$/60</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Impedance Studies.** Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy confirms a correlation between film resistance and HER overpotential. Data were collected over a frequency range of $10^{-2}$ to $10^5$ Hz at an applied overpotential of 1.3 V. Nyquist plots of the EIS data (see Supporting Information) were simulated using the model in Figure 1. Simulation parameters are provided in Table 2. The similarity among the responses of all fabricated GC electrodes suggests a similar mechanism for hydrogen evolution, and the lack of Warburg impedance indicates that mass transport is rapid enough so that the reaction is kinetically controlled.

The $R_\sigma$ term, which represents charge transfer resistance within the catalyst film, has the largest impact on overpotential (Table 2). The multilayered modified electrodes require the least overpotential and also display the lowest $R_\sigma$ with values of 0.004 and 0.006 MΩ for GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]$^+$ and GC-CB-ReL$_3$, respectively. The $R_\sigma$ for the ionic film of GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$ is 0.09 MΩ under optimal loading conditions, which is 24 times larger than that for GC-CB-[ReL$_3$]$^+$. Additional catalyst loading increases the $R_\sigma$ of GC-[ReL$_3$]$^+$ consistent with slower electron transfer through the thicker film. The charge neutral catalyst film of GC-ReL$_3$ displays the largest $R_\sigma$ of 0.72 MΩ under optimal loading conditions and also requires the largest overpotential.

**Evaluation of Active Species.** To investigate the identity of the active species on the electrode surface, a series of UV-visible studies was performed. First, to verify the presence of intact complex on the electrode surface, diffuse reflectance measurements of catalysts deposited on optically transparent indium tin oxide (ITO) electrodes were collected after initial
deposition and following catalysis. The spectra (Figures 4a and b) confirm the presence of ReL₃ (544 nm) and [ReL₃]⁺ (580 nm) on the surface of freshly prepared ITO-ReL₃ and ITO-[ReL₃]⁺, respectively. Following HER, both films display a peak at 544 nm, indicating that all surface exposed complex has been converted to the ReL₃ catalyst resting state. To evaluate if the bulk material has also been converted to ReL₃, the [ReL₃]⁺ film was removed from the GC electrode surface by washing with DCM, and UV-visible analysis of the resulting solution was performed. The spectra of DCM washings collected after HER at an applied potential of −1.48 V in 0.5 M H₂SO₄ for 3 min are identical to those collected prior to catalysis (Figures 4c and d). The results indicate the complexes are stable during catalysis with no formation of additional DCM soluble species. Further, the DCM rinsed electrodes are inactive for HER upon reimmersion into the H₂SO₄ solution, precluding the presence of a metal sulfide cluster or similar species on the GC surface or dispersion in the aqueous solution as the HER catalyst. The combined spectroscopic results convincingly establish intact [ReL₃]⁺ complexes on the modified GC electrodes. Because [ReL₃]⁺ is active for homogeneous HER, we attribute the heterogeneous HER activity to these surface confined [ReL₃]⁺ species but cannot exclude the possibility that activity could also result from an unobserved degradation product.

**Tafel Slope Analysis.** The Tafel plot for an HER displays the relationship between the applied overpotential and catalytic current density. The slope of the Tafel plot is dependent on the rate limiting step, and its value is commonly used to evaluate the mechanism of HER on metal surfaces under acidic conditions. The two dominant mechanisms for HER on metal surfaces under acidic conditions are Volmer–Heyrovsky (eqs 2 and 3) and Volmer–Tafel (eqs 2 and 4).

Volmer (discharge reaction):

\[
\text{H}_2\text{O}^+ + e^- + \text{cat} \rightleftharpoons \text{cat} - \text{H} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \tag{2}
\]

Heyrovsky (ion + atom reaction):

\[
\text{H}_2\text{O}^+ + e^- + \text{cat} - \text{H} \rightleftharpoons \text{cat} + \text{H}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \tag{3}
\]

Both mechanisms begin with a Volmer step, which is a discharge reaction that combines H⁺ and an electron to yield a metal hydride (cat-H). In the Volmer–Heyrovsky mechanism, the second step is a Heyrovsky “ion + atom” reaction that releases H₂ following the addition of a second proton and electron to cat-H. Alternatively, in a Volmer–Tafel mechanism, the second step is a Tafel combination reaction with H₂ release upon combination of two equivalents of cat-H. If the Volmer step is rate limiting, the theoretical Tafel slope is 116 mV/decade regardless of the identity of the subsequent step. However, if the Volmer step is fast, the Tafel slope is dependent on the second step. For a Volmer–Heyrovsky mechanism with a slow Heyrovsky step, a Tafel slope of 38 mV/decade is predicted, whereas a slope of 29 mV/decade is expected for a Volmer–Tafel mechanism with a slow Tafel step. Ideal Tafel slopes serve as benchmarks to assign the rate limiting HER step on metal surfaces, although actual values may deviate.

Although Tafel slope interpretations were developed for HER at metal surfaces, they have been applied to evaluate the mechanism of other heterogeneous catalysts such as molybdenum sulfide that are deposited on electrode surfaces. Tafel analyses of the HER polarization curves of the [ReL₃]⁺ modified electrodes (Figure 5) reveal slopes from 139 to 193 mV/decade (Table 1). The slopes did not significantly change for data collected using a rotating disk electrode at variable rotation speeds (see Supporting Information). The slopes are considerably greater than the 31 mV/decade observed for Pt but consistent with the proposed HER mechanism for ReL₃ complexes in homogeneous solution (Scheme 2).

The proposed homogeneous HER mechanism for ReL₃ (Scheme 2) correlates with the proposed heterogeneous HER mechanism of the ReL₃ modified electrodes (Scheme 3). The “like” term signifies that the steps on the modified surface resemble those on traditional heterogeneous metal surfaces with the notable exception that all bond-making and bond-breaking occurs at the sulfur ligands of a single metal site. That is, immobilization of ReL₃ on GC translates both the HER activity and the HER mechanism from homogeneous to
heterogeneous conditions. The large Tafel slopes for the ReL3
modified electrodes suggest a rate limiting Volmer-like step,
which corresponds with initial thiolate protonation and
complex reduction. The second step is described as a
Heyrovsky-like step, as it involves the reaction of the second
proton and electron at the initial active site to yield the formal
ReI-dithiol Re(LH)2L. This is distinct from a second Volmer
step, which would involve proton/electron addition at a second
reactive site (see Supporting Information for a detailed
description). The
final H2 evolution step involves homolytic
S−H bond cleavage of the cis-thiols similar to the coupling of
metal hydrides in a Tafel step. The similarity of the
homogeneous and heterogeneous mechanisms derives from
the fact ReL3 serves as the active catalyst under both conditions.

For simplicity, only the Re-(SR)3 portion of the catalyst is shown.

DFT Studies. To elucidate the mechanism of hydrogen
evolution by discrete ReL3 active sites, DFT calculations were
performed. These gas phase calculations are representative of
the single site activity under homogeneous and surface confined
conditions. The electronic and geometric properties of all
complexes of the proposed mechanism in Scheme 2 were
explored along with location of their transition states for H2
evolution pathways. Complexes with an even number of
electrons (ReL3, [Re(LH)L2]+, [HRe(LH)L2]−, and [Re-
(LH)L3]) were considered in both the singlet (S = 0) and
triplet (S = 1) ground states for both closed-shell and open-
shell configurations. All odd electron complexes ([ReL3]−,
[Re(LH)L2]+, and [Re(LH)L3]−) were calculated as doublets
(S = 1/2). Intermediates formed upon the addition of one
proton were evaluated with protonation at S3, consistent with
previous X-ray crystallographic studies. Addition of the
second proton was examined for both ligand-based protonation
at S2 and metal-based addition as the Re-hydride.

The ground state of the neutral ReL3 complex is best
described as a restricted singlet Re(III) (d4, S = 0) center
bound to three thiolate ligands (Figure 6). Optimized metal–
ligand bond lengths for the singlet ground state are 0.02–0.09
Å longer than experimental values, as typical for DFT
calculations, while triplet state deviations from experimental
bond lengths were larger. Furthermore, the neutral singlet
species (S = 0) was favored over the triplet state (S = 1) by 2.6
kcal/mol. Due to the small di
ference in energy between the
singlet and triplet states, attempts were made to obtain broken
symmetry solution for the open-shell singlet. Calculations for
the open-shell singlet were performed using the singlet
geometry in combination with triplet orbitals as initial guesses.
Examination of optimization steps show a decrease in the
⟨S**2⟩ value moving from 2.0152 and collapsing to a
final value of 0.00. This result confirms the nature of the ReL3
complex as a closed-shell restricted singlet.

The initial steps of the catalytic mechanism involve the
transfer of one proton and one electron to ReL3 to yield the
neutral [Re(LH)L2] intermediate. Prior studies indicate that
either proton or electron transfer can occur first. Initial
protonation at S3 yields the previously isolated and
characterized [Re(LH)L2]−. The [Re(LH)L3]− intermediate is
best described as a Re(III) (S = 1) open-shell triplet
coordinated by two noninnocent thiolate donors and one

Scheme 2. Proposed Homogeneous HER Mechanism for
ReL3, Highlighting Re-Dithiol vs Re-Hydride Isomers as the
Key Intermediates

Scheme 3. Proposed Volmer—Heyrovsky—Tafel-like
Mechanism for Heterogeneous HER ReL3 Modified
Electrodes

Figure 6. Bond lengths (Å) and angles (deg) for ReL3 from S = 0 and
S = 1 DFT optimizations (M06/LANL2DZ) and the experimental
(Exp.) X-ray crystal structure. ΔG indicates relative zero-point free
energy (kcal/mol) values of the S = 0 and S = 1 electronic states.
thiol donor (Figure 7). Single-point energy calculations were performed as both closed-shell singlet and triplet in addition to the X-ray crystal structures of [Re(LH)L₂]⁺. The free energy of the triplet is also preferred energetically, lying 5.33 kcal/mol lower than the closed-shell singlet and 3.55 kcal/mol lower than the open-shell singlet. Further examination of the (S**,2) values confirms an open-shell configuration of the triplet, yielding a final value of 2.0132 with the less energetically preferred open-shell singlet with an (S**,2) value of 0.9516.

For the double intermediates [ReL₃]⁻, [Re(LH)L₂]₀, and [Re(LH)₂L]⁺, examination of the atomic spin densities (SD) reveals a propagation of ligand-centered radical character around the three S donors with each protonation step. The formal Re(II) species [ReL₃]⁻ shows 6.5 and 6.4% SD on the S2 and S3 donors, respectively, with no significant contribution from S1 (Figure 8). This suggests S2 and S3 have a small degree of thyl character and can be considered “noninnocent”, while S1 is best described a thiolate. Protonation of [ReL₃]⁻ occurs preferentially at S3, yielding [Re(LH)L₂] and resulting in a notable transfer of spin-density from S3 and Re onto S1 and S2. The S1 and S2 donors are now noninnocent with 8.6 and 9.1% SD, respectively, whereas S3 is a thiol (Figure 8). The next step of the mechanism is the formation of [Re(LH)₂L]⁺ upon addition of the second proton. Although this may potentially occur at sulfur, yielding a Re(II)-dithiol or at the metal to give a Re(IV)-hydride, only the former structure could be optimized. Protonation is favored at S2, prompting a shift of SD onto S1, which now accounts for 23.1% of the unpaired SD (Figure 8). The electronic structure of [Re(LH)₂L]⁺ is doublet (S = 1/2) with a formal Re(II) center coordinated by a noninnocent thiolate (S1) and two thiols (S2 and S3).

Propagation of spin density as a function of protonation may be seen by analyzing the geometric parameters of the doublet intermediates. The Re–S1 bond distance decreases as a function of ligand electron density, further indicating non-
innocent character. The distance drops from 2.57 Å in \([\text{ReL}_3]^-\) to 2.51 Å in \([\text{Re(LH)L}_2]^-\) after initial protonation at S3 with a further decrease to 2.38 Å in \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^+\) after the second protonation at S2. The Re–S2 bond distance decrease upon protonation at S3 is consistent with an increased SD, which further increases when S2 is protonated. The Re–S3 bond distance shows an increase with each protonation step.

The final step of the HER mechanism is the addition of a second electron to yield the hydrogen evolving complex \(\text{ReL}_3\cdot\text{H}_2\), which can be represented as either a Re(I)-dithiol or a Re(III)-hydride. The electronic and geometric parameters of the Re(I)-dithiol \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^0\) were examined in the singlet \((S = 0)\) as well as the triplet \((S = 1)\) states with only successful optimization of the singlet electronic state, however. The electronic and geometric parameters of the Re(III)-hydride \([\text{HRe(LH)L}_2]\) were examined as a singlet \((S = 0)\) and triplet \((S = 1)\) with the triplet being 2.03 kcal/mol lower in energy than the singlet (see Supporting Information). The singlet Re(I)-dithiol \((S = 0)\) configuration is favored over the triplet Re(III)-hydride \((S = 1)\) by 4.7 kcal/mol (Figure 9). This energy gap is sufficiently small, and it should be noted that \([\text{HRe(LH)L}_2]\) cannot completely be excluded as the H$_2$-evolving complex based solely on single point energy calculations.

To unequivocally resolve the electronic structure of the H$_2$-evolving complex, TS for reaction pathways were located for both \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^0\) (Figure 10A) and \([\text{HRe(LH)L}_2]\) (Figure 10B). The traditional metal hydride \([\text{HRe(LH)_2L}]^+\) pathway proceeding through TS-\([\text{HRe(LH)_2L}]^+\) requires an insurmountable 81.5 kcal/mol barrier. In contrast, ligand-centered H$_2$ evolution along the \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^-\) pathway proceeds through TS-\([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^-\) over a modest barrier of 2 kcal/mol (Figure 10C), represented by the imaginary frequency \(i113\) cm$^{-1}$. The S–H bond lengths in TS-\([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^-\), 1.524 and 1.532 Å, are 0.125–0.133 Å longer than the respective equilibrium bond lengths 1.399 and 1.399 Å in \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^-\). This may be attributed to a transfer of charge densities from the formal Re(I) to the thiol sulfurs moving forward along the IRC, initiating the release of two H atoms that couple to form hydrogen (see Supporting Information). The IRC analysis is consistent with a ligand-centered H$_2$ evolution pathway best described as homolytic cleavage of two cis-coordinated metal thiol S–H bonds.

\section*{Conclusions}

In summary, we fabricated a series of modified electrodes to translate the nonaqueous, homogeneous HER activity of Re$_3$ to a solid support for heterogeneous application in an acidic aqueous environment. The GC-\([\text{ReL}_3]\) and GC-\([\text{ReL}_3]^+\) electrodes demonstrate good, long-term stability in overpotential following an initial conditioning period. The overpotential can be significantly decreased in freshly prepared

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{image}
\caption{Bond lengths (Å) and angles (deg) for optimizations (M06/LANL2DZ) of (a) \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^0\) (S = 0) DFT, (b) \([\text{HRe(LH)L}_2]\)^0 (S = 1), and (c) \([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^+\). \(\Delta G\) indicates relative zero-point free energy (kcal/mol) values of the S = 0 and S = 1 electronic states.}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{image}
\caption{Transition states and energy profile for HER through Re-dithiol and Re-hydride pathways. (A) Representation of TS-\([\text{Re(LH)_2L}]^-\) showing lengthening of two S–H bonds associated with H$_2$ evolution. (B) Representation of TS-\([\text{HRe(LH)L}_2]\) showing H$_2$ evolution from Re–H and S–H. (C) Comparison of relative energies (ZPE corrected) for Re-dithiol and Re-hydride HER pathways using M06/LANL2DZ.}
\end{figure}
electrodes by incorporation of CB, but after conditioning for 1.5 h, the improvement in overpotential is diminished.

Although the relatively large overpotential of these electrodes limits their practical application, the ligand-centered HER by ReL₃ opens the door to novel scaffolds and strategies for catalytic HER development. Furthermore, these electrodes represent a rare example of a well-characterized homogeneous catalyst translated to a heterogeneous surface by simple physiosorption. We propose that these catalysts remain intact on the surface as the active HER species but cannot rule out the presence of an undetected quantity of catalytically active degradation products. The remarkable features of this system include long-term stability without inclusion of covalent linkers degradation products. The remarkable features of this system presence of an undetected quantity of catalytically active catalyst translated to a heterogeneous surface by simple

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was supported in part by the National Science Foundation (Grant CHE-1361728) and a grant from the Kentucky Science and Engineering Foundation pursuant to Grant Agreement KSEF-148-502-15-350 with the Kentucky Science and Technology Corporation. The authors are thankful to Cardinal Research Cluster at the University of Louisville for providing the computational facilities. We thank Xiaoming Fan for help with SEM and Samuel Dilip for help with TEM. We also want to thank Dr. Frank P. Zamborini’s lab for usage of the UV-3600 Shimadzu UV–vis–NIR spectrophotometer and a CHI 660 electrochemical workstation and the University of Louisville Conn Center for Renewable Energy Research for providing access to facilities.

REFERENCES


ASSOCIATED CONTENT

 Supporting Information

Nyquist plots, SEM images after HER catalysis, stability measurement data, optimized geometric parameters of [HRe(LH)L₃]⁺, intrinsic reaction coordinate analyses, and computational input coordinates (PDF)

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Corresponding Authors

*E-mail: robert.buchanan@louisville.edu.
*E-mail: grapperhaus@louisville.edu.

ORCID

Craig A. Grapperhaus: 0000-0003-4889-2645

Author Contributions

W.Z. and A.Z.H. contributed equally.

Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

Inorganic Chemistry

DOI: 10.1021/acs.inorgchem.6b00289


(55) Haddad, A. Z.; Garabato, B. D.; Kozlowski, P. M.; Buchanan, R. M.; Grapperhaus, C. A. Beyond Metal-Hydrides: Non-Transition-