

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

A Place to be Navajo: Rough Rock and the Struggle for Self-Determination in Indigenous Schooling. By Teresa L. McCarty.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/55k8c150>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Trafzer, Clifford E.

Publication Date

2002-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ous anthologies. Wisuri has been resourceful and uncovered new visual gems, including a mid-nineteenth-century photograph of a group of women and children on a scaffold at the edge of a cornfield, guarding their corn from blackbirds. The agricultural role of women in Ojibwe history is one that deserves further examination

Ojibwe Waasa Inaabidaa has a few flaws. For example, Peacock attributes the first book published in Ojibwe to Bishop Baraga, when actually the first Ojibwe text was published by the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM) whose missionaries had been present in Ojibwe country for more than five years prior to Baraga's arrival. Given the lasting impact of Baraga's work and the continued use of the Ojibwe dictionary and grammar that he compiled, it is easy to understand why the translations done by the ABCFM have largely been forgotten. Further, their missions had little lasting impact in the communities where they settled. In addition to the standard religious texts and hymnals, these Presbyterians and Congregationalists also translated basic school texts for use in their day and boarding schools. The Minnesota Historical Society houses editions of most of these ABCFM publications in its archival holdings.

Also, some readers may be put off by the strong presence of the author in the text. In his own words, referring to a letter Peacock discovered in an archive written by his great-grandmother, "That incident brought history home to me. It put a human face on it for me and reminded me that we are both the products of and participants in that history... I will forever refuse to distance myself abstractly from my research" (p. 66). In this case, the author's self-avowed subjectivity is an asset to the text. It personalizes the history examined in the book, adds to its conversational quality, and provides an Ojibwe-centered commentary on how our history and issues have been presented in other venues as well as how we experience them. To contextualise myself, I also am Ojibwe and may have my own biases in favor of the perspectives set forth in Peacock's text.

Cary Miller

University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee

A Place to be Navajo: Rough Rock and the Struggle for Self-Determination in Indigenous Schooling. By Teresa L. McCarty with photographs by Fred Bia. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2002. 229 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Diné or Navajo people of the American Southwest believe that their ancestors, the Holy People, progressed through three worlds before entering the glittering or present world. According to traditional creation stories, each world contained positive and negative thoughts and actions, a continual tension between diverse forces. When First Man, First Woman, Coyote, and other Holy People entered the Fourth World, they found chaos in the land, including many monsters. Holy People and Monsters lived side by side, continuing the tension the people had known in the previous three worlds. Navajo stories

teach that this struggle is ever present, a challenge, a fact of life. Seeking balance is central to Diné philosophy, religion, and medicine. But the world is imperfect, and the tensions of ancient times take on new forms in the present world that both beautify and complicate life. This is the theme of *A Place to be Navajo*, and one that is evident throughout the history of the Rough Rock School from its inception in 1966 to the present. Like the first Navajo creations, the school emerged from visions, thoughts, ideas, and a communal will to put the school into motion.

Teresa McCarty has written a significant book, carefully taking the reader from the outside or non-Navajo world into the heart of Navajo country where she introduces readers to the enchanting valleys, canyons, mountains, and plateaus of the contemporary reservation. In a well-written narrative, she invites readers to join her on the road from Ganado to Chinle and north through the valley. Mesas rise up on both sides of the road, particularly in the west where Black Mesa stretches sixty miles paralleling the valley. The pavement snakes its way above Chinle for fifteen miles to Many Farms, the first site of Dine College, once known as Navajo Community College. Another road converges with the highway on the left, running west for another fifteen miles to Rough Rock, a small community nestled within the shadow of Black Mesa. Using the experience of Rough Rock community to form a school responsive to the needs of Navajo people, McCarty presents a unique study that will be of value to anyone interested in education, Native Americans, cultural preservation, and the successes of community-based programs.

McCarty argues that although she is the central author of the book, the work is collaborative. She confesses that she was drawn into the community and the people through her long-term association with them. Although some scholars may fault McCarty for “losing objectivity,” the work is extremely balanced and honest. Moreover, it is researched and written by a non-Native whom Navajo people invited into their world, community, homes, and hearts. As a result, the book presents an outsider and insider’s perspective based on the voices of several Navajos who trusted McCarty with their words and stories, a remarkable feat for one not born of the people. She skillfully weaves documentary evidence and field work with oral histories, offering a book that provides ethnographic information that recognizes the importance of place and unique people. She details the creation of the school in the 1960s, its early objectives, and the function of the Rough Rock school. The book focuses on Navajo curriculum, language, themes, philosophy, and leadership. Scholars interested in the boarding school experience of Native Americans will be grateful for the oral histories McCarty assembled detailing the time when “We were going to school being taught only by Anglos.” She deconstructs the school, dealing with changes over time, the significance of community within the school, the importance of Native and non-Native leadership, classroom approaches, the importance of language, and the problems inherent in the school and its relationship with the federal government.

The book deals with several themes. The issue of Navajo leadership and control of the school by the Native community permeates the volume. Five elders directed matters for the Rough Rock school at its creation in 1966.

From that time forward, the school has had a deep and abiding relationship with Navajo elders, the keepers of traditions who are vested with power and who used their influence to shape the school into a new Navajo institution. Like the creation story, the origin stories of the Rough Rock school are filled with tensions between varying forces. From its beginnings, the Rough Rock school has experienced many diverse issues that have pulled the school, its community, administration, faculty, and students in different directions. Some scholars and participants may consider these difficulties destructive, divisive, and harmful, but in a traditional sense, these adversities have strengthened the institution both internally and externally. By fighting the “monsters”, the Rough Rock school emerged a hero in American Indian education, standing up for its ideals and forging ahead in spite of opponents, negative evaluations, funding deficiencies, and community strife. In offering its unique educational opportunities to numerous children, the school and community exerted its own sovereignty, taking a stand against colonialism in favor of communalism. The net result is an enriched curriculum and educational experience that draws on the traditional values of Navajo people and the positive offering of mainstream education.

The book is filled with the voices of Navajo people and non-Native members of the Rough Rock community who created and maintained Rough Rock school for many years. McCarty allows these voices to come forward and draws on her oral histories for chapter titles, captions, and choice comments and quotes throughout the narrative. The author privileges Navajo views and provides a place for the people to share their ideas, content, and concerns. However, she is clear in stating that the Rough Rock school developed as an outgrowth of President Lyndon Johnson’s war on poverty, a demonstration project of the federal government to provide greater economic opportunity for Navajo people. In addition, the school emerged as a means of fostering Navajo leadership and self-determination. The great experiment was to merge Navajo education, language, values, and philosophy in a federally funded school—institutions that had once attempted to destroy Native American languages and cultures. Formal education through school systems had been foreign to Navajo people until the invasion of the United States into Navajo country in the nineteenth century. Traditionally, Navajo education had once been the purview of parents, grandparents, aunts, uncles, and local elders. The people had spent the winter months telling stories and learning lessons, transmitting knowledge through the oral traditions. Modern schools developed as a result of the Navajo Treaty of 1868 and missionary schools were founded on the reservations. In 1966, the use of Navajo education by Navajos in a community school was a radical idea, but one that came to life primarily because of the thoughts and actions of Navajos and their friends.

A central problem faced by those associated with the Rough Rock school has been the blending of two cultures, languages, curriculum, and educational philosophies into a single school. Navajo and English are languages that are worlds apart, just as the values of the two cultures are largely divergent. Some teachers, administrators, students, and community members have asked whether the central objective of the school is to teach students in the

Navajo way so that they can fulfill their destinies as well-informed and educated members of the Navajo community, or whether the objective of the school is to preserve and nurture the Navajo way while preparing children to meet the demands of a foreign school system driven by non-Natives obsessed with scoring high on tests and meeting the demands of local, state, and federal standards—all set by non-Natives. This tension is not new for the Rough Rock school, and it is one that has been met with a variety of responses. Although difficult, Rough Rock has attempted to teach the Navajo way and provide students with sufficient skills to score well on standardized exams. By making this effort, many problems have emerged but so has a unique institution that emphasizes the Navajo way while dealing with the challenges of the twenty-first century. The issue has not been resolved and never will, because the core issue is the tension inherent in dealing with things in the Navajo way—seeking harmony and balance but addressing tension and adversity associated with life among the earth surface people.

Clifford E. Trafzer

University of California, Riverside

Racial Revolutions: Antiracism and Indian Resurgence in Brazil. By Jonathan W. Warren. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2001. 363 pages. \$64.95 cloth; \$21.95 paper.

Hundreds of books and articles discuss Afro-Brazilians' place in Brazil's racial classification system, but few if any deal with indigenous people. The usual explanation is that Brazil's indigenous population is so small—350,000, less than one percent of the nation's population of 170 million—that they do not figure prominently in the construction of racial categories. Social scientists agree that more than half of Brazil's racially mixed population has some African ancestry, and so examination and analysis of the racial classification system focuses on it. In addition, until recently, most Brazilians (and many others) believed that Indians were disappearing and soon would be extinct in Brazil. Thus, indigenous identity became a residual category for most analysts of Brazilian culture. But in the past decade, according to Brazil's latest census, the country's indigenous population (that is, the number of people who identify themselves as Indians) has doubled, to 700,000. About half live in cities and towns or in rural areas outside indigenous reserves. They are becoming known in Brazil as "resurgent Indians": people who formerly did not call themselves indigenous but who have reclaimed an indigenous identity not necessarily associated with a particular group or tribe. Why? Anthropologist Marta Azevedo, of the Instituto Socioambiental in São Paulo, explained in a recent interview: "The decade of the nineties was very good for the Indians. At the Constitutional Convention [1987–88] and the Earth Summit [1992], they appeared in the media in a positive light. As the environmental issue grew in prominence, they emerged as defenders of the environment. In addition, the Federal University of Minas Gerais did a DNA study in 1997 that