

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development: Navajo Resources and Their Use. By Philip Reno.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5bn3h6jb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 6(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Stea, David

Publication Date

1982-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

the paucity of historical investigation of the period 1869–1920. This is the period in Navajo history which I call “the great void,” a period which historians have shied away from and which ethnohistorians have treated only peripherally. It remains a challenge to scholarship.

Apart from the disappointment of the abrupt ending of the book, which may have been beyond the author’s control, there is the further disappointment of innumerable typographical errors, missing words, and misspellings. In a day of declining standards in book production it is perhaps futile to recall that things were not always so. But twenty-five errors in fifty pages? This seems excessive and is surely bound to induce frustration in readers.

Lawrence C. Kelly
North Texas State University

Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development: Navajo Resources and Their Use. By Philip Reno. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1981. 200 pp. \$12.95 paper.

The Navajo Nation, occupying Northeastern Arizona, Northwestern New Mexico, and part of Southern Utah, is the largest and most populous of U.S. Indian Reservations. It is also, perhaps paradoxically, a place of poverty amid potential affluence, an area rich in natural resources, but poor in monetary return. For decades, no-one asked “who benefits and who pays” concerning Navajo resources and the Dineh, who once walked in the beauty of their land, suffered in silence and invisibility. Then came the “energy crisis,” and the issue of Indian resources rapidly emerged into prominence. Native Americans and those who worked with them began to ask about their resources, about how they had been exploited in the past, and how they might be managed in the future.

Navajo Tribal Chairman Peter McDonald became leader of the Council of Energy Resource Tribes in the mid-1970s. But the problem of Navajo resource management had begun long before the 1973 oil embargo brought Native Americans to the attention of other Americans, and the problem extended beyond energy

to include the economic development of all resources. Philip Reno's insightful and well documented study examines the history of Navajo economic development both before and after the 1972 Navajo Ten Year Plan. Reno begins with the history of Native American economic development, indicating the resemblance of economic difficulties experienced by reservations to those of the Third World. In a nutshell:

With poor nations, Indians share the problems arising from a "dual economy." On one side, their natural resources are extracted by giant outside corporations—"multinationals." These extractive operations are highly technological, and ore and other raw materials are shipped from producing countries to industrialized societies for transformation and the greater part of final consumption. The other side of the dual economy in Indian societies is usually traditional agriculture, livestock, and handicrafts. Lacking both additional land and advanced technology, such an economy is caught in the "Malthusian pinchers"—an increasing population pressing against a fixed limit of food and other means of livelihood(p. 2).

Reno proceeds to outline the differing development options perceived by Navajos as a developing nation, and by the technologically developed nation within which Navajo land is embedded. He documents the economic history of the tribe from pre-Columbian times, through the introduction of sheep and horses by the Spanish and the concomitant incorporation of Pueblo skills into Navajo tradition, to the Navajo's most recent economic role as an "internal colony" of the United States. Differing aspects of Navajo land tenure in on-and-off reservation areas are examined in relation to the trusteeship role historically played by the federal government in Native American land and resource management. He also considers the conflicting demands placed upon the Bureau of Indian Affairs to represent both Native American economic interests and the policies of the U.S. Department of the Interior.

Chapters 3 through 6 are devoted to "non-energy" Navajo resources: livestock, water, agriculture, and forestry. Livestock grazing is at the heart of what has become Navajo tradition over the past four hundred years, and Reno sees Navajo lifeways as "compelling factors for retention of the livestock economy.

Upgrading the productivity and incomes of Navajo families engaged in grazing is, in fact, a central part of the Ten Year Plan, and Navajo land-use planning is beginning to give practical meaning to the Indian land use ethic." However, Reno also observes: "The Navajo experience, like that of tribesmen in the wide stretches of Africa, Asia, and Latin America, leaves little doubt that a land ethic cannot by itself save the land from the demands of a growing population on a fixed land and technological base" (p. 45).

The "fixed land base" is limited by more than simple geographical boundaries: water is, and always has been, a dominant concern of both Indians and non-Indians in the American Southwest, especially in the realm of irrigated agriculture. In fact, development of the Navajo Indian San Juan/Chama Irrigation Project "is the Tribe's number one priority for economic development. The project will be one of the largest irrigated agricultural units in the United States and the largest enterprise ever for an Indian tribe" (p. 70). But non-traditional Navajo agrobusiness is tied to traditional grazing, and nearly 45% of the 217,000 irrigated acres will be devoted to livestock grazing, together with range improvement and soil conservation demonstrations.

Irrigated agriculture may be the successful Navajo enterprise of the future, but forestry—Navajo Forest Products Industries, created in the late 1950s—is the successful enterprise of the present. Reno's chapter on forestry and NFPI, one of the few tribal enterprises to "make it on its own," is a major achievement; it not only summarizes the situation well, but makes insightful recommendations for further improvement of an industry that had "produced more income and job opportunities for Indians than any other resource" until the energy crisis. The forms of economic development which have made the Navajo so visible over the last ten years do not involve the renewable resources whose development is controlled largely by the Navajo, but the non-renewable energy resources whose development rights have been leased to others. These—coal, oil, and uranium—are described in chapters 7 through 10. Reno indicates how energy and mineral resource leases were initially negotiated by the BIA at ridiculously low rates of return to Indians, who may have under their lands up to a third of the low-sulfur stippable coal and half the uranium reserves of the Western United States. Reno says that for the Navajo:

The issue is simple enough—the Tribe is not getting a fair return on its energy resource leases. . . . The sovereignty of Indian tribes is obviously different legally than that of sovereign nations, but tribes have found grounds for the cancellation of contracts and have talked of “nationalizing foreign operations” on their land (pp. 116, 120).

The majority society profits from this policy because its energy profligacy can continue. A few Indians have also benefited. Some Navajos have obtained relatively well-paying jobs in the mines. They live better, but their improved standard of living has widened the gaps in the “dual economy.” This form of affluence is temporary at best and will last only until the non-renewable resources give out or their extraction is no longer economically profitable.

Who pays? Strip mining companies involved in coal extraction are required by federal and state laws

to restore the land to its condition before mining, or a reasonable approximation. [However], no such provisions have been made in contracts or legislation for restoring “strip-mined people,” people uprooted like the land. . . , there is no program to restore them to a useful role in life (p. 122).

Uranium mining has demanded even greater payments:

The companies which produced the uranium and the government agency which bought and used it “externalized” the environmental and human costs of their operations. . . . These well-heeled operations passed on to others various costs resulting from their production of uranium. They passed on to Navajo miners and their families the costs of loss of health and life. United States taxpayers paid the cost of PHS [Public Health Service, i.e. U.S.] treatment of the miners and of welfare for the families of those who died or were disabled (p. 135).

Reno indicates that Navajo energy resources are non-renewable in *two* ways: Their physical supply is exhaustible over a relatively short time period and royalties from depleted tribal resources have largely been expended, rather than being invested in productive enterprise. Reno quotes Lorraine Ruffing’s reference to this as “economic cannibalism,” the Navajo Nation lit-

erally consuming its capital. In the language of economic "multipliers" there is a "trading post mentality" to all of this. Royalties have been increased and more favorable terms negotiated, but a dollar produced on the reservation leaves almost immediately, with little or no internal circulation. In an Anglo-dominated economy, this is a fatal flaw.

The final chapter of *Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development* is devoted to planning. The need for resource inventories, economic analyses, and comprehensive planning is stressed, and the concept of "Gross Navajo Product" is introduced. Minerals policy and land-use planning are given special attention. In the concluding pages, Reno devotes special attention to the relation of what is transpiring in Navajo Land to the global situation of indigenous people:

The Navajo are part of the world paradox: their energy resources provide heat, air conditioning, and light for a string of cities from Albuquerque to Los Angeles, while many Navajos cook over wood fires, and have neither electricity nor running water in their homes (pp. 153-4).

Reno's book is a major and important work. It has only two possible flaws. First, the book bends over backwards to present a "balanced" view of the Navajo resource situation. From the point of view of Native American activists, it may seem almost too objective. But Reno is no polemicist. He presents the data in the dispassionate manner of a good social scientist. Then, in the manner of a good journalist, he reserves his commentaries for the editorial pages, which are the concluding sections of the several chapters. Some will feel that the exploitative situation of the recent past justifies more outrage. But outrage is not the final point of the book.

The second issue relates to economic alternatives. Reno presents insightful suggestions along with well researched data, especially in the case of forestry; his first chapter indicates his sensitivity to Navajo culture and his concluding chapter his awareness of the importance of planning. But, the economic alternatives and planning mechanisms he proposes are largely within the "mainstream." With the exception of grazing, alternatives potentially closer to the Navajo way are given fairly scant attention; "cooperatives," for example, are allotted just five lines on page 44.

If the above are flaws, however, they do not detract in large measure from the significance of the work. With over 200 references and at least an equivalent number of footnotes, no hard-core academic can fault Philip Reno on his scholarship. Further, the book is well-organized and exceptionally readable.

David Stea
University of California, Los Angeles

This Song Remembers. Self Portraits of Native Americans in the Arts. Jane B. Katz, Ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1980. 207 pp. \$8.95 cloth

The story of American Indian art has undergone many examinations, in general, paralleling the telling epics of Native North American people. We have read and heard judgments and observations which ignored or denigrated its artistic worth; have seen its classifications as mere ethnographic artifacts; and have shared, at times, the urgent concern over the purity of "real" Indian art vs. "reckless" experimentation in the manner of 20th century mainstream art.

That Indian art has finally "arrived" is certainly a commonplace by now. The museum shows, gallery exhibits and shelves, university syllabi, library holdings, school inclusions of Indian arts, the market place with its investment mentality, and ultimately the kitsch/trinket shops lend clear evidence to the entry of Indian art into American awareness. The permanence of such visibility is uncertain, to be sure.

Among the issues to attract the attention of those seriously concerned with Indian aesthetics, we find questions of art vs. crafts, sexual division in media and design, anonymity of the artists, design composition and diffusion, the place of ritual and prayer in the creation of tribal art objects, continuity and innovation, caucasian influence on tribal traditions, and many others regarding the content, form, social function and market value of traditional and contemporary Native American art.

One of these pervasive themes in Indian art—and it applies to the culture in general—is the drift from imagining the Native artist as an anonymous, faceless artisan to seeing him emerge as a distinctly individual creative person. It is in this regard that