Title
From Fantasy to Traditional Planning [Forum]

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5g6069vc

Journal
Places, 12(1)

ISSN
0731-0455

Author
Dunlop, Beth

Publication Date
1998-10-01

Peer reviewed
Beth Dunlop

From Fantasy to Traditional Planning

Florida has always been a place where fantasies are turned into architectural realities, at least since the 1880s, when railroad tycoons Henry Flagler and Henry Plant began to build hotels for the tourists they were luring on their trains. In St. Augustine, Flagler built rides to the Spanish Renaissance in Tampa. Plant erected a great Moorish pile topped with minarets.

As time passed, the fantasies that shaped Florida became more palatable—Mediterranean and Mediterranean neighborhoods or eccentric roadside attractions, for example—and sometimes even converged easily with reality. That is, in one way, the case at Florida Southern College in Lakeland, which houses the largest single-congregation of Frank Lloyd Wright buildings anywhere in a campus designed as an island to the sun. Wright’s delicate stucco buildings, trimmed with copper and stained-glass fragments, were set amid a grove of oaks, though today the cypress trees are all but gone and the buildings suffer from years of collegiate wear and tear.

The era following World War II, a period of rapid growth, became less fanciful. Yet Florida was not to relinquish its role as a fabricator of architectural illusions, a role taken up by Disneyland and the many theme parks that followed. Today, the Disney Company, under chairman Michael Eisner, is known as one of the world’s foremost patrons of architecture, and Disneyworld is where many of the company’s most interesting buildings have been constructed. Most recently, Disney has branched out into what is best described as New Urbanism in constructing a new town adjacent to its theme parks.

New urbanism has become one of the most important areas of architectural inquiry and practice. Many designers and theorists believe the New Urbanism, the movement that has spawned the revival of traditional town planning, is perhaps the most compelling and popular movement in American architecture in many decades. The earliest New urbanists garnered critical attention and popular admiration, but with Celebration it all seemed to gel. Celebration is not only bucolic by the panache of Disney and the marketability of the Orlando area but also a serious attempt to grapple with ideas about the nature and future of neighborhood, community and town planning.

Celebration encompasses 10,000 acres, with building allowed on only half of that, the rest is protected wetland. The town eventually will have 8,000 houses arranged in compact neighborhoods that revolve around a lakeside downtown. There is a golf course, swimming pool, tennis courts and a sequence of small neighborhood parks.

The plan was created by Robert A. M. Stern, FAIA, and Stephen Robertson, FAIA, after a series of charrettes that included other architects; an important early session included the terms of Duany and Plater-Zyberk and GoodForm, Inc. as participants.

Stern and Robertson’s plan reflects a number of philosophical and pragmatic ideas about American town planning, from the sequence of spaces to role of the back yard. It is not, Stern and Robertson said, an “ideological plan,” but one based on observation and historical knowledge.

They sought precedents in a wide range of pre-World War II small towns. One key model was the fashionable Long Island town of East Hampton, from which they derived such ideas as raising the public golf course as a major green edge or pulling the parking into interior courts behind downtown buildings.
Southern towns and cities also provided prototypes for Celebration’s architecture. The residential architecture is derived from six basic historic styles—defined as classical, Victorian, Colonial Revival, “coastal,” (a meshing of French Colonial and Low Country architectural traditions), Mediterranean and French. A pattern book created by Urban Design Associates governs the design of houses, showing what elements are appropriate to which style. The result in Celebration is sometimes homogeneity and sometimes startling contrasts.

The downtown is intended to be an old-fashioned town center, with commercial, office and residential uses. The most important buildings were designed by an array of prominent architects who were asked to produce symbolic civic structures that do stand out a bit, but not too much. Starn and Robertson designed all the other downtown buildings as “background,” basing them on a variety of historic precedents but typical of commercial buildings.

The Celebration School is one example of the symbolic civic structures that serve as landmarks in the town; it combines a school and a teaching academy and is intended to be a “model” school with numerous teaching and learning innovations. The school is just a block away from the town center, which gives it a powerful civic presence. Architect William Rawn, FAIA, took that mandate seriously, choosing to design a school that both “respects its community—and earns[es] the respect of its community.”

To find architectural precedents, Rawn traveled to nearby Florida towns and cities, looking for examples of schools that, by their design, had significant presence. He found several, including a public elementary school in the small town of Mt. Dora and a parochial school in downtown Orlando. The Celebration school was designed to have strong street edges, and to be just imposing enough to be memorable.

In its architecture and location, the Celebration School looks back to the role educational institutions played in towns in the years before centralized county districts and mega-schools began to dominate. The interior, however, looks forward with classroom “neighborhoods” that allow for small student groupings and teaching flexibility. The school is also tightly linked to the community by the use of technology that allows parents, teachers and students to talk to one another at almost any time.

The Celebration Pattern Book process has been affectionately termed a “Yield Potato Head” approach to the housing styles in the town. It is a hefty, handsome volume based on similar books created for builders and craftsmen in the early twentieth century. It delineates the basic elements of “the Celebration house”—front facade, back yard, side wings, porches—spelling out what is allowable within the six architectural styles and four housing types permitted in the town’s first phase. The pattern book is a kit of parts, with numerous potential combinations of roof types, finish materials, windows...
There is also a layer of design review. Control is kept over paint colors, renovations and even the placement of screened porches and pool enclosures. Design review, however, is a more intuitive process, a layer after the pattern book's work is done. Former Celebration official Joseph Barnes, AIA, points out that design review is as much an art as a science, saying that even though he might not be able to say what makes good music he knows it when he hears it.

One idea that became important in Celebration's planning and design was cross-breeding. The town reflects aspects of numerous others, the architecture is drawn from these particular American styles that in turn have melded together a number of European precedents in a way that it is possible to trace the ancestry but find no prototypes. Robertson termed the process one of editing and selection of town settings that were both successful and emblematic of small town life. Even the downtown Celebration buildings, though the products of parasitic architects, are not flamboyant but modeled in scale and outlook, part of a larger context and good citizens of the town.

One important aspect of the towns created under the premisses of rectitudinal planning is the mixing of incomes and ages, as well as of combining land uses: apartments above stores, townhouses adjacent to the school, commercial centers within neighborhoods—all of which really relate one to the other.

At Celebration, this was executed with care. Apartments sit above shops and offices in downtown Celebration, and rent rapidly. Smaller, more affordable houses sit adjacent to larger, more expensive ones; though Celebration is at the top end of the housing costs in its category, its housing stock at what might be considered middle market. Too, it is attracting older couples and senior citizens along with the more typical young families.

Giuntini believes that it is one of the true "breakthroughs of Celebration, the breaking of some of these developer taboos." That it has worked so well in developer language means sold so well at Celebration, offers a precedent for other towns and developments across the country.

Beth DuBose, an architecture critic living in Miami, is the author of Building a Dream. The Art of Disney Architecture, Miami Trends and Traditions, Architecture and Florida's Vanishing Architecture, as well as numerous other publications.