### **UCLA**

# **American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

#### **Title**

Alternative Contact: Indigeneity, Globalism, and American Studies. Edited by Paul Lai and Lindsey Claire Smith.

#### **Permalink**

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5gg892kg

### **Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal, 37(1)

#### ISSN

0161-6463

#### **Author**

Jacobsen, Kristina M.

#### **Publication Date**

2013

#### DOI

10.17953

# **Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <a href="https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/">https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/</a>

overall interactions between market forces and the ecology of the northern Great Plains.

Hedren capably synthesizes a number of primary and secondary sources from the United States and Canada, but he minimizes or ignores certain historical issues. The author questions interpretations that characterize the transformation of the northern Great Plains from the homeland of the Sioux into a center of economic development as an example of colonialism, acknowledging that these scholars raise intriguing points, but ultimately questioning the applicability of the concept as it implies the existence of a premeditated plan to dispossess the Sioux. Hedren's identification of colonialism as a monolithic and homogenous concept neglects the works of scholars such as Frederick Cooper, Ann Stoler, and Laura Briggs, who have demonstrated that colonialism was far from a unidirectional or simplistic relationship between colonizers and the colonized. Colonialism serves a useful means of understanding the transformation of the northern Great Plains by acknowledging the diverse ways in which Euro-Americans tried to reshape Sioux Country and the ways in which Native peoples contested and challenged these efforts. Hedren also overlooks scholarship by Raymond DeMallie and Dee Brown that questions claims by the United States Army about the violent nature of the Lakota ghost dancers. Nevertheless, Hedren employs an engaging narrative style that renders After Custer readily accessible to general audiences, and his cogent overview of the transformation of the Great Plains would make this book a useful text for undergraduate courses focused on the American West or nineteenth-century United States history.

Robert D. Miller San Diego Mesa College

Alternative Contact: Indigeneity, Globalism, and American Studies. Edited by Paul Lai and Lindsey Claire Smith. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011. 400 pages. \$30.00 paper.

Originally published in the September 2010 issue of American Quarterly, the fifteen papers and introduction of Alternative Contact focus on the new "indigenous turn" in American studies, adding to a cadre of texts that aims to broaden our understandings of contemporary indigenous life and politics. Using settler colonialism as a framework for understanding relations between indigenous peoples/nations and the first-world nation-states that surround them, contributors advocate for a more critical ethnic studies which specifically examines the intersections of indigeneity, nation, and imperialism. Exploring sometimes

Reviews 161

overlooked connections between Native American, indigenous studies, and American Studies, Alternative Contact seeks to decenter "Indigenous contact with Anglo-America" (3) by examining how a global politics of indigeneity intersects with US imperialism in new and innovative ways. This contact includes interactions between indigenous peoples and various colonial subjects such as migrants, refugees, and other racialized groups in the Pacific Islands, Asia, and the Americas. With three sections titled "Spaces of the Pacific," "Unexpected' Indigenous Modernity," and "Nation and Nation-State," the anthology features indigenous and non-indigenous scholars in a wide variety of disciplines who present case studies in sites as diverse as Mexico, American Sāmoa, New Zealand, the Philippines, Japan and China.

Alternative Contact strives to balance an emphasis on the cultural and political distinctiveness of indigenous peoples while foregrounding the commonality of their shared struggle vis-à-vis colonialism. For example, using the controversial Arizona laws SB 1070 and HB 2281 as case studies, Lai and Smith draw attention to the complete absence of indigenous peoples of Mexico/Central America in current discussions of US-Mexico migration. They also contrast the invisibility of Mexico's indigenous peoples against the relative visibility of southwestern US tribes such as the Tohono O'odham Nation in this heated border debate. Other contributors distinguish nations from nation-states in the indigenous context (Andrea Smith), critique the joining of Pacific Islanders with Asian Americans in the term "Asian Pacific Islander" (Judy Rohrer), and question using indigeneity as a global concept (Alice Te Ponga Somerville). Somerville, for example, suggests use of the term "Fourth World" to more accurately reflect the political reality of indigenous minority peoples who "have been forced to compete for indigenous status with European settlers and their descendants" (17). The authors broaden our understandings of who is indigenous and under what circumstances and through what means claims to indigeneity are made strategically. These examinations of indigeneity in "unexpected places" take into consideration global indigenous-indigenous connections, indigenous-evangelical intersections, and those indigenous peoples who identify as "cowboys" rather than as "Indians,"

In "Attacking Trust: Hawai'i as a Crossroads and Kamehameha Schools in the Crosshairs," Judy Rohrer examines the recent trend toward "reductive racialization" of Kanaka Maoli (native Hawaiian) identity (37). After the 2000 Supreme Court civil rights case *Rice. v. Cayetano*, haole (white) residents of Hawai'i brought private lawsuits against indigenous Hawaiian language and culture-focused institutions such as Kamehameha Schools, accusing Kamehameha Schools of racial discrimination based on their exclusive admission policies. Because Kanaka Maoli indigeneity is not being read as ancestry or genealogy, but as "race," haole residents of Hawai'i can insist on their children's

"right" to enroll in Kamehameha and, in the process, "dehistoricize and distort Kanaka Maoli struggles" by diminishing the unique sovereign political status of Kanaka Maoli in Hawai'i (32). In some cases non-Hawaiians claim they are "more Hawaiian" than their indigenous Hawaiian counterparts, since as long-time residents of Hawai'i they have knowledge of "authentic" Hawaiian cultural practices such as enacting the hula and are able to express the "true spirit of Aloha." Rohrer argues that these legal battles exemplify how cultural appropriation and playing Indian "claim Hawaiianness for non-Hawaiians" (41–43).

Alice Te Punga Somerville's "Maori Cowboys, Maori Indians" employs an analysis of Western films as depicted in the short stories of Maori author Witi Ihimaera to address the relationship between Aotearoa (New Zealand) Maori and indigenous communities in North America. Examining two young Maori boys' identification with the "cowboy" and dis-identification with the "Indians" of cowboy-and-Indian films, Somerville argues that the categories of "Indian" and "cowboy" are not mutually exclusive and that "'Indians' can indeed become cowboys under certain circumstances" (266). Given the long history of North American and Maori participation in rodeo and country music, disidentifying with American Indians in a film should not necessarily be seen as a simple case of internal colonialism and racial self-hatred, although it can also be that (277). Rather, Maori-American Indian connections might be read as more localized, nuanced articulations of indigeneity as mediated by the film industry, US military occupation, and US global hegemony in New Zealand. Thus, indigenous-indigenous connections, such as that between Maoris and American Indians, represent "a historicized matrix of self-recognition, mutual recognition, and misrecognition" that ultimately allows readers and viewers a more accurate understanding of indigenous modernity (258).

Questioning the assumption that being Christian makes one less Native, Andrea Smith employs a method she calls "intellectual ethnography" to show how both evangelicals in the church and indigenous intellectuals in the academy can both have a vested interest in decolonizing methodologies. "Decolonization in Unexpected Places: Native Evangelicalism and the Rearticulation of Mission" examines the surprising ways in which evangelical Christianity and methodologies of indigenous decolonization (such as that put forth by Waziwatawin Angela Wilson) sometimes overlap and form unique alliances. Insisting that Native peoples are producers, shapers, and theorizers of religious discourse, not just objects of study, Smith examines the "double anomaly" of being a Native Christian today (173). She uses extensive interviews with Native evangelicals and attendees of the 2007 Native American Institute of Indigenous Theological Studies to show how Native Christians sometimes disarticulate Christianity from the colonial process and missionization from Jesus' message of love, tolerance, and self-acceptance. She notes that "to build the political power necessary

Reviews 163

to effectively decolonize indigenous nations, and indeed the world, our political imperative is not to foreclose possible alliances with Native peoples who seem to be assimilationist or conservative, but to identify possible nodal points of connection that can lead to global transformation" (181).

The breadth of this book and its interdisciplinary reach is extensive and impressive. With the volume's greatest strength being its focus on Asian/Pacific Islander/Native North American points of alternative connection and slippage, contributors do an excellent job of exploring alternative connections between "different non-European peoples outside the organizing schemas of Western modernity and globalization" (26). However, although the book claims to join theoretical with practical and ethical concerns (25), the volume is heavily weighted toward the theoretical, especially literary and film criticism. Overall, this book is highly recommended as a helpful theorization of ways to think about indigeneity in a broader cultural, political, and international context. In exploring contact zones, the book convincingly demonstrates not only the centrality of Native American and indigenous studies within an American studies framework, but also how indigenous studies can be analytically useful for ethnic and American studies, and vice versa.

Kristina M. Jacobsen Duke University

America's Hundred Years' War: U.S. Expansion to the Gulf Coast and the Fate of the Seminole, 1763–1858. Edited by William S. Belko. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2011. 320 pages. \$65.00 cloth.

William S. Belko, an associate professor of history at the University of West Florida, is both the editor and one of the contributors to this essay collection. Based upon secondary sources, the book deals much with the expansion of the American empire to the Gulf Coast, with the subtitle, "U.S. Expansion to the Gulf Coast and the Fate of the Seminole, 1763–1858," bracketing the hundred-year period examined. With regard to the Seminoles, however, strictly speaking there is not much light cast on their "fate" other than what is generally already known. The Seminoles fought a guerrilla war in America's longest conflict; they avoided much direct confrontation but retreated to safe familiar grounds and attacked at opportune moments. The Seminole resistance inflicted considerable damage to the empire builders, provides a unique example of early guerrilla warfare in the United States, and demonstrates their ability to live on whatever resources could be found. Further, the capture of Osceola and the deceptive use of a flag of truce casts another dark shadow