

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Plains Indian Photographs of Edward S. Curtis. Edited by the University of Nebraska Press.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5hx2d4jb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 25(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Harris, Alexandra N.

Publication Date

2001-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

William Powers gives an excellent summary and useful description of contemporary Lakota spirituality in his essay. He details the seven sacred ceremonies given the Lakota by White Buffalo Calf Pipe Woman, whom some say was the manifestation of Wohpe or Falling Star. He also references the annual winter ride that today commemorates the 1890 Wounded Knee massacre, "Wiping the Tears."

Trudy Griffin-Pierce's contribution on Navajo religion is a beautiful piece. She gives a detailed description of the Navajo worldview, the Diyin Dine'e, or holy people, and the chantways to treat illness and restore health and balance in all its many manifestations. Her explanation of the Mother Earth-Father Sky duality in Navajo religious thought is also excellent.

In the essay on "contemporary Mescalero Apache ceremonialism," Ines Talamantez analyzes the Apache puberty ceremony, Isanaklesh Gotal, for Apache girls. The creation story of a divine Apache deity, Isanaklesh, explains every detail of the contemporary ceremony. Talamantez contends that the ceremony "functions as the most significant factor in preserving traditional Apache values and giving them meaning in present-day Apache life" (p. 155).

The grace of Richard Dauenhauer's contribution is that it surveys Tlingit religion in three parts: "the pre-contact period, major post-contact religious influences, and some contemporary interactions of the two" (p. 161).

Ann Fienup-Riordan describes the traditional spiritual culture of the Yup'ik Eskimos. The weakness of this essay, however, is its lack of contemporary perspective. Her contribution is in the tradition of the ethnographies presented in mainstream anthropological writing of the past.

I enjoyed reading the essay by Franco Meli on how the sacred is portrayed in Indian literature, although it is a rather strange fit for an anthropological collection. On the other hand, it is perfectly appropriate for the American Indian studies.

Conclusion? Not the most exciting work from a Native American studies perspective, but something the student of Indian spirituality would want to take a look at, if nothing more than for several of the more innovative and substantive articles it contains.

Steve Talbot

Oregon State University

The Plains Indian Photographs of Edward S. Curtis. Edited by the University of Nebraska Press. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 2001. 186 pages. \$50.00 cloth.

With few rare exceptions, scholarly consideration of Edward S. Curtis's photographs have almost exclusively discussed his work in its entirety—the epic multitribal, twenty-volume form entitled *The North American Indian*, published from 1907 to 1930. Because of this tendency to generalize across Native North America, a volume examining Curtis's relationship with indigenous people of a specific culture area is a welcome divergence from the routine. This book

features an introduction and three essays based on a symposium and photographic exhibition involving the photographer's images of Plains people.

Although the focus on a distinct group is well appreciated, the book's emphasis on this particular culture area is potentially problematic. As Martha H. Kennedy admits in her introduction, this area "has broad appeal and significance because of a widespread tendency to regard Plains Indians as representative . . . of all American Indians" (p. 1). The purpose of the book is to explore one region in depth to draw conclusions "about the meanings and intentions behind the entire project" (p. 1). However, this presumption and resulting generalizations only reinforce the notion that Plains people are "emblematic" of all other Native American peoples, a notion that Curtis himself sought to disprove. In the most notable of the generalized observations, Duane Niatum was injudicious in claiming that Curtis "waited patiently," unlike other photographers of his time, to be invited into the ceremonies (p. 75). Christopher Lyman's account of the staged Navajo Yebechai ceremony, recounted in his book *The Vanishing Race and Other Illusions* (1982), contests this indiscriminate claim, whether or not it was true in the Plains.

The actual stated goal of the book is to emphasize the cultural diversity Curtis discovered on the Plains. The volume's brief written length, only eighty pages, is coupled with the substantial background details that the authors felt necessary to understand fully the social and historical context in which Curtis lived. This amount of peripheral information limits the depth to which the cultural diversity of the Plains is explored. Contrary to what one might expect in an examination of a particular cultural group of Curtis's work, no contrast was made between images of the Plains and those of other areas. Rather than emphasizing the uniqueness or exploring the internal diversity of the Plains, the approach mostly served to make general comments on Curtis's work, using the Plains images as examples. Due to the deficiency of detail specific to the relationship between Curtis and his subjects on the Plains, this volume serves only as a preface to a potentially larger exploration of Curtis's Plains Indian photographs that reaches beyond a commercial audience.

Regardless of the limitations, the three essays present ideas that are essential in understanding and interpreting Curtis's work. Martha A. Sandweiss has previously published several works concerning photography of the West. In this volume, she provides a detailed account of the ideological and commercial motivations of early photographers in her essay, "Picturing Indians: Curtis in Context." Although Kennedy offers some historical background in her introduction, Sandweiss analyzes thoroughly the "vanishing race" aesthetic that permeates Curtis's composition. This social backdrop is integral to understanding the impact of photographers who studied Indians. Yet this assessment of historic photography leaves little space for its application to Curtis's Plains photographs.

However, Sandweiss does touch very briefly on an immensely important concept: Native people's use of photographs "for their own purposes" (p. 33). The concept of Native people imposing their own contexts onto old images continues to inspire a growing number of studies and projects, including Lucy Lippard's *Partial Recall* (1992) and editor Jane Alison's *Native Nations*:

Journeys in American Photography. Other projects examine direct relationships between images and the Native communities, including Hartman H. Lomawaima's present work using Curtis's images at his native Hopi villages, as well as Alexandra Harris's recent master's-thesis study with the Pueblo of Laguna (University of California Los Angeles, 2001).

Sandweiss's essay provides a historical foundation for Mick Gidley's "Ways of Seeing the Curtis Project on the Plains." Gidley is the only one of the three authors who deals directly and comprehensively with Curtis's Plains images. Gidley discusses Curtis's methods of photographing tribal diversity through distinguishing "types," describes contextual anecdotes relating to various images, and addresses Curtis's selective inclusion of information in the finished volumes.

Most importantly, Gidley emphasizes the "collective" nature of *The North American Indian* project. Rather than simply a man with a "vision," Curtis had a constant team of men who collected ethnographic information, participated in darkroom work, and kept journals about the trips to the Plains. Gidley's essay successfully illustrates how each player—be it photographer, assistant, or indigenous subject—approached and understood the project. By exploring these varying interpretations, Gidley cautions the reader not to consider the Curtis project as exclusively romantic and contrived, as other authors have previously claimed. Yet, he claims, Curtis's work is not an accurate ethnographic record of Native peoples. Rather, Gidley develops his interpretation based on the source of the contextual information in each photograph.

Duane Niatum's essay, "The Aesthetic Impulse of Edward S. Curtis' Images of the Great Plains Indians," seems at first to be solely directed at praising Curtis's "vision" and the beauty of his photographs. Once the reader advances past the acclaim, Niatum examines the photographer's use of visual composition using selections from the Plains collection. Although an assessment of Curtis's technique is relevant and necessary in this venue, the content of this essay could have been added to Sandweiss's related article, leaving space free for a more contrasting argument. Niatum's essay easily overlaps with Sandweiss's discussion of nineteenth-century photographers' motivations toward American Indians. His discussion extends Sandweiss's by expanding on historical aesthetic approaches and would potentially connect her line of reasoning to Niatum's explication of specific Plains images. Unfortunately, this interrelation diminishes the importance of Niatum's discussion on aesthetics.

The concluding essay might be more relevant to a scholar of Curtis's photography had the author further addressed other questions and issues emergent in the artist's work. Curtis's artistic technique has been praised and criticized for many years; readers need a new perspective. How do the artist's Plains photographs compare with those of other tribes and those of other photographers on the Plains? Curtis was known to have used Native consultants such as Upshaw (Crow) and Richard Throssel (a Cree living on the Crow Reservation)—what motivations did these men have to carry on ethnographic or pictorial work once Curtis left the area? How do Native American photographers today feel about Curtis's photographs? Many more questions come to mind that are not answered by the essays in this book.

The concern for space has limited the depth of the authors' explorations of Curtis's images. As it is, the book focuses less on Curtis's images of the Plains and more on the aesthetics and motivations of Western photographers. While Sandweiss and Niatum provide essential background material, Gidley's essay most impressively investigates the collective effort that is *The North American Indian*. Most importantly, Gidley's examination of the different "ways of seeing" Curtis's work ultimately includes "the perspectives of the subjects of the project" (p. 50). Rarely has an author apprised both sides of the photographic relationship, given the lack of early writings by Native subjects regarding the exchange. In a recently released documentary, film director and producer Anne Makepeace touches on this exchange and has integrated Curtis's life story with reactions from the Native people he photographed or their closest descendants. By doing this she illustrates the interaction between the controversial photographer and his subjects. Her documentary film, *Coming to Light: Edward S. Curtis and the North American Indians* (2000), is an excellent retrospect on the life of Edward Curtis and, at the same time, gives consideration to the individuals he photographed.

Despite the limitations of the book's intended examination of Curtis's Plains images, the work introduces key issues in the study of nineteenth and early-twentieth century photography of Native American peoples. The essays also provide an extensive bibliography for any scholar of Curtis's work, as well as for historians of American photography. This is especially true of Gidley's sources, as he uses many unpublished and uncollected materials. While this volume is merely groundwork for a deeper study of Curtis's photogravures and how they relate to Native culture areas, the authors address significant issues relating to how we examine and reexamine photography of Native American peoples.

Alexandra N. Harris

University of California, Los Angeles

Religion, Law, and the Land: Native Americans and the Judicial Interpretation of Sacred Land. By Brian Edward Brown. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1999. 199 pages. \$59.95 cloth.

When the Bush Administration released its National Energy Policy in May 2001, a policy broadly designed to expedite corporate extraction of nonrenewable natural resources by significantly easing environmental regulations that had only recently been installed to provide some safeguards for the environment, indigenous peoples, concerned private citizens, environmentalists, and other activists organizations were put on notice that Bush's mantra of "compassionate conservatism" did not include any "compassion," much less actual "conservation," for the natural world.

Of course, the majority of Americans that did not vote for Bush, and most of those who did cast their ballots for him, already knew this. Bush's environmental record was one of the most important issues in the election, and with