

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Chiricahua Apache Enduring Power: Naiche's Puberty Ceremony Paintings. By Trudy Griffin-Pierc.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5nm6z6p2>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Greenfeld, Philip J.

Publication Date

2010

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

might have taken, if any, to prevent the spread of fire to trees. Lightfoot and Parrish add perspective to this question in their explanation of small, frequent, low-severity surface fires that would burn floor debris, grasses, and shrubs but minimize damage to the overstory (100).

Anthropology students and cultural-resource specialists interested and/or working in California should gain considerably from Lightfoot and Parrish's book. Although it offers a summary of California Indian culture found in other texts, its importance lies in the model of fire management. Basically, the model suggests that inhabitants actively worked to enhance the diversity and productivity of economically important plant and animal resources. Using a rotational system of prescribed burns, they created a patchwork of heterogeneous habitats containing plants of different stages of succession (36, 111).

Resource specialists who periodically find themselves excavating prehistoric sites in various parts of the state can and should apply some of the lessons brought forward in this new book: that is, a research perspective that Native life was not always a rosy picture of abundant acorns and deer; thus one might expect to find more diversity and persistence of varied plant remains in deposits (for example, Wolgemeuth [2004], which lends credence to the notion of Native Californians as fire managers). The authors have also demonstrated how combining research from multiple disciplines—ecology, ethnography, ethnohistory, and archaeology/paleoecology—has its advantages, a fact that students and practitioners easily should ascertain from the book.

Finally, *California Indians and Their Environment: An Introduction* definitely opens doors to understanding some of the dynamics that challenge decision makers in our society today. For example, the use of prescribed burning and effects of global warming are problematical areas for government; however, they are issues that Native Californians and their prehistoric predecessors certainly experienced through time. The authors offer further insight regarding the potential benefits of introducing some vestiges of Native habitats within contemporary farms, an alternative to modern industrial agribusinesses (148). Clearly, this new book articulates a fresh viewpoint that explains why studying California Indians and their unique roles as fire managers was and still is important.

James Gary Maniery

Par Environmental Services

Chiricahua Apache Enduring Power: Naiche's Puberty Ceremony Paintings.

By Trudy Griffin-Pierce with a foreword by J. Jefferson Reid. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2006. 185 pages. \$75.00 cloth; \$32.95 paper.

This is a unique and amply illustrated little book combining personal quest, ethnographic expertise, artistic expertise, and historical background. *Chiricahua Apache Enduring Power* is theoretically informed in terms of contemporary anthropological views with a focus on agency, landscapes, resistance,

art history, and personal experience in an attempt to describe and reconstruct the Chiricahua Apache experience as prisoners of war after the surrender of Geronimo in 1886. What is particularly fresh in this book is the description and analysis of Cochise's younger son Naiche's hide paintings of the Chiricahua Apache girl's puberty ceremony, a ceremony that has continued as a primary feature of Apache identity in the contemporary era.

The project began when Griffin-Pierce was asked to speak as an artist about the style and symbolism in Naiche's hide paintings of the Apache girl's puberty ceremony at a seminar bringing the Chiricahua Apache Prisoner of War Descendants to the University of Arizona and the Arizona State Museum. Naiche was the only Apache to represent this ceremony in paintings at the time he was incarcerated; most Apache artists focused on military exploits or courting scenes (xv). This is somewhat ironic in that the *gaan* or *gh2h4* along with the image of Changing Woman or White Painted Woman (*'isdzan naadleeshê*), the deity the pubescent girl manifests at the puberty ceremony, are two of the most prominent subjects of contemporary Apache art.

According to Griffin-Pierce, the primary theme of the book is the continued existence of a Chiricahua Apache cultural identity, in spite of the fact of their long captivity as prisoners of war (twenty-seven years) and their political merging with the Mescalero Apache tribe. She wants to make the Chiricahua experience come alive for the reader, and does this by personally visiting each scene of their captivity and describing these locations in detail in terms of her own experience (9).

One thing that has always interested me about the Chiricahuas is the fact that every other Apachean group in the Southwest has a reservation in or near the center of their nineteenth-century territory except the Chiricahuas; however, if you look on a map and trace major routes of westward migration by nineteenth-century Americans fulfilling their "manifest destiny," those routes go right through the middle of Chiricahua territory, while they go north or south of other Apachean territories. These routes are still visible on any contemporary road map as the interstate freeway system. Given that fact, it is not surprising that the Chiricahuas took the brunt of the American thirst for empire. The author notes that the Chiricahua Apache Prisoner of War Descendants organization is the contrastive reaction to government pressure; its existence demonstrates the opposite result of the assimilation desired by nineteenth-century empire builders. I contend that Chiricahua social formations with well-defined territorial divisions and what appears to be the strongest and most individually identifiable leadership class of all the Apachean societies reflect this reactive pressure not just after surrender but also throughout the contact situation during the nineteenth century and before.

The author rejects the view that the Chiricahuas were simply the unfortunate victims of an overwhelming American military; instead, she wants to consider them as rational decision makers who at various points weighed their options and made conscious decisions about their future. In terms of contemporary theory they expressed agency and resistance as James Scott has defined it (*Domination and the Arts of Resistance*, 1990).

The original inspiration for this book came out of a request to speak at a seminar about Naiche's hide paintings, and that is the subject of chapter 6, "The Chiricahua Apache Girl's Puberty Ceremony and Naiche's Hide Painting." However, in order to understand the context of these paintings Griffin-Pierce tries to experience the various places linked to the paintings as directly as possible. This means actually visiting all of those locations important to the Chiricahua prisoners of war. She began her quest in chapter 1, quite close to home (she lived in Tucson and taught at the University of Arizona), with a trip to the Cochise Stronghold and Fort Bowie, now a national historic site near Benson, Arizona. Part of the irony of Chiricahua history is the fact that national monuments, historic sites, and national forests with accompanying campgrounds now commemorate their past, but none of the Chiricahua descendants can actually live where their ancestors did.

In chapter 2 she continues her quest in St. Augustine, Florida, to Fort Marion where the Chiricahuas were first moved after the August 1886 surrender. She quotes frequently from Jason Betzinez's firsthand account, which recounts the bewilderment and betrayal that the noncombatant Chiricahuas felt when they were shipped along with Geronimo's band to the east.

In chapter 3 we follow her as she moves across Florida to Fort Pickens where the combatant Chiricahuas were incarcerated. She notes that a marked contrast exists between the heavy humid air in St. Augustine and the fresh ocean breezes that blow at Fort Pickens. Here she discusses the effect of exile upon the human spirit and the loss of consciousness of place that is so important to human existence. For Apaches in particular this link to the land is especially strong, as noted by Keith Basso's writings on Western Apache place names and their link to Apache values and sacred stories. This section is well informed by contemporary anthropological theory about the nature and importance of landscapes and concepts of place.

From Florida the Chiricahuas were moved to Mount Vernon Barracks in Alabama and so too did Griffin-Pierce in chapter 4. Here all the surviving prisoners were reunited except for five of the children who were sent to Carlisle Indian school where four of them died. All told, some one hundred Chiricahua children died from tuberculosis after being sent off to school (86). After the prisoners were moved from Mount Vernon, the federal government turned the site over to the state of Alabama, and it was converted to a mental hospital, which it apparently still is today. Mount Vernon was especially hard on the Chiricahuas. Its humidity and mosquitoes were worse than in Florida, and a large number of people died there.

It is also in this chapter that the author reviews the other institution that affected the Chiricahuas: Carlisle Indian Industrial School. Framing her discussion of Gramsci's ideas about schools and state control of the social order, she explains the importance of indoctrination in the next generation of Chiricahuas so that they will conform to the expectations of the nation of which they now, like it or not, are a part. Hair cutting, arbitrary naming (controlling an individual's identity), and wearing a uniform were all part of this process, which has been documented in any number of works about the Indian boarding school experience.

Chapter 5 chronicles the next stop on Griffin-Pierce's journey, Fort Sill, Oklahoma, where the Chiricahuas were moved in 1894 and would remain until 1913 and 1914 when they were given an opportunity to move to the Mescalero Reservation in New Mexico. Although he apparently had been drawing with crayons at Fort Pickens, this is where Naiche actually produced the hide paintings, the primary rationale for the book (141). The author, like the Chiricahuas, felt she was not truly at home in Oklahoma, but coyotes howling, open views, and mountains in the distance are certainly closer to the Southwest than the humid, mosquito-infested swamps of the Southeast. It was here that Naiche came in contact with Plains Indians, who have a well-documented history of recording events on hide. It also seems that various individuals had been encouraged by the director of Carlisle Indian school to make drawings in order to demonstrate their progress toward civilization. Griffin-Pierce interprets these drawings not as evidence of conformity but as "hidden transcripts" by using Scott's concept of underlying actions of resistance. They demonstrate resistance by re-creating it on paper (often ledger books) or hide in order to remind people of what they lost. Indian history had traditionally been oral or visually recounted, and these paintings were their history. Griffin-Pierce comments, "The survival of subgroups within society depends upon their ability to marshal compelling collective memories and to keep these alive" (132).

Griffin-Pierce's journey ends in chapter 6 with her return to the Southwest and the Mescalero Reservation. In this chapter she discusses the meaning of Naiche's artwork. Although Apaches are not noted for visual record keeping like Plains Indian groups, they have an artistic tradition, which is documented by Virginia and Harold Wayland and Alan Ferg in their book on hand-painted leather playing cards (*Playing Cards of the Apaches*, 2006), and, like their Navajo cousins, they used dry paintings to summon power during curing ceremonies. Griffin-Pierce believes that, like dry paintings, Naiche's hide paintings were intended to summon power. They feature the girl's puberty ceremony because it is the central ceremony of past Apache existence and is a ceremony that continues to have life today. It is a ceremony that was held even when they were fleeing the military. Naiche's paintings are thus a symbol of resistance and a prayer for power by people whose existence was severely threatened during this time period.

Let me add a personal note. I first read this book in 2007 when I was asked to be the outside reviewer for Dr. Griffin-Pierce's tenure decision at the University of Arizona. At that time I was very impressed both with this book and her overall record and recommended her for tenure/promotion, which subsequently was granted beginning in the fall of 2008. I happened to check the Arizona Web site last summer and to my surprise found that she had died in January. She left behind a work that she can be proud of, and I am pleased to have had the opportunity to write this review.

Philip J. Greenfeld
San Diego State University