

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Exiled in the Land of the Free: Democracy, Indian Nations, and the U.S. Constitution. Edited by Oren Lyons and John Mohawk.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5zc957gn>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Jacobs, Wilbur R.

Publication Date

1994

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Those who study and respect the power of the oral tradition and the ways of the Iroquois will find this volume an indispensable reference. My only wish is that the authors had indexed the work copiously, since that would have enhanced its value as a research and reference tool. For the more general reader, the text will continue to challenge our minds and our hearts, since it is also great philosophy and literature in its own right.

Donald A. Grinde, Jr.

California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo

Exiled in the Land of the Free: Democracy, Indian Nations, and the U.S. Constitution. Edited by Oren Lyons and John Mohawk. Santa Fe, New Mexico: Clear Light Publishers, 1992. 336 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

For the historical world of Indians and Indian-white relations, here is a splendid new book. The volume had its genesis in conferences between newspaper publisher Thomas E. Worrell, Jr., and Oren Lyons, professor of American studies at the State University of New York at Buffalo, on the topic of the U.S. Constitution and the American Indian. With the sponsorship of Thomas Worrell, financial assistance from the Five Rings Corporation, and the collaboration of John C. Mohawk and Oren Lyons, both of SUNY Buffalo, the book had its birth. The authors, a phalanx of able Native American scholars and non-Indian ethnohistorians, have come together to analyze the place of the American Indian in issues of sovereignty and democracy relating to the U.S. Constitution. The authors have gathered a mountain of evidence to question themes in the Eurocentric scholarship that for so long has dominated European imperial history and general American history. Oren Lyons (Onondaga Nation), John Mohawk (Seneca Nation), Vine Deloria (Standing Rock Sioux tribe), Donald A. Grinde, Lawrence M. Hauptman, Robert Venebles, Howard Berman, and Curtis G. Berkeley, give us a fascinating overview of historic and current issues on democracy, Indian sovereignty, the Constitution and Congressional power, and the roots of political theory. As Peter Matthiessen writes in an introduction, one of the most important arguments emerging in this fine book is the need to recognize the principle of Indian sovereignty, "since the American government has never permitted it to become an 'issue'" (p. xii).

In the first chapter, Lyons argues that English policies in Ireland reflected the rationalization that Irish and Indians must turn over their lands to the English, who could make better use of it. Another rationalization was that as non-Christians, Indians had no legal right to the land (p. 26). Citing Bartholome de Las Casas (the priest who accompanied the first Spanish conquerors), John Mohawk expands on the Eurocentric theme by pointing to the tradition of the "just war" that justified Spanish brutality. Mohawk also discusses images of the American Indian produced by American historians, such as the Reverend Charles A. Goodrich. The Reverend declared that Indians had no society, their language was so vacuous that they were unable to talk to each other, and that Indian men spent their lives brutalizing their women (p. 53).

Contributor Robert W. Venebles contends that it is time we recognize that Indians, as Gouverneur Morris said on 7 July 1787, during the Philadelphia Convention, had "liberty and life . . ." (p. 75). Indians were looked down upon partly because their expressions of sexuality were different from those accepted by Christians. Indians were characterized as "wild men"; echoes of the first encounters are evident as early as Shakespeare's *The Tempest*, in the character of Caliban, son of a "brave new world" (p. 89). Venebles also includes a trenchant discussion of Benjamin Franklin, who, in his writings, praised Indian methods of fighting, Indian modes of governance, Indian civility and morality, and the wonders of Indian corn (p. 105).

Perhaps the heart of this valuable book is the long, heavily documented chapter by Howard R. Berman dealing with evolving concepts of Indian sovereignty and international law between 1600 and 1776. Because the sources on the Six Nations Iroquois are voluminous, Berman is able to take us through a complex story of English, Dutch, French, and Anglo-American relations in some sixty pages (with an additional twenty six pages of footnotes). The theme that permeates this saga of war and peace between European imperial antagonists is that the Iroquois were never conquered; they said time and again that they were their own people. The Haudenosaunee (Iroquois) were not "vassals" of any European power, despite the pretentious claims of England and France (pp. 182-83).

Curtis Berkeley's discussion of United States-Indian relations, concentrating on constitutional issues, and Donald Grinde's penetrating analysis of Iroquois political theory stress the impact of the Six Nations upon emerging American concepts of

governance leading up to the Constitutional Convention. Although non-Indian Iroquois researchers have consistently ignored the impact of Indian people upon the growth of the American concepts of freedom and liberty, these two chapters offer strong evidence to refute their stand. Vine Deloria's eloquent treatise (chapter 7) on the application of the Constitution to American Indians likewise should be required reading for those unfamiliar with legal issues and the Indians. Deloria contends that the underlying theme of the litigation he analyzes is that "the Indian nations are not subject to the Constitution because they existed prior to its adoption and have inherent powers, whereas the Constitution is a document of delegated and ceded powers" (p. 315).

In the final chapter on Congress, plenary power and the American Indian, Lawrence M. Hauptman takes on Congressional misused power and intrusions, from the Dawes Act to the New Deal, to "benefit" the Indians. What is needed, he argues, is an alteration of the doctrine of plenary power (another name for paternalism and intervention) to a policy permitting Indian self-government (p. 336).

Taken together, these fine essays (some of them worthy of expansion into separate books), are a clarion call for re-examination of all issues in the history and present-day relations between the United States government and the American Indians. We are greatly indebted to the publishers, editors, and authors for their printing of this superb book.

Wilbur R. Jacobs
UC Santa Barbara

Life and Death in Mohawk Country. By Bruce E. Johansen. Golden, Colorado: North American Press, 1993. 224 pages. \$23.95 cloth.

The recent conflicts involving Mohawk communities at Akwesasne, Kanasatake, and Kahnawake have become some of the most written—and talked about—events in recent American Indian history. Reported by journalists around the world and debated intensely in Canada and the United States, the troubles of the Mohawk community have also become the subject of two books: Rick Hornung's *One Nation Under the Gun* (New York: Pantheon,