

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Colonial Challenges: Britons, Native Americans, and Caribs, 1759-1775. By Robin F. A. Fabel.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/609617d7>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Cohen, Charles L.

Publication Date

2002-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ing on war societies, as much of the historical literature about the Kiowas does, Rand explores the social and economic realities of the Kiowa people. One section of her essay examines the beadwork produced by Kiowa women. Rand uses records associated with the production and sale of this beadwork, as well as examples of the beadwork preserved in museum collections, to show the economic and cultural contributions Kiowa women made to reservation life. Kiowa women produced goods for sale, but they also made beadwork for ceremonial functions, contributing to both the economic survival and cultural continuity of the Kiowas. Rand also traces material contributions Kiowa men made to their bands' survival, focusing on exchanges between Kiowa men and government agents, which allowed the Kiowas to survive and maintain social relations within their bands. Through this essay, Rand demonstrates that studies of the past are incomplete if they do not convey an understanding of the material reality of American Indians. Studies such as Rand's, which do examine the material culture of American Indians, complicate facile notions of dependency and cultural destruction resulting from American colonial policies.

Additional essays by LeAnne Howe, Patricia C. Albers, and James F. Brooks explore, respectively, the theoretical challenges of stories, historical materialism, and comparative indigenous histories. There are no comprehensive formulations of indigenous theories of history in this collection, and readers looking for such content will be disappointed. Rather, the essays in *Clearing a Path* suggest ways to connect Native histories and theory, and to articulate Native theories of history. The possibilities for future inquiry, which are suggested by this collection, are perhaps the book's greatest contribution to the field of American Indian studies.

Alyssa Mt. Pleasant
Cornell University

Colonial Challenges: Britons, Native Americans, and Caribs, 1759–1775. By Robin F. A. Fabel. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2000. 282 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

Early American historiography has recently undergone two major changes in perspective. The first—inserting Native peoples within mainstream narratives of European colonization—constitutes a concerted break with the past. The second—expanding the venerable tradition of imperial history Charles Andrews forged a century ago—links events in British North America to happenings in New France, the northern Spanish Borderlands, the Caribbean, and West Africa as well as Great Britain and Europe. *Colonial Challenges* evinces both trends, surveying the interaction of Britain and its colonies with three peoples of color living far apart—the Cherokees of the Appalachian interior, the small bands inhabiting the Lower Mississippi River basin, and the Black Caribs of St. Vincent—from the French and Indian War until the American Revolution. Robin Fabel advances American Indian scholarship by systemati-

cally comparing the impact of British policy on disparate peoples and by suggesting how their responses might collectively have influenced imperial thinking as the thirteen colonies girded for revolt. Ultimately, however, these cases reveal little about anything beyond themselves.

Fabel's exposition divides into two longer parts that sandwich a much shorter section. The first chapters rehearse the advent, progress, and denouement of the Cherokee War (1759–61). Fabel holds both the British and the Cherokees responsible for the deterioration of friendly relations. Officials "misused" their allies, "slight[ing] them in word and deed" while "stint[ing]" them of goods the Cherokees considered "their due" (p. 42); British penny-pinching nudged their erstwhile partners toward the French. On the other hand, the Cherokees' decentralized polities denied neutralist leaders the capacity to curtail anti-British factions, whose headstrong independence precipitated or recklessly prolonged conflict. When some of Oconostata's warriors, acting alone, slaughtered a band of refugees slouching home from Fort Loudon under a flag of truce, their "treacherous attack" hardened British "determination" to "humiliate" their new enemies (p. 68). Working for the most part over familiar ground, Fabel successfully confutes notions that the war ended indecisively; after the 1761 campaign, he asserts, "never again" would Cherokees "take up arms against the British" (p. 87). The next time war savaged Carolina these former foes battled American patriots together.

More informative is the two-chapter study of the Lower Mississippi's "small tribes" (e.g., the Tensas, Houmas, Ofos, and Tunicas), if only because most historians of Anglo-America have ignored them. After the Treaty of Paris transferred the Floridas to Britain and Louisiana to Spain, these nations found themselves in "the seam" between rival empires (p. 88) and turned accident into strategic advantage. Plotting to maintain their fragile autonomy, the small tribes played the European behemoths against each other, entertaining emissaries from both or moving beyond harm's reach while simultaneously maintaining their distance from the Creek/Choctaw war, in which engagement might have destroyed them. Their tactics won an important concession in the early 1770s when, worried about fighting Spain over the Falklands while staving off a rumored Indian conspiracy (nonexistent, as it turned out) along the Lower Mississippi, Britain forbade colonists from entering the region. Yet, as frequently happened, the actions petty officers took on the ground did not always accord with Whitehall's grand visions. Against orders not to provoke the Spanish, Lt. John Thomas, who identified with the "small tribes" so completely that he joined their dances and fancied himself a war chief, tried to keep the Tunicas from crossing the Mississippi River, thus placing themselves within the Spanish orbit. Fabel rightly instances Thomas as "one of Richard White's Middle Ground people" (p. 127), those who appropriated (in this case) Indian ways in order to advance British interests, but he wrongly calls Thomas's program "unrealistic" because it sought to reverse the "traditional Amerindian directional drift" across the Mississippi (p. 131), a judgment that reduces the Tunicas to determinism's playthings. The small tribes succeeded at remaining autonomous even though they were dispersed and lacked any mechanism for concerted political action because, Fabel further contends,

they had gradually acquired “a commonality of lifestyle” (p. 133), a plausible hypothesis requiring more evidence of the tribes’ cultural traits than the book provides. Alternatively, they may have acted in seeming concert because, possessing like social organizations and occupying equivalent geopolitical niches, they gauged their predicaments similarly and so acted in parallel.

The most fascinating material concerns the Black Caribs, who descended from slaves wrecked on St. Vincent about 1675. Maroons rather than indigenes, strictly speaking, they nonetheless deserve Fabel’s treatment because their contacts with Britain were politically and sociologically analogous to those of the Cherokees and the small tribes. The Black Caribs inhabited an isolated enclave on St. Vincent’s north end, a location coveted by planters eager to enlarge their cane fields. Urged on by the powerful sugar lobby, the ministry sanctioned an invasion, but the Black Caribs resisted so stoutly that parliamentary opponents used the debacle to box the ministry’s ears. Brought to the bargaining table only by a naval blockade that cut off supplies, the Black Caribs kept most of their land, though postwar efforts to incorporate them into white society, at least as troops, came to naught.

Whatever these encounters’ intrinsic interest, the book leaves their larger implications unclear. For one thing, Fabel never explains why they matter so much. The paucity of work on the small tribes and the Black Caribs itself warrants spotlighting them, but novelty does not explain the space devoted to Cherokees, who have already gained much scholarly notice. The period 1759–1775 was certainly pregnant with North America’s future, yet for reasons unknown Fabel ignores the largest contemporary nativist movement, Pontiac’s so-called “Conspiracy.” Nor does he elaborate the concept of “crisis” sufficiently to make it an effective interpretive framework, since it does not apply equally to all sides. The Cherokees, small tribes, and Black Caribs confronted cultural trauma and possibly extinction, but so did many Indians in that era; was anything distinctive about their peculiar situations? Britain, too, faced a crisis, though one sparked by its own colonists, not these nations, “mere nuisances” to London (p. 11). Did the separate native and imperial crises interrelate? Fabel frames this intriguing question without answering it, concluding only that imperial officials might have learned from these examples that in an American war they could count on their navy, should train their troops in “bush warfare,” and ought to cultivate native alliances. He may be correct, though he can only infer, not prove, that experience taught British ministers anything. Indeed, having ultimately subdued the Cherokees and Black Caribs, they might have concluded that the best way to end colonial resistance was with armed force.

However, Fabel does not meld these instances into a more generalized view of British and indigenous relations. He is surely right that indecision, delay, and vacillation make British decision-making “hard to characterize” (p. 206), but he leaves debatable the degree to which provincial officials or private individuals might have shaped events. He does well to demonstrate that Cherokees, the small tribes, and Black Caribs all used the most effective means available to gain their ends, and to observe that none of them enjoyed permanently centralized political organizations that might have coordinated

their responses to British actions more effectively, but in the end it is hard to gauge the depth of his insights except insofar as they reaffirm axioms about Indians' agency and the defensive nature of their aggression. As a result, the book offers three detailed studies rather than an integrated analysis of the dynamic between the British Empire and the autochthonous peoples on its western rim.

Charles L. Cohen

University of Wisconsin, Madison

Culture in the American Southwest: The Earth, the Sky, the People. By Keith L. Bryant, Jr. College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 2001. 379 pages. \$24.47 cloth.

If, as many believe, the Southwest is the most distinctive region in the United States, it is not surprising that artists of various kinds have been attracted to the region. Longtime Texas A & M Professor Keith Bryant, Jr., now emeritus professor at the University of Akron, explores culture in the Southwest in a book that is the result of two decades of research and extensive travel throughout the region. While Bryant's definition of the Southwest differs from others—he draws a boundary that goes from Houston to Tulsa to Colorado Springs to Los Angeles—he shares with others the identification of certain characteristics such as light, landscape and the interaction of cultures. Bryant writes, "Incredible light, natural grandeur, ancient peoples, romantic myths, and a geography at once beautiful and yet brutal thus molded the southwestern societies." Bryant notes, too, that the Southwest blends but does not homogenize Indian, Hispanic, and Anglo societies. Bryant relates culture to urbanization and argues that institutions of culture emerged with the process of urban growth. Initially Anglos sought to recreate the society that they had known in the East and Midwest, but that imported culture would be changed by existing landscape and societies. Throughout the twentieth century there was tension between those who sought change and those who sought to preserve regional values and influences. As the century progressed, southwestern culture ceased to be regional as the maturation of southwestern art, literature, and architecture increasingly influenced national culture.

However, the focus of this book is on the American Southwest. After an introductory chapter on the Native American and Hispano background and a second chapter on the period from 1850 to 1900, Bryant gets to the real focus of his work: the twentieth century. The remainder of the book is divided into twenty-year blocks except for the last chapter, which covers the years from 1980 to 1995. The chapters are structurally similar. Each deals with issues of growth, economic change, and increasing urbanization followed by a discussion of architecture, art, literature, music, and theater.

In the second half of the nineteenth century the arrival of the railroad stimulated immigration and urban and economic growth, and newcomers,