

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

William Bartram on the Southeastern Indian. Edited and annotated by Gregory A. Waselkov and Kathryn E. Holland Braund.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/64p7d1rp>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 20(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Ethridge, Robbie

Publication Date

1996-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ing Bear's *My Indian Boyhood*, Robert A. Trennert's, *The Phoenix Indian School: Forced Assimilation in Arizona, 1891–1935*, and Francis Paul Prucha's *The Churches and the Indian Schools, 1888–1912*.

S. Carol Berg
College of St. Benedict (Minnesota)

William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians. Edited and annotated by Gregory A. Waselkov and Kathryn E. Holland Braund. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. 341 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

William Bartram was an eighteenth-century naturalist who, as a young man, traveled throughout the southeastern United States. Bartram had shown an early aptitude as a naturalist and illustrator and had accompanied his father, botanist John Bartram, on a scientific expedition in east Florida. Later, after having tried and failed as a merchant and then a Florida planter, Bartram persuaded London physician and horticulturist Dr. John Fothergill to sponsor him on a botanical expedition through the newly acquired British lands in the Southeast. For four years, Bartram traveled through the Southeast, visiting northern Florida, the southern Atlantic coast, and the interior Cherokee, Creek, and Choctaw lands. He proved to be an excellent botanist and zoologist and also turned out to be an astute ethnographer of southeastern Indian life. Afterward, he returned to his home in Philadelphia and several years later compiled his notes and drawings into *Travels through North and South Carolina., Georgia, East and West Florida, the Cherokee Country, the Extensive Territories of the Muscogulges, or Creek Confederacy, and the Country of the Chactaws*, which was first published in 1791.

Bartram's writings have been an important primary source for scholars and historians of the southeastern Indians, as well as those interested in the environmental history of the Southeast. *Travels* has also garnered a large popular audience. Since its first publication, it has gone through several reprints, the most noteworthy of which is Francis Harper's 1958 *Naturalists Edition*. In this, Harper edited and heavily annotated Bartram's *Travels*, with special regard to his descriptions of southeastern flora and fauna. Waselkov's and Braund's volume is a much-needed companion piece to Harper's edition, since this volume concentrates on Bartram's writings about the southeastern Indians.

In parts I through III of *Travels*, Bartram recounts his journeys through the Southeast with long, descriptive passages on the native plants and animals he saw. In part IV, he records his observations on the Choctaw, Creek, and Cherokee under such headings as "persona and character," "government and civil society," "marriage and funeral rites," and so on. At the time of Bartram's travels, just prior to the American Revolution, most of the places he visited were Indian-held lands, and he, therefore, had many encounters with various Indian men and women. He describes these encounters in parts I through III, and these descriptions are as important as part IV in revealing much about eighteenth-century southeastern Indian life.

In *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians*, Waselkov and Braund excerpt all such passages from parts I through III of *Travels*; part IV is included in its entirety. Waselkov and Braund also include, in chapter 3, Bartram's "Observations on the Creek and Cherokee Indians," which originally appeared as volume 3 of the *Transactions of the American Ethnological Society* (1853). Here, Bartram answers a series of ethnographic questions on the southeastern Indians and provides drawings of prehistoric mound sites he saw and eighteenth-century Creek towns and households. Chapter 4 is the heretofore unpublished Bartram manuscript "Some Hints & Observations, concerning the civilization, of the Indians, or Aborigines of America," which consists of Bartram's philosophical outpourings on the rights of Native Americans. Although "Some Hints and Observations" contains little new information on the southeastern Indians, it gives important insights into Bartram's philosophy on Native Americans, his stance on their relationship with America, and, if one reads between the lines, on American policy and public opinion regarding Native Americans at that time.

William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians, then, is a complete compilation of Bartram's writings on the subject. Waselkov and Braund, an archaeologist and a historian, respectively, are experts on the Historic period of the southeastern Indians, and their seventy-five pages of annotations aid the reader in interpreting what Bartram saw and experienced among the southeastern Indians. Anyone who has slogged through an unedited and unannotated primary source knows the value of a carefully edited and annotated version such as this. Waselkov's and Braund's notes explain much of what Bartram saw in light of modern scholarship and also clarify many uncertainties.

For example, Bartram wrote *Travels* after he returned from his four-year sojourn, and he combined several different journeys into one travelog. Therefore, the dates and places are confused. Waselkov and Braund, through historical sleuthing and by using archaeological information, reconstruct Bartram's routes and attempt to impose some order on Bartram's apparent disregard for time and place. This is an especially pertinent contribution, since the questions that modern scholars and lay persons ask in relation to Bartram's writings are refined enough to make this type of information absolutely necessary.

Ever since *Travels* was first published, Bartram has been alternately exalted and disparaged. His descriptions of flora and fauna have been both scrutinized for error and used as unimpeachable sources on the southern environment before the age of cotton. Anthropologists and historians generally accept his depictions of the southeastern Indians, especially since much of what he wrote has been corroborated by other sources, but Bartram unapologetically portrays them in a gentle light. This had led to some suspicions about his reliability. In examining the question of his reliability, Waselkov and Braund delve much into Bartram the man, in an effort to uncover his particular philosophies and bent of mind not only toward the Indians but toward nature and the world in general.

The first chapter of *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians* is a biographical sketch of Bartram, his Quaker upbringing, his exposure to Enlightenment thought, his failures, and his successes, all of which went into forming his outlook. The concluding chapter examines all of this in relation to his writings on the southeastern Indians. Waselkov and Braund place Bartram's portrait of the southeastern Indians within the larger intellectual debate of the time as to whether Native Americans were, in fact, human and, if so, whether they could be reformed into "civilized" westerners. They conclude that Bartram portrayed the southeastern Indians as a gentle and moral people because he believed them to be such and as a countervail to the tendency at the time to perceive all Indians as amoral, subhuman savages. The editors applaud his use of cultural relativity in an age of extreme ethnocentrism and understand his exalting of Indian life as an effort to "critique the excesses of Western civilization" (p. 203).

Waselkov and Braund obviously like Bartram, deftly addressing criticisms of him and his work; any criticism they themselves may level at Bartram is as gentle as Bartram's rendering of the

Indians. Herein lies the only real flaw of *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians*. One comes away believing that the late eighteenth-century southern frontier was the rhapsodic paradise that Bartram so eloquently portrays it as. Waselkov and Braund, while not altogether promoting this view, allow their readers to see the eighteenth-century southern frontier through Bartram's rose-colored glasses, without giving readers an alternate view. As even Bartram must have realized, the southern frontier was a lethal and violent place, albeit a physically beautiful one. Bartram could not have traipsed through Creek, Choctaw, and Cherokee country in carefree splendor. He, like everyone else, had to watch his back. Frontier whites and Indians were living in a tense, charged atmosphere wherein an amicable encounter could quickly turn into a violent, deadly one.

Waselkov and Braund admit that Bartram's "noble savage" take on the southeastern Indians probably led to some exaggerations and misperceptions on his part. They defend him as being an honest man who would not have fabricated his experiences with Indians, but who interpreted them in a benevolent, moral light that may or may not have revealed the truth.

For example, much has been made of the lone Bartram's chance meeting with an irate Seminole on a Florida trail. The Seminole, cheated in a trade deal, had sworn to kill the first white man he saw, which happened to be the unsuspecting Bartram, who immediately stuck out his hand for a friendly shake. The Seminole, according to Bartram, proffered his hand in friendship, proving not only the Seminole man's humanity and virtue but that of all Native Americans. Waselkov and Braund agree with Bartram's detractors that this incident is difficult to corroborate and that it probably reflects more on Bartram than on the Seminole, but they conclude that Bartram's lofty interpretations do not detract from the veracity of his writings. To my mind, Waselkov and Braund could use a pinch of healthy skepticism. After all, given the volatile situation on the eighteenth-century southern frontier, the Seminole incident is extraordinary and, if true, does not necessarily portray humanity and virtue so much as frontier trade swindles, personal vendettas, and perhaps a Seminole man's perplexity at meeting a lone, unarmed, and strangely friendly white man on the trail.

Really, Waselkov's and Braund's own biases toward Bartram are only a minor flaw in an exemplary work. In fact, one can see that their regard for Bartram brought the book into being, and this, in itself, excuses their leniency with him. For Waselkov and

Braund have given scholars and fans of Bartram an invaluable source of his writing on the southeastern Indians and the tools and information with which to interpret and use his work.

Robbie Ethridge
University of Georgia

Zuni and the Courts: A Struggle for Sovereign Land Rights.
Edited by E. Richard Hart. Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1995. 337 pages. \$ 40.00 cloth.

Some thirty years ago, long after most other Indian tribes had filed land claims, the Pueblo of Zuni initiated litigation related to its aboriginal land claims, rights and uses. In the first case, the Pueblo of Zuni sued the United States, seeking payment for aboriginal lands that had been taken by the United States without compensation. In the second case, also against the United States, the Zuni sought compensation for environmental damages to Zuni trust lands caused by the United States government and by private enterprises where the federal government should have provided protection for those lands. In the third case, the United States, in fulfillment of its trust responsibilities for the Pueblo of Zuni, sued a private rancher in east-central Arizona on behalf of Zuni to establish an easement that protected Zuni access to an ancient religious trail.

Providing an overview of these cases and of Zuni history, Richard Hart has collected essays written by a number of experts and others who testified for the Pueblo—including historians, anthropologists, archaeologists, and scientists—as well as commentary from the Pueblo's attorneys. The collected essays are a valuable contribution to an understanding of a late twentieth-century Indian people's efforts to secure their land rights. The intent of Richard Hart is to make the complex realms of expert testimony accessible to a wide audience. The essays enable the reader to see the kinds of evidence that convinced two U.S. district courts of the merits and validity of Zuni's claims against the United States regarding lost aboriginal lands and environmental damages to their trust lands, and convinced an Arizona district court of the existence under Arizona law of an easement established by Zuni pilgrims across private land that lay between the Pueblo and "Zuni Heaven."