

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Lines Drawn Upon the Water: First Nations and the Great Lakes Borders and Borderlands. Edited by Karl S. Hele.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6543x042>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Stark, Heidi Kiiwetinepinesiik

Publication Date

2009-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Nonetheless, the catalog provides an exceptional introduction to an important artist, and the quality of production and plates is to be commended. It compares most favorably with another exhibit catalog, *Fritz Scholder: Indian/Not Indian*, published in 2008 by the NMAI. That was also published to coincide with the exhibition of Scholder's work and includes discussions of the artist's background, influences, and themes. I hope that these two works will inspire similar quality catalogs for future exhibitions of indigenous artists. *Vital Signs* concludes with an artist's history, selected bibliography, and glossary of printmaking terms that will provide good starting points for the reader seeking additional sources of reading and research. *Joe Feddersen: Vital Signs* reveals that the artist's pulse is very strong.

John N. Low

University of Michigan, Mitchell Museum of the American Indian

Lines Drawn Upon the Water: First Nations and the Great Lakes Borders and Borderlands. Edited by Karl S. Hele. Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2008. 378 pages. \$85.00 cloth.

Lines Drawn Upon the Water: First Nations and the Great Lakes Borders and Borderlands is a much-needed contribution to the growing field of border and borderland studies. This volume sheds light on the unique position and experience of First Nations living in the borderlands of the United States and Canada while demonstrating that First Nations did not monolithically respond to the construction of borders in their various forms. The contributors sought to examine how First Nations of the Great Lakes were impacted by and responded to the imposition of colonial and national boundaries. First Nations of the Great Lakes, historically and today, have interacted with numerous tribal and European nations and felt the effects of the formation and rise of nation-states. Europeans' desire for empire necessitated the drawing of lines both on the land and the water in their competition for control. First Nations' intellectual, metaphysical, geographical, and political landscapes were challenged and reshaped through the process of colonial nation-formation. Yet First Nations often utilized their position between imperial rivals to achieve their own aims. Therefore, this volume examines "the border not as a barrier but as a crucible where conflicting currents of identity, history, and culture shape local and national communities" (xxiii).

Although border and borderlands studies have a longer intellectual tradition initially examined by Herbert Eugene Bolton in his 1921 volume *The Spanish Borderlands*, only in the last decade has there been an increase in scholarship that specifically examines the US-Canadian border. For example, Sheila McManus's *The Line Which Separates: Race, Gender, and the Making of the Alberta-Montana Borderlands* (2005) examines the impact of the forty-ninth parallel in the west during the nineteenth century. Two recent contributions include David G. McCrady's *Living with Strangers: The Nineteenth-Century Sioux and the Canadian-American Borderlands* (2006) and Sterling Evans's *The*

Borderlands of the American and Canadian West (2006). Complementing these studies, this volume encourages its readers to look beyond national borders and comparative studies and, instead, encourages scholars to consider the borderlands as regions. As with the aforementioned studies, much of the work on the US-Canadian border has been situated in the nineteenth century and in the west. *Lines Drawn Upon the Water* extends beyond these previous studies by examining the impacts of the border and borderlands from the seventeenth century through today, addressing physical, metaphysical, and epistemological boundaries in order to encompass borderlands as a geographical reality and an intellectual space.

This volume contributes to the critical examination of the geographical and political position of First Nations and their relationship to the colonial nation they reside within. More so, this volume sheds lights on the spaces created between nations and borders and borderlands. In doing so, the contributors have paid special attention to the political, cultural, and social consequences of imperialism while shedding light on how First Nations have successfully resisted being defined and contained by the conditions of colonialism. The impact of borders and imperial nations on First Nations has resulted in a great deal of transformation beginning in the seventeenth century and continuing today. By combining pieces that look at historical and contemporary First Nation responses to the construction of borders, this volume demonstrates the artificiality and lived reality of the border and being a people of the borderlands.

As noted by Hele, this volume builds from Jeremy Adelman and Stephen Aron's theory of borderlands, which "emphasizes how local history is shaped by imperial rivalries and Aboriginal attempts to exploit these differences 'partly to resist submission but mainly to negotiate intercultural relations on terms more to their liking'" (xvii). This volume succeeds in this aim. One of the strengths of this collection of essays is the contributors' ability to demonstrate the complexities and multiplicities of the borderlands. These essays weave through the varied borders that operate in the Great Lakes region: the physical boundaries that have been carved onto the land by nature, the political boundaries that have become *Lines Drawn Upon the Water*, the metaphysical and epistemological boundaries that exist between different peoples and cultural views, and the patrol and enforcement (or lack thereof) of these borders.

This volume demonstrates how First Nations people and their relationships persisted despite the divisions created by political and physical boundaries. First Nations of the Great Lakes can be understood as a people bifurcated by national and political boundaries. Yet Native people also actively and strategically resisted these divisions and boundaries. As Phil Bellfy illustrates, Anishinaabe nationhood extended beyond the US-Canadian border as Anishinaabe treaty signatories crossed the border to negotiate the best possible treaties with competing nations. Edmund J. Danziger Jr. examines how Anishinaabe people responded to US and Canadian policies in the nineteenth century in multifarious ways in their desire to protect their cultural, political, and economic independence.

Borders are a lived experience for First Nations. Borders have divided communities, families, and cultures. Yet a number of the contributors shed light on the relationships and kinship networks that persisted in the face of imperial powers. For example, Hele demonstrates how individual relationships in and across communities shaped life and reality on the ground, revealing the difficulties of imposing and enforcing a border in the Sault Ste. Marie region. Alan Knight and Janet E. Chute explore how communities are born out of and revitalized through personal and kin relationships. Their piece exposes the flexibilities of identity that can be and often are continually negotiated and multilayered. In their examination of the Sault Métis, Knight and Chute reveal how identity cannot be contained in the singular category of Anishinaabe, Métis, or non-Indian. Although borders and borderlands are often understood through an examination of the literal and physical lines that get drawn on maps and the political borders that are patrolled, Knight and Chute shed light on the complexities of First Nation life in the borderland and how lines become drawn also on the body and one's identity. In contrast, Norman Shields examines the borderlands of law, politics, gender, and "race." He nicely elucidates the ways that Indian status legislation has served to border identity and yet has been met with markedly different responses from Native communities, arguing for the need to recognize the underlying historic and demographic issues that motivate Native response.

One of this volume's strengths is the various pieces that examine the impact of metaphysical and epistemological borderlands for First Nations. Catherine Murton Stoehr examines First Nation response to metaphysical borders, focusing on the Anishinabeg Methodist Movement. Michelle A. Hamilton illustrates how borderlands are a geographic reality and an intellectual space in her analysis of anthropology and the Six Nations of the Grand River. Ute Lischke's piece closes this volume, with good reason. Perhaps the strongest contribution in this volume, Lischke demonstrates the broad impact of borders on First Nations as well as how Native peoples resist these impositions. Focusing on the works of Louise Erdrich, he sheds light on how many Native people have seen these lines as artificial and yet have also had encounters with the real dangers that are a consequence of patrolled borders for Native people living in the highly regulated region. Yet not all aspects of ourselves can be contained and codified. Lischke demonstrates how stories resist the containment of borders. Native people use their stories to resist, reshape, and reclaim the border and borderlands.

An important aim of the volume is to "encourage others to view the region [of the Great Lakes] as a whole despite the artificial division that affected and continues to affect all who live within it" (xv). Hele notes, and this volume demonstrates, that "one cannot truly speak of, for instance, Iroquois or Ojibwa pasts, presents, and futures without exploring the nature of their relationship to the international border and those relationships that transcend it" (xix). This collection primarily utilizes a local focus to illustrate the impacts of and responses to borders and borderlands for individuals, families, and communities. Though some of the studies could use stronger connections to the broader framework of borders and borderlands by more clearly assessing what the local

can teach us about the national and global, nonetheless, this volume has many strengths that make it a critical read. This work demonstrates the need to reconfigure our understanding of place and space, recognizing the implications of constructing, enforcing, and defying borders and its effects on the lands and peoples in between. Hele and the other contributors call for a reenvisioning of the Great Lakes as a space/place that must be understood by looking at both sides of what has been a permeable line for Native peoples of this region. Great Lakes past, present, and future cannot be understood outside the context of the people and places north and south of this line. The region's history and its people can only be fully understood by recognizing the impacts of borders while looking beyond the borders.

Heidi Kiiwetinepinesiiik Stark

University of Minnesota—Duluth

Medicine Bags and Dog Tags: American Indian Veterans from Colonial Times to the Second Iraq War. By Allen Carroll. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 287 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

American Indian veterans have had a unique place in the history of the United States since the nation began. Although they have served the country in each of its wars since the American Revolution, their perceptions of patriotism, honor, flag, and country often have differed from those of their fellow servicemen, not least because of the complex and often tumultuous relationship between their tribal nations and the US military. Furthermore, Native veterans have had to deal with misperception, stereotype, and racism before, during, and after their service while also continuing their tribal traditions. In attempting to explain the totality of the Native veteran experience, Al Carroll's *Medicine Bags and Dog Tags* argues that Native veterans not only have endured challenges from non-Native perceptions but also have adapted and used such perceptions to create new warrior and veteran traditions within the culture of the US armed forces.

The book is enormously ambitious on a number of levels. Other books dealing with Native veterans have tended to focus on a particular war (Thomas Britten's *American Indians in World War I* [1997]), group (William Meadows's *The Comanche Code Talkers of World War II* [2003]), or individual (Hollis Stabler's *No One Ever Asked Me* [2005]). Carroll does not restrict himself in such ways, instead opting for a comprehensive approach that he hopes "will help Native veterans and their families and friends understand their service in the largest possible context" (10). One of the book's strengths is Carroll's breadth of knowledge on veteran-related subjects. Whether discussing Iroquois warrior roles and rituals in the War of 1812 or the actions of Mitchell Red Cloud during the Korean War, Carroll demonstrates familiarity with a startling array of topics. His sources, including archival records, oral histories, and a long list of published sources, likewise show impressive diversity and research.

Carroll thus gives numerous specific examples of Native veterans throughout the book, and it is at its most enjoyable and informative when he does so.