

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Victorio: Apache Warrior and Chief. By Kathleen P. Chamberlain.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6765897k>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Tate, Michael L.

Publication Date

2008-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

only feebly at geographic or cultural specificities), unconvincing romance, and clunky historical reimaginings, *Two Spirits* is, when taken alone, well intended but generally banal. Yet the novel is fully part of a larger and more troubling representational history, one in which Native sexualities and genders have been reduced to utilitarian symbols for non-Natives to legitimize themselves and their various claims of belonging. This is not the *nadleehí* Hasbaá's story, nor that of the elders Dezba or Barboncito, or even those of Michael the mixed-blood Cherokee or Jose the Mexican *vaquero*; though embedded in an episode from Navajo history, it's not even the story of the Diné resistance and survival during the events around the Long Walk. These are all incidental elements in a story that ultimately celebrates a gay white man finding his liberation and awakening by becoming the noble inheritor of Native tradition, a figure for whom the Indians and people of color in the novel exist only as (often sexually available) means to his self-enlightening ends. Ironically, diverse Native sexualities are reduced to little more than historical wallpaper, and the possibility of richly textured queer Native subjectivities is relegated to exotic afterthought.

For all its ostensibly good intentions, *Two Spirits* is ultimately very little about two-spirited peoples' lives, experiences, or storied realities, let alone the social, cultural, and political struggles of Native communities still trying to maintain their ways on their own terms. Instead, it's a story about how white men can find sexual and spiritual fulfillment through high-minded sex with exotic brown people. We've heard this story before, and it's no less exploitative now.

Daniel Heath Justice

University of Toronto

Victorio: Apache Warrior and Chief. By Kathleen P. Chamberlain. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007. 242 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

Among today's readers, Victorio is remembered as a determined Apache chief who led many of his people in an 1879 breakout from a New Mexico reservation. Their retreat across the mountains and deserts of western Texas was a model of ingenuity, where relatively small numbers of warriors carried out delaying actions to protect their families from advancing American soldiers. The army's pursuit even involved Colonel Benjamin Grierson, a senior officer whose small escort barely survived Victorio's onslaught at the Battle of Devil's Ridge. In the end, however, Victorio succumbed to the realities of a massed military campaign by American and Mexican forces that culminated in the Battle of Tres Castillos, where Lieutenant Colonel Joaquín Terrazas and his Chihuahua militia forces cornered the fleeing Apache Band. Short of ammunition and other vital supplies, they made a determined stand that resulted in the deaths of seventy-eight Indians and the capture of sixty-eight men, women, and children. Among the bodies found in the ledge outcroppings was that of Victorio, a leader who had witnessed and participated in some of the most important events in Apache history between 1825 and 1880.

Today's Apache people remember Victorio through their oral traditions, and they pay homage to him not merely as an accomplished warrior but also as a devoted family man, diplomat, spiritual guide, and leader of the Chihennes Band. Kathleen Chamberlain, professor of history at Eastern Michigan University, captures all these dimensions of the man, and she convincingly demonstrates that he worked with agents and military officers to preserve peace whenever he agreed with their policies, even to the point of "arresting" troublemakers from among his own people. Yet Victorio was an unrelenting foe of the bureaucrats who moved his people from one agency to another.

Utilizing an ethnohistorical approach, Chamberlain reconstructs Victorio's life through all of its phases. Although no extant documents have survived to explain his childhood and teenage years, the author does a credible job of describing the probable events and experiences of these formative years. The book opens with the tribal creation story and explains how strong cultural values shaped the lives of all Apache people. Readers are given a solid understanding of ceremonies, ethics, and military training techniques for young men, as well as the domestic and spiritual roles for young women. Likewise, Apache connections to sacred places are affirmed throughout the book, especially the Chihennes' attachment to Ojo Caliente where they chose to settle during the reservation period. Had they not been continuously harassed by whites who coveted ownership of the area and government officials intent on saving money by closing some agencies, the Chihennes probably would not have resorted to forcible tactics.

Raised in a centuries-old "raid and trade" environment, all Apache bands were used to alternating patterns of commerce and warfare with their Indian neighbors. This pattern was re-created in the eighteenth century as Apache relations extended to Spanish settlers and government officials. Yet when the first Americans moved into the Southwest on the heels of the 1846 Mexican-American War, most Apaches tended to regard them as potential trading partners and military allies to be enlisted against their enemies. Unfortunately, the initial feelings of goodwill gave way to bloodshed and reprisals. American scalp hunters such as John James Johnson, James Kirker, and King Woolsey used brutal tactics in their enforcement of Mexican scalp bounty laws, often making no distinction between peaceful Indians and those who engaged in raiding forays. The Civil War era brought further neglect by the US government when annuity payments and other treaty promises went unfulfilled. Territorial militias, often manned by Indian-hating frontiersmen, made the situation worse by hiding behind the American flag while committing atrocities against noncombatants.

Chamberlain does an excellent job of untangling the morass of complicated events that transpired between 1865 and 1880 and of placing Victorio at the center of many of the most important events. The killings of band leaders Cuchillo Negro in 1857 and Mangas Coloradas in 1863 thrust Victorio into a leadership position. Like Cochise of the Chokonon Band, he initially tried to steer a middle course of accommodation with American officials, while still safeguarding Chihenne rights. By the 1870s, however, Victorio more often participated in raids against enemies, and he earned the reputation as a fierce warrior on both sides of the international border.

The seminal event in Victorio's life that turned him against fickle American policy occurred in the spring of 1877, when he and his people were moved to San Carlos Reservation in Arizona. There they were forced to become intensive agriculturalists in a sterile environment that could produce little more than subsistence crops. Agent John Clum harbored good intentions for the Chihennes, but his vision was myopic at best. Several months later, Victorio and co-leader Loco directed three hundred followers off the reservation and returned to their beloved Ojo Caliente to await further clarification from Washington, D.C. When orders finally came, they sent a chill through the people who were ordered back to San Carlos as part of a government attempt to cut administrative costs under the policy of concentration. For the moment, Loco acceded to the order and returned with some Chihennes to San Carlos, but Victorio and his followers headed southward to join their kinsmen on the Mescalero Reservation. Peace proved elusive, and when rumors circulated that Victorio would be imprisoned, he fled the reservation for the final time. Chamberlain correctly describes the events that led to Tres Castillos not as a planned suicidal act but rather as a realistic response to overwhelming odds.

Victorio: Apache Warrior and Chief represents an important new study of southwestern Indian life during the nineteenth century. It complements an earlier classic, Dan Thrapp's *Victorio and the Mimbres Apaches* (1974), without imitating its approach. Thrapp's book is far more detailed about military matters and offers a more extensive account of the rigors of army campaigning in the Southwest. Even with the use of Indian scouts to help locate remote Apache rancherias in the mountains and canyons, soldiers and their heavy equipment were no match for the swift foe. Apaches' intimate knowledge of trails, water holes, and location of supply caches provided them with important advantages for remaining beyond the reach of regimental columns. However, when moving large numbers of their own people to safety, the warriors and their leaders forfeited most of these advantages and put themselves at greater risk. Such was the inevitable duty of men such as Victorio who had to place the interests of the band ahead of their own personal goals.

As volume 22 in the University of Oklahoma's highly successful Western Biographies Series, this book conforms to the mandates of the series. It remains within the prescribed word limits imposed by the press. More important, the study does not include footnotes or endnotes. Although this may perturb researchers who wish to pursue specific points of evidence, the issue has been addressed in a different way. The author has placed a copy of the manuscript, complete with all endnotes, with the Center for Southwest Research at the University of New Mexico. Furthermore, the author's lengthy bibliographical essay stands as a model for evaluating the strengths and weaknesses of source materials on the Apache wars. Chamberlain is correct to conclude that a definitive biography of Victorio's life probably never will be written due to the scarcity of background materials, but this book should answer most of our needs.

Michael L. Tate

University of Nebraska at Omaha