Title
Holistic Community Development: Wellness for the Collective Body

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6d66z66r

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(3)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Gould, Kerin

Publication Date
2006-06-01

DOI
10.17953

Peer reviewed

<div align="right">

COMMENTARY

</div>

Holistic Community Development: Wellness for the Collective Body

KERIN GOULD

In many indigenous cultures, health is seen as the maintenance of balance among mental, physical, and spiritual well-being rather than the absence of disease. Life out of balance and in conflict with values and protocols—whether through one's own behavior or intrusive forces—is often seen as a cause of disease and loss of vitality. For example, some see trauma-induced *susto,* "soul loss" or a sort of soul displacement, as a serious illness (with symptoms akin to post-traumatic stress disorder [PTSD]) that requires a restorative treatment with herbs or, if it is more serious, ceremonial healing. Medicine man George Walking Bear Gillette of the Tubatulabal tribe stated simply that one reason so many people had diabetes was because life was no longer sweet enough.[1] Other illnesses are attributed to neglecting ceremonial obligations, unfulfilled dreams, or immoderate or disrespectful actions. Healing—whether through bone-setting skills, herbal treatment, steam baths, or spiritual practices—is an act of reestablishing balance. Hot and cold balance evenly. Bones are realigned to work together again without pain. Reciprocity between patient and community and/or natural and spirit worlds is set back in harmony and souls are recentered in their bodies. In this system it is rare that a symptom or a part of the body is treated in isolation; mind, body, spirit, environment, and community are all involved. If Native community development could be

After living with an Hñañhu community in Mexico, Gould returned to study indigenous community well-being and development in the Native American Studies program at the University of California, Davis, where she is currently performing dissertation research on the complex relationship between worldview and community-development projects.

approached this way and be framed as improving and maintaining integral well-being for the collective, then, ideally, holistic community development could heal deep injuries and fractures, boost internal strengths, balance mental-physical-spiritual needs, and even restore the community's soul. For example, a community that has been exposed to overwhelming violence or traumatic events could collectively show symptoms similar to those of *susto* and require a community plan for healing that could be approached in a holistic way, much like traditional approaches to individual health. This approach would have to address more than economic or political development and include the relationships among economy, environment, culture, knowledge, family and society, education, and spirituality in order to restore and maintain the whole community body.

While there is a danger that this argument could be misinterpreted as saying that indigenous communities are "sick," I would clarify that I am not referring to curing a symptom, battling an isolated germ, or correcting a genetic defect. I believe this metaphor is worth using because a community is similar to a body with many interdependent parts and because many communities are seeking wellness in integrated, collective ways that nurture the community body as a whole and mend fractures, wounds, and bruises. Healing in this sense has less to do with disease or weakness and more to do with rejoining and rebalancing for longevity, strength, and overall wellness. Colonialism's continuing impairment of self-determination and self-reliance has caused damage to vital organs such as family functionality, mental health, gender relations, cultural continuity, environment, and ownership of indigenous knowledge. These injuries hurt in many subtle ways that are less obvious than poverty or loss of land and rights. As a result, Native people face a very complex set of challenges to their own self-determined approach to healing. As Taiaiake Alfred (Mohawk) put it, "It is incumbent on this generation of Native people to heal the colonial sickness through the re-creation of sound communities, individual empowerment, and the re-establishment of relationships based on traditional values."[2]

In working toward recovery, indigenous communities have become more and more adept at triage approaches—staunching the bleeding and mending fractures—by gaining political and economic expertise. At many levels the indigenous presence is increasingly sophisticated and articulate, from local development projects to participation in international entities such as the United Nations or the World Conference on the Information Society. More lawyers, activists, and analysts are tackling legal, political, and economic questions, such as the *Cobell v. Norton* case, in order to recover trust fund money that the government is accused of failing to distribute to Native Americans or the World Bank's and the International Monetary Fund's obligation to obtain free, informed, and prior consent before starting any projects on indigenous lands. Recent elections in Bolivia, Venezuela, Ecuador, and Peru have seen unprecedented responsiveness to the indigenous political presence. Many Native businesses are creatively shaping opportunities and turning historic constraints into advantages.[3] This skilled and courageous work has staved off near-fatal decline in many cases and paved the way for revitalization in other areas.

However, some particularly inspired community leaders are devising strategies that go beyond surviving within a Euro-American, global corporate system and beyond mastery of the techniques necessary to face the dominant politico-economic system. They create integral, autochthonous, visionary development. As opposed to exclusively economic or political development, this kind of community development is decidedly comparable to holistic health approaches—identifying root problems, treating the network of internal systems, drawing on inner strength, and including prevention, long-term maintenance, and restoration—and these community-specific prescriptions can be seen as healing the damage to the self-reliance and self-determination suffered under colonization, restoring balance, and invigorating and strengthening the community.

AN OUTSTANDING EXAMPLE OF HOLISTIC DEVELOPMENT IN THE TEWA COMMUNITY OF POJOAQUE

The Poeh Cultural Center and Pojoaque Pueblo Construction Services Corporation represent integrated and complementary community-development projects that support each other while resolving community-identified issues. In their sequential project plan, the Poeh Pueblo (New Mexico) planned a center for cultural preservation, education, and cultural tourism to be built by its own construction company and incorporated traditional adobe building technology. According to Susan Guyette the community and tribal government identified several goals that were interconnected: (1) strengthening kinship bonds through working in support of traditional activities, (2) earning income through culturally appropriate activities, (3) preserving cultural context for traditional religious practices, (4) creating income and activities to support the tribal government system, (5) developing projects that are integrated into the natural environment, and (6) strengthening cultural identity.[4] The center provides a space for preserving cultural items, has elders teach children about their culture, and increases and enriches tourism and outreach. The construction company now builds for nonreservation clients as well as in their own community, therefore reducing unemployment and the social ills that go along with it. As Guyette explains, the diversity of interested participants and the combination of many different community activities within these projects interlaced the program into the life of the tribal community, joining different families, age groups, education and experience levels, and tribal and outside communities.

Whether high-tech or handmade, based on traditional material culture or far from it, holistic projects join seemingly separate needs, goals, social segments, and skills to present an integrated project that aims to strengthen overall well-being.

Familiarity with this complex line of work can provoke a reconsideration of definitions of community development. The term *development* has increasingly earned some negative connotations, through the imposition of neocolonial criteria such as productivity, unlimited growth, and income per capita as well as the perpetuation of a dependent labor force/market.

Also, top-down or external developers can seem to be doing something *to* a place and the word can conjure up images of strip mines and strip malls full of box stores that, after the hoopla and funding dry up, turn into urban blight or postboom ghost towns. Development often comes to indigenous people with the imposition of a label: underdeveloped. Both Arturo Escobar and George Manuel (Shuswap) have written about the effects of this one-sided discourse.[5] In this kind of development, where indigenous people have little input on the kind of activity taking place in their region, what is called *development* becomes its opposite: *envelopment*, the process of enclosing, limiting, or stifling. In its original sense, as Jack Forbes writes, "development is the process of unfolding, opening up, liberating or unleashing some group or object."[6] In the botanical sense, the word implies an unfolding life cycle and maturing; in photography, an image is revealed or focused; and when ideas develop, they take shape and fill out. Ideally, as humans develop, they are learning, finding, and following their own good path. Many indigenous peoples' recent initiatives are reflecting these positive meanings and reshaping development on their own terms. In this work I propose optimistically returning the word *development* to its organic sense: the planning and organizing process that moves a community toward unfolding, taking shape, learning, and following its own good path. I would suggest that this kind of community development may or may not be linked to community government. The civil society approach may seem more viable for some self-development projects. Further, I would like to propose that community development, distinct from strictly focused economic or political development, must be as multifaceted and holistic in its proposals as the community, its worldview, and its goals for well-being. However, this does not imply that political acuity, employment, and income generation are not desirable outcomes of development, only that alone they may not create well-being any more than taking a single high-potency vitamin or stitching up a single wound will create a whole, healthy body. Therefore, the term *community development* in this work will refer to the process of making community as a whole, complex body to flourish and thrive.

THE HOLISTIC APPROACH: LOOKING FROM DIFFERENT ANGLES

Just as colonization attacked self-determination and self-reliance on many levels, the response—the recovery of self-development—must also occur on multiple levels. These different elements must interconnect with each other and with their own worldview for (traditionally or even vestigially) cosmocentric cultures. While indigenous people of the Americas share many commonalities, each community is a unique body of worldview, historic experiences, environment, politics, culture, legal parameters, and social structures and each situation has many facets and points of view to consider. Therefore, we ought to examine the question of indigenous community development from many angles, using many kinds of knowledge and expertise, above all those of Native thinkers, planners, and intellectuals. Perspectives from many fields interconnect within this discussion of Native self-development.

Ethnohistory, for example, insists that we examine history using first-person accounts, oral histories, images, and cultural objects, and many other sources outside of the texts produced by Euro-American historians. This should prompt us to look at community development through many sources but ethnohistory has another contribution to make as an analytical approach.

Tribal ethnohistories can be said to validate knowledge and intellectual ability, and to recognize nonmainstream concepts of time, such as the concept of "stacking time" or of the purpose of history, both explained by Peter Nabokov in *A Forest of Time*.[7] As stories have always taught lessons, they can also identify values and expected behavior, such as the Iroquois concept of planning for seven generations ahead, a concept that encapsulates philosophies of time and relatedness to shape planning processes.

I can only imagine how it must feel for indigenous youth to have school, text, and media information contradicting all the ideas learned through experience and family/cultural traditions. Revaluing these stories through an ethnohistorical approach heals the asphyxiation and disorientation caused by their suppression and can validate the incorporation of important values and social structures into community-development planning.

In the arena of indigenous politics, the focus is mainly on sovereignty, autonomy, self-determination, and decolonization, and it is hard to conceive of independently planning a community's future without this work as a background. After experiencing countless political changes over the years, many communities are developing at points in between full self-determination and the need for services, protections, and entrepreneurial opportunities from state and transnational corporate entities, and this is simply part of the decolonization process. James Anaya is quite right in pointing out that, after years of assaults, plunder, discrimination, and suffering, indigenous peoples have an improved body of norms, conventions, and agencies. "International law has evolved, however modestly, to challenge the legacy of this history and the forces that would see it continue."[8] However, even as indigenous people refine their political abilities, many economic and governmental decision-making processes are descended from European thought and do not always reflect a Native American way of knowing. For example, some tribal organizations use *Robert's Rules of Order* rather than use traditional, consensus-seeking protocols for meetings. In the Hñañhu community of San Pablito, the *Presidencia-auxiliar* or community government is similar to any nonindigenous community in Mexico (as it has to interact with municipality, regional, and state bodies) while the council of elders exists but is largely symbolic and is not well respected.[9] These foreign structures were not necessarily adopted blindly but were probably chosen or accepted as a way for these bodies to be recognized as legitimate and in many instances were adapted strategically in the tribe's best interests. Stephen Cornell suggests that more traditional, nonassimilated groups and cultural claims have been ignored, while more assimilated groups are given more attention and participation.[10] However, Taiaiake Alfred argues for a fully Native political approach to decolonization: "At their core, European states and their colonial offspring still embody the

same destructive and disrespectful impulses that they did 500 years ago. For this reason, questions of justice—social, political, and environmental—are best considered outside the framework of classical European thought and legal traditions."[11]

Even as decolonization is progressing, the struggle between the nation-states' political power and that of Native peoples can cripple development by imposing its own goals, protocols, technology, and organizing structures. I propose that the gains made within the politico-economic framework of the state will seem very hollow if in the long term they result in the (further) marginalization of indigenous worldviews and the concomitant assimilation, loss of vital knowledge, loss of language, dissent and rivalry in communities, and the social problems associated with consumerism and individualism. The imbalance will continue to keep communities from fully thriving. Certainly Vine Deloria Jr.'s lifetime body of work has made clear the dangers of achieving a sort of acculturated success in economics and politics when it sacrifices spiritual, social, educational, and cultural indigeneity.

Economics, livelihood, and self-reliance are, without a doubt, an especially important element in the health of each community. While mainstream economic concepts and trends may certainly affect Native entrepreneurs and tribal businesses, the indigenous economy has to take a number of unique variables into account to have the circulation of benefits reach all of the community's extremities. There are racial, legal, and historical factors, and indigenous people, like any other humans, have their own ideas (traditional and otherwise) about their own economies and how to sustain themselves. Duane Champagne draws a strong connection between worldview and community economics:

> Native cultures prefer redistribution sharing, as hoarding is severely criticized. . . . Natives often view the land, elements, animals, plants, and nature in general as a sacred gift from the Creator, and to violate it leads to misfortune and retaliation from the disturbed beings. The world is not to be remolded, as in Western views; it is not a natural resource to be exploited, but rather part of a grand plan, and so all resources need to be conserved in order to play their role in the Creator's plan. Humans should take only what they need for subsistence; to take more disrupts the relations with the powers of nature. . . . In many Native groups the community comprises not only the social and political connections among humans, but also extends to intense relations with the forces of the non-human world which are considered powerful and sacred. The relations of this cosmic community cannot be disrupted by human interests without retaliation and rebalancing.[12]

This demands a different measure of what it means for a community to be thriving. In addition, this view that a healthy economic situation depends on healthy relationships with community and environment must work with and around the dominance of mainstream economics.

The topic of indigenous development is not entirely an economic question, yet its relationship to globalization and the market economy cannot be ignored. In reference to the roots of international development Colombian scholar Arturo Escobar says:

> By constructing the underdeveloped economy as characterized by a vicious circle of low productivity, lack of capital, and inadequate industrialization, development economists contributed to a view of reality in which the only things that counted were increased savings, growth rates, attracting foreign capital, developing industrial capacity, and so on. This excluded the possibility of articulating a view of social change as a project that could be conceived of not only in economic terms but as a whole life project, in which the material aspects would be not the goal and the limit but a space of possibilities for broader individual and collective endeavors, culturally defined.[13]

The loss of self-determination and self-reliance experienced by indigenous communities has certainly been driven by economic questions to an important degree, and this devastation in turn has sapped the vitality from other areas of life.

John Moore states that different economic ideologies were at the heart of the clash between invaders and indigenous Americans and that the capitalist nature of the invasion drove the attack on culture, religion, and self-sustaining ways of life.[14] Alice Littlefield suggests that livelihood and values have been attacked together in the interests of a state economic vision. "With regard to the indigenous peoples, their communal economies were undermined by measures designed to transform their land and labor into commodities, through the twin policies of allotment and education."[15] It is interesting to note the regret expressed by communities whose resources have been commodified, such as the Hopi/Navajo water tables, as drought and pollution distress the health of their people.

Criticism of (global) development as a continuation of economic hegemony can also contribute to this discussion. As Ivan Illich writes:

> Fundamentally, the concept [of development] implies the replacement of wide spread, unquestioned competence at subsistence activities by the use and consumption of commodities; the monopoly of wage labor over all other kinds of work; redefinition of needs in terms of goods and services mass-produced according to expert design; rearrangement of the environment in such fashion that space, time, materials and design favor production and consumption while they degrade or paralyze use-value oriented activities that satisfy needs directly. And all such worldwide homogeneous changes and processes are valued as inevitable.[16]

In other words, this hegemony insists that one is not qualified to feed and care for oneself according to experience and historical knowledge. One has

to buy the food and take the medicine approved by the dominant production system, usually consisting of outside entities that have limited knowledge of one's living situation. These authors would probably agree that hegemonic economic manipulation is a pernicious, debilitating disease that spreads throughout the community, causing a loss of land, ideologies, and independence. Reuniting economic pursuits with indigenous worldview, values, knowledge, and culturally appropriate organizing does not signify returning to a harsh subsistence lifestyle. Rather it aims to revive a community's own ability to define and pursue well-being by removing intrusive constraints and demands much as traditional healers sometimes remove disease-causing "intrusive objects" by absorption through ceremonial objects such as paper spirit-figures or eggs or sucking out the cause of illness.

Once a community identifies its issues and goals, perspectives and models from the field of community development can be adjusted to reflect Native values, protocols, consensus building, and identity awareness. In a sense, these tools can support self-diagnosis, assessment of what the community's baseline is, and examination of problems, and then lay out a specific regimen for long-term wellness. In the context of an indigenous community, the ideas of human and social capital could acknowledge the importance of the network of families and clans, neighborhood works associations, and fraternal or ceremonial societies (and perhaps, more recently, reservation basketball teams). Robert D. Putnam, a Harvard professor of political science, writes that these networks of smaller associations create civic engagement or "social capital."[17] He suggests that such a horizontal society creates mutual protection, reciprocity, and trust—all of which sound like values that typify many indigenous societies.

Community development has utilized Ferdinand Tönnies's idea of contrasting *Gesellschaft* (institutional, efficient, industrial, and focused on means to external ends) and *Gemeinschaft* (organic, intimate, collective, and based on family, values, tradition, and instinct) classifications to assess different types of communities and the changes happening in them. Indigenous people can use this typology to consider the nature of their communities; how and why the communities are changing; and what type of community they would like to be part of.[18] While no community or project is likely to be entirely *Gesellschaft* or *Gemeinschaft*, but somewhere in between, self-characterization may form an important part of envisioning a future. Many factors are sure to influence both how people see themselves and how they would like community development to make changes for them: for example, proximity to cities and out-migration, degree of self-sufficiency, social position of elders and traditionalists, density of housing, and exposure to other communities' projects.

An asset-building approach could foster a positive look at what a community has to work with, as John McKnight suggests, rather than focus on deficiencies.[19] Wind power projects on Northern Plains reservations are a good example of this, as they develop a resource that is easy to overlook, shift focus away from the seeming barrenness of the land, and provide an ecological and sought-after energy resource. This approach could also counter inferiorization and frustration by highlighting intangible and community-owned cultural

assets. Dean Howard Smith (Mohawk) suggests that the introductory step of assessing intangible, human, and material capital or resources in a manner that is specific to the indigenous community seems to open up possibilities that perhaps have not been recognized, as these assets can include storytelling and educational skills, timber and forestry skills (Menominee tribe), location (Pequots), or cultural interest and reputation.[20]

Visioning is another method of community planning.[21] Participants envision their ideal communities and then assemble the steps to realize this future. This seeks consensus and fosters positive thinking but could be adjusted to include a vision of the past, which is a consideration of historical elements that identify, unite, and support the community. Idealizing the past in this process would be a way of indicating what is strongly valued by the community rather than frivolous fantasizing.

Just as Alcoholics Anonymous does not always succeed for Native Americans because its goals focus on a Protestant work ethic and a white-picket-fence view of normal life, some approaches will not work due to cultural conflicts, different priorities, or different expectations. [22] But there are many proposals from this field that could be adapted for use by Native communities.

WHERE HEALTH AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT INTERSECT

Mental health and physical health are major parts of collective and individual wellness and we can certainly benefit from looking at community development from the point of view of community health workers and healers. What are the root problems in the community that affect wellness? Should projects address only symptoms? Does a project treat one area and create an imbalance in another? Metaphor aside, a people that is strong, active, free of disease, mentally lively, and resilient is well equipped to thrive in other areas; the relationship between community development and health is a reciprocal one.

In many areas, from the North to the South, crushing poverty and hopelessness contribute to poor health. Poverty is connected to deprivation illnesses, the lack of allopathic care available to patients, and the loss of accessible solutions found in plant biodiversity and traditional knowledge. Overcrowded and inadequate housing helps spread diseases among families. Cholera and tuberculosis continue to reappear among the indigenous people with fewer resources. Families must feel terribly frustrated and powerless when members become ill with diseases that are known to be curable elsewhere.

While it is harder in Central and South America to distinguish indicators for indigenous people from national numbers, one can see that more economic success fixes some problems while it exacerbates others. In the community of San Pablito, for example, domestic violence, abandonment of children and elders, diabetes, and cancer are on the rise even as the number of houses with running water and refrigerators increases and the local clinic expands.[23] Some of the improvements can be credited to out-migrant workers who bring money back to the community, but they may also bring the effects of living outside their community. For instance, one man who went to the United States to work and bring home income also brought back the

community's first case of acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and infected his wife before passing away. Pepsi, snack chips, and instant noodles are often more accessible, convenient, and "modern" than fresh vegetables, and many families have given up farming or gardening to work on cash crops such as coffee or crafts. This also takes family members away from the time-consuming traditional foods.

The statistics on Native American health in the United States show more than just the effects of poor medical services (which can be improved with Native doctors, cultural sensitivity, and better-equipped clinics); the effects of overprocessed commodity food rations on Native people that result in high rates of diabetes and heart disease; the physical manifestations of the separation from traditional foods and activities (which can be improved through integrated food production and distribution programs); and the toxic effects of mining or other industrial polluters (which can be addressed through political and environmental action). There are many health problems that can be traced to sources that are not toxins, deficiencies, germs, or viruses but are social issues.

Both the US Census of 2000 and the Surgeon General's Report of 2003 show disproportionately high rates of certain problems. Alcohol-related deaths are much higher than the national rate, for example. Rates for current alcohol abuse and/or dependence for Vietnam veterans from northern plains and southwestern tribes have been estimated as high as 70 percent compared to 11 to 32 percent of their non-Native counterparts. The American Indian Vietnam Veterans Project found lifetime prevalence of PTSD to be 45 to 57 percent among American Indian veterans, rates significantly higher than among other Vietnam veterans.[24]

The rate of violent victimization of American Indian/Alaska Natives (AIANs) is more than twice the national average, and the US Census indicates that Native Americans are far more likely to be victimized by people of other races than other Americans. The rate of suicide for AIANs is 1.5 times the national rate. "Violent deaths—unintentional injuries, homicide, and suicide—account for 75 percent of all mortality in the second decade of life for AIANs."[25] The higher rate of traumatic exposure results in a 22 percent rate of PTSD for AIANs, compared to 8 percent in the general US population. There is a vicious circle in some areas where exposure to so many tragedies affects young people in such a way that they engage in high-risk activities (for example, reckless driving and careless sexual practices) or are depressed and/or suicidal—resulting in more tragedies. According to Clark and Stately, "The current generations of American Indians face layers of repetitive traumatic losses that are physical, cultural, and spiritual in nature. These multiple layers of repetitive loss, in addition to the major traumas of the past, contribute to the pain, psychological numbing, and destructive coping that can best be described as a chronic stress disorder at a community level."[26]

The consequences of these behavioral, mental, and physical health problems have a painful ripple effect in communities, reinforcing feelings of historical powerlessness, grief, and trauma. The term *soul wound* has been coined by Duran and Duran and accepted by several writers on Native mental

health.[27] Maria Yellow Horse Brave Heart (Hunkpapa/Oglala Lakota) has looked to historical traumas passed on from generation to generation in order to explain some of the mental/behavioral and physical health problems found among the Lakotas. "The historical trauma response [HTR] includes substance abuse as a vehicle for attempting to numb the pain associated with trauma. The HTR often includes other types of self-destructive behavior, suicidal thoughts and gestures, depression, anxiety, low self-esteem, anger, and difficulty recognizing and expressing emotions."[28] Repeated exposure to trauma and sympathetic responses to the traumas of family members exacerbates the effects. Brave Heart recommends the benefits of recognizing the sacred nature of family roles and bonds:

> A Native culture that traditionally fosters extensive familial and social support networks also offers protection against substance abuse. Native ceremonies often require discipline and commitment, delay gratification, and provide Native children with healthy role models of skills needed in refusal behavior and healthy defenses against substance use.[29]

Improvements in the physical, mental, and spiritual health of community members would provide the stronger individuals needed to work on improving collective well-being, while a stronger community would provide improved services for collective and individual well-being. Taiaiake Alfred makes a strong connection between behavioral health and community: "The only way to erase this pain and sorrow is to confront it directly. Most Native life is a vortex of pain in need of an anchor of hope. The pain is the result of colonialism. Yet the real tragedy is that many Native people are left to sink for want of the hope that a healthy, supportive, and cohesive community could provide."[30]

Different culturally specific approaches are being used to address these multifaceted problems, combining community participation and mental and physical health practices. Some programs have integrated traditional food production (for example, bison and wild rice) into community food programs that seek a return to healthier more suitable diets. On the Pine Ridge Reservation, grassroots groups and other tribal governments along with star athlete Billy Mills have contributed water, seedlings, and assistance to the Slim Buttes AG project in order to promote family gardens. These unite generations in the hard work needed to produce healthy, fresh foods and even some foods used for ceremonies. The 500 community gardens provide fresh organic produce to some 3,800 people on a reservation that has an estimated 80 percent unemployment and high rates of diabetes and obesity.[31]

In Northern California, Chapa De clinics are run by a consortium of local tribes and offer a wide variety of services and programs addressing mental, dental, physical, and spiritual health; provide health education, prenatal, and perinatal care; and run self-esteem-building cultural workshops such as beadwork, creation of dance regalia, and herbology. Based on the knowledge that all aspects of health are integrated, Chapa De's programs empower clients to improve their health on all levels. Programs are integrated and

the different departments work together closely. Clinic Administrator Susan Navarro explains, "We see ourselves as multidisciplinary to treat the whole individual, really into prevention. We use the allopathic model, which is the western model, but we want to incorporate more traditional modalities into the services we provide."[32] These include massage, acupuncture, and traditional Native treatments that a health service otherwise couldn't bill for. The balance that Chapa De infuses into planning, networking, board and personnel, educational programs, and holistic health service offerings makes the organization a nexus between agencies and community, between needs and resources. By reaching out in many directions similar to the local oak trees, Chapa De is growing strong roots that will make the organization a solid and long-lasting presence in Northern California's Native and non-Native communities as it improves its clients' well-being.

In Canada, the Center for Indigenous Nutrition and Environment (CINE) is a collaborative effort among researchers, environmentalists, and First Peoples but has an all-Native governing board. It aims for *participatory research*; a term that usually suggests Native participation in a project directed by others and often is not much different from being an informant. However, CINE's response strategies seem to respond largely to tribal/community requests for research and information.

San Francisco's Native American Health Center has invented a program/ policy known as the "Circle of Care" that incorporates practices such as "youth empowerment, leadership training, self-help, higher education, communication skills, affordable housing, good nutrition, community mobilization, economic development, wellness education, positive parenting, traditional medicine, and a value system based on Indian culture," natural elements, and social institutions in a holistic system of care.[33]

These programs are innovative, holistic, and culturally specific in their pursuit of well-being. They take into account the many cultural, historic, medical, spiritual, mental, economic, environmental, and social elements that shape the Native health panorama. Community development can certainly emulate and parallel this approach in its own pursuit of quality of life. Rose Clark and Antony Stately, in assessing human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (HIV/AIDS) treatment programs for Native people, write that successful treatment of individuals', families', and communities' historical grief should use culture as a resource that offers protection and builds strength. "For interventions to be culturally relevant, they must be based on holistic philosophy, or principles that combine the biological, psychological, social, and spiritual aspects of a person's life. Traditional values of AI/ANs promote physical and emotional well-being among all Indian people."[34] An integral approach can support the importance of cultural strengths. It seems that by extension community development that is holistic, balanced, and culturally appropriate could work in a parallel or reciprocal way with the mental, physical, and spiritual health workers in the community, because many root causes of collective problems addressed by community development are also at the root of individual or family problems.

In addition to physical and mental health, spiritual wellness is important for both the individual and the collective but worldview may be overlooked in certain approaches that focus on quantifiable, tangible, immediately perceptible results. But Vine Deloria Jr. reasons, "For it is the manner in which people conceive reality that motivates them to behave in certain ways, that provides them with a system of values, and that enables them to justify their activities."

Many people do not refer to their spiritual practices and beliefs as a religion, but as a way of living. Is it possible then to discuss community planning and ignore the most deeply rooted, widely shared, and basic ideas about how people in that community should live? Furthermore, definitions of well-being and health are intimately tied to spiritual beliefs and notions of how one is supposed to live properly (according to one's own cultural and personal definition). Many worldviews tie human health directly to that of the larger community of relatives (for example, animals, mountains, winds, and spirits), making it clear that our work in keeping the world well is what will keep us well.

In very broad brushstrokes, we can point out some ways of thinking and living that can contribute to community development. For example, worldviews based in nonlinear time imply, unlike free-market philosophy, that endless growth is impossible and that natural cycles must be worked with rather than conquered. Alternative notions of time also suggest that things happen when they are supposed to, rather than as scheduled, and this may require different attitudes toward planning. Reciprocity—with other people or with other environmental or spirit beings—is a widely shared value that shapes both social and economic relations within many indigenous communities. It implies systems of ethics and equity, shared responsibility, and sustainability. Many indigenous people say "all my relatives" in their own languages (*Mitakuye Oyasin* in Lakota, or *no-o-go-mach* in Mi'kmaq, for example) to represent concepts of interconnectedness, and this familial relationship suggests that the effects of development will be felt by many humans and other living things that all depend on each other and require public works for the collective good. As Vine Deloria Jr. explains:

> A living universe within which events and actions have moral content necessarily suggests that all things are related. Not only is everything related, but it also participates in the moral content of events, so responsibility for maintaining the harmony of life falls equally on all creatures.[35]

In South and Central America work bees (a gathering where people work on a common project, often combined with socializing) go by the names *tequio*, *faena*, or *minga*, but the ethic of organizing the community for the collective good is virtually the same. The natural order of interrelatedness is reflected in social organizing. The Haudenosaunee concept of keeping seven generations in mind during community development has been adopted widely throughout the indigenous Americas and presents a stark contrast to the structures of fiscal years and fast returns on investments.

CONCLUSION

We can see that indigenous peoples' current relationship to development has evolved in connection to their places, cultures, and histories. Along with this experience, their own worldviews have adapted and shaped some outstanding strategies for surviving and thriving. In the very best of these cases, the communities will be able to heal old social fractures, revitalize knowledge and practices, strengthen abilities, and restore the soul of the communities to foster long-term well-being. While some community-development plans may try to treat issues with a pharmaceutical approach, suppressing the symptoms or addressing isolated problems, a holistic approach can revitalize, strengthen, and sustain the whole community body for many lifetimes to come.

NOTES

1. Perspectives on Native American Health conference, University of California, Davis, 3 April 2004.

2. Taiaiake Alfred, *Peace, Power, Righteousness: An Indigenous Manifesto* (Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University Press, 1999), 35.

3. According to the 2001 census, Native American small businesses now number 197,300. Native businesses in North America currently include publishing, film studios and recording companies (e.g., Canyon Records, SOAR), clothing design, energy traders (e.g., Consortium of Energy Resource Tribes, Global Development Corp.), software (e.g., Kabotic Software Technologies), and airlines (e.g., Air Creebec, First Air), in addition to the better-known gaming industry (Barbara Powell, "Rez Biz: Growing Native Economies," *Native Peoples Arts and Lifeways* 18 no. 1 [November–December 2003], http://www.nativepeoples.com/article/articles/100/1/Rez-Biz%3A-Growing -Native-Economies [accessed 13 June 2006]). Native businesses now make up 11% of all businesses in Alaska. Eighty-three percent of the Pine Ridge labor force is engaged in microenterprise and 30% of these get at least half of their income from microenterprise. Across the United States, finance and technical assistance organizations, tribal college classes, and tribal business information centers all provide services to Native enterprises, and loans have been provided for 373 tribal business projects, totaling 4.7 million dollars (Native American Entrepreneurship Report, March 2002, Native Assets Research Center, First Nations Development Institute, Fredericksburg, VA).

There are currently 247 tribally run casinos in the United States that fund or contribute to fire departments, health clinics, schools, museums, genealogy and history research, scholarships, reforestation, hatcheries, and agriculture programs or, in a few cases, pay out "per capita" payments to tribal members. One northern California tribe has invested in a stock portfolio in order to assure long-term income for the community. The Confederated Tribes of the Umatillas' smaller casino provides employment and income as well as a tribal clinic, recreation center, police force, tribal government building, reforestation work, and a salmon hatchery. Ben Sherman (Oglala), the chair of Western American Indian Chamber of Commerce on Indian

Tourism compared Native private enterprise developers to "modern day warriors" (Ben Sherman, "Tourism in Indian Country: Opportunities for Developing and Protecting Our Resources," *Winds of Change* [2001]: 48).

For Central and South America, many economic indicators simply do not differentiate between indigenous and other social sectors, but the last few decades have seen a rise in support for indigenous economic development in the form of microlending (e.g., Aid to Artisan, Freedom from Hunger) and Fair Trade marketing support for coffee, chocolate, and crafts (e.g., Global Exchange, TransFair). Growing contact with faraway markets, often through the Internet or migration, as in the case of the Otavalo Quechuas who travel to Europe and the United States to sell crafts and perform Andean music, offers new sales outlets and information about going prices. Ecotourism offers some communities a way to preserve environment and culture while bringing work and income. Although this isn't always the case, some indigenous groups have been able to take a good deal of control over the tourism in their region in spite of the clout of this $10 billion industry.

4. Susan Guyette, *Planning for Balanced Development: A Guide for Native American and Rural Communities* (Santa Fe, NM: Clear Light Publishers, 1996).

5. Arturo Escobar, *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995). George Manuel and Michael Posluns, *The Fourth World: An Indian Reality* (Toronto: Collier, 1974).

6. Jack D. Forbes, "Envelopment, Proletarianization and Inferiorization: Some Aspects of Colonialism's Impact upon Native Americans and Other People of Color in Eastern North America," *Journal of Ethnic Studies* 18, no. 4 (Winter 1991): 95–122.

7. Peter Nabokov, *A Forest of Time: American Indian Ways of History* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

8. James S. Anaya, *Indigenous People in International Law* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), 184.

9. Mariano de la Loma, personal communication, San Pablito, Puebla, Mexico, 2003.

10. Stephen Cornell, *The Return of the Native* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), 216.

11. Alfred, *Peace, Power, Righteousness,* 21.

12. Duane Champagne and Ismael Abu-Saad, *The Future of Indigenous Peoples: Strategies for Survival and Development* (Los Angeles: UCLA American Indian Studies, 2003), 210–11.

13. Escobar, *Encountering Development*, 85.

14. John Moore, *The Political Economy of North American Indians* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993), 15.

15. Alice Littlefield, "Learning to Labor: Native American Education 1890–1930" in *The Political Economy of North American Indians*, ed. John Moore (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993), 45.

16. Ivan Illich, *Shadow Work* (Boston: Marion Boyars, 1981), 15.

17. David Putnam, "What Makes Democracy Work," *National Civic Review* 82, no. 2 (1993): 101–7.

18. Larry Lyon, *The Community in Urban Society* (Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, 1999).

19. John L. McKnight, "Looking at Capacity, Not Deficiency" in *Revitalizing Our Cities*, ed. Marc Lipsitz (New York: The Fund for an American Renaissance and the National Center for Neighborhood Enterprise, 1985), 101–6.

20. Dean Howard Smith, *Modern Tribal Development* (Berkeley: Altamira Press, 2000), 103.

21. Gary Paul Green and Anna Haines, *Asset Building and Community Development* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2002), 43.

22. Mark Monroe, *An Indian in White America* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1994), 106.

23. Lupe Aparicio (head nurse at San Pablito clinic), personal communication, 2003.

24. US Department of Health and Human Services, Office of the Surgeon General, "Mental Health: Culture, Race, and Ethnicity," 2001, http://www.mentalhealth .samhsa.gov/cre/ch4_conclusions.asp (accessed 13 June 2003).

25. Ibid.

26. Rose Clark and Antony Stately, "American Indians and HIV/AIDS" in *Healing and Mental Health for Native Americans; Speaking in Red*, ed. Ethan Nebelkopf and Mary Philips (Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press, 2004), 159.

27. Ibid., 159.

28. Maria Yellow Horse Brave Heart, "Historical Trauma Response among Natives" in Nebelkopf and Philips, *Healing and Mental Health for Native Americans*, 7.

29. Ibid., 14.

30. Alfred, *Peace, Power, Righteousness*, 34.

31. David Melmer, "Healthy Food and Work Part of Pine Ridge Gardens," *Indian Country Today* 20 December 2004, http://www.indiancountry.com/content .cfm?id=1096410033 (accessed 13 June 2003).

32. Susan Navarro, personal communication, 24 October 2003.

33. Ethan Nebelkopf and Janet King, "Urban Trails: A Holistic System of Care," in Nebelkopf and Philips, *Healing and Mental Health for Native Americans*, 50.

34. Clark and Stately, "American Indians and HIV/AIDS," 163.

35. Vine Deloria Jr., *Spirit and Reason: The Vine Deloria Jr. R*eader (Golden, CO: Fulcrum Publishing, 1999), 52.