

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Survival of the Spirit: Chiricahua Apaches in Captivity. By H. Henrietta Stockel.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6k14s4gj>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Szasz, Margaret Connell

Publication Date

1994

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

This is not an endorsement of "golden age" history before or during Spanish times; nor is it an indictment of Spain for native demographic, cultural, or political reversals that accompanied the occupation of North America. Instead, in well-written, plain language, Weber tells us what happened and then dissects the chronology by theme, analyzing motive, immediate impact, and long-term results. Conquistadors and warriors, friars and native priests, viceroys and chieftains emerge as real humans with strengths and weaknesses. Weber never loses his grasp of the significance of differences in cultures as they, at times, compete; at times, cooperate; and ultimately come to co-inhabit lands throughout the region. Simultaneously, he tells us that peoples mixed, forming new groups that became the cultural core of new Borderlands societies just as Spain lost her foothold in North America.

The power of the book, beyond its utility as an unequalled one-volume synthesis, is in the author's unusual sensitivity to his historical actors—one-on-one—and to his continued interest in understanding and unraveling the multicultural landscape of North America. No social scientist since Carey McWilliams has done as much as David Weber to promote awareness of Spain and Mexico's impact and importance in the peopling of the United States. This is excellent history and deserves a place in the libraries of ethnohistorians as well.

William R. Swagerty
University of Idaho

Survival of the Spirit: Chiricahua Apaches in Captivity. By H. Henrietta Stockel. Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1993. 360 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

In October 1894, 259 Chiricahua Apache prisoners of war arrived at Fort Sill, Oklahoma, their third site of imprisonment since their surrender in 1886. In the eight years since they had been removed from their homeland in the southwestern desert, they had been crowded into harsh quarters in Fort Marion or at Fort Pickens, Florida, and in a malaria-infested region just north of Mobile, Alabama. During these years, they had been immersed in the heavy, humid environment of the Southeast. The Southwest still permeated the minds of those who could remember, but, even for them, that memory was receding. Mildred Cleghorn, who was born during

the Fort Sill years, recalled her mother's recollection of their arrival at the new location. On that night, "a whole new generation of Chiricahuas, unaccustomed to such cacaphone, encountered the howls of coyotes plaintively echoing about the landscape." Others who "dimly remembered" began to recall their earlier days, but

the emotion evoked by the sounds now unfamiliar except in memory must have been too great to contain. Reminded thus of times long past and places far away, a number of the old women began to cry. They felt the people had come home at last (p. 247).

Even at Fort Sill the Chiricahua were not yet home. An estimated three hundred more of them would die in the ensuing two decades in Oklahoma, but they were finally west of the Mississippi River, a considerable distance north of the Gulf, and on the edge of the arid West. The contrast between these two environments—the moist Southeast and the dry Southwest—is perhaps impossible to comprehend without having lived in both. In the high desert, the sparseness of vegetation, the muted colors of mountain and plain, and the vast, clear sky are etched into one's being. For the Chiricahua, the western edge of Indian Territory was evocative of their traditional southwestern lands.

The twenty-seven-year imprisonment of these Chiricahua is perhaps less well known than the "Trail of Tears"—when the major tribes of the Southeast were removed to Indian Territory—and the "Long Walk" of the Navajo, who were incarcerated at Bosque Redondo, or Fort Sumner, along the Pecos River in eastern New Mexico. While Geronimo, healer and warrior of the Chiricahua, bears an international reputation, few Americans are aware of the fate of the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Apache. And even those who may have become acquainted with this episode of our American past through Ted Turner's 1993 production *Geronimo* are probably not aware of the impact of disease on these prisoners. H. Henrietta Stockel's book tells the story. *Survival of the Spirit, Chiricahua Apaches in Captivity*, focuses on the devastating consequences of contagious diseases such as tuberculosis on a people accustomed to freedom of movement in a desert environment; it also substantiates the Chiricahua people's remarkable persistence, despite their battering by inhuman conditions and a neglectful U.S. government.

Stockel's background in Native American health and her experience as author of *Women of the Apache Nation* enabled her to deal

effectively with the complexities of nineteenth-century contagious diseases and other illnesses, and also to provide some background on Apache healing methods refined through observation and adaptation to the natural environment. Stockel reiterates the general perception that precontact native people were extraordinarily free of the common cold, measles, the plague, and other ailments long familiar to the people of the Eastern Hemisphere. Moreover, she distinguishes between the Apache response to those diseases and the response of their neighbors, the Pueblo Indians. As sedentary, village-dwelling people, the Pueblo were frequently devastated by epidemics following the Spanish arrival; by contrast, the Apache, who were accustomed to moving to new locations whenever necessary, continued this pattern after outsiders moved into the region. Consequently, they avoided the destructive impact of the contagious diseases that afflicted the Pueblo. As long as they were free, the Apache maintained their general health.

Geronimo, one of the last to hold out against the American military forces, ridiculed his enemies for their inexperience. The father of renowned Chiricahua artist Allan Houser recalled Geronimo saying, "[T]he soldiers always gave the Apaches warning because they said 'ready, aim, fire,' and by that time the Apaches had scattered" (p. 251). Even Geronimo acquiesced, however, when he began to fear that the Chiricahua as a people would disappear. (He is still criticized today by some descendants for holding out too long.)

Survival of the Spirit recounts how the contagious diseases common to the Southeast almost wiped out the Apache during their lengthy imprisonment. Stockel's portrayal of the prisoners of war as victims is reinforced by the shocking mortality statistics during their incarceration. In the 1870s, a count of the Chiricahua revealed some 930 members; those who were captured and sent by train to Florida numbered 519; those who remained in 1913 numbered 275. The majority returned to the mountainous lands of the Mescalero Apache in south-central New Mexico, where their children and grandchildren live today. Stockel reserves a special section for the impact of these horrific conditions on the children, especially those who were forcibly removed to eastern boarding schools such as Richard Henry Pratt's Carlisle Indian School. Of one hundred Chiricahua children removed to Carlisle, half died, with the primary cause of death being tuberculosis. When these children became mortally ill, Pratt sent them home to die among their imprisoned families.

By contrast, Stockel's portrayal of the Chiricahua as participants in their own destiny is strengthened by their actions and their attitude during imprisonment. Men such as Naiche and Geronimo, who were sent to Fort Pickens, Florida, were very active in maintaining the grounds surrounding the fort; like the prisoners sent to Fort Marion, they were subjects of curiosity for tourists, and they earned cash by selling crafts to these visitors. When the Fort Pickens male prisoners were reunited with their families, they encouraged the children to continue their schooling, viewing education as the route to understanding the world of the "white eyes." During their imprisonment at Mount Vernon, Alabama, the Chiricahua leadership also negotiated for removal from this deadly location.

Stockel's assessment of the U.S. government's motivation for the prolonged incarceration of the Chiricahua Apache remains ambivalent. In her introduction, she writes, "I cannot prove willful genocide by the U.S. government" (p. xxii). In her afterword, however, she probes the ineptitude of the federal government, arguing that the government could have returned the tubercular Chiricahua to New Mexico, where they might have recovered, as did so many other non-Native Americans who relocated there for their health. Stockel asks, Is this form of neglect "in and of itself genocide?" Even before writing this account, she promised an elderly Chiricahua that she would write in her book, "Yes, I believe it happened," to which he responded, "No one has done that before" (p. 275).

This is a powerful story, but it is strengthened further by the types of sources used. Stockel combines interviews with archivists and others at the imprisonment sites with first-hand descriptions of those sites; she also juxtaposes the writings of Eve Ball, Dan L. Thrapp, Morris Opler, and other specialists with Chiricahua oral history. The strongest chapter consists of excerpts from interviews that Stockel conducted with Chiricahua people. One of these members concludes: "[T]hinking of these things, my opinion is not very good of Western society" (p. 255). The question of culpability may remain open, but the suffering of these people lends credence to the assessment of one Chiricahua: "We learned that an Executive Order was as worthless as any other piece of paper. If a man's spoken word is worthless, so is his written one" (p. 256).

Margaret Connell Szasz
University of New Mexico