

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Comanche Ethnography: Field Notes of E. Adamson Hoebel, Waldo R. Wedel, Gustav G. Carlson, and Robert H. Lowie. Compiled and edited by Thomas W. Kavanagh.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6mv777rt>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Campbell, Gregory R.

Publication Date

2010

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Comanche Ethnography: Field Notes of E. Adamson Hoebel, Waldo R. Wedel, Gustav G. Carlson, and Robert H. Lowie. Compiled and edited by Thomas W. Kavanagh. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 571 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

Scholars of Native North America have long recognized that underlying much of the ethnographic literature written about various indigenous societies is often a much richer, detailed data source: unpublished field notes collected by ethnographers. Among Native American societies, a significant proportion of ethnographic field research was collected during the early era of anthropology's development as a science, an era in which many elders remembered or still practiced prereservation cultural traditions. Many of those field notes are archived, across the country or internationally, in various repositories and institutions. Obviously, the published ethnographic works, although often data-rich descriptions of a particular tribe's social behaviors and cultural life, are edited, synthetic treatments.

Part 1 contains the ethnographic field notes generated during the 1933 Comanche field party. Under the direction of Ralph Linton, five graduate students spent six weeks recording aspects of traditional Comanche culture as remembered by eighteen Comanche elders. In the introduction, the editor provides brief biographical sketches of the ethnographers and Comanche consultants, as well as descriptions of each ethnographer's notebooks, including data strengths and weaknesses. Kavanagh also explicitly outlines his editorial considerations and procedures, including the protocols used to make the notes more readable and useful.

With the exception of several consultant interviews, which did not record a specific date that the interview was conducted, the main body of collected ethnographic field notes is organized by Comanche consultant, according to the date or dates on which they were interviewed during the course of the project. Within each interview, the editor provides topical labels, highlighting the subject matter. In addition, Kavanagh, where appropriate, supplies footnotes to the ethnographic entries, either to enhance, to clarify, or as a point of cross-reference to other entries or use in later published accounts about the Comanche. As Kavanagh points out, the results of the 1933 ethnographic field investigations resulted in numerous publications that are considered standards when researching Comanche cultural traditions.

As a compilation, the ethnographic field notes offer insights into kinship, social organization, material culture, sociopolitical organization, religious beliefs and practices, economics, history, and oral traditions. Although the quality and quantity of data varies within each consultant interview, the end result is an immensely detailed, nuanced, useful data source and reference covering a myriad of subjects about Comanche culture.

While gathering the 1933 ethnographic field party notes, the editor decided that Robert Lowie's 1912 field investigations, archived at the American Museum of Natural History, warrant publication. Using the same editorial protocols, along with appropriate footnotes, the editor in part 2 reproduced Lowie's field notes. Although the entries are not cross-referenced with any of

the ethnographic data collected during the 1933 Comanche field party, the data is a welcome addition to the volume. The inclusion of Lowie's ethnographic data only enhances the work's utility as a reference source. Further, the appendices linking the 1933 field party notes with three major published works produced by E. Adamson Hoebel or Gustav G. Carlson, participants in the field project, provide a useful guide for comparative purposes.

As the author who compiled, edited, and organized the work, Kavanagh should be commended for his efforts. The book is meticulously constructed, providing a resource that will become a standard for Great Plains research. For the Comanche people, scholars, or anyone interested in indigenous cultural traditions of the Southern Great Plains, *Comanche Ethnography* is vast in topical subject matter, exposing the complexity of Comanche cultural traditions. It is a piece of scholarship that brings the importance of field notes as a valuable cultural and scientific resource to the forefront. For Kavanagh, a scholar of Comanche ethnography and ethnohistory, the project was clearly a labor of love.

Gregory R. Campbell
University of Montana

Comb Ridge and Its People: The Ethnohistory of a Rock. By Robert S. McPherson. Logan: Utah State University Press, 2009. 264 pages. \$26.95 paper.

Since the publication of Keith H. Basso's *Wisdom Sits in Places* (1996), cultural anthropologists, ethnohistorians, and cultural geographers have experienced a growing appreciation for living landscapes. In *Comb Ridge and Its People: The Ethnohistory of a Rock*, Robert S. McPherson follows in this time-honored tradition, inviting the reader on a narrative journey through both time and place, including places that truly ignite the imagination, such as the massive alcoves within Comb Ridge that are reported to be the breathing holes of Arrow Head Big Snake, or Tl'iish K'aa'. Among the Navajo, this reptile is said to have flown through the air before becoming frozen into the rock formation now known as Comb Ridge (64–65). Although invisible from outer space, this "one-hundred-mile-long, two-hundred-foot-high, serrated cliff [that] cuts the sky" of southeast Utah is nevertheless noteworthy as the centerpiece of McPherson's new ethnohistory. To the question, "Is there more than a pamphlet to be written about the local history of the Comb Ridge and the people of southeastern Utah?" McPherson answers with a resounding yes (1). This text includes a table of contents, notes, bibliographic references, and index. There also is an extensive array of color photographs, black-and-white historic photographs, and a three-dimensional topographic map depicting the unique physiography that defines this portion of southeastern Utah situated east of Monument Valley and west of the Four Corners and Mesa Verde National Park.

Readers interested in the Southwest; archaeology; the ethnohistory of Paiutes, Navajos and Utes; the contact period; and the precursors to the