

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Native Religions and Cultures of North America: Anthropology of the Sacred. Edited by Lawrence E. Sullivan.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6nv4727q>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 25(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Talbot, Steve

Publication Date

2001-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

starting point of the investigation as well as the nonchronological arrangement. Only one page of discussion ties each section together. The texts, furthermore, range from William Faulkner's *Go Down Moses*, published in 1942, to *Tombstone*, produced in 1993, and back to *The Wild Bunch*, made in 1969, and so forth. What's missing is the story about the shifting attitudes and historical forces on both sides of the border that make these different visions possible. A clearer overall narrative could have tied these works together more profitably.

Some readers may object to Canfield's choice to treat classic and popular works with no differentiation. He also reads popular films in the same manner as novels. My concern on this score is that mainstream film production can differ radically from literary production in its goals and effects, not to mention its medium.

Canfield does take pains to include an American and a Mexican woman writer as well as several male Mexican writers and filmmakers, but he has included no American Indian works in the study. This seems curious given the two chapters on Geronimo and the significant contributions of Native peoples within the Southwest. Even within the analyses of the films *Broken Arrow*, *Buffalo Soldiers*, and *American Legend*, Canfield focuses on the border crossing of the white and black protagonists and never on the Apache characters. He does consider the various depictions of Geronimo as either heroic or villainous, but gives little attention to the Indian characters who are frequently making huge concessions in crossing cultural borders. Possibly these concessions are not well developed in the films. It may also be symptomatic, however, of a shortcoming in border studies generally. The dialectic of the United States and Mexico tends to overshadow that of indigenous peoples and immigrants on both sides of the border.

Aside from these concerns, I found the book to provide thoughtful, close readings of a number of works I would not have considered together. Once yoked, they render a new appreciation for regional themes and help to advance our consideration of borders of all kinds. By teaching us to resist adherence to one group, these mavericks may offer a model for much broader understanding.

Julie Tharp

University of Wisconsin, Marshfield/Wood County

Native Religions and Cultures of North America: Anthropology of the Sacred. Edited by Lawrence E. Sullivan. New York: The Continuum Publishing Company, 2000. 249 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

This edited work by Lawrence E. Sullivan is mainly an anthropological treatment of American Indian "religion." Sullivan is director of the Center for the Study of World Religions at Harvard University and a past president (1996) of the American Academy of Religion. The book is part of a series entitled *The Anthropology of the Sacred*, which he edits with Julien Ries. Like most anthropological works dealing with Native peoples, "North America" apparently

means north of Mexico. From an indigenist perspective, this is an illogical limitation that represents an Anglocentric bias in mainstream academe.

The focus of the book is on Indian spirituality as manifest in religion in what is termed "the anthropology of the sacred," whatever that means. As a Native American studies scholar (even though my Ph.D. is in anthropology), I found some of the anthropological lingo in the introduction and in a couple of the selections a bit tedious and unnecessary.

Eight North American Indian and Eskimo groups are surveyed: Yurok, Absarokee/Crow, Creek/Muskogee, Lakota, Navajo, Mescalero Apache, Tlingit, and Yup'ik Eskimo. Authors include Thomas Buckley, Richard Dauenhauer, Ann Fienup-Riordan, Trudy Griffin-Pierce, John Grim, Joel Martin, William K. Powers, and Ines Talamantez. A final chapter by Franco Meli reviews the sacred in American Indian literature. At least two of the academic contributors, Talamantez and Griffin-Pierce, are either Indian or of Indian descent. Others, such as William K. Powers, are established scholars for their respective Native American groups, in Powers's case, the Lakota.

Sullivan introduces the nine selections by correctly emphasizing that "religion stands at the heart of Native American life" (p. 1). Then, after several pages of a somewhat meandering discourse, he almost too generously summarizes each selection. The reader can easily ascertain the substance of the respective contributions by reading these introductory pages, which end with a brief and not very successful attempt to find common themes among the nine selections. In actuality, the collection is a potpourri of articles with little continuity in the way of a consistent paradigm, or overarching theme, save for the general subject matter of Native religions. Nevertheless, the work is a significant collection, even though some selections are more noteworthy than others. The work contains some useful ethnographic summaries, and several contributions are truly insightful and innovative. For the student of Indian spirituality, the book is worth consulting.

I found the essay on the ceremonies of the Yurok by Thomas Buckley timely and interesting. It is one of the most substantive articles in the collection. In it he analyzes the Jump Dance and the Deerskin Dance over time in an ethnology of world renewal. The sections on dialogues and cultural politics are especially interesting.

The essay by John Grim on the Absarokee/Crow "anthropology of the sacred" is more problematic. I found the anthropological jargon in this rather long article somewhat difficult to follow. (I felt like the talking parrot recently featured in *National Geographic* who admonished a younger parrot protégé just learning to talk: "Speak clearly!") Although it contains some good information on spirituality, kinship, and social structure, it becomes at times tedious and overly erudite.

Joel Martin, on the other hand, gives an excellent account of the continuity in Creek/Muskogee religion despite the changes it has undergone in four major periods of history: "With each major transformation, Creeks altered their religious formation, . . . yet clearly depend[ed] upon the past for key symbols, rites, and values" (p. 87).

William Powers gives an excellent summary and useful description of contemporary Lakota spirituality in his essay. He details the seven sacred ceremonies given the Lakota by White Buffalo Calf Pipe Woman, whom some say was the manifestation of Wohpe or Falling Star. He also references the annual winter ride that today commemorates the 1890 Wounded Knee massacre, "Wiping the Tears."

Trudy Griffin-Pierce's contribution on Navajo religion is a beautiful piece. She gives a detailed description of the Navajo worldview, the Diyin Dine'e, or holy people, and the chantways to treat illness and restore health and balance in all its many manifestations. Her explanation of the Mother Earth-Father Sky duality in Navajo religious thought is also excellent.

In the essay on "contemporary Mescalero Apache ceremonialism," Ines Talamantez analyzes the Apache puberty ceremony, Isanaklesh Gotal, for Apache girls. The creation story of a divine Apache deity, Isanaklesh, explains every detail of the contemporary ceremony. Talamantez contends that the ceremony "functions as the most significant factor in preserving traditional Apache values and giving them meaning in present-day Apache life" (p. 155).

The grace of Richard Dauenhauer's contribution is that it surveys Tlingit religion in three parts: "the pre-contact period, major post-contact religious influences, and some contemporary interactions of the two" (p. 161).

Ann Fienup-Riordan describes the traditional spiritual culture of the Yup'ik Eskimos. The weakness of this essay, however, is its lack of contemporary perspective. Her contribution is in the tradition of the ethnographies presented in mainstream anthropological writing of the past.

I enjoyed reading the essay by Franco Meli on how the sacred is portrayed in Indian literature, although it is a rather strange fit for an anthropological collection. On the other hand, it is perfectly appropriate for the American Indian studies.

Conclusion? Not the most exciting work from a Native American studies perspective, but something the student of Indian spirituality would want to take a look at, if nothing more than for several of the more innovative and substantive articles it contains.

Steve Talbot

Oregon State University

The Plains Indian Photographs of Edward S. Curtis. Edited by the University of Nebraska Press. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 2001. 186 pages. \$50.00 cloth.

With few rare exceptions, scholarly consideration of Edward S. Curtis's photographs have almost exclusively discussed his work in its entirety—the epic multitribal, twenty-volume form entitled *The North American Indian*, published from 1907 to 1930. Because of this tendency to generalize across Native North America, a volume examining Curtis's relationship with indigenous people of a specific culture area is a welcome divergence from the routine. This book