UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

Migration, Modernity and Social Transformation in South Asia:Migration, Modernity and Social Transformation in South Asia

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6q49w81h>

Journal

American Anthropologist, 107(4)

ISSN

0002-7294

Author

LEONARD, KAREN

Publication Date

2005-12-01

DOI

10.1525/aa.2005.107.4.734

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

he highlights key research findings of the STEP, especially regarding the development of disequilibrium theory, which constitutes a serious challenge to conventional understandings of ecosystems as self-regulating equilibrium systems. The literature review (Chapter 2) delineates the links between equilibrium thinking in ecology and ecological thinking in cultural anthropology, especially the rise of cultural ecology in the mid-1900s. He documents the challenges to these approaches manifested in disequilibrium theory in ecology and behavioral and political ecology in anthropology, including the role of methodological individualism and rational choice theory in behavioral ecology. McCabe takes an intermediate stance, claiming that "the theoretical focus of this book can be seen as . . . the integration of individual- and systems-level analysis" (p. 31). He does provide multiple levels of analysis including individual decision making, group-level herding patterns, and national and international policies that affect Turkana pastoralists. The analyses of decision-making patterns among four herding families (particularly the male heads of these families), however, are the core of the book and, in my view, the most effective in making his case. His analysis of decision making seems closer to rational choice (which can also accommodate exogenous factors) than he claims.

Following the literature review (which includes a nice discussion of theories of violence in anthropology) and background material on the Turkana and their environment in Part 1, Parts 2 and 3 present a detailed analysis of herding decision making among four families that McCabe followed from 1980–96. Narrative accounts of movements and their rationales are followed by a quantitative analysis of reasons for movement, frequencies, and durations. The season by season accounting of movements, although at times tedious, clearly shows the influence of environmental factors and (in)security in the patterns of movement of the herders. Herding strategies are also determined by individual personalities (more aggressive or more conservative) and by individual circumstances (size of the herd, availability of labor, and trustworthiness of herding labor). Thus, although the environment (both natural and political) clearly puts constraints on individuals and broadly patterns their movements (as further demonstrated in the group-level analysis of Part 4), there is still scope for individual choice and variation—something not well captured in disequilibrium theory. McCabe also discusses the effects of marriage decisions and social reciprocity, again using the four families as examples, and how these social goals intertwine with that of increasing livestock numbers for survival. It is difficult to evaluate how generalizable the family growth patterns observed here are, and the discussion would have been strengthened by some theorizing of the operation of the social institutions (e.g., marriage, reciprocity, and management of common property) in general.

The book is weaker in its conclusions about the implications of disequilibrium thinking for policies toward pastoralists. McCabe rightly calls for East African governments to provide security for pastoralists, but he does not analyze

why such calls have not been effective to date. He does not comment on recent studies of pastoral land tenure or conflict mitigation programs conducted in Kenya, nor on the ongoing constitutional drafting process in which land rights are likely to be institutionalized. The impact of the market economy is downplayed. Although it may not have been critical to the four families studied, markets are certainly an important force for the Turkana, many of whom have left the district to seek employment elsewhere. That said, this book is an important contribution to the literature on East African pastoralism and an effective demonstration of disequilibrium ecology in action.

Migration, Modernity and Social Transformation in South Asia. Filippo Osella and Katy Gardner, eds. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2004. 380 pp.

KAREN LEONARD

University of California, Irvine

These 13 ethnographic studies of international and intranational migration in South Asia look at both the receiving and sending communities and are framed by a useful introduction by Katy Gardner and Filippino Osella that reviews the theoretical literature and compares the chapters along several dimensions. The book calls attention to intranational migration and the consequences of migration for the migrants' home communities, redressing the greater attention often given to international migration and questioning simplistic notions of cultural hybridity versus essentialism, cosmopolitanism, postnationality, and the like. The chapters address these theoretical issues vigorously. Another strength is the historical depth and cross-referencing characteristic of the studies (some chapters were given in 2001 at a University of Sussex conference and those plus others were published in *Contributions to Indian Sociology* in 2003).

Because the outstanding feature of the volume is the thorough ethnographic and historical research conducted by the contributors, a necessarily brief summary follows. Jonathan Spencer reviews population movements in Sri Lanka to show management by colonial officials and an evolving postcolonial rhetoric of national purity for mass mobilization; here, the politics of movement and violence and the history of border transgressions and hybridity questions current notions of transnationalism, globalization, and a "post-national" order. Roger Ballard looks at Pakistani migrants from Mirpur in Britain, focusing on this district to show that substantial remittances over several decades have not produced sustainable economic development there. Ballard argues that both economic and social transformations have been seriously constrained, not through the failure of Mirpuri entrepreneurship but because the Pakistani state has failed to provide infrastructural transformations. Francis Watkins's study of poor Pakhtuns from Kohery village in northern Pakistan migrating to the Gulf states finds that money earned abroad is well spent to build stronger families and kin ties at home and that a "more

international understanding of Islam" (p. 61) has added a spiritual dimension to traditional Pakhtun notions of honor and influence. Edward Simpson also takes up Islamic reform, adding social and religious practices (rival versions of Islamic orthodoxy) to gifts and ideas when considering the fruits of migrations. Simpson attributes social differentiation among Sunni Muslim ship owners, sailors, and their kin in the town of Mandvi and the village of Salaya in Kachchh, Gujarat, to earlier migrations and relates the exchange of gifts and commodities to Islamic reform and the relative moral qualities attributed to different kinds of exchanges. Filippo and Caroline Osella show how migration from Kerala to the Gulf has produced changes in the Hindu *kuthiyottam* ritual (human blood sacrifice), reflecting upwardly mobile people and innovative forms and senses of religiosity. C. Y. Thangarajah focuses on female Muslim migrants from eastern Sri Lanka to the Middle East and their reconfiguration of everyday practices within a more pan-Islamic framework, seeing this as enabling the women to expand their rights and opportunities. Maya Unnithan-Kumar connects poor Rajasthani women's migrations to a slum in Jaipur, India, to reproductive anxieties and outcomes, discussing both positive and negative outcomes for them. Arjan de Haan describes labor migrants in Calcutta and their encounters with modernity as structured by gender, generation, region, religion, and caste. Jonathan Parry also focuses on intranational migration to Bengal, long-distance migration to the steel town of Bhilai from other states; he found strong disinclinations to return, particularly among those best placed in the labor market, in public not private sector jobs. Geert De Neve shows that rural migrants working in the garment industry in Tirupur, Tamil Nadu, are not stereotyped as less committed or hardworking than local workers, and that, for the workers, local networks and the ambivalent nature of raised expectations shape their decisions to stay or return home. Ben Rogaly, with Daniel Coppard, Kumar Rana, Abdur Rafique, Amrita Sengupta, and Jhuma Biswas, studied interactions between those seeking seasonal agricultural work and their recruiters in West Bengal, investigating how self-identification was shifted or consolidated by migration and association with other people and places. Randall Kuhn studied rural-urban migration in Bangladesh, finding that traditional networks were enhanced to consolidate positions in cities. Finally, Vinay Gidwani and K. Sivaramakrishnan present a sophisticated case for "rural cosmopolitanism" in India, carefully disentangling cosmopolitanism from transnationalism, necessarily progressive political or cultural agendas, and modernization theory that places people, places, and cultures at different stages of development.

Several authors use the phrase *culture of migration*, but the book's achievement is to demonstrate the variety, complexity, and highly contextualized nature of cultures of migration. Marital, patronage, and recruitment networks at home and away are more significant than the distance traveled by migrants, it would seem, although most chapters also testify to the crucial roles played by the state or states

in shaping the "modernities" differently understood and practiced in these fine case studies.

Global Prescriptions: Gendering Health and Human Rights. Rosalind Pollack Petchesky. London: Zed Books, 2003. 306 pp.

KAJA FINKLER

University of North Carolina

In her book, Rosalind Petchesky envisions, with passion, a new world order that would eliminate all injustices and inequalities and that would establish health as a human right. It would entail global governance based on having a civil society empowering women through local participatory democracy. She aspires to a globalized world that reflects popular mandates and aspirations—one in which priority will be given to health over property, and health care delivery will be equally distributed among the entire world's people.

The book describes, in rich detail, transnational women's health movements working toward advancing this agenda—the small accomplishments and the various failures of women's conferences, including those in Beijing and Cairo. Women may have become, in some measure, empowered by these efforts, however, within increasingly powerless national institutions. Globalization and privatization promoted by the World Bank, IMF, and the current U.S. administration contribute to reducing services for women and impede any success of the agenda Petchesky proposes. She describes the conferences and the attempts at implementation of women's health rights programs by women's nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) in several parts of the world—including India, South Africa, Brazil, Nigeria, and Peru, where such organizations ranged from being tolerated to neglected—providing the reader with interesting particulars. But much of the book's central thesis, frequently repeated, concerns the adverse role of global capitalism in modern society and will be familiar to readers of *The Nation* or *The New York Review of Books*.

Various significant points are raised that sometimes get lost in the minute facts presented. For example, Petchesky correctly criticizes major world institutions for their use of cost-benefit analysis to evaluate health and access to affordable health care worldwide, instead of regarding health as a universal human right. She calls attention to the vocabulary in such analyses that refers to "consumers" and "users," which becomes conflated with human rights and citizens.

Petchesky makes excellent arguments against family planning movements that stress population control, which may lead to a form of eugenics, and for programs that promote broader economic and social changes that emerge out of local initiatives and lead to declines in fertility.

After reading the book, one is left with admiration for Petchesky's exhaustive study of women's efforts the world over to achieve reproductive health rights, pursue sexual pleasure, and protect their bodily integrity. But one is also