UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
Talking on the Page: Editing Aboriginal Oral Texts. Edited by Laura J. Murray and Keren Rice.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/70z0t3x1
Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(4)

ISSN
0161-6463
Author
Brooke, Paul
Publication Date
2000-09-01

DOI
10.17953
Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

or gaming resources, there must be more formal rules too. What are these and how do they interface with the sustainable ethic that Davis asserts exists in Menominee culture?

By adopting a narrow definition of private property, Davis argues that it does not exist in Menominee society and therefore ignores the importance of institutions guiding individual behavior for the good of the collective. As law professor James Huffman notes in his "An Explanatory Essay on Native Americans and Environmentalism," "it is not entirely true that Native Americans knew nothing of ownership. The language of the common law of property, like all of the English language, was unfamiliar to them. But the concepts of the tenancy in common was not foreign to bands and tribes who claimed and defended entitlements to hunting and fishing grounds. Nor was the concept of fee simple title alien to Native American individuals who possessed implements of war and peace, and even lands from which others could be excluded" (*University of Colorado Law Review* 63[4]: 907).

The time has long passed for scholars interested in explaining the failure and success of American Indian economies to stop building straw men in the image of Chief Seattle and to start considering the formal and informal institutions that weave individuals into collectives that can sustain themselves. It will no longer do to claim that Indian cultures are different, indeed superior, with respect to their interface with nature. The Forest Management Plan can assert that "The Menominee culture exists in harmony with Mother Nature, understanding the circle of life," but such a culture never has been and never will be sufficient to ensure efficient or sustainable resource use (quoted on p. 180). Markets and trade depend on a culture of respect for private ownership; otherwise conflicts would be resolved through police and courts, consuming vastly greater amounts of the surpluses generated from trade. Whatever the society, the rules of the game do matter; whether these rules matter more or less ought to be the debate. *Sustaining Forests, the People, and the Spirit* contributes little to the more-or-less debate because it leaves formal and informal rules out altogether, and provides little insight into whether the Menominee experiment is sustainable, and what other American Indians might learn from this experiment.

Terry L. Anderson
Stanford University

Talking on the Page: Editing Aboriginal Oral Texts. Edited by Laura J. Murray and Keren Rice. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999. 122 pages. $40.00 cloth; $14.95 paper.

Those of us who actively edit Native oral texts face a multitude of dilemmas and concerns in our work. *Talking on the Page*—a collection featuring a series of papers presented at the Conference on Editorial Problems—does a superb job, for the most part, of examining these dilemmas and concerns from a melange of perspectives.

The strengths of *Talking on the Page* far outweigh its weaknesses. The first and last essays demonstrate absolute thoroughness. "The Paradox of Talking on the Page: Some Aspects of the Tlingit and Haida Experience" by Nora and Richard Dauenhauer is a solid overview of the quandaries of editing aboriginal oral texts. The essay covers the difficulties inherent in turning the oral into the written (in English instead of Haida or Tlingit), turning the written text into a Western one (in terms of stylistics), turning the performance into a properly formatted text (with cues beyond mere language), and turning stories on taboo subjects into something palatable by the community or other audiences (pp. 5–33). One of the more intriguing discussions raised by the Dauenhauers is the reaction by the Tlingit community to these written projects. "[W]e have many enthusiastic supporters in the forty-five to seventy-five age group; but we have many detractors.... For those who do not speak the language, the language serves as a reminder of things they fear or do not know, contributing to a sense of guilt, inferiority, or hostility" (p. 30).

Julie Cruikshank, like the Dauenhauers, codifies her essay, "The Social Life of Texts: Editing on the Page and in Performance," to respond to her own field research and experiences. With examples drawn from Angela Sidney, Kitty Smith, and other elders, Cruikshank works her way through the minefield of issues facing editors of oral texts. She teaches us how important written texts, shaped by the context of their performances, are to these aboriginal women: "[A] story can 'do' several different things. [Angela Sidney] also constructed an important link between an ancient story . . . and three distinctly different social occasions—the return of a son, the demonstration of her own deepening knowledge during the 1940s, and the opening of a college in the 1980s" (p. 107). Cruikshank answers many of the questions raised by the creation of aboriginal texts, and asks difficult questions about the loss of native speakers, the impact of the Internet, and the possibility of bureaucratic control. These will be some of the questions that editors of aboriginal language will debate in the twenty-first century.

Some of the other essays in *Talking on the Page* further dissect the role and value of language in Native communities. Basil Johnston probes into the development of language in Anishaubae children. He provides a model—through recounting a Nana'b'oozoo story—of how aboriginal people internalize language and story. Ultimately this is a lesson in how we all come to understand words and stories in our own communities (pp. 43–51). Similarly, Victor Masayesva Jr. in "It Shall Not End Anywhere: Transforming Oral Traditions" ponders the power of language within his own tribe's sovereignty:

> My understanding derives solely from moments of ritual and ceremony when I hear those words and songs as they are involved in the fulfillment of Life—language as creation in a procreative sense.... It must surge forward as if it were the life-breath itself, as if keeping the physical body alive were dependent upon our words. (p. 92)

Masayesva's passion for the Hopi language reinforces his belief that Native communities must preserve their own oral and written records. Why should outsiders edit and decide the fate of his community?

Ironically, some of J. Edward Chamberlin's work needs serious editing; the piece, "Doing Things with Words: Putting Performance on the Page," begins with an offensive quote, courtesy of Lenny Bruce. And while Chamberlin may have used the quote to entice his audience, it seems awkward and intrusive in the context of a scholarly collection. My suggestion is to start reading Chamberlin's essay at the bottom of the fourth page (p. 72). The rest of the essay has some valuable insights, especially concerning Chamberlin's work with the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples and his concept of overturning the idea of "privileging . . . *events* over *words*" (p. 84).

Even with Chamberlin's overzealous writing, *Talking on the Page* comes highly recommended. The collection challenges many assumptions, issues, and dilemmas facing the editing of aboriginal oral works. It features a variety of authors, from poets to scholars to filmmakers. Certainly *Talking on the Page* is a rich resource for those invested in the study of oral language.

Paul Brooke
Grand View College

Western Apache-English Dictionary: A Community-Generated Bilingual Dictionary. Edited by Dorothy Bray, in collaboration with the White Mountain Apache Tribe. Tempe, AZ: Bilingual Press. 485 pages. $20.00 Paper.

In 1972 the White Mountain Apache Cultural Center published a small English-Western Apache dictionary. A number of years later, the building in which copies of the dictionary were stored burned down, and since then the few copies that remain have circulated among bilingual teachers, cultural activists, and scholars. A reverse Western Apache-English dictionary, printed by the White Mountain Apache Tribal Education Department in 1978, is even harder to find. So the publication of this handsomely packaged volume, which combines this earlier work with the work of approximately two dozen volunteer collectors and lexicographers from the White Mountain community, is a welcome occasion.

The text is a labor of love, the product of more than a decade of work by a dedicated group of volunteers and consultants. Dorothy Bray's preface states that the dictionary is "intended primarily for the Apaches who are learning to read and write their own language." Another goal of the dictionary is to "help standardize the written form of the language" (p. ix).

The dictionary contains more than 10,000 entries, although approximately 40 percent of these record g/d and d/n variants between White Mountain and San Carlos Apache dialects. For instance, *idindlaag* and *idindlaad*, "sunlight," and *nadą́' nasdil* and *nadą́' nayiznil*, "he scattered the corn around," are all given separate entries with cross-references to each other as dialectal variants. (The latter example shows that the goal of standardized written representation is still problematic.) The sources for the dictionary