

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Cherokees and Missionaries, 1789-1839. By William G. McLoughlin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/71x9379b>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 10(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kenney, Susan A.

Publication Date

1986-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Never afraid of either hard work or of learning a new skill, the reader is taught how to skin a mule, harvest a cotton crop, work in a copper mine and in a salmon cannery. Therefore, this book serves as a good primary source for those economic opportunities that were available to a journeyman laborer during the first half of this century. Occasionally, the experience described is limited in depth and in length, and McCarthy admits realistically that his short, choppy stylistic sentences show that "big words are hard to spell" because he never finished elementary school, but he concludes that "I have done my best." And indeed, his final years, content with his wife and proud of two fine sons who completed their educations and have good lives, confirm that McCarthy did indeed achieve his goals after his journey ended. In spite of now being a lonely widower, his ethnic faith strengthens him. He concludes his story by confiding that sometimes, when he is alone, he feels a tug at his arm, and the medicine men tell him that "the unseen visitors are my ancestors, family, and friends . . . calling me to join them. When I do, we'll be a complete family again, for I am the last of my generation." Fortunately, the McCarthy memories will remain after him, not just in the oral tradition of a Homeric storyteller, but in written form.

Edith Blicksilver
Georgia Institute of Technology

Cherokees and Missionaries, 1789-1839. By William G. McLoughlin. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1984. xiii + 375 pp. Bibliography, index. \$32.50 Cloth.

William G. McLoughlin trods seemingly well known territory in *Cherokees and Missionaries*. Many books focus on the fifty year period of Cherokee history before their removal in 1838-39. Yet no other work illuminates the complexity and interworkings of events with such clarity or understanding. McLoughlin accomplishes this because his orientation allows him to ask significant questions unthought of in most other works on the subject. He tells us "this book is written from within the nation looking out rather than from outside looking in (p. 2). This focus takes him beyond the traditional fascination with the so-called "progressives" who, aligned with Christian missionaries, welded the

Cherokees into a Christian, civilized nation united under a centralized, republican government. Instead, his goal is a full blown analysis of the many segments within Cherokee society. He is sensitive to their varied perspectives and motivations as they assess and cope with the complex demands of their changing world. The result is rich, textured, full-faceted historical analysis.

McLoughlin recognizes that Cherokee culture survived this period by transforming. He is interested in the *process* of transformation, the process of conscious acculturation. Contraction of the land base, disruption of town patterns, depletion of game, and military defeat all necessitated major changes in Cherokee economic, political and social orientations. But the changes, at least internally, were self-directed and, as McLoughlin illustrates, most entailed protective or preservative innovation and selective adaptation. Following the lead of Robert F. Berkhofer Jr. and Anthony F. C. Wallace, McLoughlin explores the positive aspects of internal divisions. Examining Cherokee factionalism provides the means to explain the choices they had. It "articulates and promotes options" (p. 7). This interpretation of factionalism provides the structure for McLoughlin's analysis of the cultural transformation that takes place during these years. The result is what McLoughlin calls a history of Cherokee revitalization.

The second aspiration of this book is to illuminate Christian missionary activity in the Cherokee nation. The juxtaposition of what the missionaries hoped to accomplish, and what the Cherokees wanted them to accomplish, is clearly delineated. The missionaries desired the transformation of the Cherokees into a Christian, and therefore "civilized," people. The Cherokees, however, saw in the missionaries a means to secure education geared toward dealing with new economic and political realities.

McLoughlin scrutinizes the work and attitudes of the various Christian denominations involved in the Cherokee missionary field—the Presbyterians, Moravians, American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, Baptists, and Methodists. Past studies concentrate on the American Board missionaries for three reasons: 1) they worked almost exclusively and were most successful with the politically prominent mixed bloods; 2) they were the most politically active of all Cherokee missionaries in fighting Cherokee removal; and 3) their records are extensive and easy to access since they are in English. The Moravians, the first permanent resident missionaries among the Cherokees, are second in prominence in the literature largely for the first reason.

However, their apolitical stance and their use of German in their written reports and diaries have resulted in less thorough use of their records than is needed. The Baptists and Methodists, who left fewer records and catered to the traditionalist full bloods, have suffered almost total neglect. McLoughlin rectifies this imbalance. His exploration of Baptist and Methodist missionary activity is especially refreshing and adds exciting new material to the discussion of Cherokee adaptation. By elucidating the spiritual orientation, organizational apparatus, and goals of each denomination he clarifies the segments of Cherokee society to which each group appealed and how their position and success changed with new circumstances.

The social egalitarianism and bottom up orientation of the Baptists and Methodists gave them a much wider appeal. While American Board and Moravian missionaries labored in locales populated by the more acculturated Cherokees, the Baptists and Methodists sent circuit riders into the more remote, poor mountain districts where they ate, slept and lived with the Cherokee people. Their more democratic, less formal brand of Christianity stressed personal, spiritual commitment that would lead *toward* reformation rather than strict adherence to doctrine. Baptism and communion were more easily achieved and did not require total transformation. These denominations eagerly sought the assistance of Cherokees as interpreters, exhorters, and even ordained ministers. Such willingness to actively include the Cherokees made Christianity a viable element in the process of revitalization.

As noted, McLoughlin provides an analysis of shifting Cherokee factions and strategies for survival as a people. He investigates three separate removal crises and several periods of revitalization entailing various social and religious dimensions. His extensive, careful use of primary sources results in a narrative rich in detail and salient observations. For example, his chapter on White Path's rebellion (1824-27) and the internal conflicts over the proposed national constitution is a good case study of how innovative questioning and the mining of difficult sources can yield rich historical analysis. White Path's rebellion was no simple reactionary movement by traditionalists wishing to turn back the clock. McLoughlin illuminates how the "rebels," rather than being opposed to all acculturation, were trying "to keep faith with their own heritage and identity as a people" (p. 213). The constitutional crisis of 1827-28 focused discussion on issues

that the Cherokee people had been struggling with for years. The basic question was how far and how quickly should acculturation take place. The preservation of the Cherokee land base was a primary concern.

In the first quarter of the nineteenth century the Cherokees struggled to find a common path to follow in their efforts to thwart repeated attempts to remove them. Their government became increasingly centralized and a series of laws supporting basic changes in such areas as inheritance, trade, property, law enforcement and marriage were passed. Traditionalists understood that this growing corpus of rules and regulations contradicted traditional Cherokee concepts of community, harmony, and sharing. They recognized the threat to the remaining powers of the decentralized town governments made by the proposed constitution in 1827. The pro-constitutionalists argued that a centralized government and an educated, Christian nation was the Cherokees' best defense against white expansion because they undermined the main arguments of Manifest Destiny and justification for Indian removal. The constitution was their stand for territorial status. The Cherokee "rebels" repudiated this argument that only total transformation into white men could save the nation. The rebellion stemmed from a belief that acculturation must be tempered by a deep commitment to Cherokee identity and self-respect—the old religion and traditions had merit. Opposition to removal was universal. Virtually all Cherokees were national separatists. But whereas Charles Hicks, John Ross and the Cherokee elite sought a solution in far-ranging assimilation, many traditionalists feared the very essence of Cherokee identity was threatened.

In most respects McLoughlin achieves his goals. His discussion of syncretism is somewhat disappointing. Important questions go unanswered. What remained intact in the fundamental Cherokee world view? What was altered? What was discarded? Such issues as changing kin and economic structures need more extensive assessment.

Yet it is more important to focus on what McLoughlin accomplishes. His book more clearly explicates what the majority of the Cherokee people were doing and thinking than any other study to date. He reveals the political dimensions of Christianity among the Cherokees and illuminates the deep social fissures present in Cherokee society. This is a dense book full of insightful anal-

ysis. It achieves a great deal of balance in assessing and comparing missionary and Cherokee view, attitudes, perceptions and choices. It is must read material for any scholar of Cherokee society. Happily, good historical technique combined with literate style makes this an enjoyable task.

Susan A. Kenney
Los Angeles

Papers of the Sixteenth Algonquian Conference. Edited by William Cowan. Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1985. 229 pp.

Actes du Dix-Septième Congrès des Algonquinistes. Édités par William Cowan. Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1986. 394 pp.

Beginning in 1968, an interdisciplinary conference on Algonquian studies has been held annually at various localities in Canada and the U.S.A. Papers are welcome in either French or English. Publications resulting from conferences that take place in Québec utilize French for their front matter; otherwise, English is used. Under the editorship of William Cowan, the Papers of the Algonquian Conferences have been published on a regular basis since 1975. While the initial volume was published by the National Museum of Man in its Mercury Series, all subsequent Papers have been published by Carleton University.

From the outset, scholars from diverse backgrounds and interests have been encouraged to read papers on topics related to the Algonquian peoples. While a fine balance of presentations covering all facets of the pertinent disciplines has proven elusive at any one meeting, most fields have received some attention at one time or another. The largest number of published papers, by far, have been on linguistic topics. Ethnology and ethnohistory have also been accorded considerable coverage. On the other hand, archaeology and, especially, physical anthropology have received considerably less frequent attention.

Of the 25 papers read at the Sixteenth Algonquian Conference held in Duluth, Minnesota, 14 were submitted for publication. A complete list of the titles of the unpublished papers is included in the editor's introduction. A particularly important and unique feature of this publication is the *Cumulative Index of the Papers of*