

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Medicine Bags and Dog Tags: American Indian Veterans from Colonial Times to the Second Iraq War. By Allen Carroll.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/73w5p22v>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Herley, Sam

Publication Date

2009-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

can teach us about the national and global, nonetheless, this volume has many strengths that make it a critical read. This work demonstrates the need to reconfigure our understanding of place and space, recognizing the implications of constructing, enforcing, and defying borders and its effects on the lands and peoples in between. Hele and the other contributors call for a reenvisioning of the Great Lakes as a space/place that must be understood by looking at both sides of what has been a permeable line for Native peoples of this region. Great Lakes past, present, and future cannot be understood outside the context of the people and places north and south of this line. The region's history and its people can only be fully understood by recognizing the impacts of borders while looking beyond the borders.

Heidi Kiiwetinepinesiiik Stark

University of Minnesota—Duluth

Medicine Bags and Dog Tags: American Indian Veterans from Colonial Times to the Second Iraq War. By Allen Carroll. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 287 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

American Indian veterans have had a unique place in the history of the United States since the nation began. Although they have served the country in each of its wars since the American Revolution, their perceptions of patriotism, honor, flag, and country often have differed from those of their fellow servicemen, not least because of the complex and often tumultuous relationship between their tribal nations and the US military. Furthermore, Native veterans have had to deal with misperception, stereotype, and racism before, during, and after their service while also continuing their tribal traditions. In attempting to explain the totality of the Native veteran experience, Al Carroll's *Medicine Bags and Dog Tags* argues that Native veterans not only have endured challenges from non-Native perceptions but also have adapted and used such perceptions to create new warrior and veteran traditions within the culture of the US armed forces.

The book is enormously ambitious on a number of levels. Other books dealing with Native veterans have tended to focus on a particular war (Thomas Britten's *American Indians in World War I* [1997]), group (William Meadows's *The Comanche Code Talkers of World War II* [2003]), or individual (Hollis Stabler's *No One Ever Asked Me* [2005]). Carroll does not restrict himself in such ways, instead opting for a comprehensive approach that he hopes "will help Native veterans and their families and friends understand their service in the largest possible context" (10). One of the book's strengths is Carroll's breadth of knowledge on veteran-related subjects. Whether discussing Iroquois warrior roles and rituals in the War of 1812 or the actions of Mitchell Red Cloud during the Korean War, Carroll demonstrates familiarity with a startling array of topics. His sources, including archival records, oral histories, and a long list of published sources, likewise show impressive diversity and research.

Carroll thus gives numerous specific examples of Native veterans throughout the book, and it is at its most enjoyable and informative when he does so.

Because the overall topic is so large, he rarely focuses or presents in-depth analysis of anyone in particular. It would be enough of a challenge for any historian to cover the experiences of the veterans of one tribe even in a single military conflict. Carroll covers an extreme amount of ground, as his book's subtitle suggests. As a result, undoubtedly many readers will finish the book wishing they had gotten to know the veterans mentioned in the book better. Carroll devotes a respectful, detailed chapter to the aftermath of the death of Lori Piestewa, a member of the Hopi tribe who became the first woman in the US military killed during the Iraq War in 2003. Generally, though, the book does not present thorough accounts of Native veterans' experiences, particularly wartime experiences, as much as other books in the genre. Readers wanting rich stories of Cherokee cavalry under Stand Watie during the Civil War or of Navajo code talkers during World War II will have to look elsewhere.

Much of the book is a condemnation of whites' attitudes and misunderstandings toward Native groups. Considering the book's title, one might have expected Carroll to spend more time dealing with Native veterans and less on white perceptions and stereotypes of Native veterans. The second chapter deals almost exclusively with Robert Rogers, a white colonial militia leader. Although the chapter draws conclusions regarding Native-themed imagery in the US military that Carroll later shows to be important, it nonetheless says little directly about Native veterans. Native veteran experiences intertwine with the burden of such perceptions and stereotypes, certainly, but the book sometimes feels as though it is disproportionately weighted toward white perceptions and stereotypes rather than toward Native experiences or Native adaptations to such perceptions and stereotypes. A reader with any understanding of Indians' long history of interacting with non-Natives will be at least somewhat familiar with such issues before reading Carroll's work.

Carroll is rather scathing in his assessment of scholars of Native history, particularly non-Native scholars who specialize in Native history, and sometimes fairly so. Well aware of the historiography on Native veterans, Carroll at one point criticizes Britten for asserting that there was "such a diversity of Native veterans['] experiences that no conclusions are possible" (8). Carroll's book, especially as broad as it is, inherently encounters difficulties in drawing its own conclusions. For example, even though Carroll cites several Native voices in an attempt to describe Native veteran loyalty to the United States and to downplay loyalty to the nation-state during a discussion of the meaning of Native patriotism, it remains a complex issue. Although Carroll makes some valid points, he generalizes at times in a way that makes one wonder how much he speaks for all or most Natives and Native veterans.

Carroll demands precision in the language that historians use, and yet *Medicine Bags and Dog Tags* would have benefited from a brief explanation regarding terms. As it is, the book contains ambiguous terminology that sometimes makes it difficult to discern what or whom the author is discussing. Carroll often uses the words *Anglo*, *white*, and *non-Native* seemingly interchangeably. He spends much of his first chapter criticizing the use of Native veteran characters in "Anglo written and filmed works" and includes in the discussion, for example, the character Thunderbird from Marvel's X-Men

series of comic books (17). The creator of the Thunderbird character (Len Wein) and the founder of Marvel Comics and creator of X-Men (Stan Lee) speak English and probably fall under most general conceptions of “white.” But they also are of Jewish heritage (Romanian-Jewish, in the case of Lee), and their example presents questions of specificity in regard to the “Anglo” label.

The book is not without some factual errors. For example, Carroll briefly discusses the case of *Standing Bear v. Crook* (1871) in which Standing Bear, “an elderly Ponca man,” had his cause taken up by Thomas Tibbles, a “white journalist married to a Native woman” (96). The trial actually took place in 1879. At the time, Standing Bear was not an elderly man, and Tibbles was not yet married to Susette La Flesche, a Native woman.

Carroll’s style is rare in that he writes certain parts of his book in the first person. He sometimes includes personal anecdotes, such as when he gives a critical opinion of the character Billy Bear in the 1987 science fiction/action film *Predator* or recounts some of his own experiences in the military. Carroll’s experience as a veteran gives him a perspective that readers should appreciate. Sometimes, however, one wishes that he were discussing a Native veteran he had researched rather than himself.

Finally, there are times when Carroll seems to want to engage in political issues rather than Native veteran topics. For example, he dedicates only a three-page section on the 1991 Persian Gulf War that discusses at least as much about Native perceptions of Kurds and the war as it does about Native veterans of the war. Yet Carroll devotes ten pages to a discussion on controversial political activist Ward Churchill that seemingly has nothing to do with Native veterans. Whereas Carroll usually writes with skill to tie a wide range of topics back into military issues (such as when he intertwines the debate regarding schools’ usage of Native mascots into a discussion of the US military’s usage of Native imagery), his need to touch so thoroughly on Churchill or criticize David Yeagley in a book on Native veterans is a bit puzzling. Certainly, historians have shown it possible to write solid books about Native veterans without mentioning either man.

That Carroll’s work does not succeed entirely should not be surprising; a work three times its length could not have done so with the range of peoples and eras that the book tries to cover. There is much in *Medicine Bags and Dog Tags* with which readers, certainly including Native veterans, might disagree or even find fault. Early in the book, Carroll rightly praises Tom Holm’s *Strong Hearts, Wounded Souls* (1996) as one of the landmark works on Native veterans and then states his own intention to go further than Holm in asserting a need to correct white misperceptions in order to achieve a true understanding of the history of Native veterans. *Medicine Bags and Dog Tags* probably does not achieve as much as Carroll would have liked. It does, however, raise questions and present ideas for how to encapsulate the wholeness of the Native experience in the US military, and it therefore leaves something of value from which historians and readers can build.

Sam Herley

University of Nebraska–Lincoln