

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Two Spirits: A Story of Life with the Navajo. By Walter L. Williams and Toby Johnson.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7697z3j3>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Justice, Daniel Heath

**Publication Date**

2008-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

people worked with non-Native reformers to maintain and develop their institutions, whenever possible, they used these institutions to maintain tribal traditions. In this way, the southern New England Natives demonstrate how a subaltern group could become part of the mainstream society and culture, while resisting complete assimilation.

*Tribe, Race, History* provides a welcomed synthesis of the literature on the Native experience within this important region and significant original insights based on in-depth archival research. Mandell's prose is rich and smooth, and his mixed chronological and thematic organization, though repetitive in some places, provides readers with a clear understanding of his primary arguments. Students of New England Native history, as well as the broader nineteenth-century Native experience, will find this book thought provoking and enjoyable.

C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa  
Illinois College

**Two Spirits: A Story of Life with the Navajo.** By Walter L. Williams and Toby Johnson. Maple Shade, NJ: Lethe Press, 2006. 331 pages. \$18.00 paper.

Of all facets of Indigenous life, none has perhaps been more fascinating, titillating, repulsive, or bewildering to Euro-Western observers than those of Native gender mores and sexualities. Many early European invaders interpreted variant sexual and gender expressions as the embodied testimony to the moral degeneracy of the Indigenous populations, and the persecution of those people and practices was used to justify even the most horrific acts of violence. For example, in 1513, the conquistador Vasco Nuñez de Balboa used war dogs to slaughter almost forty male-embodied people wearing women's clothing in the household of Porque, the chief of Quarequa, whom he believed to have been engaged in "most abhominable and unnaturall lechery." Individuals in Native communities who have expressed gender identities or sexual behaviors outside the rigid realm of heteronormative patriarchy have been targeted for mockery, exclusion, or assault by non-Natives, while also being marginalized within many of their own communities, especially in recent years as antisex Christian evangelism and Euro-Western gendered expectations have become increasingly embedded in many tribal cultures.

In spite of these historical and contemporary struggles, queer and two-spirit Native people continue to walk in dignity, and their many contributions are essential to the vibrant continuity of their various tribal nations. Even when faced with social and political hostility, two-spirited people have shifted the conversations in many of their communities to incorporate a more inclusive understanding of gender, sexuality, love, and family, sometimes by returning to premissionary traditions, sometimes by appealing to the higher values of kinship and community.

Part of that important shift has been a result of increased access to a wide range of historical, sociological, anthropological, and even fictional resources

that illuminate the long, defiant history of gender and sexuality diversity in the Americas. Admittedly, such resources have been mixed in success and quality. Much of the scholarship on queer and two-spirited topics is still burdened with racist terminology and essentialist constructions (such as anthropologist Will Roscoe's much challenged but insistent use of the term *berdache*). In fiction that deals with queer male Native sexuality, for every novel that honestly examines the complicated familial, political, and interpersonal dimensions of queer Native realities today (such as Craig Womack's *Drowning in Fire* or Greg Sarris's *Watermelon Nights*), we have celebrated but racist historical fetish fiction like Richard Amory's *Song of the Loon* (1966, reprinted in 2005 as part of Little Sister's Classics by Arsenal Pulp Press) and Tom Spanbauer's *The Man Who Fell in Love with the Moon* (1991), which are, aside from better publishers and a veneer of literary sophistication, only superficially different in their exotic sexual and spiritual objectification from more lurid gay pulps like Brad Powers's *Little Big Horny* (1977) or P. H. Bennett's *Halfbreed's Rise* (1979).

Although absent some of the more overtly racist dimensions of these other texts, and published with a high-minded purpose of enlightenment and liberation, *Two Spirits: A Story of Life with the Navajo*, is nevertheless rooted in this appropriative representational genealogy. Walter L. Williams, the novel's academic coauthor, is best known for his problematic but groundbreaking study, *The Spirit and the Flesh: Sexual Diversity in American Indian Culture* (1986). His scholarship has been an extension of one of the guiding principles of early queer studies and activism: to challenge homophobic presumptions of queer deviance by finding, celebrating, and theorizing the normalized or nonpathologized historical examples of queer people in various cultures. Of particular interest to Williams and other US academics, writers, and activists in the late 1970s through the 1980s (when queer Native writers began to find a broader literary audience for their own unmediated voices) was the intriguingly different social status held by those who might today be considered gay, lesbian, bisexual, and trans- or otherwise-gendered in a number of American Indian communities. Invoking these precedents and their continuation today was of vital importance in asserting an essentially American Indian queerness that not only recognized homosexuality but also celebrated it.

*Two Spirits*, cowritten by Williams and novelist Toby Johnson, is very much within this celebratory intellectual and political trajectory. It is at once a historical novel, an ethnographic and historical indictment of US Indian policies in New Mexico Territory following the Civil War, and a celebration of gay love and sex across cultural lines. The primary plot surrounds the political, religious, and sexual awakening of the young Indian agent Will Lee, a rather naïve white Virginian who has headed to the lands of the Navajo people on a journey of self-discovery and rebellion against the harsh theological dictates of his preacher father. He finds himself in a land torn by colonial tensions and populated with stock characters: brutish white soldiers (typified by the corrupt historical figure of General Carleton) and Mexican *banditos*, wise and noble old Indians (gendered according to their spheres of lengthy explication, with the female community leader Dezba providing information about Diné culture and old man Barboncito giving the political history of

the American occupation), unschooled but sexy men of color (from Will's friend and first love Michael, a hot mixed blood predictably descended from a Cherokee grandmother, to Jose, the tightly muscled Mexican *vaquero* who introduces Will more fully to the "dear love of comrades" after Will reads him some of Walt Whitman's poetry), and the exotic and entrancingly erotic *nadleehí* healer Hasbaá, who becomes Will's great love and cultural key to the ancient spiritual wisdom of Changing Woman. Will advocates on behalf of the Navajo people against Carleton's genocidal policies that culminate in the devastating Long Walk, but when he fails to stop the worst of the atrocities, Will abandons his old life and embraces the ways of his new family. Eventually, when a somewhat more benign Indian policy comes to bear on the Navajos, Will fakes his death (ostensibly to protect his life with his *nadleehí* wife, Hasbaá, from missionary and administrative scrutiny) and is reborn as the Diné shepherd, Manuelito, who raises a family of adopted Navajo orphans with Hasbaá. He lives, if not happily ever after, with the contented knowledge that it is in part his duty now, as one of the "Two Spirits," to join with Hasbaá "to protect the Diné people, the ancient culture and the Two-Spirit wisdom" (312).

The novel's didactic purpose, as the authors make clear in the historical note at the end of the book, is twofold: to shine a light on the inhumane treatment to which the Navajos were subjected during this historical period and, more broadly, to answer a larger need by locating "variant sexuality and 'gay identity' directly in the line of the transformation of humankind through evolution, to restore harmony for ourselves and our way of seeing the world" (323). Asserting that "people who today would be called gay or queer were the seers, shamans, soothsayers, wizards, witches, mystics, oracles, wise old men and wise old women of legend" who have "been centered in the driving force of the evolution of consciousness," the authors posit that such a realization "allows a mystical way of describing gay identity that places us clearly in the line of responsibility for the Great Work of 'saving the world' and 'perfecting Humankind'" (324).

This is an ambitious goal, but the novel is handicapped in realizing its aims by an excess of cardboard characterizations, histrionic dialogue, and erratic plot development. More problematic, however, is the authors' insistence in reducing what could be a compelling story of cross-cultural queer love in a time of political struggle to a melodramatic mission of exoticized New Age pedantry. Here, the heavy-handed lesson leads the story into the realm of cliché, and character relationships replicate the long and tired history of whites looking to Indians for their own spiritual and sexual salvation, only now with a queer interracial twist. Ultimately, the story is a little more than a gay *Dances with Wolves*, albeit with more sex and speechifying, where traditional Indigenous knowledge and spirituality belongs to all good-hearted seekers and where the ultimate purpose of Indians is to help white gay men find their special place of legitimacy in the world.

In its mishmash of New Age-inflected essentialist gay exceptionalism, ethnographic reportage (including a hodgepodge of Navajo, Lakota, and Ojibway terms and concepts, justified through nonsensical explanations that gesture

only feebly at geographic or cultural specificities), unconvincing romance, and clunky historical reimaginings, *Two Spirits* is, when taken alone, well intended but generally banal. Yet the novel is fully part of a larger and more troubling representational history, one in which Native sexualities and genders have been reduced to utilitarian symbols for non-Natives to legitimize themselves and their various claims of belonging. This is not the *nadleehí* Hasbaá's story, nor that of the elders Dezba or Barboncito, or even those of Michael the mixed-blood Cherokee or Jose the Mexican *vaquero*; though embedded in an episode from Navajo history, it's not even the story of the Diné resistance and survival during the events around the Long Walk. These are all incidental elements in a story that ultimately celebrates a gay white man finding his liberation and awakening by becoming the noble inheritor of Native tradition, a figure for whom the Indians and people of color in the novel exist only as (often sexually available) means to his self-enlightening ends. Ironically, diverse Native sexualities are reduced to little more than historical wallpaper, and the possibility of richly textured queer Native subjectivities is relegated to exotic afterthought.

For all its ostensibly good intentions, *Two Spirits* is ultimately very little about two-spirited peoples' lives, experiences, or storied realities, let alone the social, cultural, and political struggles of Native communities still trying to maintain their ways on their own terms. Instead, it's a story about how white men can find sexual and spiritual fulfillment through high-minded sex with exotic brown people. We've heard this story before, and it's no less exploitative now.

*Daniel Heath Justice*

University of Toronto

**Victorio: Apache Warrior and Chief.** By Kathleen P. Chamberlain. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007. 242 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

Among today's readers, Victorio is remembered as a determined Apache chief who led many of his people in an 1879 breakout from a New Mexico reservation. Their retreat across the mountains and deserts of western Texas was a model of ingenuity, where relatively small numbers of warriors carried out delaying actions to protect their families from advancing American soldiers. The army's pursuit even involved Colonel Benjamin Grierson, a senior officer whose small escort barely survived Victorio's onslaught at the Battle of Devil's Ridge. In the end, however, Victorio succumbed to the realities of a massed military campaign by American and Mexican forces that culminated in the Battle of Tres Castillos, where Lieutenant Colonel Joaquín Terrazas and his Chihuahua militia forces cornered the fleeing Apache Band. Short of ammunition and other vital supplies, they made a determined stand that resulted in the deaths of seventy-eight Indians and the capture of sixty-eight men, women, and children. Among the bodies found in the ledge outcroppings was that of Victorio, a leader who had witnessed and participated in some of the most important events in Apache history between 1825 and 1880.