

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Sarah Winnemucca. By Sally Zanjani.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/77p3s68r>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Fowler, Catherine S.

Publication Date

2002

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Sarah Winnemucca. By Sally Zanjani. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. 2001. 369 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Sarah Winnemucca is a controversial nineteenth-century figure, a Native daughter of the Northern Paiute people of the Great Basin, and an active participant in some fifty years of her peoples' struggles with and adjustments to a permanent non-Indian presence in their lands. There have been several attempts in the last twenty years to tell her story to a wide variety of audiences, including children, young adults, casual adult readers, and scholars. All the tellers have based their approaches more or less on Sarah's own book, *Life among the Piutes: Their Wrongs and Claims*, published in 1883, and variously rumored to have been the first book written by a Native American, a Native American woman, or a Native American of the Great Basin. All have focused on her accomplishments: her book, whatever "first" it represents; her advocacy of Paiute rights and abilities to run their own lives; her numerous speeches in cities on both coasts and before the US Congress; her heroism during the Bannock War; and her school for Paiute children, a remarkable early experiment in bilingual/bicultural education. Only the more serious have tackled the many contradictions and controversies that surround her life: her multiple marriages, all but perhaps one to non-Indians; her rumored love of alcohol and gambling; her often flamboyant personality and hot temper; her favoritism of and aid to the military, including campaigns involving her own people; and her possible exaggeration of the role she and her family played during difficult times and in different events. All have provided a reading of history as they have seen it, and from what sources apart from the book that they could find. None has been able to answer all the questions that surround this very complicated person whom we can only know through historical reconstruction.

Zanjani's attempt adds considerable material to the story through additional serious research, a lively writing style, and a willingness to look deeper into some of what may have motivated Sarah Winnemucca to be and become who she was. The book provides a balanced view of the many facets of Sarah's life. It certainly affirms her achievements, and thus should be welcomed by her supporters. But it also does not shy away from the controversies surrounding her, possibly also pleasing her opponents. For anyone new to her story, the book should demonstrate first of all just how remarkable a person she was. Second, it shows just how complex reconstructing a person's life from documentary sources can be. And third, it illustrates that defining motivations in cross-cultural historical settings is indeed difficult.

Zanjani's account uses Sarah's book as its outline for all but the last three chapters which concern events after Sarah's book was published. Her work parallels Sarah's, moving chapter by chapter from Sarah's earliest childhood experiences in the 1840s when Anglos first began traversing her homeland and settling within it, to her girlhood spent with her family in the early settlements of California and western Nevada, to the war years of the 1860s in Nevada, to the early reservation period at Pyramid Lake, Nevada, and Malheur, Oregon, to the more turbulent times of the Bannock War of 1878, and ultimately to the years of exile for Paiute people at Yakima and Fort

Vancouver, Washington. Sarah's positive identification with non-Indians and the path of education and accommodation are well-reflected throughout. But so is her growing disenchantment with Indian agents and other schemers who would strip her people of their lands and the right to govern their own lives. The last three chapters cover Sarah's time in Boston and Washington, D.C., in association with the Peabody sisters (Elizabeth Palmer Peabody and Mary—Mrs. Horace—Mann), and other noted reformers attempting to right the wrongs done through western expansion. They also focus on her founding of and struggle to run a private school for Paiute children on her brother's farm in Lovelock, Nevada, and ultimately her retreat to Idaho and untimely death in 1891. Zanjani also provides a short epilogue in which she adds data from interviews with some contemporary Northern Paiute people as to how they see Sarah and her accomplishments.

Zanjani provides documentation from several sources, including local newspapers, federal and state documents, private diaries, and published accounts to supplement and verify many of the incidents and other matters treated in Sarah's book. Quite a number of her sources are new to the chronicling of Sarah's life, and it is obvious that she spent considerable time in careful research. She clearly points out where sources agree with what Sarah had to say and where they seem to differ, and attempts to resolve some of the differences. She carefully examines some of the controversial aspects of Sarah's life, especially attempts by specific individuals (such as Agent William V. Rinehart in the early 1880s) to discredit her on a local and national level. She looks behind some of these reports to the individuals making the accusations, seeking their motivations and often revealing a good deal about both the positive and negative situations that confronted Sarah personally, as well as other Native people in Nevada on the local, regional, and national levels.

But the book cannot answer all the controversy that surrounds the life of Sarah Winnemucca, including in the minds of her own people. In every situation of contact and conflict between ethnic entities, some individuals choose one path, such as accommodation, and others choose another, such as various forms of resistance. Often they end up in opposing camps. Sarah Winnemucca felt that she had some answers, and worked hard to promote them. She had the qualities that attracted both avid supporters and detractors. This book is certainly the clearest portrait to date of her life to date and as such will stand for years to come.

Catherine S. Fowler

University of Nevada, Reno

Teaching Spirits: Toward an Understanding of Native American Religious Traditions. By Joseph Epes Brown. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001. 192 pages. \$22.00 paper.

Joseph Epes Brown has produced a powerfully important scripture on Native American spirituality that exposes the spiritual decay of "a contemporary