

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Hermanitos Comanchitos: Indo-Hispano Rituals of Captivity and Redemption. By Enrique R. Lamadrid.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7jb9n9rx>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Garcia, Peter J.

Publication Date

2004-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Hermanitos Comanchitos: Indo-Hispano Rituals of Captivity and Redemption. By Enrique R. Lamadrid. Photographs by Miguel A. Gandert. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2003. 264 pages, with CD. \$45.00 cloth; 27.95 paper.

Enrique Lamadrid has written a rigorous ethnography based on literary criticism and regional cultural history devoted to the contemporary and historical performances of *Los comanches*, the Spanish colonial folkplay, among Pueblo Indian, Genizaro, and Hispano communities throughout northern New Mexico. Specifically, his study focuses on the ethnogenesis, transcultural mimesis, and intertextuality in which Numunuh (culture of the Plains) dances, songs, and dramatic pageants are performed among New Mexico's indigenous communities as part of their unique spiritual, ritual, and historical observances. Regional Comanche "enemy dances" are called *kwítara* (Tewa Comanche) songs and are performed in all of the Pueblo villages with local and regional variations annually. Likewise, Hispano *comanches* of various types are also performed in larger urban centers such as Bernalillo, Albuquerque, Alcalde, and Los Ranchos de Taos during seasonal celebrations, fiestas, and other important social events and religious occasions. Genizaro communities perform *Los comanches* in their *cautivo* (captive) variety in villages like Abiquiú. Comanche productions are integral to many mestizo feast-day celebrations and patron saint devotions.

Lamadrid's ethnography is essentially a structural-functionalist interpretation of the role of *Los comanches* among New Mexico's "Indo-Hispano" communities. To carry out his interpretive task, he enlists a conceptual framework integrating Spanish literary criticism and regional cultural historical analysis situated within the various performance contexts observed, recorded, transcribed, translated, and analyzed. His work includes numerous musical transcriptions with English translations and a high-quality CD recording of many of the performances discussed throughout the book. Each of these unique functions plays a critical role in establishing the symbolic dimensions of *Los comanches* in the spiritual and social lives of Hispano, Native American, and Genizaro communities throughout New Mexico.

After reviewing the actual historical records, *Documentos de la Guerra: Comanche Wars and History, 1706–1875*, Lamadrid focuses on *Las Historias de la Gente*—oral histories, stories, memories, and tales of the Comanches—in order to build his case for a more critical textual and contextual analysis of actual Comanche performances. He draws on ethnographic evidence gathered over thirty years of fieldwork to demonstrate how the theses play out in the actual performance settings and probes further the deeply rooted nature of New Mexico's dynamic cultural history, social memory, and complex and overlapping identity formations. For example, to demonstrate how the transcultural mimesis thesis works, Lamadrid draws from the ethnopoetic logic of *Los comanches*, from available literary sources and manuscripts, from observed ritual performances, and from the commentaries of native performers, musicians, cultural members, and storytellers. The resulting analysis is truly transdisciplinary, convincing, and compelling.

Lamadrid investigates the various performance types of Comanche performances and festivals including *Comanches de la Serna*, *Comanches Guadalupeños*, nativity plays, and New Year's Day Comanche dances. He provides a critical investigation of contextual issues including transplanted and reinvented urban traditions observed in Los Griegos, Los Ranchos de Albuquerque, Four Hills (Albuquerque), and Bernalillo and long-standing rural-based performances situated in smaller villages like Tomé, San Mateo, and Cochití/Peña Blanca. His book also examines several community-based revivals and the cultural politics surrounding inventions and reinventions of regional traditions. One of the most interesting features of Lamadrid's investigation is that he situates *Los comanches* within multiple sites of public life and ritual performance within the region's larger Indo-Hispano working-class ritual cycle and folkways.

As far as ethnography goes, Lamadrid situates *Los comanches* in a post-colonial framework that problematizes New Mexican society intertwined within his own reflexivity. He articulates his own subjectivity and ethnographic "shadow" in relation to his own multicultural, gendered, and "New Mestizo" identity. As such, Lamadrid's affecting presence is evident throughout much of the research as he seeks to interpret and articulate the underlying significance and deeper meaning of these performances as symbolic acts of ritualized resistance and counterhegemony.

Boldly articulating his complex "coyote," or Hispanic/Anglo, status as an overeducated organic intellectual and community leader early in the book, I find Lamadrid ever mindful of the cultural sensitivity of his ethnographic inquiry and the volatile cultural and linguistic politics addressed throughout the work. Lamadrid discusses more of his "affecting presence" and his own ethnographic shadows in the final chapters. What I don't understand is why Lamadrid insists on using the curious "Indo-Hispano" label used by only a handful of New Mexico's regional folklorists and writers like Rudolfo Anaya, Ruben Cobos, and Maurilio E. Vigil. I've never heard any of my contemporary New Mexican "raza" or Native research associates refer to themselves as "Indo-Hispanos." Considering the historical fact that Nuevo Mexicanos have lived among and even intermarried with Anglo-Americans for more than 150 years, I find most New Mexicans, including myself, culturally if not racially Indo-Hispano-Anglo although most prefer to remain in denial of our Indo-Hispano-Anglo or "new Mestizo" heritage.

Lamadrid's investigations hardly mention Anglo-American cultural influences on *Los comanches*, and for the most part perhaps they truly are not there. I've discussed this issue at length with Lamadrid and have accompanied him on various field visits but certainly have not observed the extensive array and variation of *comanches* that he has. A self-identified "Chicano," and newly elected director of the University of New Mexico's underdeveloped Chicano Studies Program, Lamadrid seems either unfamiliar with or altogether indifferent to more analytically advanced theoretical texts put forth by Chicana and Chicano scholars from across the borderlands. Lamadrid began his remarkably "serendipitous" recovery project during the spring of 1973, when his wife Carlota Domínguez's aunt Fermilia or "tía Phil" Domínguez Wood

provided him with a photocopy of a well-worn manuscript that was dated 1863 and signed "J. J. Vigil." The young and ever-curious folklorist immediately noticed various sections of verse titled "Cuerno Verde," "Don Carlos Fernández," "Cabeza Negra," and "Don José de la Peña." He admits never having heard of Hispano "Comanches" until that time. Despite the lack of stage directions, Lamadrid immediately recognized it as some sort of dramatic poem and began investigating the manuscript in more detail. The second chapter, *Alli Vienen Los Comanches* (Dancing with the Enemy), is one of the most convincing to this reader. In this chapter Lamadrid demonstrates how the Indo-Hispano culture is evidently hybrid by nature and design. He examines the contextual issues for *Los comanches* with a comparison of Pueblo and Spanish rituals and integrates his own critical analysis of *Moros y Cristianos*, *Los Matachines*, and similar Pueblo "enemy dances" and "animal dances."

Seen within the broader historical and political context of the twentieth century, Lamadrid reminds his readers that New Mexico was not granted statehood until 1914. This fact often overlooked, he concludes that at the time it was more politically expedient to emphasize Spanish-European rather than Mexican or mestizo traditions, and the work of folklorists such as Aurelio M. Espinosa reflected their times. Nuevo Mexicano elites embraced Hispanophile discourse for its social and class distinctions, the motivation for the emergent *criollo* discourse across Spanish America. Lamadrid offers ample evidence to suggest that the Hispanophile cultural agenda was promoted, even initiated, by Anglo elites impatient with the endless national deliberations concerning New Mexico statehood.

More convincing yet is the CD recording that includes twenty-six examples from the combined personal and public archives of Enrique R. Lamadrid, Jack Loeffler's Peregrine Arts Sound Archive, and John D. Robb Archives of Southwest Music in the Center for Southwest Research at the Zimmerman Library at the University of New Mexico. Despite the exuberant attention to musical detail, Lamadrid concludes that "the music, in typically hybrid indita style, uses an array of diatonic, chromatic, pentatonic, and modal melodies, or at least emulate Indian music. The resulting synthesis is so complex that the expertise of an ethnomusicologist is needed to understand what the ear intuits" (109). The recent hire of at least three ethnomusicologists at the University of New Mexico will, one hopes, encourage the development of further research, students, and a long overdue ethnomusicology program with a regional focus on local and Southwest Indian and/or Mexican folk, traditional, and popular musics. Lamadrid struggles with many of the ethnomusicological challenges posed by the musical performances of *Los comanches* heard on the CD and analyzed throughout the book. For example, he mentions that "the music of 'El Torito' has a distinctive blend of Pueblo and Navajo elements. . . . Its vocables are quite unique and resemble words. As happens with other North American indigenous musical traditions, words also find their way into song texts, but over the generations and between the cultures, specific meanings can be obscured" (168). Despite the musical challenges, Lamadrid's research provides solid transdisciplinary analysis of the overall aesthetic production of *Los comanches*.

According to Lamadrid, until recently, Hispano-Comanche celebrations could only be found in the original performance context of traditional feast days, attended typically by local families and their friends. Beginning in the mid-1970s and through the 1990s, however, the Hispano-Comanche dances from Ranchos de Taos traveled to perform in other festival settings in the region and as far away as Washington, DC. Lamadrid has been involved in several national festivals and reports on the controversies and contestations surrounding the presentation and performance of *Los comanches* in the most public venues. For example, the 1992 Columbian quincentennial celebrations at the national level were contested by Native groups, then reconstrued as the "Great American Encounter" by the Smithsonian, with two important exhibits. "Seeds of Change," in the National Natural History Museum, featured the plants and animals of the Columbian exchange, which forever changed culture and agriculture in both Old and "New" Worlds. The "American Encounters" exhibit, in the National History Museum, featured a case study of the cultural history of New Mexico over four centuries of Native and Hispano cultural relations. The year 1992 was a banner year for New Mexico because, in addition, the state was honored in that year's Smithsonian folklife festival, and two Smithsonian-Folkways CDs featured both Hispanic and Native American musical traditions. In the tense and rarified atmosphere of 1992 the appearance of *Los Comanches de la Serna* at the festival created a fascinating controversy. Following a week of "cultural conversations" on the National Mall, threats of boycotts (both internal and external) arose by individuals and groups disturbed by issues of "cultural representation" in the inclusion and presentation of Hispano-Comanche culture to a national audience. Lamadrid explains that mestizo culture was deemed "too complex and confusing" to portray properly without offending Native groups. Lamadrid notes the use of feathers, buckskins, vocable singing, and dance was just too suggestive of Native culture and was therefore totally inappropriate for use by a non-Native group in a national showcase. The boycotts were called off after negotiations and mediations, and the "Comanches" events were removed from the central plaza area past the edge of the exhibit area, to the center lawn of the Mall. As official presenter, Lamadrid commented, "In colonial times, Indo-Hispano or genízaro occupied the bottom rung of society and were often settled in marginal or unprotected areas far from the main centers of population. Our location on the Mall is an interesting and appropriate parallel."

In conclusion, Lamadrid provides a compelling case demonstrating that the phenomenon of Hispano-Comanche cultural mimesis is a reality that goes beyond mere wishful thinking. He writes that after the peace of 1786 trade fairs were no longer necessary and Comanchero traders ventured from New Mexico east to the Plains, to deal directly with the Numunuh. They became so closely allied with their partners that by the mid-nineteenth century American observers had difficulty telling them apart. Anglo authorities also had similar problems in distinguishing Numunuh children from the Mexican captive children raised in the same families. In fact, Mexican captive children were preferred over Anglo-American children by the Numunuh

for this very reason. Cultural mimesis, emulation, and identification are all produced by desire. Lamadrid concludes that “strangely, even the most appalling episodes from the worst years of the Comanche wars are seen through the wishful lens of desire, the desire for peace, which lends a romantic dimension to the most unimaginable scenes of human suffering in New Mexico, the tragic massacres of the late eighteenth century,” which continue to be commemorated and observed today.

Peter J. Garcia
University of Arizona

Hiroshima Bugi: Atomu 57. By Gerald Vizenor. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2003. 209 pages. \$26.95 cloth.

One of our most original contemporary writers, Gerald Vizenor has an impressive body of work of great complexity and refinement published over the last forty years. This trickster writer with an enormous appetite for experimentation and endless playfulness mocks rigidity and essentialized structures wherever he can find them. One would assume that the post-Indian post-modern writer has already pushed the boundaries of discourse, novel, theory, and identities, but there is more to come. His text is rich and demanding but equally exciting. His readers expect to be challenged, and they will not be disappointed. The novel further explores some of Vizenor’s former interests: survival and transcendence, sexuality and eroticism, breaking cultural barriers. It draws on eclectic sources ranging from *Gone with the Wind* and *Casablanca* to Homer, Adorno, Shakespeare, and Marguerite Duras.

This time, though, Vizenor *performs* a novel in plain view and takes the reader along to witness his virtuosity. His novel follows the pattern of the boogie characterized by a steady rhythmic ground bass and a series of improvised melodic variations. He combines two separate narratives that employ different narrators and distinct fonts. The first narrative, poetic prose, is visually displayed to convey rhythm, and it is punctuated by haikus, which provide floating crystallized images that are persistent and haunting. The second type of narrative is steady and tame and sustains the imaginative flight of the first in several ways. On the one hand, it provides the information needed by the reader to fully penetrate the cognitive level of the first narrative as it comments on it, giving the reader information on the topics and events portrayed but also on the writing itself. On the other hand, it provides the writer’s notes that were reworked into the first narrative and, therefore, shows the kitchen of creation. The only ingredient added to the notes is Vizenor’s virtuosity as a writer. It sounds discouragingly complicated, but it is just ingenious and works exquisitely. The fact that it is one of those things whose impact can be fully grasped when experienced rather than described, just like music, only proves how successful Vizenor is in his endeavor.

It is also a kabuki novel. It stages the sophisticated and highly stylized form and classical refinement of the kabuki theater. An important characteristic