

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Social Change in the Southwest, 135&1880. By Thomas D. Hall.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7p6193pg>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 13(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Snipp, C. Matthew

Publication Date

1989

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Though at times uneven, *The Witch of Goingsnake and Other Stories* offers nonetheless another valuable example of a new and important voice in American fiction. These are the stories of original Americans, what Principal Chief Wilma Mankiller calls stories of "balance and synthesis."

Were the provincial publishing wizards of New York awake and the rest of the nation alert to what is actually happening in American literature, they would really notice, at long last, American Indian fiction. Among such Indian writers as Gerald Vizenor, N. Scott Momaday, Louise Erdrich, Leslie Silko, and James Welch, they would notice Robert Conley.

Louis Owens

University of New Mexico

Social Change in the Southwest, 1350–1880. By Thomas D. Hall. Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 1989. 320 pages. \$35.00 Cloth.

This is an ambitious book. It tries to distill over 500 years of history in the space of just under 250 pages, exclusive of notes and references. At the same time, Hall uses his historical narrative to advance a complex critique of a complex set of ideas known generically as World Systems Theory (WST). Needless to say, this book is as dense as it is ambitious: packed with complex ideas, complicated arguments, and historical details.

As this description might suggest, the scope of this work is sufficiently grand that many potential readers might be skeptical of its merits, or fear it as unreadable. Nonetheless, rest assured that despite its subject matter, *Social Change in the Southwest* is an informative, readable work that succeeds well in many respects. It should appeal to, and should be read by many different audiences because it addresses diverse interests in World Systems Theory, the history of the Southwest, economic history, historical sociology, theories of social change, and relations between American Indians and Europeans. Hall should be commended for taking-up a challenging problem and handling it with adept conciseness.

Although closely linked, it is most convenient to review the theoretical contributions of Hall's volume separately from its contributions as an historical work. Early in this book, Hall takes aim

at the intellectual shortcomings of World Systems Theory (WST). WST is an intellectual framework that has been used to explain the growth and dominance of capitalistic economies. Despite its popularity, Hall points out that WST is not well-equipped for understanding the economic systems of indigenous societies, nor the collision that takes place as capitalism comes into contact with non-capitalistic societies. On this latter point, Hall uses his critique of WST to develop his concept of "incorporation."

The concept of "incorporation" is likely to be this book's most enduring contribution to the WST literature. This is because it provides a vehicle for explaining the transformation of indigenous societies that results from their contact with capitalistic economic systems. As a way of viewing social change, incorporation is a long-term process by which indigenous societies are gradually absorbed into capitalistic economic systems. Ultimately, incorporation leads to the economic exploitation of indigenous societies for the benefit of capitalistic interests. The exploitation of native societies is made possible because of economic relations that promote economic dependency among indigenous populations.

The concept of incorporation is particularly interesting because it suggests that while native societies are absorbed into capitalistic economies, they do not lose their distinctive character. As such, the idea for incorporation represents an alternative for concepts such as acculturation or assimilation for anticipating the consequences of intercultural contact. Whereas theories of assimilation or acculturation have predicted the eventual absorption and disappearance of native cultures, incorporation implies the preservation of indigenous societies through the creation of incorporated, albeit exploited ethnic enclaves. Hall's thinking about incorporation allows him to at once posit social change resulting from inter-cultural contact without causing him to conclude that such change must inevitably lead to the disappearance of indigenous societies.

To demonstrate the workings of incorporation, Hall uses the Southwest as a case study with a long sweep of time, 1350 to 1880. As a case study, this is a particularly interesting time and place because of the unique social diversity that it brings to Hall's study. The southwest that Hall studies includes the Spanish and their American successors—both of whom had different interests

and approaches to the indigenous populations of this area. And, there was great diversity among the Native societies that inhabited the land. In particular, the sedentary Pueblos and the nomadic Comanche and Apache provide an especially interesting contrast in the ways that Spaniards and later the Americans dealt with Native people.

Hall's analysis of southwestern history begins with a brief sketch of the anthropology of this region. This is a useful digression for two reasons. One is that it provides the reader with a better understanding of the cultures native to this area. Second, it provides the context for the social changes that take place with the arrival of the Spanish and later the Americans.

Hall's analysis of relations between the Spanish and the southwestern Indians shows how the Spanish were adept at using trade and intertribal rivalries to foster economic dependency. On the one hand, the Spanish provided guns and horses to nomadic hunters such as the Comanche. This had the effect of making them more efficient hunters. At the same time that guns and horses greatly increased the hunting production of the Comanche, this technology also transformed their ability to attack and harass the sedentary Pueblo Indians. The Pueblos, now under stress from the well-armed and mounted Comanches, found themselves in the position of seeking assistance from the equally well-armed and mounted Spanish. The Spanish reliance on slave labor in their silver mines also meant that a vigorous trade in captures existed to further exacerbate intertribal conflicts.

In 1846, the United States went to war with Mexico and in 1848, concluded this war with the signing of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo. The signing of this treaty marked officially the demise of the Spanish presence in the Southwest and the emergence of the United States as a dominant influence. The emergence of the U.S. as a political power in this region also marked a new era in white-Indian relations.

Unlike the Spanish, the government of the United States was not especially interested in promoting trade with the Indian population. Instead, the political agenda of the United States was dominated by interests in opening up the territory for settlement and agricultural production. This meant removing and/or otherwise restricting American Indian's use of the land; the results were predictable. As Hall points out, the conflicts between

whites and Indians intensified for the next 20 years until the tribes of this region were subdued with military force and their land expropriated.

This greatly simplified sketch of Hall's historical analysis does not do justice to his discussion. There are many relevant details that I have omitted but are representative of the ways American Indians were brought into the world economy and at the same time exploited and isolated from it. Though American Indians were active participants in establishing capitalism in the New World, they were never full and equal partners in the process.

While this book deserves praise, it is certainly not flawless. One shortcoming is the lack of connection between the theoretical framework that shapes the historical inquiry and the historical narrative itself. At the outset, readers are given a fairly abstract analysis of WST in connection with indigenous societies. However, in the chapters that follow this discussion, Hall seldom returns to his theories to explain how his historical information supports (or does not support) his thinking about the development of capitalist economies. Although this makes the historical narrative somewhat more readable, readers may wonder whether and how the masses of historical details fit into Hall's ideas about incorporation.

As I suggested at the beginning of this review, this is a good book but it is not light reading. It is certainly an excellent book for scholars conducting research and for graduate students developing their expertise in WST, American Indians, or the history of the Southwest. For this reason, I would gladly recommend it for such an audience. However, I would be more reluctant in recommending it as a classroom text for undergraduate students.

C. Matthew Snipp
University of Wisconsin-Madison

Collections Arctiques. By Yvon Csonka. Neuchâtel: Musée d'Ethnographie, 1988. Maps, illus., indices, glossary, bibl., 214 pages. No price available.

Switzerland's Neuchâtel is not the place where one would expect to find a collection of Inuit clothing and artifacts, some of them (particularly from the Central Arctic), now rare. The col-