

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Engendered Encounters: Feminism and Pueblo Cultures, 1879-1934. By Margaret D. Jacobs.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7zp9q3p1>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Haaland, Debra

**Publication Date**

2000-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

*The Enduring Seminoles* offers valuable insights into the functioning of an important facet of Florida Indian life that is only glimpsed in more comprehensive historical treatments. The story of life in the tourist camps is compellingly told from the Indian's viewpoint. The book's greatest contribution is in affirming that Seminoles were indeed sentient beings fully in charge of their lives, even though it may have appeared otherwise to reformers and government officials of the time. In the process the tribes formed an attachment to tourism that persists to the present day. This book fills an important niche alongside such specialized works as Dorothy Downs' study of the Indians' famed patchwork in *Art of the Florida Seminole and Miccosukee Indians* (1995), and Patricia Wickman's exploration of material culture associated with the Seminoles' greatest leader in *Osceola's Legacy* (1991). All these books are essential reading for anyone who hopes to develop a comprehensive understanding of the cultural history of Florida's Seminole and Miccosukee peoples.

Harry A. Kersey  
Florida Atlantic University

**Engendered Encounters: Feminism and Pueblo Cultures, 1879–1934.** By Margaret D. Jacobs. Lincoln: The University of Nebraska Press, 1999. 328 pages. \$45.00 cloth; \$20.00 paper.

Margaret D. Jacobs has good intentions in trying to weave "what were long scattered and loose threads into a larger rich narrative tapestry" (Ramón A. Gutiérrez, back cover). Her sixty-one pages of endnotes attest to her collection of valuable archival sources such as the John Collier, Mary Austin, Kenneth Chapman, Mabel Dodge Luhan, and Elsie Clews Parsons papers plus another fourteen pages of an extensive bibliographic essay. Her melding of these sources into one book works well.

Void of a much-needed introduction, the book is divided into six sections beginning with "White Women, Pueblo Indians, and Federal Indian Policy." For those readers unfamiliar with John Collier's Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA), Jacobs adequately explains the climate of federal Indian policy for the Pueblo Indians around the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, and the rush of white women onto the Southwest landscape. These white women moved in waves. Some wished to educate the Indians to bring them out of their perceived ignorance, while others realized the Indians' value to feminism and felt that exposing Pueblo Indian women's "high status" would further their cause of gaining equality with men (p.72). The women also wished to preserve and document Pueblo cultures before they fell victim to modernism.

The following five chapters relay mostly the viewpoints of the white women reformers, the anti-modern feminists, and the federal governmental organizations. White women reformers, such as Mary Disette and Clara True, marched across the Southwest crusading to uplift Indian women. They saw the Pueblo women as victims of "Indian male supremacy" (p. 24). They urged Pueblo women to become educated and independent, thereby earning their

own money so as not to rely on men. Dissette and True themselves never married but relied on "relationships with other women for companionship" (p. 46). They also became monetarily self-sufficient and believed they were good role models for the Indian women and girls they wished to influence.

By the early 1920s anti-modern feminists, such as Elsie Clews Parsons, Mabel Dodge Luhan, and Mary Austin worked to convey their realization that the status of Pueblo women was superior to that of any middle-class white woman in America. These anti-modern feminists shunned industrialization and looked with a romantic eye on Pueblo communities for their oneness with nature (p. 92). Thus, a throng of the rich eastern women moved to New Mexico to grab onto a piece of culture they had never before experienced. Within this circle, "sexual expressiveness" played a large part (p. 70). Simply put, the anti-modern feminists slept around and cared not what society thought.

These women characterized the Pueblos as "feminist's utopias" (p. 73)—not for reasons of sexual expressiveness, but because Pueblo communities were largely matrilineal and matrilocal (p. 72). In this way the feminists felt Pueblo women enjoyed a higher status than they. Mabel Dodge Luhan, in moving to Taos, wished so much to be like a Pueblo woman that she cut her hair Pueblo-style and "wore a shawl about her as Pueblo women did" (p. 101). In leaving the high-society world she had come to detest, she managed to garner a Taos Pueblo woman's husband (Tony Luhan), advocate for his divorce, and marry him after she, too, divorced.

Within the text, Jacobs also writes of Pueblo community organization and religion, the 1920s controversy over Indian dancing, and the feminists' and reformers' roles in the Indian Arts and Crafts movement. The dance controversy stemmed from white people's reports to the BIA about alleged "indecent performance[s]" followed by governmental agencies' actions to stop the Pueblos from holding the dances (p. 138). This struggle lasted only a short time. The Indian Arts and Crafts Movement advocated to help the Indians become self-sufficient by turning their domestic crafts into money-making businesses. Whereas pottery was considered a necessity to Pueblo peoples, the women reformers and feminists saw it as "art" and pushed the people into selling off their old wares to be placed in private and museum collections. Pueblo art became hot and marketable, as did the people who made it.

Were I not a Pueblo woman myself I may have found the book delightfully meaty with hard quotes about sex, betrayal, and compassion. Before getting too far into the book, however, Jacobs states that her reluctance to perform oral interviews with Pueblo Indians stems from a "long history of exploitative contact with white women" (p. 4). By page five a full disclaimer jars the reader. Jacobs states that her "own attempts to gain firsthand insights from the Pueblos threatened to turn into the latest manifestation of the phenomenon I describe in this book," meaning that she did not want to be viewed as an ugly anthropologist and so refrained from interacting with any Pueblo people. Although commendable, this reason for not including true Pueblo insights is not solid enough to carry the reader through the entire book.

At this point I wanted to know more about her so-called attempts. At what Pueblos (considering that there twenty: nineteen in New Mexico and one—Hopi—in Arizona) did she try to interact with the people? What actions were taken by the Pueblos that apparently quelled these attempts? It is common knowledge in New Mexico that many, if not all, Pueblo villages are open to the public on feast days. Here one could visit the church, see dances in the plaza, and even partake in feasting at a Pueblo home, as all the homes are open to visitors for eating. While a casual visit to a few Pueblo villages may not have qualified for extensive research, anything would have helped Jacobs get a feel for the living culture about which she attempts to write. Her attempts to convey Pueblo views on dance, religion, and art are void of depth and truth. In writing such a book she would have done better to adhere to her archival sources and write the book completely omitting the Pueblo view.

I also realized even before reading the first page that the book was written neither for an audience highly educated in Pueblo culture and history nor for active participants in Pueblo culture. Instead the book is aimed at the millions of people who unknowingly perpetuate an uninformed and often false knowledge of Pueblo people. Such an audience would include those who found Ramón Gutiérrez's book *When Jesus Came the Corn Mothers Went Away* (1991) a significant contribution to history on the Southwest. The fact that Jacobs chose Gutiérrez to endorse her book almost shouts that Pueblo people are not invited to peruse its pages. Even though she states that his book "elicited [both] praise and criticism," it is clear which side of the controversy Jacobs stands (p. 249). For those who wish to read of the white women crusaders for the Pueblo Indians, it might be more fruitful to use the primary sources cited in the book rather than to sift through the assemblage of conjectured discourse.

Since the coming of the Spanish to the Southwest in the mid-1500s Pueblo people have dealt with intruders onto their lands and have in many ways learned to keep their own sense of superiority, even in the face great odds. When the Spanish and Americans forbade the Indians from practicing their religions, the Pueblos pretended to be Christians outwardly while carrying on their religions behind closed doors. I shook my head when Jacobs wrote that the clown "skits" at Hopi "may have . . . served to create a carnival-like occasion" (p. 135). Having been to Hopi and other Pueblos where clowns are present, I have known only that their "doings" are an integral part of the sacred ceremonies and in no way are meant to create a carnival-like atmosphere.

The worth of this book is its success in tying together many written sources. Pueblo oral history was not included; therefore, the book cannot be considered valid as far as the Pueblo view is concerned. Considering that Jacob's intent was to explore the "changing relationship between Anglo-American women and Pueblo Indians" (back cover), she falls severely short of portraying both sides of her cross-cultural study. When embarking on this genre of study, one should explore aspects of both cultures, including the culture not their own.

*Debra Haaland*

University of California, Los Angeles