

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Monsters of Contact: Historical Trauma in Caddoan Oral Traditions. By Mark van de Logt.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8dg5w35j>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 43(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Cox, Michael Leonard

Publication Date

2019

DOI

10.17953/0161-6463-43.1.113

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Monsters of Contact: Historical Trauma in Caddoan Oral Traditions. By Mark van de Logt. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2018. 252 pages. \$65.00 cloth; \$50 electronic.

In recent decades, a growing number of scholars have begun to rethink and reexamine the oral traditions and “myths” of Native Americans. While oral traditions have always been important to the Indigenous peoples who told and retold these stories for many centuries, scholarly interest in such stories was long the domain of folklorists, linguists, and cultural anthropologists, who have tended to view such stories through the lens of reconstructing cultural values, spiritual beliefs, and reckonings of space and place. Storytelling traditions have proven to be particularly problematic for historians, who, with some exceptions, pursue linear chronology as a baseline for their work, requiring at least some specific touchstones of time to locate stories within that chronology.

Many stories do not neatly or obviously conform to the histories constructed by European colonists or their Euro-American progeny, leading to a form of historical neglect in which stories have not been given adequate consideration as sources of tangible historical information. One subgenre of storytelling in many Indigenous traditions involves the activities of monsters, which have often been read as moral lessons or warnings of various sorts, and are sometimes dismissed as the most “farfetched” oral traditions of all. In this compelling book, Mark van de Logt works to bring monster stories to the forefront of a consideration of a new way of understanding the history of the Caddoan people. In the process, he examines these stories as the way by which the Caddoan people remembered tangible, documentable historical events and coped with the trauma wrought by real-world contact with Europeans, Americans, other Indigenous people, and the diseases and technologies Europeans brought to Caddoan worlds.

In some ways, this book is a response to the work of Ronald J. Mason, who argues in his *Inconstant Companions: Archaeology and North American Indian Oral Traditions* (2007) that the historicity of oral tradition is limited and better understood to provide insights into the mentalities of the tellers of the stories, not their cultural histories. One of Mason’s major problems with oral tradition as history is that one cannot adequately separate the “real” from the “fantastical” and still acknowledge the historical validity of the story as a whole. While acknowledging the concerns of scholars like Mason, van de Logt disagrees with most of his assertions, arguing that oral traditions, even as “fantastical” as monster stories, can often be rooted in historical reality.

Van de Logt is careful to plainly state that there are problems with using these monster stories as history. Stories sometimes lack consistency when comparing versions from multiple tellers; little is known about most of the Caddoan peoples who told these stories aside from names and a few biographical tidbits; the words and images used in stories are not always obvious analogies to known historical reference points and details (is a forked stick a firearm, for example?). Despite these limitations, the author is willing to engage in educated speculation to bridge the gaps between story and history. Choosing monster stories from all four extant Caddoan peoples (the Caddo, Wichita, Pawnee, and Arikara), the book approaches the oral traditions as the

baseline for reconstructing Caddoan histories. Rather than using the oral stories as corroboration for historical facts gleaned from other (usually non-Indigenous) sources, the author uses the stories as the principal history, building supportive evidence for the stories as history from the other pieces of available information.

The introduction provides a short overview of Caddoan culture, as well as an extended discussion of the uses scholars, mostly anthropologists, have made (or not made) of oral traditions during the past one hundred years. Van de Logt also discusses the discomfort, even anger, that some Native Americans experience when scholars try to employ stories in nontraditional ways. For some, a story is true in a sacred sense and not meant to depict recent historical events or people; some argue that the stories predate the arrival of Europeans and their historical records. While aware of and appreciative of this discomfort, van de Logt argues that failing to consider stories as legitimate historical sources leaves Indigenous people's understandings of their histories out of the dominant narrative. Finally, the introduction provides an overview of the burgeoning field of monster studies, which examines monster stories from around the world in a variety of contexts.

Part I (chapter 1) provides an overview of the various storytellers and storytelling traditions among Caddoan peoples, from which van de Logt draws the stories in the book. Chapters 2 through 5, grouped as Part II: Oral Traditions as History, serve as focused analyses of separate monster stories in context of recorded historical events. Chapter 2 examines the Arikara story of Whirlwind as analogous to the smallpox outbreaks that plagued the Arikara in the latter half of the eighteenth century. Chapter 3 examines a Wichita tale involving contacts with the Spanish and French in 1750s Texas, which van de Logt argues are Wichita memories of the destruction of Mission Santa Cruz de San Saba in 1758. Chapter 4 discusses Pawnee accounts of Flint Monsters in the late-seventeenth and early-eighteenth centuries, and their linkages to the arrival of armored Spaniards, with whom the Pawnee routinely fought. Chapter 5 links Caddo stories of cannibals and an Old Man with an Iron-nosed Mask to the de Soto expedition. The final chapter comprises Part III: Oral Traditions and Ethnohistorical Analysis, which examines stories of Scalped Men and Pahukatawa—the most notable Pawnee prophetic figure of the nineteenth century—in relation to the epidemic violence Pawnees faced from their enemies, particularly the Lakota and Cheyenne, contextualizing the stories within the framework of historical genocide.

Throughout the book, the strength of the connections van de Logt makes between stories and history varies. The most compelling chapter concerns the Wichita story of Coyote, Spider-Man, and an evil old woman. Van de Logt provides convincing arguments that these were Wichita depictions of specific people and history: Coyote was likely a Comanche who led Comanche-Wichita warriors to attack Mission San Saba in 1758; Spider-Man, who provided Coyote with a gun, represents the French; and the old woman is a portrait of Our Lady of Refuge, representing the Spanish who stole and enslaved Wichita children. Other connections made between monster stories and historical events are also reasonable, but in most cases a lack of corroborating historical source materials necessitates more speculation and leaves these interpretations more open to question.

Monsters of Contact provides intriguing possibilities for telling Indigenous history from a more Indigenous-centered perspective. In the process, van de Logt does ask scholars to take some leaps of faith onto what is, for historians at least, uncertain ground, where educated speculation necessarily must stand in for missing facts. From this reviewer's perspective, van de Logt's assertions and speculations are warranted, and will, at the very least, require a response, whether historians are supportive or opposed. This book promises to provoke ongoing discussions about the historicity of oral traditions and will force us to consider the possibility that monsters are indeed real.

Michael Leonard Cox
San Diego Mesa College

Okanagan Grouse Woman: Upper Nicola Narratives. By Lottie Lindley. Edited and with an introduction by John Lyon. Foreword by Allan Lindley. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2016. 512 pages. \$65.00 cloth; \$35.00 paper and electronic.

Okanagan Grouse Woman: Upper Nicola Narratives is a profoundly moving collection of Okanagan (Interior Salish) tellings by elder Lottie Lindley that is valuable for many different audiences as well as generations to come. One of the last fluent speakers of her dialect, the author learned her language, teachings, and stories from the old ones "in a manner unbroken by colonization" (xvii). Although one can engage in the book's different parts at various levels and points, please begin with the foreword by Lottie Lindley's grandson Allan Lindley, who shares the wisdom he has learned about stories in general and the honor he feels to be able to share his grandmother's stories with others. Reading this foreword prepares the ground to be planted with the seeds of each story, so that they may grow and develop in each person as may be relevant to them.

Lottie Lindley shares stories in her language, which encodes the Okanagan world view. There are twenty-nine narratives in all. The first narratives are from long ago (*captik'wł*), when people were turned into stones and mountains, and sea monsters inhabited what are now lakes. There are also stories from early contact, passed on to the narrator, that share how lands came to be inhabited. The narratives have a wide range of themes, including the history of places and their names, advice for coming of age, how to train to be a hunter, and the impacts of residential school, as well as changes in weather patterns witnessed over the last century or so. Some stories tell of the narrator's personal life, but most are stories she has heard from her elders. The book has three parts which allow each narrative to be presented in several formats. Part 1 renders the narratives in Okanagan and part 2 offers English translations. Some of the stories have two English versions in part 2: in the first version, editor John Lyon has aimed to be as faithful to the original Okanagan telling as possible, while the second is Lottie Lindley's version of the story. In some cases, the editor has written a preceding contextualization that sets the stage for the narrative, or Lottie Lindley has added some comments.