

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Indian Water in the New West. Edited by Thomas McGuire, William Lord, and Mary Wallace.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8h09n4fq>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(3)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Burton, Lloyd

### Publication Date

1994-06-01

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

types of social change that result from the adoption of slavery and from the other forms of social interaction that come with it. The Klamath, relative latecomers to slavery, realized that there was profit to be made by slave trading and adopted both horses and slave capture and trading successfully in the early 1800s.

Other than the above-mentioned contributions, I find little in this book that has not already been said about Northwest Coast slavery. The considerable ethnographic and historical errors make it particularly aggravating reading. Nevertheless, it is helpful to have the many disparate references to slavery compiled in one volume.

*Daniel L. Boxberger*  
Western Washington University

**Indian Water in the New West.** Edited by Thomas McGuire, William Lord, and Mary Wallace. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1993. 260 pages. \$35.00.

Editing symposium proceedings into book form is a challenge under the best of circumstances. The scholarship and writing style are usually uneven, both gaps and overlaps in coverage of the subject often occur, and the time lag from conference proceedings to book publication can be substantial. If there are multiple editors as well as multiple contributors, and the subject is one as inherently complex and fast-changing as the water rights claims of American Indian tribes, the task becomes even more daunting.

Fortunately, in their development of *Indian Water in the New West*, editors Tom McGuire, Bill Lord, and Mary Wallace have, for the most part, succeeded admirably in meeting the challenge before them. The knowledgeable and insightful contributors to the book certainly provide one key to their relative success, but their own well-spoken expertise and extensive collective experience in the subject matter are obviously just as important.

The book makes two important contributions to the existing literature in the field. The first is an effort to present a diversity of well-reasoned perspectives on the status of tribal water resource claims and issues. The book thus avoids becoming a manifesto for one point of view or another. Some authors are fairly supportive of tribal claims; others are clearly less so. One particularly wel-

come addition to the traditional dialogue over these issues is Austin Nuñez's and Mary Wallace's case study chapter on the San Xavier O'Odham of Southern Arizona. This chapter—in addition to being in the voice of a tribal leader—also forthrightly discusses the spiritual as well as the economic and legal significance of water to the O'Odham people.

The second significant contribution of this edited collection is that it provides fairly in-depth case studies of how several major water rights/water management controversies have been or are being resolved. Included in this review are cases involving tribes from throughout the American West, covering a variety of different approaches to resolving water rights conflicts. This is an important feature of the book, since it demonstrates that no one policy approach seems appropriate to all of these different cases.

The editors were somewhat less successful in assuring the timeliness of their material. The essays in *Indian Water and the New West* were originally given as working papers at a conference in 1989, and there are relatively few literature or legal references in the book later than 1990. (One notable exception is the Nuñez/Wallace chapter on implementation of the O'Odham settlement legislation, which evidently was done shortly before the book went to press.) However, the real value of the book lies in the themes it presents and the diverse philosophical and tactical perspectives it portrays, as well as in its carefully documented case studies; its relative lack of timeliness should therefore be seen as a single drawback that by no means prevents the book from being an important contribution to the scholarly literature on American Indian water law and policy.

Two more points must be made, which actually constitute less a criticism of this book than a commentary on most of the literature on American Indian water rights, my own book (*American Indian Water Rights and the Limits of the Law*) included. We all have tended to discuss these issues as if we were dealing with a finite problem of contract interpretation between otherwise unrelated parties (the Folk-Williams chapter in the "New West" collection is an important exception to this generalization). The predominant thinking seems to have been that, once resolved (whether by negotiation, litigation, or legislation), the problem would simply go away.

But what these resource management issues are really speaking to is only one element of a complex, ongoing relationship in which indigenous peoples and Euro-Americans have been inex-

trically involved for the last three hundred years. The treaties and other agreements governing this relationship are "living law" no less than is the U.S. Constitution itself. The reciprocal impacts of tribal and neighboring non-Indian water resource management decision-making will continue to be felt for as long as we all inhabit the same continent. The quest for some "final solution" to these issues is illusory, like a lake-mirage on the desert horizon that continually lures us yet remains always just beyond our reach. Perhaps a more appropriate goal is the creation of durable arrangements for the cooperative management of this commonly used resource for generations to come, with an understanding that the quest for certainty and finality may in some respects be futile.

Lastly, since so much western water law is unique to the history, geography, and politics of the American West, researchers tend to think of issues raised by American Indian tribal claims as also unique. However, it is worth noting that *Indian Water in the New West* was published in the year that the United Nations General Assembly declared to be the "International Year of Indigenous Peoples." Tribal efforts to perfect legal claims to, and exercise more control over, water are wholly in keeping with similar activities by other indigenous peoples throughout the Americas and the entire Pacific Rim, as they attempt to assert sovereign control over the resources on which their future economic well-being depends. While the geographic and cultural circumstances of each American Indian water rights case may have some unique features, they also have more in common with the ongoing efforts of other indigenous people to reclaim their environmental birthright through principles of international law and U.N. diplomacy than most opponents of American Indian water rights claims would care to admit.

*Lloyd Burton*

University of Colorado at Denver

**K'äuroondak: Behind the Willows.** By Richard Martin, as told to Bill Pfisterer. Fairbanks, Alaska: Center for Cross-Cultural Studies, University of Alaska. 306 pages. \$20.00 paper.

This lovely book contributes to a growing body of literature from subarctic Athabascan oral storytellers. In recent years, a number