# UC Davis UC Davis Previously Published Works

# Title

Intermediate-Depth Earthquakes Controlled by Incoming Plate Hydration Along Bending-Related Faults

**Permalink** https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8kc932np

**Journal** Geophysical Research Letters, 46(7)

**ISSN** 0094-8276

# **Authors**

Boneh, Yuval Schottenfels, Emily Kwong, Kevin <u>et al.</u>

Publication Date 2019-04-16

# DOI

10.1029/2018gl081585

Peer reviewed

# Intermediate depth earthquakes controlled by incoming plate hydration along bending-related faults

Yuval Boneh<sup>1,2</sup>, Emily Schottenfels<sup>3</sup>, Kevin Kwong<sup>4</sup>, Iris van Zelst<sup>5</sup>, Xinyue Tong<sup>6</sup>, Melody
 Eimer<sup>7</sup>, Meghan S. Miller<sup>8</sup>, Louis Moresi<sup>9</sup>, Jessica M. Warren<sup>10</sup>, Douglas A. Wiens<sup>7</sup>, Magali
 Billen<sup>11</sup>, John Naliboff<sup>11</sup>, Zhongwen Zhan<sup>12</sup>

- <sup>6</sup> <sup>1</sup> Department of Geological Sciences, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA
- <sup>2</sup> Now at Department of Geological and Environmental Sciences, Ben-Gurion University of the
   Negev, Be'er-Sheva, Israel
- <sup>9</sup> <sup>3</sup> Department of Earth and Environment, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, USA
- <sup>4</sup> Roy M. Huffington Department of Earth Science, Southern Methodist University, Dallas,
- 11 Texas, USA
- <sup>5</sup> Seismology and Wave Physics, Institute of Geophysics, Department of Earth Sciences, ETH
   Zürich, Zürich, Switzerland
- <sup>6</sup> Department of Geological Sciences, Jackson School of Geosciences, University of Texas at
   Austin, Austin, Texas, USA
- <sup>7</sup> Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Washington University in St. Louis, Saint Louis,
   Missouri, USA
- <sup>8</sup> Research School of Earth Sciences, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia
- <sup>9</sup> School of Earth Sciences, University of Melbourne, McCoy Building, Parkville, Australia
- <sup>10</sup> Department of Geological Sciences, University of Delaware, Penny Hall, Newark, Delaware,
- 21 USA
- <sup>22</sup> <sup>11</sup> Department of Geology, University of California, Davis, California, USA
- <sup>12</sup> Seismological Laboratory, Division of Geological and Planetary Sciences, California Institute
   of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125, USA
- 25 Corresponding author: Yuval Boneh (bonehyuv@bgu.ac.il)

# 26 Key Points:

- Global survey demonstrates a correlation between bending faults in the incoming plate and the seismicity rate of intermediate depth earthquakes
- Fault throw provides a proxy for overall fault damage and the ability of water to penetrate
   and hydrate the incoming plate
- A mechanical parameter based on the incoming plate faulting controls the seismicity rate of intermediate depth earthquakes

33

## 34 Abstract

- Intermediate depth earthquakes (focal depths 70 300 km) are enigmatic with respect to their
- 36 nucleation and rupture mechanism, and the properties controlling their spatial distribution.
- 37 Several recent studies have shown a link between intermediate depth earthquakes and the
- thermal-petrological path of subducting slabs in relation to the stability field of hydrous minerals.
- 39 Here we investigate whether the structural characteristics of incoming plates can be correlated
- 40 with the intermediate depth seismicity rate. We quantify the structural characteristics of 17
- 41 incoming plates by estimating the maximum fault throw (MFT) of bending-related faults. MFT
- 42 exhibits a statistically significant correlation with the seismicity rate. We suggest that the
- 43 correlation between fault throw and intermediate depth seismicity rate indicates the role of
- 44 hydration of the incoming plate, with larger faults reflecting increased damage, greater fluid
- 45 circulation, and thus more extensive slab hydration.

# 46 Plain Language Summary

47 In subduction zones, one tectonic plate plunges beneath another into the Earth's interior. Some

- 48 of the earthquakes that occur at subduction zones are unusual due to their occurrence at depths of
- 49 70 to 300 km ("intermediate depths"), deeper than the expected limit of brittle failure. In this
- study, we evaluate whether the faults that form when a plate bends as it enters a subduction zone
- can explain the occurrence of these deep earthquakes. Sea water penetrates deep into these faults
- and forms new, hydrous minerals, but these new minerals are not stable deeper in the subduction
- zone. Laboratory experiments show that breakdown of these hydrous minerals can cause
- seismicity at depths of 70 300 km (intermediate depths). Here we examined a set of 17
- 55 subduction zone segments around the globe and found that the seismicity is correlated with the
- faults that formed due to plate bending. This observation can be explained if the amount of foulting prior to subduction controls the amount of hydrous mineral formation which
- 57 faulting prior to subduction controls the amount of hydrous mineral formation, which
- subsequently determines the intensity and rate of subduction zone related intermediate depth
- 59 earthquakes.

# 60 **1 Introduction**

Intermediate depth earthquakes, defined as seismic events at depths of 70 - 300 km, are a

- <sup>62</sup> unique feature of subduction zones, delineating the upper crust and mantle of the subducting slab
- in what is often referred to as the Wadati-Benioff zone [*Benioff*, 1963; *Wadati*, 1928]. The
- 64 dehydration of hydrous minerals in the subducted slab is the most commonly invoked
- 65 mechanism to explain events at these depths, where conditions of high temperature and pressure
- 66 should inhibit dynamic fracture or frictional sliding [*Green and Houston*, 1995; *Hirth and*
- 67 *Guillot*, 2013; *Meade and Jeanloz*, 1991; *Yamasaki and Seno*, 2003]. Rheological instabilities in
- some hydrous minerals deformed under high pressures (> 1 GPa) have been observed
- 69 experimentally [*Ferrand et al.*, 2017; *Jung et al.*, 2004; *Jung et al.*, 2009; *Okazaki and Hirth*,
- 2016; *Proctor and Hirth*, 2016; *Raleigh and Paterson*, 1965]. However, there is still ambiguity
- regarding the specific mechanism(s) through which hydrous minerals can generate seismic
- events. Additionally, there is considerable uncertainty about the degree of hydration of the
   incoming plate, particularly for the oceanic upper mantle, which should be largely anhydrous due
- incoming plate, particularly for the oceanic upper mantle, which should be larg
   to extraction of water during mid-ocean ridge melting [e.g., *Hacker*, 2008].
- Extensional faulting due to plate bending provides a conduit for fluids into the crust and uppermost mantle. Slab hydration and fluid circulation associated with plate bending-related

faults have been observed in seismic and electromagnetic studies [*Cai et al.*, 2018; *Grevemeyer* 

78 *et al.*, 2007; *Key et al.*, 2012; *Nedimović et al.*, 2009; *Van Avendonk et al.*, 2011; *Worzewski et* 

*al.*, 2011]. Numerical models suggest that stress and pressure changes during slab bending and

slab unbending can induce circulation of fluid through the fault zones into the lithospheric

81 mantle [*Faccenda et al.*, 2009; *Faccenda et al.*, 2012]. Subducting slabs have been inferred to

82 contain a significant amount of water, with hydration of the crust and mantle deduced from  $14 \mu = 2000$  C is the 2010 F and 12000 P and 1000 P

- seismic surveys [*Abers*, 2000; *Cai et al.*, 2018; *Faccenda et al.*, 2008; *Peacock*, 1990; *Pozgay et al.*, 2000; *Theo et al.*, 2007] and from chamical anrichments observed in are magnes [o.g., *Plank*]
- *al.*, 2009; *Zhao et al.*, 2007] and from chemical enrichments observed in arc magmas [e.g., *Plank*

85 and Langmuir, 1998; Stern, 2002].

This wide range of observations for incoming plate hydration, together with the 86 experimental evidence for embrittlement of hydrous minerals at high pressures, leads to an 87 expected relationship between incoming plate bending faults, amount of slab hydration, and 88 intermediate depth seismicity [Ranero et al., 2005]. A correlation between the hydration state of 89 the incoming plate and the seismicity rate in the subducted slab has been established regionally 90 [Shillington et al., 2015]. However, a previous attempt to find a worldwide relationship based on 91 the predicted water flux due to mineral dehydration did not find a correlation [Barcheck et al., 92 2012]. Here, we show that incoming plate faults, which may control the extent of hydration 93 pathways in the subducted slab, correlates globally with the off-trench intermediate depth 94 95 earthquakes. We postulate that the global distribution of intermediate depth earthquakes is controlled by the extent of faulting and fracturing on the incoming plate, and thus that hydration 96

97 is inherited through the brittle deformation history of the incoming plate.

# 98 2 Methods

99 2.1 Seismicity rate for intermediate depth earthquakes

In order to quantify the seismic productivity of intermediate depth earthquakes, we used
the International Seismological Centre (ISC) Bulletin earthquake catalog (http://www.isc.ac.uk).
The ISC Bulletin is the most complete and comprehensive teleseismic earthquake catalog
available and includes documentation of globally recorded earthquake hypocenters, phases,
magnitudes, and other pertinent earthquake data [e.g., *Di Giacomo et al.*, 2015].

105 The intermediate depth events used in this study were chosen based on three criteria: (1) 106 focal depth of 70 - 300 km, (2) magnitude of  $m_b \ge 4.5$ , and (3) occurrence between 1964 to 107 2015. Although the ISC catalog contains events beginning in 1900, global monitoring of 108 earthquakes for these magnitudes became effective only in the 1960s. We define the seismicity 109 rate as the number of events normalized by the trench length (km) and time (year).

We estimated the seismicity rate for 17 subduction zone segments (Fig. 1) with trench lengths of 210 – 1450 km (Table S1). For each segment, the increasing focal depth of intermediate depth events away from the trench trace the descending slab. Maps of each subduction zone showing the trench segments are provided in the supplementary material (Fig. S1).



115

**Figure 1**. Left: Global map showing the subduction zone segments used in this paper (segment

numbers correspond to IDs in Table S1). Intermediate depth earthquakes are delineated bycircles colored by the hypocenter depth. Right: enlargement of the South-America trench,

subdivided into 4 segments of different seismicity rates.

120 2.2 Bending-related fault throw

121 Slab flexure and the resulting tensional stresses generate normal faulting [e.g., *Ludwig* et 122 al., 1966; *Parsons and Molnar*, 1976; *Ranero* et al., 2003]. The bending-related normal faults, 123 manifested in horst and graben features, are a common characteristic of subduction zones and 124 can be seen in seismic reflection images and bathymetric maps up to about 100 km seaward of 125 the trench axis [e.g., *Chapple and Forsyth*, 1979; *Hilde*, 1983].

We quantified the vertical component of fault displacement (i.e., fault throw) in the incoming plate using a compilation of previously published bathymetry data from seismic reflection imaging and ship-based multibeam mapping [Table S2]. In regions with sparse or no data for bending fault offset, we used bathymetric data from the Global Multi-Resolution Topography (GMRT) [*Ryan* et al., 2009] accessed with GeoMapApp

131 (<u>http://www.geomapapp.org/</u>). Topographic profiles orthogonal to both fault strike and the trench

132 were manually selected and used to calculate the vertical fault throw on distinct seaward facing

normal faults (Fig. 2 and Fig. S2). We quantified the maximum fault throw (MFT) for each

region as a representation of the regional faulting intensity. Here we focus on MFT calculated as

- the average of the largest 10% of fault throw measurements for each region, but we also
- evaluated MFT based on the largest 5%, 20%, and 30% of fault throw measurements (Fig. S3).



Figure 2. Bathymetry and incoming plate roughness due to bending faults. (a) The SouthAmerican coast with intermediate depth earthquakes (from Fig. 1). Yellow boxes show the
locations of the zoomed-in bathymetry images shown in b and c. (b and c) Bathymetric maps
(GRMT) where A-A' and B-B' indicate the cross sections d and e, respectively, showing the
rough central (b) and conversely smooth southern (c) bathymetry off South America.

Fault throw represents fault displacement when a small variation in dip angle is assumed. We use it here to represent fault intensity on the assumption that this provides a proxy for hydration of the incoming plate. We therefore omit bathymetry related to seamounts and focus on bathymetry related to plate faulting. Topographic fault scarps and fault throw estimates have often been used to infer regional stress state, tectonics, and deformation rates where direct field studies are not possible, such as is in other submarine environments and planets [*Schultz et al.*, 2006; *Wilkins et al.*, 2002].

#### 150 **3 Results**

#### 151

137

3.1 Comparison of incoming plate properties with seismicity rate

The co-variation of the bathymetric expression of faults (as represented by MFT), and the 152 153 intermediate depth seismicity rate for the 17 trench segments is shown in Figure 3. This correlation suggests a general trend, where the largest fault throws are associated with an 154 increase in intermediate depth seismicity. For example, the bathymetry of Cascadia presents low 155 fault throw values of less than 50 m [Masson, 1991] and no intermediate depth earthquakes have 156 been recorded at this subduction zone. On the other hand, the highly faulted slab at the Tonga 157 trench has the highest seismicity rate of our dataset (46.2 10<sup>-3</sup> km<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup>). Regional data show a 158 similar trend. For example, we divided the Nazca plate, which subducts beneath South America, 159 into four parts according to the bathymetric texture (Fig. 1). Along the northern part of the South 160 America trench, the bathymetry is rough with MFT ~ 800 m, whereas the ocean-floor becomes 161 smoother towards the south with MFT ~ 80 m (Fig. 2). The seismicity rate follows this trend, 162 with higher seismicity rates corresponding to regions with rougher fault scarps. To test possible 163 variations in the magnitude completeness of the ISC seismic catalog, we compared the seismicity 164 rate with a threshold of  $m_b \ge 4.5$  and threshold of  $m_b \ge 5.6$  [*Di Giacomo* et al., 2015]. We found 165 no significant statistical difference in the seismicity rate between the two thresholds (Fig. S4). 166



Figure 3. The seismicity rate of intermediate depth earthquakes against the incoming plate
 maximum fault throw (MFT). MFT error bars are the standard deviation of the averaged 10%
 fraction largest fault throws, except Java, which is estimated to be 100 – 500 m by *Masson*

171 [1991]. Error bars for segment 15 are smaller than the symbol size.

Syracuse et al. [2010] defined several slab properties and the correlation of these 172 properties with seismicity rate is shown in Figure 4; slab age (Fig. 4a), convergence velocity 173 (Fig. 4b), dip angle (Fig. 4c), and thermal parameter (Fig. 4d). In contrast to the positive trend 174 between MFT and seismicity rate, none of these parameters show a clear correlation with 175 intermediate depth earthquake intensity. In particular, the thermal parameter ( $\varphi$ ), defined as the 176 product of slab age and convergence velocity perpendicular to the trench [Kirby et al., 1996], 177 where higher values of  $\varphi$  correspond to cooler slabs. This parameter provides a proxy for slab 178 temperature, assuming that heating of the subducting lithosphere is by conduction [Molnar et al., 179 180 1979]. The thermal state of a subduction zone has been assumed to control deep seismicity due to temperature-dependent mineral breakdowns reactions [Kirby et al., 1991], yet  $\varphi$  is not 181

182 correlated with seismicity rate (Fig. 4d).



167

Figure 4. The seismicity rate of intermediate depth earthquakes plotted against slab properties
from *Syracuse* et al., [2010]: (a) age, (b) convergence velocity, (c) dip angle, and (d) thermal
parameter.

187 3.2 Statistical significance of the MFT correlation with seismicity rate

We use three different statistical measures to evaluate the correlations between MFT and 188 properties of the incoming plate (Table S3): (1) the Pearson product-moment correlation 189 190 coefficient, (2) the Kendall rank correlation coefficient, and (3) the Spearman rank correlation coefficient. The Pearson's coefficient is used to explore the linear dependence between two 191 variables. The other two coefficients provide a measure of how well the relationship between the 192 two variables can be described by a monotonic function. In other words, they test the extent to 193 which the positive/negative relationship between two variables is systematic without the 194 necessity of a linear relationship. We also calculated the p-value to test the significance of the 195 196 correlations, where p varies between 0 and 1 and a small p-value indicates evidence against the null hypothesis. In our analyses, the null hypothesis is that no correlation exists between the two 197 variables. We consider a correlation to be significant when  $p \ll 0.05$  and the correlation 198 coefficients are higher than  $\sim 0.6$ . 199

Our analysis reveals high, statistically significant correlations between seismicity rate and 200 MFT for all three statistical tests (Fig. S5). The correlation between seismicity rate and MFT 201 (average of the top 10% of fault throws) shows values of 0.86, 0.6 and 0.74 for the Pearson, 202 Kendall and Spearman coefficients, respectively (Table S3). In contrast, none of the four other 203 parameters (slab age, velocity, dip, and thermal parameter) show a significant correlation, with 204 coefficients < 0.54, 0.21, and 0.32 for the Pearson, Kendall and Spearman coefficients, 205 respectively (Fig. S4). We also tested different definitions for MFT, using both higher (20% and 206 30%) and lower (5%) percentages of the total fault throw to calculate MFT. The correlation of 207 seismicity rate with MFT is statistically significant for all definitions although using a higher 208 percentage (20 or 30% of the largest faults throws) results in slightly lower correlations. 209

The rank correlation coefficients (Kendall and Spearman) give slightly lower correlations than the linear correlation coefficient (Pearson), because they are less sensitive to extreme values. The high value of the Pearson coefficient partly stems from the high MFT and seismicity rate values Tonga and South Peru-North Chile. Nevertheless, the fact that the rank dependence coefficients also show significant correlations supports our finding of a positive relationship between MFT and seismicity rate.

### 216 4 Discussion

Our results indicate that bending-related faulting of the incoming plate may be a 217 significant control on the seismicity rate of intermediate depth earthquakes. This relationship 218 between shallow incoming plate faults and intermediate depth seismicity rate was previously 219 shown for the Nazca and Cocos plates and was interpreted as fault reactivation [Ranero et al., 220 2005]. However, Warren et al., [2007, 2008] found that rupture directivity of intermediate depth 221 earthquakes was inconsistent with the orientation of outer-rise normal faults. Thus, the 222 correlation that we observe may instead be explained by hydration along these faults, with 223 subsequent embrittlement of the hydrated regions at >70 km, in accordance with nucleation 224 mechanisms for intermediate depth earthquakes. 225

4.1 Fault-zone damage leads to slab hydration

Bending faults provide a pathway for fluid circulation and deep hydration within the 227 downgoing plate [Emry and Wiens, 2015; Grevemeyer et al., 2007; Iver et al., 2012; Key et al., 228 2012; Nishikawa and Ide, 2015; Ranero and Sallares, 2004; Ranero et al., 2003; Tilmann et al., 229 2008]. The damage associated with faulting leads to channels of increased permeability that 230 allow deep fluid penetration into the oceanic lithosphere [e.g., Naif et al., 2015] and these fluids 231 react with the host rock to form hydrous minerals [e.g., Andreani et al., 2007]. The ability of 232 fluids to penetrate and react deep in the lithosphere is governed by properties such as fracture 233 density, permeability, and porosity, which are enhanced by faulting [Sibson, 2000]. Importantly, 234 these physical properties are expected to evolve through progressive displacement on faults. 235

Fault displacement and length scaling relationships [Cowie and Scholz, 1992; Schultz et 236 al., 2006] suggest that for greater fault displacement (and therefore greater fault throw), a larger 237 volume of the incoming plate is damaged. This provides the potential for enhanced hydration on 238 larger faults and thus more hydrous minerals would then be available at intermediate depths to 239 cause dehydration embrittlement. Gouge thickness [Scholz, 1987] and damage zone thickness 240 [Faulkner et al., 2011; Savage and Brodsky, 2011; Shipton and Cowie, 2001] increase with 241 increased fault displacement. Hence, the ability of fluids to migrate through the rock is 242 dependent on the damage-zone structure. Within the core of a fault, the permeability may be low 243 due to the presence of fault gouge. However, in material adjacent to the fault core, the 244 permeability can be an order of magnitude higher as a result of cracking in the region known as 245 the damage-zone [Caine et al., 1996; Evans et al., 1997]. 246

*Mitchell and Faulkner* [2012] showed that fracture density, damage-zone width, and fault displacement control overall damage zone permeability and that fault-related fracturing and permeability scale with fault displacement. The displacement (d) is scaled with the width of damage surrounding the fault (DW):

251

$$DW = \frac{a \, d}{b+d} \tag{1}$$

where DW is in meters, and a and b are constants with values of 96.25 and 147.16, respectively [*Mitchell and Faulkner*, 2012; *Savage and Brodsky*, 2011] based on regression of fault-zone data [*Faulkner* et al., 2011]. Cowie and Scholz [1992] showed that the fault length (L) can be scaled with the displacement:

256

Assuming Andersonian faults with 60° dip, displacement can be estimated from the fault throw. Using equations 1 and 2, the area of the damage-zone (DZ) due to faulting can be estimated:

 $d/L \propto 0.01$ 

260

 $DZ = L \cdot DW \tag{3}$ 

(2)

where DZ has units of  $m^2$ . The damage-zone associated with faulting increases the permeability around the fault and allows fluid infiltration and subsequent hydration [*Reynolds and Lister*, 1987; *Rüpke and Hasenclever*, 2017].

For the bending-faults in this study, the damage-zone width, estimated from the faultthrow, shows a quasi-linear relationship with the seismicity rate (Figure 5). As hydration kinetics are relatively fast [*Martin and Fyfe*, 1970], the limiting factor for slab hydration is the supply of water through brittle slab fractures and faults [*Rüpke* et al., 2013]. Although mineral production during hydration reactions has the potential to seal cracks [e.g., *Michibayashi*, et al., 2008], the

- reaction also results in a positive volume change that can generate additional fracturing and
- 270 permeability [*Audet* et al., 2009; *Jamtveit* et al., 2009]. The relationship between mechanical
- faulting and the extent of plate hydration has been observed in extensional faults at continental
- rifts [*Pérez-Gussinyé and Reston*, 2001], where faults have been found to serve as fluid conduits
- for hydration. *Bayrakci* et al. [2016] used seismic tomography of a continental margin offshore
- from western Spain to determine that the volume of serpentine had a linear dependence with the
- amount of fault displacement, consistent with the linear relationship presented in this study (Fig.
  5). We conclude that fault displacement controls the overall damage zone structure and
- permeability of the subducted plate and that bending faults function as conduits for fluid
- 277 permeasing of the subducted place and that bending faults function as conducts for find 278 infiltration into the oceanic lithosphere. Therefore, maximum fault throw provides a proxy for
- the extent of hydration in the slab, which later leads to intermediate depth seismicity.



280

Figure 5. Left: seismicity rate plotted against damage-zone width estimated from fault
displacements. Data from this study show a similar relationship to the estimated extent of
hydration as a function of damage-zone width as determined from seismic data by *Bayrakci* et al.
[2016] for the Iberia rifted margin. Right: schematic diagram of a subduction zone, illustrating
the relationship between bending faulting, incoming plate hydration, and intermediate depth

seismicity (modified from *Billen* [2009]).

4.2 The effect of incoming plate structure on intermediate depth earthquakes

Previous studies have investigated the relationship between the thermal structure of the 288 slab, dehydration, and intermediate depth seismicity [Abers et al., 2013; Hacker et al., 2003; van 289 Keken et al., 2011; Wei et al., 2017]. The premise behind such studies is that dehydration and 290 291 breakdown of hydrous minerals cause intermediate depth seismicity, as the thermo-petrological state of the slab determines when mineral phase boundaries are crossed, controlling the depth of 292 earthquakes [Gorbatov and Kostoglodov, 1997; Hacker et al., 2003; Peacock, 2001]. Fracturing, 293 elevated fluid pressure, and stress heterogeneities due to dehydration may all contribute to the 294 nucleation of intermediate depth earthquakes [Davies, 1999; Ferrand et al., 2017; Gasc et al., 295 2017]. 296

The correlation of thermal structure and slab age with intermediate depth seismicity suggests that the nucleation mechanism is temperature dependent [*Brudzinski et al.*, 2007]. This could be associated with the specific rheology of the hydrous minerals that have formed due to

the brittle-ductile-brittle transitions characteristic of many hydrous minerals [*Brantut et al.*,

2011; Jung et al., 2009; Proctor and Hirth, 2016; Raleigh and Paterson, 1965]. Alternatively,

302 seismicity may result from dehydration embrittlement and the related change of fluid pressure

and stress heterogeneities [Ferrand et al., 2017; Hirth and Guillot, 2013; Okazaki and Hirth,

2016]. Although the pressure-temperature conditions in the slab are a first-order control on the

release of fluids at intermediate depths, here we find that a mechanical parameter, fault throw,

determines the net availability of fluids and therefore controls the intensity of intermediate depth

307 seismicity.

# 308 **5 Conclusions**

309 We show a significant correlation between a global dataset of intermediate depth

seismicity rates and the occurrence of shallow faulting caused by plate bending. Other

parameters of the subducted slab such as plate age, convergence velocity, dip angle, and thermal

parameter do not show a statistically significant correlation. Our results suggest that shallow

313 processes associated with bending faults of the incoming plate have a strong control over

intermediate depth seismicity rate. We propose that the hydration extent of the subducted slab,

estimated from its faulting, exerts a primary control on the prevalence of intermediate depth

seismicity. Thermo-petrological models that seek to describe intermediate depth earthquakes

through mineral phase stability and breakdown of hydrous phases should also account for the

318 extent of hydration within the slab.

# 319 Acknowledgments

320 This research project was initiated at the 2017 Cooperative Institute for Dynamic Earth Research

321 (CIDER) summer program "Subduction Zone Dynamics" at the University of California,

Berkeley. We wish to thank the other organizers B. Romanowicz, P. van Keken, E. Hauri, and C.

Till. CIDER-II is funded as a "Synthesis Center" by the Frontiers of Earth Systems Dynamics

324 (FESD) program of NSF under grant number EAR-1135452. We also wish to thank Geoffrey

Abers and an anonymous reviewer for constructive comments and gratefully acknowledge Yi

Hu, Wang-Ping Chen, Samer Naif, and Hannah Rabinowitz for valuable discussions. Bathymetry

327 profiles from GeoMapApp (<u>http://www.geomapapp.org/</u>) were used in this study and are

included in the supporting information. A bathymetry profile from the Mariana trench (center)

329 was collected by R/V Langseth cruise, MGL1204 and is available from NOAA at

330 <u>http://www.marine-geo.org/link/entry.php?id=MGL1204</u>. Seismic data for the Japan trench was

collected by JAMSTEC (KR13-11). Seismicity data used to quantify the intermediate depth

seismicity rate was taken from the International Seismological Centre (ISC) Bulletin earthquake

catalog (http://www.isc.ac.uk).

334

# 335 **References**

Abers, G.A., 2000. Hydrated subducted crust at 100–250 km depth. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 176(3-4), pp.323-330.

Abers, G. A., J. Nakajima, P. E. van Keken, S. Kita, and B. R. Hacker (2013), Thermal-

petrological controls on the location of earthquakes within subducting plates, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *369*, 178-187.

- Andreani, M., C. Mével, A. M. Boullier, and J. Escartin (2007), Dynamic control on serpentine
   crystallization in veins: Constraints on hydration processes in oceanic peridotites,
   *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 8(2).
- Barcheck, C. G., D. A. Wiens, P. E. van Keken, and B. R. Hacker (2012), The relationship of
  intermediate-and deep-focus seismicity to the hydration and dehydration of subducting slabs, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 349, 153-160.
- Bayrakci, G., T. Minshull, D. Sawyer, T. J. Reston, D. Klaeschen, C. Papenberg, C. R. Ranero, J.
  Bull, R. Davy, and D. Shillington (2016), Fault-controlled hydration of the upper mantle
  during continental rifting, *Nature Geoscience*, 9(5), 384.
- Benioff, H. (1963), Source wave forms of three earthquakes, *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 53(5), 893-903.
- Bilek, S. L., S. Y. Schwartz, and H. R. DeShon (2003), Control of seafloor roughness on earthquake rupture behavior, *Geology*, *31*(5), 455-458.
- Billen, M. I. (2009), Tectonics: Soaking slabs, *Nature Geoscience*, 2(11), 744.
- Billen, M.I. and Gurnis, M., 2005. Constraints on subducting plate strength within the Kermadec
   trench. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 110(B5).
- Bondár, I., and D. Storchak (2011), Improved location procedures at the International
  Seismological Centre, *Geophysical Journal International*, *186*(3), 1220-1244.
- Bondár, I., E. R. Engdahl, A. Villaseñor, J. Harris, and D. Storchak (2015), ISC-GEM: Global
   instrumental earthquake catalogue (1900–2009), II. Location and seismicity patterns, *Physics* of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 239, 2-13.
- Boston, B., G. F. Moore, Y. Nakamura, and S. Kodaira (2014), Outer-rise normal fault
   development and influence on near-trench décollement propagation along the Japan Trench,
   off Tohoku, *Earth, Planets and Space*, 66(1), 135.
- Bouchon, M., D. Marsan, V. Durand, M. Campillo, H. Perfettini, R. Madariaga, and B. Gardonio
   (2016), Potential slab deformation and plunge prior to the Tohoku, Iquique and Maule
   earthquakes, *Nature Geoscience*, 9(5), 380.
- Brantut, N., A. Schubnel, and Y. Guéguen (2011), Damage and rupture dynamics at the brittle ductile transition: The case of gypsum, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*,
   *116*(B1).
- Brudzinski, M. R., C. H. Thurber, B. R. Hacker, and E. R. Engdahl (2007), Global prevalence of
  double Benioff zones, *Science*, *316*(5830), 1472-1474.
- Cai, C., D. A. Wiens, W. Shen, and M. Eimer (2018), Water input into the Mariana subduction
   zone estimated from ocean-bottom seismic data, *Nature*, *563*(7731), 389.
- Caine, J. S., J. P. Evans, and C. B. Forster (1996), Fault zone architecture and permeability
   structure, *Geology*, 24(11), 1025-1028.
- Chapple, W. M., and D. W. Forsyth (1979), Earthquakes and bending of plates at trenches,
   *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 84(B12), 6729-6749.
- 379 Centre, I. S. (2015), On-line Bulletin.

- Cowie, P. A., and C. H. Scholz (1992), Displacement-length scaling relationship for faults: data
   synthesis and discussion, *Journal of Structural Geology*, *14*(10), 1149-1156.
- Davies, J. H. (1999), The role of hydraulic fractures and intermediate depth earthquakes in
   generating subduction zone magmatism, *Nature*, *398*(6723), 142.
- Di Giacomo, D., I. Bondár, D. A. Storchak, E. R. Engdahl, P. Bormann, and J. Harris (2015),
   ISC-GEM: Global Instrumental Earthquake Catalogue (1900–2009), III. Re-computed MS
   and mb, proxy MW, final magnitude composition and completeness assessment, *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 239, 33-47.
- Emry, E. L., and D. A. Wiens (2015), Incoming plate faulting in the Northern and Western
   Pacific and implications for subduction zone water budgets, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 414, 176-186.
- Evans, J. P., C. B. Forster, and J. V. Goddard (1997), Permeability of fault-related rocks, and
   implications for hydraulic structure of fault zones, *Journal of Structural Geology*, *19*(11),
   1393-1404.
- Faccenna, C., Holt, A.F., Becker, T.W., Lallemand, S. and Royden, L.H., 2018. Dynamics of the
   Ryukyu/Izu-Bonin-Marianas double subduction system. *Tectonophysics*, 746, pp.229-238.
- Faccenda, M., T. V. Gerya, and L. Burlini (2009), Deep slab hydration induced by bending related variations in tectonic pressure, *Nature Geoscience*, 2(11), 790-793.
- Faccenda, M., L. Burlini, T. V. Gerya, and D. Mainprice (2008), Fault-induced seismic
   anisotropy by hydration in subducting oceanic plates, *Nature*, 455(7216), 1097.
- Faccenda, M., T. V. Gerya, N. S. Mancktelow, and L. Moresi (2012), Fluid flow during slab
   unbending and dehydration: Implications for intermediate-depth seismicity, slab weakening
   and deep water recycling, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 13(1).
- Faulkner, D., T. Mitchell, E. Jensen, and J. Cembrano (2011), Scaling of fault damage zones
  with displacement and the implications for fault growth processes, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *116*(B5).
- Ferrand, T. P., N. Hilairet, S. Incel, D. Deldicque, L. Labrousse, J. Gasc, J. Renner, Y. Wang, H.
  W. Green II, and A. Schubnel (2017), Dehydration-driven stress transfer triggers
  intermediate depth earthquakes, *Nature communications*, *8*, 15247.
- Gasc, J., N. Hilairet, T. Yu, T. Ferrand, A. Schubnel, and Y. Wang (2017), Faulting of natural
  serpentinite: Implications for intermediate depth seismicity, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 474, 138-147.
- Gorbatov, A., and V. Kostoglodov (1997), Maximum depth of seismicity and thermal parameter
  of the subducting slab: general empirical relation and its application, *Tectonophysics*, 277(13), 165-187.
- Green, H. W., and H. Houston (1995), The mechanics of deep earthquakes, *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 23(1), 169-213.
- Grevemeyer, I., C. R. Ranero, E. R. Flueh, D. Kläschen, and J. Bialas (2007), Passive and active
  seismological study of bending-related faulting and mantle serpentinization at the Middle
  America trench, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 258(3-4), 528-542.

- Hacker, B. R. (2008), H2O subduction beyond arcs, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*,
  9(3).
- Hacker, B. R., S. M. Peacock, G. A. Abers, and S. D. Holloway (2003), Subduction factory 2.
  Are intermediate-depth earthquakes in subducting slabs linked to metamorphic dehydration
  reactions?, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *108*(B1).
- 425 Han, S., S. M. Carbotte, J. P. Canales, M. R. Nedimović, H. Carton, J. C. Gibson, and G. W.
- Horning (2016), Seismic reflection imaging of the Juan de Fuca plate from ridge to trench:
  New constraints on the distribution of faulting and evolution of the crust prior to subduction, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *121*(3), 1849-1872.
- Hilde, T. W. (1983), Sediment subduction versus accretion around the Pacific, *Tectonophysics*,
   99(2-4), 381-397.
- Hirth, G., and S. Guillot (2013), Rheology and tectonic significance of serpentinite, *Elements*, 9(2), 107-113.
- Iyer, K., L. H. Rüpke, J. Phipps Morgan, and I. Grevemeyer (2012), Controls of faulting and
   reaction kinetics on serpentinization and double Benioff zones, *Geochemistry, Geophysics*,
   *Geosystems*, 13(9).
- Jamtveit, B., C. V. Putnis, and A. Malthe-Sørenssen (2009), Reaction induced fracturing during
   replacement processes, *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 157(1), 127-133.
- Jung, H., H. W. Green Ii, and L. F. Dobrzhinetskaya (2004), Intermediate depth earthquake
  faulting by dehydration embrittlement with negative volume change, *Nature*, 428(6982),
  545-549.
- Jung, H., Y. Fei, P. G. Silver, and H. W. Green (2009), Frictional sliding in serpentine at very
  high pressure, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 277(1), 273-279.
- Key, K., S. Constable, T. Matsuno, R. L. Evans, and D. Myer (2012), Electromagnetic detection
  of plate hydration due to bending faults at the Middle America Trench, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *351*, 45-53.
- Kimura, G., Y. Hashimoto, Y. Kitamura, A. Yamaguchi, and H. Koge (2014), Middle Miocene
  swift migration of the TTT triple junction and rapid crustal growth in southwest Japan: A
  review, *Tectonics*, *33*(7), 1219-1238.
- Kirby, S. H., W. B. Durham, and L. A. Stern (1991), Mantle phase changes and deep-earthquake
   faulting in subducting lithosphere, *Science*, 252(5003), 216-225.
- Kirby, S.H., S. Stein, E.A. Okal, and D.C. Rubie (1996), Metastable mantle phase
  transformations and deep earthquakes in subducting oceanic lithosphere. *Reviews of geophysics*, 34(2), pp.261-306.
- Ludwig, W.J., J.I. Ewing, M. Ewing, S. Murauchi, N. Den, S. Asano, H. Hotta, M. Hayakawa, T.
  Asanuma, K. Ichikawa, and I. Noguchi (1966), Sediments and structure of the Japan Trench. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 71(8), pp.2121-2137
- Martin, B., and W. Fyfe (1970), Some experimental and theoretical observations on the kinetics
   of hydration reactions with particular reference to serpentinization, *Chemical geology*, 6,
   185-202.

- 460 Massell, C. G. (2002), Large-scale structural variation of trench outer slopes and rises.
- Masson, D. (1991), Fault patterns at outer trench walls, *Marine Geophysical Researches*, *13*(3),
   209-225.
- Meade, C., and R. Jeanloz (1991), Deep-focus earthquakes and recycling of water into the
   Earth's mantle, *Science*, 252(5002), 68-72.
- Michibayashi, K., Hirose, T., Nozaka, T., Harigane, Y., Escartin, J., Delius, H., Linek, M. and
  Ohara, Y., 2008. Hydration due to high-T brittle failure within in situ oceanic crust, 30 N
  Mid-Atlantic Ridge. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 275(3), pp.348-354.
- Miller, M.S., Gorbatov, A. and Kennett, B.L.N., 2005. Heterogeneity within the subducting
  Pacific slab beneath the Izu–Bonin–Mariana arc: Evidence from tomography using 3D ray
  tracing inversion techniques. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 235(1-2), pp.331-342.
- 471 Mitchell, T., and D. Faulkner (2012), Towards quantifying the matrix permeability of fault
  472 damage zones in low porosity rocks, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *339*, 24-31.
- Molnar, P., D. Freedman, and J. S. Shih (1979), Lengths of intermediate and deep seismic zones
   and temperatures in downgoing slabs of lithosphere, *Geophysical Journal International*,
   56(1), 41-54.
- Nakamura, Y., Kodaira, S., Cook, B.J., Jeppson, T., Kasaya, T., Yamamoto, Y., Hashimoto, Y.,
  Yamaguchi, M., Obana, K. and Fujie, G., 2014. Seismic imaging and velocity structure
  around the JFAST drill site in the Japan Trench: low V p, high V p/V s in the transparent
  frontal prism. *Earth, Planets and Space*, 66(1), p.121.
- Naliboff, J. B., M. I. Billen, T. Gerya, and J. Saunders (2013), Dynamics of outer-rise faulting in
   oceanic-continental subduction systems, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 14(7),
   2310-2327.
- Naif, S., K. Key, S. Constable, and R. L. Evans (2015), Water-rich bending faults at the Middle
  America Trench, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 16(8), 2582-2597.
- Nedimović, M. R., D. R. Bohnenstiehl, S. M. Carbotte, J. P. Canales, and R. P. Dziak (2009),
  Faulting and hydration of the Juan de Fuca plate system, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 284(1-2), 94-102.
- Nishikawa, T., and S. Ide (2015), Background seismicity rate at subduction zones linked to slabbending-related hydration, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 42(17), 7081-7089.
- Okazaki, K., and G. Hirth (2016), Dehydration of lawsonite could directly trigger earthquakes in
   subducting oceanic crust, *Nature*, *530*(7588), 81-84.
- Parsons, B. and P. Molnar (1976). The origin of outer topographic rises associated with trenches.
   *Geophysical Journal International*, 45(3), pp.707-712.
- 494 Peacock, S. M. (2001), Are the lower planes of double seismic zones caused by serpentine
   495 dehydration in subducting oceanic mantle?, *Geology*, 29(4), 299-302.
- Pérez-Gussinyé, M., and T. J. Reston (2001), Rheological evolution during extension at
  nonvolcanic rifted margins: onset of serpentinization and development of detachments
  leading to continental breakup, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *106*(B3),
  3961-3975.

- Plank, T. and Langmuir, C.H., 1998. The chemical composition of subducting sediment and its
   consequences for the crust and mantle. Chemical geology, 145(3), pp.325-394.
- Pozgay, S. H., D. A. Wiens, J. A. Conder, H. Shiobara, and H. Sugioka (2009), Seismic
   attenuation tomography of the Mariana subduction system: Implications for thermal
   structure, volatile distribution, and slow spreading dynamics, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 10*(4).
- Proctor, B., and G. Hirth (2016), "Ductile to brittle" transition in thermally stable antigorite
  gouge at mantle pressures, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *121*(3), 16521663.
- Raleigh, C., and M. Paterson (1965), Experimental deformation of serpentinite and its tectonic
   implications, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 70(16), 3965-3985.
- Ranero, C. R., and V. Sallares (2004), Geophysical evidence for hydration of the crust and
   mantle of the Nazca plate during bending at the north Chile trench, *Geology*, *32*(7), 549-552.
- Ranero, C. R., J. P. Morgan, K. McIntosh, and C. Reichert (2003), Bending-related faulting and
  mantle serpentinization at the Middle America trench, *Nature*, 425(6956), 367.
- Ranero, C. R., A. Villaseñor, J. Phipps Morgan, and W. Weinrebe (2005), Relationship between
   bend-faulting at trenches and intermediate-depth seismicity, *Geochemistry, Geophysics*,
   *Geosystems*, 6(12).
- Reynolds, S. J., and G. S. Lister (1987), Structural aspects of fluid-rock interactions in
   detachment zones, *Geology*, 15(4), 362-366.
- Rüpke, L. H., and J. Hasenclever (2017), Global rates of mantle serpentinization and H2
   production at oceanic transform faults in 3-D geodynamic models, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 44(13), 6726-6734.
- Rüpke, L. H., D. W. Schmid, M. Perez-Gussinye, and E. Hartz (2013), Interrelation between
  rifting, faulting, sedimentation, and mantle serpentinization during continental margin
  formation—including examples from the Norwegian Sea, *Geochemistry, Geophysics*, *Geosystems*, 14(10), 4351-4369.
- Ryan, W.B., Carbotte, S.M., Coplan, J.O., O'Hara, S., Melkonian, A., Arko, R., Weissel, R.A.,
  Ferrini, V., Goodwillie, A., Nitsche, F. and Bonczkowski, J., 2009. Global multi-resolution
  topography synthesis. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 10(3).
- Ryan, W. B., S. M. Carbotte, J. O. Coplan, S. O'Hara, A. Melkonian, R. Arko, R. A. Weissel, V.
  Ferrini, A. Goodwillie, and F. Nitsche (2009), Global multi-resolution topography synthesis, *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 10*(3).
- Savage, H. M., and E. E. Brodsky (2011), Collateral damage: Evolution with displacement of
   fracture distribution and secondary fault strands in fault damage zones, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *116*(B3).
- 536 Scholz, C. H. (1987), Wear and gouge formation in brittle faulting, *Geology*, 15(6), 493-495.
- Schultz, R. A., C. H. Okubo, and S. J. Wilkins (2006), Displacement-length scaling relations for
   faults on the terrestrial planets, *Journal of Structural Geology*, 28(12), 2182-2193.

- 539 Shillington, D. J., A. Bécel, M. R. Nedimović, H. Kuehn, S. C. Webb, G. A. Abers, K. M.
- Keranen, J. Li, M. Delescluse, and G. A. Mattei-Salicrup (2015), Link between plate fabric,
  hydration and subduction zone seismicity in Alaska, *Nature Geoscience*, 8(12), 961.
- Shipton, Z., and P. Cowie (2001), Damage zone and slip-surface evolution over μm to km scales
  in high-porosity Navajo sandstone, Utah, *Journal of Structural Geology*, 23(12), 1825-1844.
- Sibson, R. H. (2000), Fluid involvement in normal faulting, *Journal of Geodynamics*, 29(3-5),
   469-499.
- 546 Stern, R. J. (2002), Subduction zones, *Reviews of geophysics*, 40(4).
- Syracuse, E. M., P. E. van Keken, and G. A. Abers (2010), The global range of subduction zone
  thermal models, *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 183(1), 73-90.
- Tilmann, F. J., I. Grevemeyer, E. R. Flueh, T. Dahm, and J. Goßler (2008), Seismicity in the
   outer rise offshore southern Chile: indication of fluid effects in crust and mantle, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 269(1-2), 41-55.
- Uyeda, S., and Z. Ben-Avraham (1972), Origin and development of the Philippine Sea, *Nature Physical Science*, 240(104), 176.
- Van Avendonk, H. J., W. S. Holbrook, D. Lizarralde, and P. Denyer (2011), Structure and
   serpentinization of the subducting Cocos plate offshore Nicaragua and Costa Rica,
   *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 12(6).
- Van der Hilst, R., S. Widiyantoro, and E. Engdahl (1997), Evidence for deep mantle circulation
   from global tomography, *Nature*, *386*(6625), 578.
- van Keken, P. E., B. R. Hacker, E. M. Syracuse, and G. A. Abers (2011), Subduction factory: 4.
   Depth-dependent flux of H2O from subducting slabs worldwide, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *116*(B1).
- 562 Wadati, K. (1928), Shallow and deep earthquakes, *Geophys. Mag.*, 1, 162-202.
- Warren, L.M., A. N. Hughes, and P. G. Silver (2007) Earthquake mechanics and deformation in
   the Tonga-Kermadec subduction zone from fault plane orientations of intermediate- and
   deep-focus earthquakes. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 112, 340.
- Warren, L.M., M.A. Langstaff, and P.G. Silver (2008) Fault plane orientations of intermediate depth earthquakes in the Middle America Trench. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 113, 19207.
- Wei, S. S., D. A. Wiens, P. E. van Keken, and C. Cai (2017), Slab temperature controls on the
   Tonga double seismic zone and slab mantle dehydration, *Science advances*, 3(1), e1601755.
- Wilkins, S. J., R. A. Schultz, R. C. Anderson, J. M. Dohm, and N. H. Dawers (2002),
   Deformation rates from faulting at the Tempe Terra extensional province, Mars, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 29(18).
- Worzewski, T., M. Jegen, H. Kopp, H. Brasse, and W. T. Castillo (2011), Magnetotelluric image
  of the fluid cycle in the Costa Rican subduction zone, *Nature Geoscience*, 4(2), 108.

Yamasaki, T., and T. Seno (2003), Double seismic zone and dehydration embrittlement of the
 subducting slab, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 108(B4).

- 578 Zhao, D., Z. Wang, N. Umino, and A. Hasegawa (2007), Tomographic imaging outside a seismic
- network: Application to the northeast Japan arc, *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 97(4), 1121-1132.
- Zhou, Z., J. Lin, M. D. Behn, and J. A. Olive (2015), Mechanism for normal faulting in the
- subducting plate at the Mariana Trench, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 42(11), 4309-4317.