UC Berkeley UC Berkeley Previously Published Works

Title

Exact Transport Representations of the Classical and Nonclassical Simplified PN Equations

Permalink <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8vs5z990>

Journal

Journal of Computational and Theoretical Transport, 47(4-6)

ISSN

0041-1450

Authors

Makine, I Vasques, R Slaybaugh, RN

Publication Date

2018-09-19

DOI

10.1080/23324309.2018.1496938

Peer reviewed

Exact Transport Representations of the Classical and Nonclassical Simplified P_N Equations

I. Makine, R. Vasques, and R.N. Slaybaugh

QUERY SHEET

This page lists questions we have about your paper. The numbers displayed at left can be found in the text of the paper for reference. In addition, please review your paper as a whole for correctness.

[Q1.](#page-24-0) A disclosure statement reporting no conflict of interest has been inserted. Please correct if this is inaccurate.

TABLE OF CONTENTS LISTING

The table of contents for the journal will list your paper exactly as it appears below:

Exact Transport Representations of the Classical and Nonclassical Simplified P_N Equations

I. Makine, R. Vasques, and R.N. Slaybaugh

ARTICLE

Check for updates

Exact Transport Representations of the Classical and Nonclassical Simplified P_N Equations

I. Makine^{a,b}, R. Vasques^c, and R.N. Slaybaugh^d

^aEcole Polytechnique de Bruxelles, ULB, Bruxelles, Belgium; ^bINSTN, Centre CEA de Saclay, Gifsur-Yvette, France; ^cDepartment of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering, The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA; ^dDepartment of Nuclear Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, 4151 Etcheverry Hall, Berkeley, CA, USA

ABSTRACT

We show that the recently introduced nonclassical simplified P_N equations can be represented exactly by a nonclassical transport equation. Moreover, we validate the theory by showing that a Monte Carlo transport code sampling from the appropriate nonexponential free-path distribution function reproduces the solutions of the classical and nonclassical simplified P_N equations. Numerical results are presented for four sets of problems in slab geometry.

KEYWORDS

Diffusion equation; transport equation; nonclassical transport; Monte Carlo method

1. Introduction

A nonclassical linear Boltzmann equation has been recently proposed (Larsen [2007;](#page-25-0) Larsen and Vasques [2011\)](#page-25-0) to address transport problems in which the particle flux is not attenuated exponentially. The original motivation for this formulation came from measurements of photon free-paths in atmospheric clouds, which could not be explained by classical radiative transfer with exponential attenuation (cf. sections 5.1 and 8.3 in Davis and Marshak [2010\)](#page-24-0) This theory has since been extended and has found applications for neutron transport in reactor cores (cf. Vasques and Larsen [2014\)](#page-25-0) as well as image rendering in computer graphics (cf. d'Eon [2013](#page-24-0)).

The nonclassical theory requires the use of a *memory variable*, namely the free-path s, representing the distance traveled by a particle since its previous interaction (birth or scattering). Assuming that scattering is isotropic, the one-speed nonclassical transport equation with an isotropic internal source is written as (Larsen and Vasques [2011\)](#page-25-0)

- State University, Columbus, OH, USA 2018 Taylor & Francis Group, LLC
- 43

CONTACT: R. Vasques vasques.4@osu.edu **Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering**, The Ohio

 $2 \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

$$
\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial s} + \mathbf{\Omega} \cdot \nabla \psi + \Sigma_t(s) \psi = \frac{\delta(s)}{4\pi} \left[c \int_{4\pi} \int_0^\infty \Sigma_t(s') \psi(x, \mathbf{\Omega}', s') ds' d\mathbf{\Omega}' + Q(x) \right].
$$
\n(1)

Here, $\psi = \psi(x, \Omega, s)$ represents the nonclassical angular flux, c is the scattering ratio, and $Q(x)$ is the source. The total cross section Σ_t is a function of s such that the free-path probability distribution function

$$
p(s) = \Sigma_t(s) e^{-\int_0^s \Sigma_t(s')ds'}
$$
 (2)

does not have to be exponential.

[Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) is a generalization of the linear Boltzmann equation; classical transport is recovered when Σ_t is independent of s. In that case, Equation (2) becomes the exponential decay

$$
p(s) = p_c(s) := \sum_t e^{-\sum_t s}, \qquad (3)
$$

and [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) reduces to the well-known (classical) one-speed linear Boltzmann equation (Larsen and Vasques [2011\)](#page-25-0)

$$
\mathbf{\Omega} \cdot \nabla \Psi(x, \mathbf{\Omega}) + \Sigma_t \Psi(x, \mathbf{\Omega}) = \frac{1}{4\pi} \left[c \int_{4\pi} \Sigma_t \Psi(x, \mathbf{\Omega}') d\mathbf{\Omega}' + Q(x) \right]
$$
(4)

for the classical angular flux

$$
\Psi(x,\Omega) = \int_0^\infty \psi(x,\Omega,s)ds.
$$
 (5)

The simplified P_N (SP_N) equations, first derived by Gelbard ([1960,](#page-24-0) [1961,](#page-25-0) [1962](#page-25-0)), have been shown to be a high-order asymptotic approximation of the transport equation (Larsen, Morel, and McGhee [1993](#page-25-0)). They are particularly attractive when addressing problems in which the spatial and angular dependence of the angular flux is not severe. They are used to improve the quality of transport physics in a diffusion model while avoiding the complexity of the full P_N (spherical-harmonics) or S_N (discreteordinates) equations. Specifically, the SP_N equations can be implemented directly within a diffusion code, with numerical solutions frequently much more transport-like than diffusion solutions. We refer the reader to (McClarren [2011](#page-25-0)) for a complete review on SP_N theory.

It has been shown that certain cases in the hierarchy of the classical SP_N equations ($SP₁$, $SP₂$, and $SP₃$) can be represented exactly by a nonclassical transport equation (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0). One can obtain explicit expressions for the free-path distribution $p(s)$ and the corresponding $\Sigma_t(s)$ such that [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) can be converted to an integral equation for the scalar flux

44 45

- 46 47
- 48 49

 $\Phi(x) = \Bigg[$ $\Psi(x,{\bf \Omega}) d{\bf \Omega} = \int_0^{\bf \Omega}$ 4π $\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}$ $\psi(x, \mathbf{\Omega}, s) ds d\Omega$ (6)

that is identical to the integral formulation of the SP_N equations. This result was later extended to include the case of nonclassical diffusion (Vasques [2016](#page-25-0)).

In this work, the following original results are presented:

- 1. We demonstrate that the *nonclassical* simplified P_N equations recently introduced in (Vasques and Slaybaugh [2017](#page-25-0)) are special cases of the nonclassical Boltzmann [equation \(1\).](#page-2-0) In particular, we derive explicit expressions for $p(s)$ and $\Sigma_t(s)$ such that the nonclassical simplified P_2 and P_3 equations can be exactly represented by a nonclassical transport equation. This fully generalizes the results introduced in (Frank et al. [2015;](#page-24-0) Vasques [2016](#page-25-0)). (This result has been shown for the nonclassical simplified P_1 in Vasques [\(2016](#page-25-0))).
	- 2. We show that the moments of the transport free-path distribution $p(s)$ are approximated with increasing accuracy as the order of the SP_N equations increases. If $p(s)$ is an exponential, even moments up to 2N are exactly preserved.
	- 3. We establish that the sampling of s from the probability function $p(s)$ for this generalized results can be explicitly performed in terms of a computed-generated random number. This allows us to use Monte Carlo methods to solve these equations.
	- 4. We present for the first time numerical simulations that validate the theory proposed in references (Frank et al. [2015](#page-24-0); Vasques [2016\)](#page-25-0), as well as the generalized theory introduced here. We consider transport in slab geometry and perform Monte Carlo simulations in which the free-paths are sampled from the appropriate nonexponential distributions, demonstrating that they match the solutions obtained with both the classical and the nonclassical forms of the simplified P_N equations. This effectively shows that it is possible to solve diffusion, SP_2 , and SP_3 problems using a nonclassical Monte Carlo transport method.

The remainder of the paper is organized as follows. In Section 2, we describe the classical and nonclassical simplified P_N equations. A sketch of the integral formulation for [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) is presented in Section 3. In Section 4, we use Green's function analysis to show that the nonclassical simplified P_N equations can be represented as nonclassical transport equations. Section 5 presents the numerical results that validate the theory. The paper concludes with a brief discussion in Section 6.

128 129

 $4 \quad (*)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

2 Simplified P_N equations

The nonclassical simplified P_N equations (Nc-SP_N) are a set of diffusion approximations to [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) derived by Vasques and Slaybaugh using a high-order asymptotic expansion (Vasques and Slaybaugh [2017](#page-25-0)). This asymptotic analysis requires the first 2M raw moments of the free-path distribution $p(s)$ to be finite in order to obtain the Nc-SP_N equations for $N = M$. Here, we will limit ourselves to presenting the Nc-SP₁, Nc-SP₂, and Nc -SP₃ formulations for the nonclassical transport [equation \(1\)](#page-2-0).

Let us define

$$
\langle s^m \rangle := \int_0^\infty s^m p(s) ds \tag{7}
$$

as the *mth* raw moment of the free-path distribution function $p(s)$. The second-order Nc- SP_N equations are explicitly given as follows (Vasques and Slaybaugh [2017](#page-25-0)):

(I) Nonclassical simplified P_1 equation (Nc-SP₁):

$$
-\frac{1}{6}\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{\langle s\rangle}\nabla^2\Phi(x) + \frac{1-c}{\langle s\rangle}\Phi(x) = Q(x).
$$
 (8)

(II) Nonclassical simplified P_2 equation (Nc-SP₂):

$$
-\frac{1}{6}\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{\langle s\rangle}\nabla^2\big[\Phi(x) + \lambda_1\big[(1-c)\Phi(x) - \langle s\rangle Q(x)\big]\big] + \frac{1-c}{\langle s\rangle}\big[1-\beta_1(1-c)\big]\Phi(x) = \big[1-\beta_1(1-c)\big]Q(x),\tag{9}
$$

where λ_1 and β_1 are constants given by

$$
\lambda_1 = \frac{3}{10} \frac{\langle s^4 \rangle}{\langle s^2 \rangle^2} - \frac{1}{3} \frac{\langle s^3 \rangle}{\langle s \rangle \langle s^2 \rangle},
$$
\n(10a)

$$
\beta_1 = \frac{1}{3} \frac{\langle s^3 \rangle}{\langle s \rangle \langle s^2 \rangle} - 1. \tag{10b}
$$

(III) Nonclassical simplified P_3 equations (Nc-SP₃):

$$
-\frac{1}{6}\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{\langle s\rangle}\nabla^2\big[\big[1+\beta_1(1-c)\big]\Phi(x)+2\nu(x)\big]+\frac{1-c}{\langle s\rangle}\Phi(x)=Q(x),\qquad(11a)
$$

$$
-\frac{1}{6}\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{\langle s\rangle}\nabla^2\left[\frac{\lambda_1}{2}\Phi(x) + \lambda_2 v(x)\right] + \frac{1-\beta_2(1-c)}{\langle s\rangle}v(x) = 0, \qquad (11b)
$$

where λ_2 and β_2 are constants given by

$$
\lambda_2 = \frac{1}{10\langle s^2 \rangle \langle s^3 \rangle - 9\langle s \rangle \langle s^4 \rangle} \left[\frac{9}{5} \langle s^5 \rangle - \frac{27}{21} \frac{\langle s \rangle \langle s^6 \rangle}{\langle s^2 \rangle} + 3 \frac{\langle s^3 \rangle \langle s^4 \rangle}{\langle s^2 \rangle} - \frac{10}{3} \frac{\langle s^3 \rangle^2}{\langle s \rangle} \right],
$$
\n(12a)

JOURNAL OF COMPUTATIONAL AND THEORETICAL TRANSPORT \circledast 5

$$
\beta_2 = \frac{1}{10\langle s^2 \rangle \langle s^3 \rangle - 9\langle s \rangle \langle s^4 \rangle} \left[\frac{10}{3} \frac{\langle s^3 \rangle^2}{\langle s \rangle} - \frac{9}{5} \langle s^5 \rangle \right] - 1, \tag{12b}
$$

and λ_1 and β_1 are given by Equations (10).

The Nc-SP_N equations described in items (I)–(III) above represent a generalization of the classical SP_N equations. If Σ_t is independent of s, then [Equation \(3\)](#page-3-0) holds and $\langle s^m \rangle = \langle s^m \rangle_c := m! \Sigma_t^{-m}$. Under these circumstances, $\lambda_1 = 4/5, \lambda_2 = 11/7, \beta_1 = \beta_2 = 0$, and the Nc-SP_N equations reduce to the classical formulations as given in (Larsen, Morel, and McGhee [1993](#page-25-0)):

(IV) Classical simplified P_1 equation (SP₁):

$$
-\frac{1}{3\Sigma_t}\nabla^2\Phi(x) + (1-c)\Sigma_t\Phi(x) = Q(x).
$$
 (13)

(V) Classical simplified P_2 equation (SP₂):

$$
-\frac{1}{3\Sigma_t}\nabla^2\bigg[\Phi(x) + \frac{4}{5}\frac{(1-c)\Sigma_t\Phi(x) - Q(x)}{\Sigma_t}\bigg] + (1-c)\Sigma_t\Phi(x) = Q(x). \tag{14}
$$

(VI) Classical simplified P_3 equations (SP₃):

$$
-\frac{1}{3\Sigma_t}\nabla^2[\Phi(x)+2\nu(x)]+(1-c)\Sigma_t\Phi(x)=Q(x),\qquad(15a)
$$

$$
-\frac{1}{3\Sigma_t}\nabla^2 \left[\frac{2}{5}\Phi(x) + \frac{11}{7}v(x)\right] + \Sigma_t v(x) = 0.
$$
 (15b)

The classical SP_N formulations described in items (IV)–(VI) are asymptotic approximations of the classical linear Boltzmann [equation \(4\)](#page-3-0).

3 Integral equation formulation

In this section, we sketch the derivation of the integral equation formulation for [Equation \(1\).](#page-2-0) A detailed derivation can be found in (Larsen and Vasques [2011\)](#page-25-0). Let $S(x)$ be given by

$$
S(x) = c \int_{4\pi} \int_0^\infty \Sigma_t(s') \psi(x, \Omega', s') ds' d\Omega' + Q(x) = cf(x) + Q(x), \qquad (16a)
$$

where

$$
f(x) = \int_0^\infty \Sigma_t(s') \phi(x, s') ds' = \text{collision-rate density} \tag{16b}
$$

$$
\phi(x,s) = \int_{4\pi} \psi(x,\Omega,s) d\Omega = \text{nonclassical scalar flux.} \tag{16c}
$$

213 214

 $6 \quad (*)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

[Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) can now be written as an initial value problem:

$$
\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial s}(x, \Omega, s) + \Omega \cdot \nabla \psi(x, \Omega, s) + \Sigma_t(s) \psi(x, \Omega, s) = 0, 0 < s,
$$
 (17a)

$$
\psi(x,\Omega,0) = \frac{S(x)}{4\pi}.
$$
\n(17b)

Following the work in (Larsen and Vasques [2011\)](#page-25-0) and (Frank et al. [2015](#page-24-0)), we perform the following steps:

- 1. Calculate the solution of Equations (17) using the method of characteristics;
- 2. Operate on this solution by $\int_{4\pi} \int_0^{\infty} \Sigma_t(s)(\cdot) ds d\Omega;$
- 3. Perform a change of spatial variables, from the three-dimensional (3-D) spherical (Ω, s) to the 3-D Cartesian $x' = x - s\Omega$.

This yields

$$
f(x) = \iiint S(x') \frac{p(|x'-x|)}{4\pi |x'-x|^2} dV', \qquad (18)
$$

where $p(|x'-x|)$ is given by [Equation \(2\)](#page-3-0).

For classical transport, $p(s) = p_c(s)$ as given in [Equation \(3\),](#page-3-0) and

$$
f(x) = \iiint S(x') \frac{\Sigma_t e^{-\Sigma_t |x'-x|}}{4\pi |x'-x|^2} dV' = \iiint \left[cf(x') + Q(x') \right] \frac{\Sigma_t e^{-\Sigma_t |x'-x|}}{4\pi |x'-x|^2} dV'.
$$
\n(19)

This is the classical integral equation for the scalar flux obtained from Equation (4) . Sampling of s is given by

$$
\xi = \int_0^s p_c(s')ds' = 1 - e^{-\Sigma_i s} \Rightarrow s = -\frac{1}{\Sigma_t} \ln(1 - \xi) = -\frac{1}{\Sigma_t} \ln(\xi). \tag{20}
$$

[Table 1](#page-8-0) presents expressions and numerical values of the first six moments of $p_c(s)$.

4. Exact transport representations of the Nc-SP_N equations

In this section, we perform a Green's function analysis for each of the Nc- SP_N equations described in Section 2. The goal is to convert these equations into an integral equation for the scalar flux $\Phi(x)$. By choosing the appropriate $p(s)$, the integral equation (18) becomes equivalent to the integral formulation obtained by this Green's function analysis. Therefore, using the corresponding $\Sigma_t(s)$, [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) becomes an exact representation of the Nc- SP_N equations.

4.1 Nc-SP₁ equation (diffusion)

This nonclassical result was originally presented in (Vasques [2016\)](#page-25-0) and is included here for completeness. We define

$$
S(x) = c\langle s \rangle^{-1} \Phi(x) + Q(x) \tag{21}
$$

 $($

and rewrite [Equation \(8\)](#page-5-0) as

$$
-\nabla^2 \Phi(x) + \alpha^2 \Phi(x) = \alpha^2 \langle s \rangle S(x), \qquad (22)
$$

where $\alpha^2 = 6/\langle s^2 \rangle$. The Green's function for the operator $(-\nabla^2 + \alpha^2)$ on the left hand side of Equation (22) is

$$
G_{sp_1}(|x-x'|) = \frac{e^{-\alpha|x-x'|}}{4\pi|x-x'|}.
$$
\n(23)

Therefore, we can transform Equation (22) into an integral equation for $\Phi(x)$ by taking

$$
\Phi(x) = \iiint G_{sp_1}(|x-x'|)\alpha^2\langle s\rangle S(x')dV' = \iiint \frac{\alpha^2\langle s\rangle|x-x'|e^{-\alpha|x-x'|}}{4\pi|x-x'|^2}S(x')dV'.
$$
\n(24)

Bearing in mind that $\langle s \rangle$ represents the mean free path of a particle (i.e., the average distance between collisions), the collision-rate density can be written as $f(x) = \langle s \rangle^{-1} \Phi(x)$, such that

$$
f(x) = \frac{\Phi(x)}{\langle s \rangle} = \iiint \frac{\alpha^2 |x - x'| e^{-\alpha |x - x'|}}{4\pi |x - x'|^2} S(x') dV'. \tag{25}
$$

This result agrees with [Equation \(18\)](#page-7-0) if and only if

$$
p(s) = p_{sp_1}(s) := \alpha^2 s e^{-\alpha s} = \frac{6s e^{-\sqrt{6/\langle s^2 \rangle} s}}{\langle s^2 \rangle}.
$$
 (26)

299 300

 $8 \quad (*)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

It is easy to verify that $p_{sp_1}(s)$ is always positive and that $\int_0^\infty p_{sp_1}(s)ds = 1$, which proves that it is a probability density function. The total cross section is given by

$$
\Sigma_t(s) = \Sigma_{t,sp_1}(s) := \frac{p_{sp_1}(s)}{\int_s^{\infty} p_{sp_1}(s')ds'} = \frac{\alpha^2 s}{1 + \alpha s}.
$$
 (27)

This shows that the nonclassical [Equations \(1\)](#page-2-0) and [\(18\)](#page-7-0) with $p(s) =$ $p_{sp_1}(s)$ and $\Sigma_t(s) = \Sigma_{t,sp_1}(s)$ reproduce the Nc-SP₁ equation. We can calculate the *m*th raw moments of $p_{sp_1}(s)$:

$$
\langle s^m \rangle_{sp_1} := \int_0^\infty \frac{6s^{m+1} e^{-\sqrt{6/\langle s^2 \rangle} s}}{\langle s^2 \rangle} ds = \frac{(m+1)!\langle s^2 \rangle^{m/2}}{6^{m/2}}.
$$
 (28)

If classical transport takes place, the moments in [Table 1](#page-8-0) hold and

$$
p_{sp_1}(s) = 3\Sigma_t^2 s e^{-\sqrt{3}\Sigma_t s}, \qquad (29)
$$

which is the probability function derived in (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0) for the $SP₁$ [Equation \(13\)](#page-6-0). The total cross section becomes

$$
\Sigma_{t,sp_1}(s) = \frac{3\Sigma_t^2 s}{1 + \sqrt{3}\Sigma_t s}.
$$
\n(30)

Table 2 shows the nonclassical and classical expressions for the moments of $p_{sp_1}(s)$, as well as numerical values of the classical moments when $\Sigma_t = 1$. It can be seen from the general expressions that the second moment of the original transport $p(s)$ is always exactly preserved. Comparing to the classical transport moments $\langle s^m \rangle_c$ (see [Table 1](#page-8-0)), the first moment is slightly overestimated while the remaining higher-order moments are underestimated.

Table 2. Moments of $p_{sp_1}(s)$ (diffusion).

Moment	Nonclassical Expression	Classical Expression	Numerical value If $\Sigma_t = 1$
$\langle s \rangle_{sp_1}$	$\frac{2}{\sqrt{6}}\overline{\langle s^2 \rangle^{1/2}}$	$\frac{2}{\sqrt{3}\Sigma_t}$	1.1547
$\langle s^2\rangle_{sp_1}$	$\langle s^2 \rangle$	$\frac{2}{\Sigma_t^2}$	$\overline{2}$
$\langle s^3\rangle_{sp_1}$	$\frac{4}{\sqrt{6}}\langle s^2\rangle^{3/2}$	$\frac{8}{\sqrt{3}\Sigma_t^3}$	4.6188
$\langle s^4\rangle_{sp_1}$	$\frac{10}{3}$ \langle s ² \rangle ²	$\frac{40}{3\Sigma_t^4}$	13.3333
$\langle s^5\rangle_{sp_1}$	$\frac{10\sqrt{6}}{3}\langle s^2\rangle^{5/2}$	$\frac{80}{\sqrt{3}\Sigma_t^5}$	46.1880
$\left\langle \mathfrak{s}^{6}\right\rangle _{sp_{1}}$	$\frac{70}{3}$ \langle s ² \rangle ³	$\frac{560}{3\Sigma_t^6}$	186.6667

302 303

 $\sqrt{\langle s^2 \rangle}$

 $\left[\left(-\frac{\sqrt{6}}{\sqrt{3}}\right)s\right]$. (31)

 $\frac{\sqrt{5}}{\sqrt{6}} \tau^{-1}(\xi)$ (32)

Sampling of s is given by

Hence,

where

345 346

$$
\frac{347}{348}
$$

$$
\frac{1}{349}
$$

350

351

352 353

354

355

356 357

 $\tau(z) = (1 + z)e^{-z}$.

 $s = \frac{1}{\alpha} \tau^{-1}(\xi) = \frac{\sqrt{\langle s^2 \rangle}}{\sqrt{6}}$

 $\alpha^2 s' e^{-\alpha s'} ds' = 1 - (1 + \alpha s) e^{-\alpha s}$

 $\left[1+\left(\frac{\sqrt{6}}{\sqrt{c^2}}\right)s\right]$ exp $\left[\left(-\frac{\sqrt{6}}{\sqrt{c^2}}\right)$

 (33)

In the classical case, this expression reduces to (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0)

 $\sqrt{6}$

 $\sqrt{\langle s^2 \rangle}$

 $s = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}\Sigma_t} \tau^{-1}(\xi).$ (34)

4.2 Nc -SP₂ equation

Using the definition in [Equation \(21\)](#page-8-0), we can rewrite [Equation \(9\)](#page-5-0) as

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \nabla^2 [(1+\lambda_1)\Phi] + [1-\beta_1(1-c)] \frac{\Phi}{\langle s \rangle} = [1-\beta_1(1-c)] S - \frac{\lambda_1}{6} \langle s^2 \rangle \nabla^2 S.
$$
\n(35)

Let us define a new constant α such that

 $\xi = \int_{0}^{s}$ 0

 $= 1 - |1 +$

$$
\alpha^2 = \frac{6}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \frac{1}{1 + \lambda_1} \left[1 - \beta_1 (1 - c) \right]. \tag{36}
$$

Multiplying Equation (35) by $6\frac{\langle s \rangle}{\langle s^2 \rangle}$ $\frac{1}{1+\lambda_1}$ we obtain

$$
-\nabla^2 \Phi + \alpha^2 \Phi = \alpha^2 \langle s \rangle S - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \langle s \rangle \nabla^2 S, \tag{37}
$$

which can be rewritten as

$$
[-\nabla^2 + \alpha^2]\Phi = \frac{1}{\lambda_1 + 1} \alpha^2 \langle s \rangle S + \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \langle s \rangle (-\nabla^2 + \alpha^2) S. \tag{38}
$$

The Green's function associated with the operator $(-\nabla^2 + \alpha^2)$ is

$$
G_{sp_2}(|x-x'|) = \frac{e^{-\alpha|x-x'|}}{4\pi|x-x'|}.
$$
\n(39)

364 365

366 367

368

369

370 371

372

373

374

375 376

Table 3. Moments of $p_{sp_2}(s)$.

Using the Green's function, we can write

$$
\Phi(x) = \frac{\alpha^2 \langle s \rangle}{1 + \lambda_1} \iiint G_{sp_2} S dV' + \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \langle s \rangle S,
$$
\n(40)

and the collision-rate density is given by

$$
f(x) = \frac{\Phi(x)}{\langle s \rangle} = \frac{\alpha^2}{1 + \lambda_1} \int G_{sp_2} S dV' + \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} S.
$$
 (41)

Note that the identity

$$
S(x) = \int_0^\infty S(x + s\Omega)\delta(s)ds = \frac{1}{4\pi} \int_{4\pi} \int_0^\infty \delta(s)S(x + s\Omega)dsd\Omega
$$

$$
= \int_{4\pi} \int_0^\infty \frac{\delta(|x - x'|)S(x')}{4|x - x'|^2}dV'
$$
(42)

holds, with $x' = x + s\Omega$, $|x-x'| = s$, $s^2 ds d\Omega = dV'$. Therefore, we can rewrite the collision-rate density as

$$
f(x) = \frac{\alpha^2}{1+\lambda_1} \iiint \frac{|x-x'|e^{-\alpha|x-x'|}}{4\pi|x-x'|^2} S(x')dV' + \frac{\lambda_1}{1+\lambda_1} \iiint \frac{\delta(|x-x'|)}{4\pi|x-x'|^2} S(x')dV'.
$$
\n(43)

This result agrees with [Equation \(18\)](#page-7-0) if and only if

$$
p(s) = p_{sp_2}(s) := \frac{\alpha^2 s e^{-\alpha s}}{1 + \lambda_1} + \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \delta(s).
$$
 (44)

It is easy to verify that $p_{sp_2}(s)$ is always positive and that $\int_0^\infty p_{sp_2}(s)ds = 1$, proving that it is a probability density function. We can determine the total cross section, which is written as

- 432
- 433
- 434
- 435 436
- 437
- 438
- 439 440
- 441
- 442
- 443
- 444

445

- 446
- 447 448
- 449
- 450
- 451
- 452
- 453
- 454

455

456

457

458 459

460

461

462 463

464

- 465
- 466
- 467 468

469

470 471

472

473

 $\Sigma_t(s) = \Sigma_{t, sp_2}(s) :=$ $\frac{\lambda_1}{\lambda_1+1}\delta(s)+\alpha^2s$ $\frac{1 + \alpha s}{1 + \alpha s}$ (45)

The nonclassical [Equations \(1\)](#page-2-0) and [\(18\)](#page-7-0) with $p(s) = p_{sp_2}(s)$ and $\Sigma_t(s) =$ $\Sigma_{t,sp_2}(s)$ reproduce the Nc-SP₂ equation. We can calculate the *mth* raw moments of $p_{sp_2}(s)$:

$$
\langle s^m \rangle_{sp_2} := \int_0^\infty s^m p_{sp_2}(s) ds = \frac{(m+1)!}{\alpha^m (1+\lambda_1)}.
$$
 (46)

If classical transport takes place, the moments in [Table 1](#page-8-0) hold and

$$
p_{sp_2}(s) = \frac{25}{27} \Sigma_t^2 s e^{-\Sigma_t \sqrt{5/3s}} + \frac{4}{9} \delta(s),
$$

which is the probability function derived in (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0) for the $SP₂$ [equation \(14\)](#page-6-0). The total cross section becomes

$$
\Sigma_{t,sp_2}(s) = \frac{\frac{4}{9}\delta(s) + \frac{5}{3}\Sigma_t^2 s}{1 + \sqrt{5/3}\Sigma_t s}.
$$
 (48)

 (47)

[Table 3](#page-11-0) shows the nonclassical and classical expressions for the moments of $p_{sp_2}(s)$, as well as numerical values of the classical moments when $\Sigma_t = 1$. The classical moments of $p_{sp_2}(s)$ give a more accurate estimate of the classical transport moments $\langle s^m \rangle_c$ ([Table 1](#page-8-0)) than the ones obtained from $p_{sp_1}(s)$ [\(Table 2\)](#page-9-0). In particular, both the second and the fourth moments of the original transport $p(s)$ are exactly preserved. However, these moments are not generally preserved in the nonclassical case; for instance, the general nonclassical second moment is conserved only if $\beta_1 = 0$.

Sampling of s is given by

$$
\xi = \int_0^s p_{sp_2}(s')ds' = \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} + \frac{1}{1 + \lambda_1} (1 - (1 + \alpha s)e^{-\alpha s}). \tag{49}
$$

Hence,

$$
s = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{for } 0 < \xi < \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \\ \frac{1}{\alpha} \tau^{-1} \big((\lambda_1 + 1)(1 - \xi) \big), & \text{for } \xi > \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1} \end{cases}, \tag{50}
$$

where $\tau(z)$ is defined in [Equation \(33\).](#page-10-0) In the classical case, this expression reduces to (Frank et al. [2015](#page-24-0))

12 $\left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

$$
s = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{for } 0 < \xi < \frac{4}{9} \\ \frac{\sqrt{3}}{\sqrt{5}} \frac{1}{\Sigma_t} \tau^{-1} \left(\frac{9}{5} (1 - \xi) \right), & \text{for } \xi > \frac{4}{9} \end{cases} \tag{51}
$$

4.3 Nc-SP₃ equations

Using the definition in [Equation \(21\)](#page-8-0), we can rewrite Equations (11) as

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \nabla^2 \left[\left[1 + \beta_1 (1 - c) \right] \Phi + 2v \right] + \frac{1}{\langle s \rangle} \Phi = S,
$$
(52a)

$$
-\frac{\lambda_2 \langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \nabla^2 v + \frac{1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)}{\langle s \rangle} v = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{6} \frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{\langle s \rangle} \nabla^2 \Phi.
$$
(52b)

This system can be rewritten as

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \nabla^2 \left[\left[1 + \beta_1 (1 - c) \right] \Phi + 2v \right] + \frac{1}{\langle s \rangle} \Phi = S,
$$
 (53a)

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)}\right) \nabla^2 v + \frac{1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)}{\langle s \rangle} v = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \left[\frac{\Phi}{\langle s \rangle} - S\right].
$$
\n(53b)

We need to find the Green's functions associated to this system, which must satisfy

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{6\langle s\rangle}\nabla^2\Big[\big[1+\beta_1(1-c)\big]G^{\Phi}_{sp_3}+2G^{\vee}_{sp_3}\Big]+\frac{1}{\langle s\rangle}G^{\Phi}_{sp_3}=\delta(x),\hspace{1cm} (54a)
$$

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)}\right) \nabla^2 G_{sp_3}^v + \frac{1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)}{\langle s \rangle} G_{sp_3}^v - \frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \frac{G_{sp_3}^\Phi}{\langle s \rangle}
$$

$$
= -\frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \delta(x).
$$
(54b)

Here, $G_{sp_3}^{\Phi}$ and $G_{sp_3}^{\nu}$ are functions of $r=|x|$ that enable Equations (53) to be written as

$$
\Phi_0(x) = \iiint_{c} G_{sp_3}^{\Phi}(|x - x'|) S(x') dV', \qquad (55a)
$$

$$
v(x) = \iiint G_{sp_3}^v(|x-x'|)S(x')dV'. \tag{55b}
$$

Following the procedure presented in (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0), we seek $G_{sp_3}^{\Phi}(r)$ and $G_{sp_3}^v(r)$ that satisfy

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \frac{1}{r^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial r} r^2 \frac{\partial}{\partial r} \Big[\Big[1 + \beta_1 (1 - c) \Big] G^{\Phi}_{sp_3} + 2 G^{\vee}_{sp_3} \Big] + \frac{1}{\langle s \rangle} G^{\Phi}_{sp_3} = 0, \qquad (56a)
$$

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \Big(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \Big) \frac{1}{r^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial r} r^2 \frac{\partial}{\partial r} G^{\vee}_{sp_3} + \frac{1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)}{\langle s \rangle} G^{\vee}_{sp_3}
$$

$$
-\frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \Big[\frac{G^{\Phi}_{sp_3}}{\langle s \rangle} \Big] = 0; \qquad (56b)
$$

with

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \lim_{\epsilon \to 0} \left[4\pi \epsilon^2 \left(\left[1 + \beta_1 (1 - c) \right] \frac{\partial G_{\mathfrak{sp}_3}^{\Phi}(\epsilon)}{\partial r} + 2 \frac{\partial G_{\mathfrak{sp}_3}^{\vee}(\epsilon)}{\partial r} \right) \right] = 1, \quad (57a)
$$

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6 \langle s \rangle} \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \right) \lim_{\epsilon \to 0} \left(4\pi \epsilon^2 \frac{\partial G_{\mathfrak{sp}_3}^{\vee}(\epsilon)}{\partial r} \right) = -\frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)}.
$$

Specifically, we are looking for the Green's functions of the form

$$
G_{sp_3}^{\Phi} = \frac{e^{-\alpha s}}{4\pi s},
$$
\n(58a)\n
\n
$$
e^{-\alpha s}
$$
\n(58b)

$$
G_{sp_3}^{\rm v}=a\frac{\mathrm{e}^{-\frac{\mathrm{e}}{4\pi s}}}{4\pi s},\qquad(58b)
$$

where α and a are constants to be determined.

Using that $\nabla^2 G_{\text{sp}_3}^{\Phi} = \alpha^2 G_{\text{sp}_3}^{\Phi}$ and $\nabla^2 G_{\text{sp}_3}^{\text{v}} = \alpha^2 G_{\text{sp}_3}^{\text{v}},$ Equations (56) yield $1.2i$

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6} \left[\left[1 + \beta_1 (1 - c) \right] \alpha^2 + 2a \alpha^2 \right] + 1 = 0, \tag{59a}
$$

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6} \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} \right) \alpha^2 a + (1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)) a - \frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)} = 0.
$$
\n(59b)

From Equation (59b) we can determine a, which is given by

$$
a = \frac{\frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)}}{\left(1 - \beta_2 (1 - c)\right) - \frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6} \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \beta_1 (1 - c)}\right) \alpha^2}.
$$
(60)

We can now write Equation (59a) as

$$
-\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{6}\left[z_1+\frac{\frac{\lambda_1}{z_1}}{z_2-\frac{\langle s^2\rangle}{6}\left(\lambda_2-\frac{\lambda_1}{z_1}\right)\alpha^2}\right]\alpha^2+1=0,\hspace{1cm} (61)
$$

where

$$
z_1 = 1 + \beta_1(1 - c), \tag{62a}
$$

521 522

523 524

525 526 527

- 528 529
- 530 531
- 532 533

534 535

- 536 537
- 538

539

540

541

542

543

544 545

546

547 548

14 $\qquad \qquad$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

$$
z_2 = 1 - \beta_2 (1 - c). \tag{62b}
$$

After some manipulations, we attain

$$
-\left(\frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6}\right)^2 z_1 \left(\lambda_2 - \frac{\lambda_1}{z_1}\right) \alpha^4 - \frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{6} (\lambda_2 + z_1 z_2) \alpha^2 + z_2 = 0. \tag{63}
$$

The roots of this polynomial are given by

$$
(\alpha^{\pm})^2 = \frac{2}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \frac{\frac{1}{3}(\lambda_2 + z_1 z_2) \pm \sqrt{\frac{1}{9}(\lambda_2 + z_1 z_2)^2 - \frac{4}{9}(\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1) z_2}}{\frac{2}{9}(\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1)}.
$$
 (64)

Now we can revisit the expression for a; keeping only the non-complex solutions, we have

$$
a^{\pm} = \frac{\frac{1}{2} \frac{\lambda_1}{z_1}}{z_2 - \frac{3}{2z_1} \left(\frac{1}{3} (\lambda_2 + z_1 z_2) \pm \sqrt{\frac{1}{9} (\lambda_2 + z_1 z_2)^2 - \frac{4}{9} (\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1) z_2} \right)}.
$$
(65)

Thus, we have two solutions of Equations (56): one for α^+ and a^+ , and the other for α^- and a^- . The general solution is a linear combination of these two solutions:

$$
G_{sp_3}^{\Phi}(s) = \frac{A^+}{\langle s \rangle} \left(\frac{e^{-\alpha^+ s}}{4\pi s} \right) + \frac{A^-}{\langle s \rangle} \left(\frac{e^{-\alpha^- s}}{4\pi s} \right), \tag{66a}
$$

$$
G_{sp_3}^{\vee}(s) = \frac{A^+ a^+}{\langle s \rangle} \left(\frac{e^{-\alpha^+ s}}{4\pi s}\right) + \frac{A^- a^-}{\langle s \rangle} \left(\frac{e^{-\alpha^- s}}{4\pi s}\right),\tag{66b}
$$

where A^{\pm} are determined by Equations (57), such that

$$
A^{+}a^{+} + A^{-}a^{-} = \frac{-\lambda_1 3 \frac{\langle s \rangle^2}{\langle s^2 \rangle}}{\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1},
$$
\n(67a)

$$
A^{+} + A^{-} = \frac{\left(1 + \frac{\lambda_1}{\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1}\right)}{z_1} 6 \frac{\langle s \rangle^2}{\langle s^2 \rangle}.
$$
 (67b)

Let us define

$$
A t^+ = A^+ \frac{\langle s^2 \rangle}{3 \langle s \rangle^2}, \tag{68a}
$$

$$
A\prime^{-} = A^{-} \frac{\langle s^{2} \rangle}{3 \langle s \rangle^{2}}, \tag{68b}
$$

$$
b = \frac{\lambda_1}{\lambda_2 z_1 - \lambda_1}.
$$
 (68c)

601 602

586 587

588 589

- 650
- 651 652
- 653
- 654 655
- 656

- 658 659
- 660 661

662

- 663 664
- 665

666

667

668 669

670

671 672

673 674

675

676 677

678

679 680

681

682

683 684

685 686

687

688

 $\left(\sum_t^2 s\right)$

$$
\Sigma_t(s) = \Sigma_{t,sp_3}(s) := \frac{\frac{s}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \left[\gamma^+ e^{-\alpha^+ s} + \gamma^- e^{-\alpha^- s} \right]}{\gamma^+ \left(\frac{1}{\alpha^+} + \frac{s}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \right) e^{-\alpha^+ s} + \gamma^- \left(\frac{1}{\alpha^-} + \frac{s}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \right) e^{-\alpha^- s}}.
$$
(75)

The nonclassical [Equations \(1\)](#page-2-0) and [\(18\)](#page-7-0) with $p(s) = p_{sp_3}(s)$ and $\Sigma_t(s) = \Sigma_t(s)$ $\Sigma_{t,sp_3}(s)$ reproduce the Nc-SP₃ equations. We can calculate the mth raw moments of $p_{sp_3}(s)$:

$$
\langle s^m \rangle_{sp_3} := \int_0^\infty s^m p_{sp_3}(s) ds = \frac{(m+1)!}{\langle s^2 \rangle} \left[\frac{\gamma^+}{(\alpha^+)^{(m+2)}} + \frac{\gamma^-}{(\alpha^-)^{(m+2)}} \right]. \tag{76}
$$

If classical transport takes place, the moments in [Table 1](#page-8-0) hold and

$$
p_{sp_3}(s) = \Sigma_t^2 s (5.642025 e^{-2.94134 \Sigma_t s} + 0.469086 e^{-1.161256 \Sigma_t s}), \qquad (77)
$$

which is the probability function derived in (Frank et al. [2015\)](#page-24-0) for the SP_3 equations (15). The total cross section becomes

$$
\Sigma_{t,sp_3}(s) = \frac{5.642025(\Sigma_t^2 s) e^{-2.94134\Sigma_t s} + 0.469086(\Sigma_t^2 s) e^{-1.161256\Sigma_t s}}{5.642025\left(\frac{1+2.94134\Sigma_t s}{8.651481}\right) e^{-2.94134\Sigma_t s} + 0.469086\left(\frac{1+1.161256\Sigma_t s}{1.348515}\right) e^{-1.161256\Sigma_t s}}.
$$
\n(78)

[Table 4](#page-16-0) presents the classical expressions for the moments of $p_{sp_3}(s)$, as well as numerical values for $\Sigma_t = 1$. The nonclassical expressions are not explicitly given, but can be obtained from Equation (76); they are consistent with the classical expressions. Comparing to the corresponding classical transport moments in [Table 1](#page-8-0), the moments are preserved more accurately than in the previous cases $(SP_{1,2})$. In particular, the second, fourth, and sixth moments are exactly preserved as expected. However, these moments are *not* generally preserved in the nonclassical case.

Sampling of s is given by

$$
\xi = \int_0^s p(s')ds' = \frac{\gamma^+}{(\alpha^+)^2} \left[1 - (1 + \alpha^+ s)e^{-\alpha^+ s}\right] + \frac{\gamma^-}{(\alpha^-)^2} \left[1 - (1 + \alpha^- s)e^{-\alpha^- s}\right] = F(s),\tag{79}
$$

such that

$$
s = F^{-1}(\xi). \tag{80}
$$

In the classical case, this expression becomes

$$
F(s) = \frac{5.642025}{8.651481} \left[1 - (1 + 2.94134 \Sigma_{t} s) e^{-2.94134 \Sigma_{t} s} \right]
$$
(81)

$$
f_{\rm{max}}
$$

$$
+\frac{0.469086}{1.348515}\left[1-(1+1.161256\Sigma_{t}s)e^{-1.161256\Sigma_{t}s}\right].\tag{82}
$$

5. Numerical results

This section gives numerical validation for the theoretical results presented in this paper, as well as in references (Frank et al. [2015](#page-24-0); Vasques [2016\)](#page-25-0). Specifically, we use a Monte Carlo (MC) transport code in which the freepaths were sampled from the probability density functions derived in Section 4. The results of this MC transport code are then compared against the results obtained by deterministically solving the corresponding classical or nonclassical simplified P_N equations. It is important to note that we are not concerned about obtaining the correct transport solution of these problems. Our goal is to show that the nonclassical MC transport code correctly reproduces the solutions of the deterministic simplified P_N equations.

Due to the challenges of estimating the free-path distribution $p(s)$ in multi-dimensional nonclassical systems, this task will be left for future work. In this paper, we consider only one-dimensional (1-D) slab geometry transport. Two types of problems have been analyzed: (I) classical transport, and (II) nonclassical transport in an ensemble-averaged (homogenized) periodic random medium. For each of these cases, we have simulated two different internal source configurations: (A) a homogeneous source throughout the whole system (global source); and (B) a constant source located in a small region in the center of the system (local source).

Sections 5.1–5.4 describe each set of problems and present the results obtained. All problems obey the following simplifying assumptions:

- Transport takes place in slab geometry.
- Transport is monoenergetic and scattering is isotropic.
- The source Q emits particles isotropically.
	- There are no incoming particles through the boundaries of the system; that is, vacuum boundary conditions.

5.1 Problem set I.A: classical transport, global source

Consider a slab with dimensions $-50 \le x \le 50$ composed of a homogeneous material with $\Sigma_t = 1$. We assume that there is a homogeneous source $Q = 1$ throughout the whole system. Under these assumptions, [Equation \(3\)](#page-3-0) holds and the classical SP_N equations apply. In a diffusive system, it is expected that the scalar fluxes obtained from solving $SP₁$

730 731

690 691

689

692 693

Figure 1. MC simulations for classical transport with global homogeneous source.

[[Equation \(13\)\]](#page-6-0), SP_2 [[Equation \(14\)\]](#page-6-0), and SP_3 [Equations (15)] will converge to the same value, which should approximate the scalar flux obtained from the solution of [Equation \(4\).](#page-3-0) As the system becomes less diffusive, the scalar flux away from the boundaries should converge to the "infinite solution" $\Phi(x) = Q/[(1-c)\Sigma_t]$.

This can be seen in Figure 1, in which we present results of the simulations performed with the nonclassical MC transport code. We sample the free-paths from [Equation \(29\)](#page-9-0) (MC $SP₁$), [Equation \(47\)](#page-12-0) (MC $SP₂$), and [Equation \(77\)](#page-17-0) (MC SP₃). For the diffusive system with $c = 0.999$, the SP_N solutions converge to the same estimate of the scalar flux (Figure 1a). For the system with $c = 0.2$, the SP_N solutions converge to $\Phi(x) = 1/(1-0.2) = 1.25$, as expected (Figure 1b).

Figure 2 is a summary of the results obtained for this set of problems showing estimates for the scalar flux at $x = 0$ for different values of c. The system varies from diffusive to absorbing, and the results of the MC transport code (MC $SP_{1,2,3}$) match those obtained by deterministically solving the SP_N equations (SP_{1,2,3}). This is as expected; however, since the solutions of the different equations overlap, this set of results does not provide by itself an appropriate validation of the theoretical predictions.

5.2 Problem set I.B: classical transport, local source

Consider a slab composed of a homogeneous material with $\Sigma_t = 1$. We assume a constant source defined in a region of the system such that

$$
Q(x) = \begin{cases} 1, & \text{for } -0.5 < x < 0.5 \\ 0, & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases}
$$
 (83)

We allow the system dimensions to be as large as needed in order for the leakage to be negligible. This means that dimensions will increase as c increases and the system becomes more diffusive.

As in the previous case, [Equation \(3\)](#page-3-0) holds and the classical SP_N equations apply. If the system is diffusive, we expect that the scalar fluxes will approximate the scalar flux obtained from the solution of [Equation \(4\).](#page-3-0) However, as the system becomes less diffusive, the SP_N equations should yield different results.

[Figure 3](#page-21-0) shows the results of the simulations performed with the nonclassical MC transport code. Once again, for the diffusive system with $c = 0.999$, the SP_N solutions converge to the same estimate of the scalar flux ([Figure 3a](#page-21-0)). However, we can see that the SP_N solutions yield different results for nondiffusive systems as depicted in [Figure 3b](#page-21-0).

[Figure 4](#page-21-0) is a summary of the results obtained for this set of problems. It shows estimates for the scalar flux at $x = 0$ for different values of c. In particular, we see that the MC transport code (MC $SP_{1,2,3}$) accurately matches the solutions obtained by solving the SP_N equations ($SP_{1,2,3}$) deterministically. This validates the theoretical predictions for the classical SP_N transport representations originally introduced in (Frank et al. [2015](#page-24-0)).

5.3 Problem set II.A: nonclassical transport, global source

We consider a random periodic system as depicted in [Figure 5.](#page-21-0) It represents a random segment of a periodic medium with a period $\ell = 1.0$, containing alternate layers of material 1 (solid) with thickness $\ell_1 = 0.5$, and material 2 (void) with thickness $\ell_2 = 0.5$. Thus, the probability to find material $i = 1$, 2 in position x is given by $P_i = \ell_i / \ell = 1/2$.

Let us assume that this random periodic segment has dimensions $-50 \le x \le 50$, and that material 1 is a homogeneous solid with $\Sigma_t = 1$. We also assume that there is a homogeneous source $Q = 1$ throughout the whole system. Under these assumptions, the free-path distribution in the ensemble-averaged (homogenized) system is not and exponential. We can numerically estimate the moments of this homogenized angular-dependent free-path distribution; these are given in [Table 5](#page-21-0). For this class of problems we must apply the $Nc-SP_N$ equations using the estimated moments given in [Table 5](#page-21-0).

Similarly to the results in Section 5.1, it is expected that in a diffusive system the scalar fluxes obtained from solving Nc-SP₁ [Equation (8)], Nc- $SP₂$ [\[Equation \(9\)](#page-5-0)], and Nc-SP₃ [Equations (11)] will converge to the same value, which should approximate the scalar flux obtained from the solution of [Equation \(1\)](#page-2-0). As the system becomes less diffusive, the scalar flux away from the boundaries should converge to the volume-averaged infinite solution $\Phi(x) = Q/[(1-c)P_1\Sigma_t]$.

This can be seen in [Figure 6,](#page-21-0) in which we present results of the simulations performed with the nonclassical MC transport code. We sample the free-paths from [Equation \(26\)](#page-8-0) (MC SP_1), [Equation \(44\)](#page-11-0) (MC SP_2), and [Equation \(74\)](#page-16-0) (MC SP₃). For the diffusive system with $c = 0.999$, the Nc- SP_N solutions converge to the same estimate of the scalar flux [\(Figure 6a\)](#page-21-0). For the system with $c = 0.2$, the Nc-SP_N solutions converge to $\Phi(x) = 1/[(1-0.2)0.5] = 2.5$, as expected [\(Figure 6b](#page-21-0)).

[Figure 7](#page-23-0) is a summary of the results obtained for this set of problems, showing estimates for the scalar flux at $x = 0$ for different values of c. As in the classical case, the MC transport code (MC $SP_{1,2,3}$) closely agrees with the deterministic solutions of the Nc-SP_N equations (SP_{1,2,3}).

5.4 Problem set II.B: nonclassical transport, local source

Assume a slab composed of a random segment of the periodic medium described in Section 5.3. We consider a constant source defined in a region of the system such that

$$
Q(x) = \begin{cases} 1, & \text{for } -0.5 < x < 0.5 \\ 0, & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases}
$$
 (84)

As in Section 5.2, we allow the system dimensions to be as large as needed in order for the leakage to be negligible.

We expect the Nc-SP_N equations to yield similar results when the system is diffusive. This can be seen in [Figure 8a.](#page-23-0) As c decreases, the solutions of the Nc-SP_N equations differ, as depicted in [Figure 8b](#page-23-0). [Figure 9](#page-23-0) presents a summary of the results obtained for this set of problems, in which it is clear that the MC transport code (MC $SP_{1,2,3}$) closely reproduces the deterministic solutions of the Nc-SP_N equations (SP₁₂₃).

We note that the MC estimates for the Nc-SP₃ solutions present relative errors of 4–5% for a few cases. This is mainly due to the numerical and statistical errors introduced in the MC calculations by numerically estimating the moments in [Table 5](#page-21-0). Nevertheless, it is clear that the MC simulations predict the overall behavior of the $Nc-SP_3$ equations. These numerical results validate the original theory derived in this paper, demonstrating that

the nonclassical transport [equation \(1\)](#page-2-0) can exactly represent the Nc- SP_N equations.

6. Discussion

In this paper, we have shown that the nonclassical simplified $P_{1,2,3}$ equations (Nc-SP_{1,2,3}) can be represented exactly by the nonclassical transport [equation \(1\).](#page-2-0) We derived an explicit expression for the free-path distribution $p(s)$ for each of these equations, and showed that these expressions are a generalization of the ones previously obtained for the classical $\text{SP}_{1,2,3}$

equations. We have shown that the moments of the transport $p(s)$ are approximated with increasing accuracy as the order N increases, with the even moments up to 2N being preserved when $p(s)$ is exponential. 947 948 949

Moreover, we present numerical simulations that validate our theoretical predictions as well as those presented in previous work (Frank et al. 2015; Vasques [2016\)](#page-25-0). We show that a nonclassical Monte Carlo transport code that samples the free-paths from nonexponential distributions can accurately reproduce the deterministic solutions of the $Nc-SP_N$ equations and the classical SP_N equations. This has not been done before.

Although performed only in slab geometry, these numerical results pave the road to consistently simulate these diffusion-based approximations using a Monte Carlo transport method. Furthermore, it hints to the possibility of using these analytical formulations of $p(s)$ to approximate the solutions of the nonclassical Boltzmann equation in near-diffusive systems. Further work needs to be done to investigate how well this approach performs in multi-dimensional nonclassical systems. However, this task must be left for future work.

Acknowledgments

The statements, findings, conclusions, and recommendations are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the view of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

Disclosure statement

[Q1](#page-1-0) No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

R. Vasques acknowledges support under award number NRC-HQ-84-15-G-0024 from the Nuclear Regulatory Commission. R.N. Slaybaugh acknowledges support under award number NRC-HQ-84-14-G-0052 from the Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

References

- Davis, A. B., and A. Marshak. [2010.](#page-2-0) Solar radiation transport in the cloudy atmosphere: a 3D perspective on observations and climate impacts. Rep. Prog. Phys. 73:026801.
- d'Eon, E. [2013](#page-2-0). Rigorous asymptotic and moment-preserving diffusion approximations for generalized linear Boltzmann transport in arbitrary dimension. Trans. Theory Stat. Phys. 42:237–297.
- Frank, M., K. Krycki, E.W. Larsen, and R. Vasques. [2015](#page-3-0). The nonclassical Boltzmann equation and diffusion-based approximations to the Boltzmann equation. SIAM J. Appl. Math. 75:1329–1345.
- Gelbard, E. M. [1960](#page-3-0). Applications of spherical harmonics method to reactor problems. Technical Report WAPD-BT-20, Bettis Atomic Power Laboratory.

24 $\left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$ I. MAKINE ET AL.

- Gelbard, E. M. [1961.](#page-3-0) Simplified spherical harmonics equations and their use in shielding problems. Technical Report WAPD-T-1182, Bettis Atomic Power Laboratory.
- Gelbard, E. M. [1962](#page-3-0). Applications of simplified spherical harmonics equations in spherical geometry", Technical Report WAPD-TM-294, Bettis Atomic Power Laboratory.
- Larsen, E. W. [2007](#page-2-0). A generalized Boltzmann equation for non-classical particle transport. Paper presented at the Proceedings of the Joint International Topical Meeting on Mathematics & Computation and Supercomputing in Nuclear Applications, Monterey, CA, April. 15–19.
	- Larsen, E.W., and R. Vasques. [2011](#page-2-0). A generalized linear boltzmann equation for non-classical particle transport. J. Quantitat. Spectroscopy Radiat. Trans. 112:619–631.
- Larsen, E. W., J. E. Morel, and J. M. McGhee. [1993](#page-3-0). Asymptotic derivation of the simplified PN equations. Paper presented at the Proceedings of the ANS Topical Meeting on Mathematical Methods and Supercomputing in Nuclear Applications, Karlsruhe, Germany, April 19–23, 2.
	- McClarren, R. G. [2011.](#page-3-0) Theoretical aspects of the simplified Pn equations. Trans. Theory Stat. Phys. 39:73–109.
	- Vasques, R. [2016.](#page-4-0) The nonclassical diffusion approximation to the nonclassical linear Boltzmann equation. Appl. Math. Lett. 53:63–68.
	- Vasques, R., and E. W. Larsen. [2014.](#page-2-0) Non-classical particle transport with angular-dependent path-length distributions. II: application to pebble bed reactor cores. Ann. Nucl. Energy 70:301–311.
	- Vasques, R., and R. N. Slaybaugh. [2017](#page-4-0). Simplified PN equations for nonclassical transport with isotropic scattering. Paper presented at the Proceedings of the International Conference on Mathematics and Computational Methods Applied to Nuclear Science & Engineering – M&C, Jeju, Korea, April 16–20.
-
-
-
-