

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Navajos And The New Deal By Donald L. Parman.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/92h4q0nh>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 4(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hinton, Harwood P.

Publication Date

1980-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Shelly Grossman to make his film, *Black Coal, Red Power*, and an interview with Alvin Dashee, then Vice-Chairman of the Hopi Tribal Council, who relates a prophecy concerning the ultimate fate of American civilization and Peabody's strip mine on Black Mesa.

28. U.S. Congress. 1978a. *Relocation Of Certain Hopi And Navajo Indians*. Hearing before the U.S. Senate Select Committee on Indian Affairs on S. 1714 (95th Congress, 2nd Session).

1978b. *The Navajo And Hopi Amendments Of 1978*. H.R. 11092.

29. Washburn, Wilcomb. 1975. *The Indian In America*. New York: Harper & Row.

Contains some material on Hopi political history.

30. ————. 1979. "On The Trail of The Activist Anthropologist." *Journal Of Ethnic Studies*, Vol. 6, No. 4.

Disputes Jorgensen's and Clemmer's critical review of *The Indian In America*, and challenges the bulk of Clemmer's anthropological work among the Hopi.

31. Wright, Barton (ed.). 1979. *Hopi Material Culture*. Flagstaff: Northland Press. Introductions by Fred Eggen and Byron Harvey III.

Artifacts gathered by Mennonite missionary Heinrich R. Voth. Co-published with the Heard Museum, Phoenix.

32. Yava, Albert. 1978. *Big Falling Snow: A Tewa-Hopi Indian's Life And Time And The History And Tradition Of His People*. Edited by Harold Courlander. New York: Crown.

Not seen.

Richard O. Clemmer
California State University,
Northridge

The Navajos And The New Deal. By Donald L. Parman. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976. 316 pp. \$17.50.

When the federal government tackled the problems created by the Great Depression of the 1930s, Commissioner of Indian Affairs John Collier singled out the sprawling Navajo Reservation for a set of special programs — programs which reached deeply into the Navajo world and touched almost every aspect of daily life. Collier was particularly interested in reducing overgrazing on a scarred land, but he also sought to create a centralized tribal government, revamp the educational system, and improve existing medical facilities. At the same time he placed great emphasis on preserving Navajo religious and cultural heritage. The Bureau of Indian Affairs, working with other government agencies, poured thousands of dollars into

relief, soil erosion studies, construction, and herd reduction, and sent a host of trained personnel to explain and supervise the undertaking. It was a major effort that quickly generated frustrations and hostilities. Navajos today rank the New Deal experience as one of the most traumatic episodes in their history.

Collier's massive attempt to reorder and elevate Navajo cultural and economic life is the subject of Donald Parman's landmark study, *The Navajos and the New Deal*. A history professor at Purdue University, Parman researched widely and interviewed numerous persons in writing his book. The result is a highly significant work that discusses with clarity and balance the strengths and weaknesses of the various programs that Collier sought to implement among the Navajos.

Parman opens his book with a description of the reservation on the eve of the New Deal. Encompassing over 14 million acres, the reserve spilled into the three states of Arizona, Utah, and New Mexico. On this domain (2.4 million acres were barren and worthless) the Navajos ran 1.3 million head of sheep and goats, about twice the number the range could support. Added to this were 37,000 head of cattle and 80,000 horses. In the early 1930s, the government operated only a handful of boarding schools, provided token medical facilities (the Presbyterian hospital at Ganado was an exception), and administered the reservation through a system of six superintendencies. Roads were bad, erosion widespread, and poverty rampant. Oil had been discovered on the reservation in 1922, but the income was entangled in a controversy over lease land. During this controversy, a militant crusader named John Collier emerged as the leading spokesman for protecting Navajo rights and preserving their heritage. In 1933, he was tapped to head the Bureau of Indian Affairs. No previous commissioner, says Parman (p. 29), was so well equipped to handle the office.

Collier in 1933 began pumping federal funds into the Navajo Reservation. CCC, WPA, and PWA monies provided relief and jobs, while Department of Agriculture personnel studied range conditions, established demonstration farms, and called for reductions in sheep, goats, and horses. Indian Service employees started day schools stressing "progressive" education, and trained specialists (some were Collier's friends) established a nurses training program and pushed adult health care. Col-

lier's ambitious programs, however, immediately encountered difficulties.

A rush to reduce herds confused the Navajos and a wall of opposition, led by J.C. Morgan, an Eastern-educated Navajo, quickly developed. Nearly half of Parman's book concerns Morgan's fight against the New Deal, the support he enjoyed, and his effectiveness. In this battle, Collier emerges as articulate, shrewd, and optimistic — but naive as to Navajo life. He apparently did not fully understand the roots of Navajo culture, and the Navajos could not understand the haste and purpose of his programs. Collier particularly misgauged the deep personal attachment herdsmen held for their livestock. Faced with successive attempts at herd reduction, the Navajos balked in accepting many of Collier's programs. As a result, the major accomplishments on the reservation were largely due to E.R. Fryer, the forceful superintendent, who implemented Collier's programs through traditional channels.

In one of his most interesting chapters, Parman describes Collier's move to consolidate Navajo lands in the "checkerboard" areas to the east and south of the reservation. Here white ranchers ran stock under lease or on the open range and objected to consolidation. A powerful livestock lobby headed by Floyd Lee received support from New Mexico Senator Dennis Chavez. Parman draws a sharp portrait of Chavez, who was personally incensed at New Deal officials for denying him New Deal patronage. Chavez joined forces with Morgan in scuttling this aspect of Collier's "monkey show."

When World War II forced the government to turn its attention from the New Deal, reservation programs languished. What had been achieved? On the positive side were an annual tribal fair, a central headquarters built at Window Rock, an Arts and Craft Guild, expanded tribal enterprises, a shift from barter to a wage economy, regulations for traders, and improved medical facilities. On the negative side were an increasing birth rate, inadequate schools, continued overgrazing, and shift to poorly trained personnel.

Parman's study has few shortcomings. Purists will object to the lack of general population figures. They also may yearn for more detail on the influence of traders and wealthy Navajos on government decision making, and on the benefits these groups derived from New Deal programs. The repeated references to Communists in reservation debate need explanation. And

Indian scholars might ask why so few Navajos were interviewed for the study. Reardon (p. 10) should be Riordan. Enhancing the volume are photographs of the principal actors, a reservation map, a bibliography, and an index.

Highly readable and thoughtfully written, Parman's book not only broadens our understanding of the New Deal, but presents an in-depth look at one of its most ambitious programs. It throws into bold relief the efforts of a government bureaucrat who misread the role of culture in his zeal to promote change on the largest Indian reservation in the country. Parman's work is a sober appraisal that offers valuable insights into the history of the region and the nation during a troubled decade.

Harwood P. Hinton
University of Arizona

Native American Astronomy. By Anthony F. Aveni, ed. Austin: The University of Texas Press, 1977. 286 pp. \$15.95.

Archaeoastronomy in Pre-Columbian America. By Anthony F. Aveni, ed. Austin: The University of Texas Press, 1975. 436 pp. \$19.50.

Archaeoastronomy is a relatively new field. It is an attempt to evaluate the astronomical knowledge of civilizations whose knowledge was never preserved in the form of writing, or where most of the written records have been destroyed or lost.

The tools of the archaeoastronomer are ethnographical, textual and archaeological. Thus many disciplines are brought to bear on this problem. These two books are collections of papers concerning various particular aspects of the current activities in these areas. They are not broadly based surveys for casual reading, but the works of active scholarship — some requiring intensive reading and study coupled with background knowledge to follow the threads of the arguments.