

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Navajo Tradition, Mormon Life: The Autobiography and Teachings of Jim Dandy. By Robert S. McPherson, Jim Dandy, and Sarah E. Burak.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9704p1r5>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 38(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Frisbie, Charlotte J.

Publication Date

2014-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Navajo Tradition, Mormon Life: The Autobiography and Teachings of Jim Dandy. By Robert S. McPherson, Jim Dandy, and Sarah E. Burak. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2012. 292 pages. \$27.95 paper.

Robert S. McPherson, a prolific historian who lives and teaches in Utah, has again added to the Navajo studies literature and the Native American life history/autobiography genre with this work. I first learned of Jim Dandy in McPherson's *Dinéjí Na'nitin: Navajo Traditional Teachings and History* (2012), which includes intermittent references to Dandy's knowledge, and some of his teachings about the hogan (139–142). As McPherson's introduction indicates, Dandy's story gives us a different kind of life history/autobiography—one focused on a contemporary person rather than one born at the end of the nineteenth century or shortly thereafter—but still raised in “traditional times” when pastoralism was the economic base for reservation life. This publication of Dandy's account adds to the overall gender imbalance in the life history genre, as will McPherson's forthcoming *Under the Eagle: Samuel Holiday, Navajo Code Talker* (2013). Still, unlike recently treated life history subjects such as John Holiday and Navajo Oshley, Dandy is not a medicine man.

Now in his early seventies, Jim was born in Tonalea (Red Lake, Arizona), the third of nine children. Raised by grandparents, he is bilingual and has a deep understanding of Navajo traditions, stories, and beliefs and practices. He apprenticed to his medicine man grandfather until he was encouraged to get an education. After experiences in boarding schools in Tuba City and Sherlock, Oklahoma, as well as the Mormon Placement program, Dandy completed two years of the expected Latter Day Saints (LDS) mission work, and then earned a Bachelor of Arts in elementary education at Brigham Young University and certificates in secondary and physical education from Weber State University. He married a Navajo woman, Betty. For more than forty years he successfully worked on and off the reservation, mainly teaching in elementary and high schools, counseling, and coaching Native American students in basketball and wrestling. Now Jim and his wife live with family in Blanding, Utah.

In 1976, Jim met McPherson, became neighbors and friends, and eventually asked to have his life story recorded. McPherson secured help from Sarah Burak, an AmeriCorps VISTA worker with a Bachelor of Science in anthropology. Burak participated in interviews, additional clarifying discussions, and visits to other family members, transcribing and organizing all materials; McPherson fine-tuned the manuscript and added contextual information and data gathered earlier. The book opens with a historical overview of Navajo and Mormon interactions, followed by the chapter “Praying to Jesus, Standing for Monster Slayer.” Therein, after examining traditional Navajo beliefs, syncretism, and LDS beliefs (32–50), McPherson compares eight fundamental

aspects of Mormon and Navajo religion. The discussion is not designed to show that Navajo beliefs derive from “Lamanite” origins or that aspects of traditional Navajo and LDS religion are interchangeable, but rather that both religions, deriving from very different contexts, share comparable elements.

The Mormon placement program ran from 1947 until the 1990s and peaked on the reservation in the early 1970s, perhaps because it offered alternatives for education beyond those provided by BIA boarding schools: Intermountain, Chilocco, and the rest (250n25). Since the model was to send children away to Mormon foster families to be raised and educated before returning home, there was much concern about outcomes. On July 27, 1978 the *Navajo Times* ran a feature article about the Mormon church on the reservation and its placement program. Before that article, attention to Mormons and Mormonism in Navajo studies was minimal; initial interest shown by Ramah project workers resulted in *People of Rimrock: A Study of Values in Five Cultures* (1966) and *The Economics of Sainthood: Religious Change among the Rimrock Navajos* (1977). A few other studies emerged, such as Martin Topper’s “Mormon Placement: The Effects of Missionary Foster Families on Navajo Adolescents,” *Ethos* 7(1): 142–60 (1979), and Steve Pavlik’s “Of Saints and Lamanites: An Analysis of Navajo Mormonism,” *Wicazo Sa Review* 8(1): 21–30 (1992).

After the first two chapters of *Navajo Tradition, Mormon Life*, Dandy’s story takes over. Through chapter 7, however, voices remain mixed, since McPherson adds clarifications, information from other family members, and smooth transitions. Differences in typescript help mark speaker changes. The last four chapters (8–11) are restricted to Dandy’s voice as he presents teachings on a wide variety of traditional topics learned from parents, grandparents, and a number of life experiences. After a brief epilogue, clarifying endnotes appear before the index and bibliography. In many endnotes, especially in the final four chapters, McPherson expands on Dandy’s comments with remarks from other Navajos taken from *Leading the Way* interviews, a monthly publication edited by Kathleen Manolescu and John E. Salabye, Jr.

This professionally produced volume warrants only a few criticisms. In a few endnotes I occasionally questioned the orthography, and in others, I would expand references; for example, in the discussions of Yé’ii in chapter 8 (262–63, nn. 1–6), I would add James C. Fari’s *The Nightway: A History and a History of Documentation of a Navajo Ceremony* (1990). Also, I am unclear about Charlie Dandy’s reference to being married “in a five-day ceremony” (154). Attributions should have been included for *all* photographs, not just those from the Milton Snow collection, Navajo Nation Museum, or Kay Shumway. Finally, the background of one of Shumway’s photos is so dark it almost totally obscures the image (185).

Criticisms acknowledged, this work has real value. It's the first time we have a life history of an individual who was a successful LDS placement from *both* LDS and Navajo perspectives. Rather than finding the two faiths incompatible, and thus, like George P. Lee, choosing one and devoting his life to the church, Dandy clearly adhered to and used both. Sometimes he turned to church elders for guidance; other times, he turned to his Navajo beliefs and practices, as a patient, participant, and/or helper to address ongoing problems.

Dandy made education his life work and, as an educator, wore many hats. Readers learn how Jim devised and established the Relearning the Culture Program at Monument Valley High School. Equally instructive are the examples of community development and his leadership roles in the School Community Group, which helped force construction of educational facilities in the Utah part of the reservation after the 1975 lawsuit *Sinajini v. Board of Education* was settled (136). Jim's communication skills, leadership talents, and his multiple roles as teacher, coach, parent coordinator, process facilitator, and liaison counselor for community and educational issues were crucial in building both an elementary and high school in Montezuma Creek (1978), a high school in Monument Valley (1983), and establishing their bicultural/bilingual programs. Some of the Utah information, such as Jim's 1972 desegregation of an all-white football program, echoes information presented in Donna Deyhle's *Reflections in Place: Connected Lives of Navajo Women* (2009).

Unafraid of sharing his knowledge of traditional ways with students, parents, his own children and grandchildren, and others, Dandy was totally immersed in sharing appropriate traditional knowledge and increasing student awareness of and pride in being Navajo. His story is extremely important for all current and future educators, but especially those involved in bilingual/bicultural programs. He became a strong advocate for Navajo language, culture, and identity while teaching and serving as a coach and counselor. Becoming very active in planning programs and developing curriculum, he was responsible for working with parents, training them not just about Head Start but also about the whole curriculum. Some of his contributions to the San Juan School District's Navajo curriculum development project can be viewed at media.sjsd.org. His story includes discussions of the challenges of leading and facilitating change, identifying and working with role models, and some of the many problems educators face, such as unsupportive administrators. It also considers how to get Navajo parents interested in wrestling programs, and how to change opposition to including traditional culture in the classroom so people understand why the curriculum needs to include stick games, coyote stories, frogs in biology classes, and the like.

Another reason to enjoy this highly readable book is that Jim Dandy is a fascinating person, not just a successful educator, community leader, and

role model, but also someone with very interesting beliefs about many topics. Embedded in his story are his ideas about LOTS of things, including interethnic marriage, different ethnic groups, northern Athabaskan linguistic relationships, two-spirit people, dogs and cats, the dangers of practicing ceremonies, types of evil, skinwalker stories, the Chaashzhini (Mud dancers) portion of Enemyway ceremonies, and so forth. If one is lucky enough to become personally familiar with Navajos and aware of differences in trainings and beliefs, one appreciates the rich diversity that characterizes the Navajo Nation. And here is just one example: the story of a contemporary Navajo who continues to bridge multiple worlds and successfully combine traditional Navajo, Mormon, and Anglo approaches to life while remaining actively involved even in retirement.

Charlotte J. Frisbie

Emerita, Southern Illinois University, Edwardsville

Recording Culture: Powwow Music and the Aboriginal Recording Industry on the Northern Plains. By Christopher A. Scales. Durham: Duke University Press. 368 pages. \$89.95 cloth; \$24.95 paper.

I relied heavily on three Arbor Records recordings when teaching Native American Music classes in the early years of the millennium: Eyabay's *No Limits* (1999), Mandaree's *For the People* (2000), and Sizzortail's *Enuff Said* (1999). These recordings displayed the range of styles available on the powwow trail, and their distinct creativity and driven beats also resonated with my twenty-something students, powwow initiates or not. Arbor Records was an influential player in capturing the energy of that time in recorded sound, as powwow flourished, innovated, and connected with younger generations. Christopher A. Scales's book takes us there, providing insight into the meeting ground of recorded sound, youth culture, and Native North American "tradition."

Recording Culture documents a time before the full atrophy of Napster-era MP3 file-sharing beset the recording industry, when CD was still king and box stores like Tower distributed music. A Canadian privy to northern-style powwow practices, Scales narrates powwow culture particularly as it is seen from the western plains urban outpost of Winnipeg. Although Scales emphasizes his time as a powwow performer and sound engineer for Arbor Records at the turn of the millennium, throughout *Recording Culture* he acknowledges the substantial change that in the interim has rocked the recording industry, most notably in his appropriately titled "Coda" (after the "tail" frequently placed on powwow songs), in which he gives readers an update on the contemporary Aboriginal record industry.