

point out that the title of *Citizens Plus* is derived from the Hawthorn Report's recommendation that Indians be treated as "citizens plus." The allusions embodied in both titles (*Citizens Plus* and the Red Paper) would be worth some discussion. In the end, Mawhiney's conclusion that "the results of the study confirmed that the conceptual framework, methods, and documents chosen were appropriate" (p. 119) is hardly convincing to the skeptic.

Few historians will doubt Mawhiney's argument that Indian responses have often induced changes in Indian policy. There can be little question, for example, but that the Canadian government abandoned the main thrust of the White Paper because of the Indian response to the policy. Indian responses, however, have been among the many factors that have influenced the evolution of Canada's Indian policy. Other factors have been neglected here. For example, the Canadian Supreme Court ruling in *Calder v. Attorney General* (1973) gets one brief mention in Mawhiney's book. The Court's ruling in that case, however, challenged the assumptions and aims of the White Paper. Prime Minister Pierre Trudeau and Indian affairs minister Jean Cr tien cited the case in the summer of 1973 when the Canadian government abandoned the land claims policy set out in the White Paper and set up a new policy. It could also be argued that this decision dramatically changed the strategy of status Indians, particularly those who had not signed a land cession treaty.

Mawhiney's approach, which is so directly aimed at discussing the role that status Indians have had in the formulation of Indian policy, is refreshing. The interaction between government leaders and status Indians would be a worthwhile field for further study. This study's analytical tools and choice of documents, however, are too limited to provide comprehensive interpretation, even for this brief period.

Theodore Binnema
University of Alberta

The Voyages of Jacques Cartier. Edited and with an introduction by Ramsay Cook. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993. 177 pages. \$50.00 cloth; \$16.95 paper.

Jacques Cartier holds an important place in the annals of European exploration of the New World, because his efforts propelled

France into the international race for overseas colonies. The importance of his three voyages was manifold, but there were two major effects: (1) The intrusion into the St. Lawrence region eventually led to the major transformation of native groups in the area through their incorporation into the European world economic system, and through the introduction of trade goods and disease; and (2) it laid the foundation for the intense rivalry with Britain that played itself out over the succeeding two centuries. This volume provides all of the primary source material dealing with the voyages and other aspects of Cartier's life. As such, it is an invaluable historic and ethnohistoric resource. While others preceded Cartier in investigating the area around Newfoundland (primarily fishermen exploiting the immense richness of the cod fisheries), he was the first to leave a systematic record of the geography and the native peoples. As such accounts go, it is a succinct, incisive, although at times highly biased, chronicle of the St. Lawrence region and some of its peoples. Cartier had a mariner's sense of geographic precision, which informed his keen observational abilities.

Ramsay Cook's opening essay, entitled "Donnacona Discovers Europe," prefaces the original accounts and serves as an example of how the ethnohistorian can use such primary evidence. Cook demonstrates the advances made in scholarship since Biggar's time by pointing out that French-Indian contact opened new vistas for both peoples; this was an interactive episode of discovery, in which each side probed the other. He evaluates the data and questions a number of Cartier's assertions about what the Indians said, since he did not know their language. Cook begins the essay with a good discussion of the historical problems in dealing with such a manuscript and its author, about whose life little is known outside these documents. A key point Cook makes is that we must compare Cartier's views against what he probably already knew about native peoples and against the need to relate his observations so that a European audience could comprehend what he experienced. In passing the observations through a cultural filter, Cartier constructed a perspective of the native groups as people who could be "molded" into good Catholics but who were also untrustworthy. Cook flips the mirror around and suggests that the Iroquoian Stadaconans also reacted to the contact on the basis of certain beliefs and prior contacts. Thus, they welcomed Cartier initially and engaged willingly in barter for the metal goods of which European fishermen had made them aware. But when

Cartier, on his first voyage, kidnapped two important men, sons of the headman Donnacona, seeds of discord were sown. On the second expedition, Cartier refused to lay down his arms as a sign of good faith, insisted on advancing his own religion, and declined to reciprocate in a gift exchange, all events that generated mistrust among the Stadaconans. Although Cartier's maps and ethnographic descriptions were accurate, Cook says his interpretation and assessment of the natives peoples was "mortally flawed" (p. xl), because it had fatal consequences for Donnacona and others. Cook concludes that *The Voyages* records the mutual discovery of the French and the Indians. The seven decades since Biggar's edition witnessed the emergence of this reflexive historiography.

The manuscripts include fine English translations of the records of the first two voyages (1534 and 1535–36) and a copy of the version in Hakluyt's compendium dealing with the third journey (1541). The first two are complete records with the rich detail that ethnohistorians seek; the third is an abbreviated version of the journey that failed to discover the mineral wealth the French craved. From these pages, Cartier emerges as a man by turn enterprising and unscrupulous. His disregard of the personal rights of the natives stands in ironic contrast to his devout Catholicism. As an explorer, he was governed by practical concerns; he undertook the trip to Hochelaga (near modern Montreal) and the search for the kingdom of Saguenay in order to investigate possibilities for trade and access to mineral resources. In so doing, he provided the initial European description of the upper St. Lawrence region and its native inhabitants. Cartier exhibits something of the propagandist's flair as he regularly extols the virtues of the land and the potential to realize considerable economic gain. Of greater significance, however, is his presentation of native Indian society. From Cartier we learn something about the material culture, settlement layout and distribution, level of social complexity, economic strategies, kinship structure, and political organization of the groups with which the French interacted. Although Cartier's goals and perspective prevented him from investigating all of the aspects modern scholars deem significant, the documents provide rich potential for historic, ethnographic, and archaeological inquiry, if researchers ask the right questions. The footnotes that accompany the text point out some of these avenues of investigation and also clarify the geography to which the records make constant reference. The various letters and other documents frame

the voyages within the context of national policy and competition among European states. In other words, we obtain a sense of the total setting, from logistics to international intrigue, within which one must comprehend the expeditions.

This edition is based largely on the 1924 translation of H.P. Biggar, with some emendation by Cook. Cook changed little from Biggar's edition, except to provide more precise definitions of certain words that apply to natives and to eliminate some footnotes. For example, Cook correctly substitutes *savage* (French, *sauvaige*) for *Indian*; he notes that Biggar's translation of several terms missed the intent of Cartier's phrasing. Cook also omits the original French text that appeared in Biggar's version. The addition, however, of a number of letters that relate directly to the journeys of Cartier and Roberval add significantly to the value of this book. The letters include a number of important and revealing documents, many making their initial appearance in English. There are two types of documents. The first set are French documents that include the letters granting money to finance the three voyages; commissions granting Cartier, and later Roberval, official status to undertake the expeditions under the auspices of Francis I; a roll of the crew for the second voyage; a list of personnel (by occupation or trade) and necessary provisions for the third voyage; Cartier's will; a document naming Cartier as the one who interceded on behalf of a man unfairly beaten in a monetary dispute; a record of the baptism of three Indian men Cartier had brought back to France from his second voyage and for one of whom he stood as godfather; and a brief notice of Cartier's death. The second group consists of four documents: a letter from a Lagarto to John III of Portugal; another from the emperor to the cardinal of Toledo; a secret report by a Spanish spy on Cartier's preparations for the third voyage; and a series of depositions taken by Spanish officials from French fishermen concerning their knowledge of the activities of Cartier and Roberval gained while the men gathered cod near Newfoundland.

The first set of letters provides insights into the nominal justification, logistics, and practical finances associated with France's first official venture into the often hazardous, but potentially rewarding, field of overseas exploration. The various letters, accounts, and lists indicate the shift in goals between 1534 and 1541. Whereas the initial voyage focused on discovering a passage to the East Indies, the last trip, by the inclusion of women, various artisans, and livestock, revealed at least a tentative effort to estab-

lish settlements, both to guard access to the still-hoped-for Northwest Passage and to cultivate the region Cartier often described as suitable for agriculture. The second set of documents offers a revealing glimpse into the imperial concerns of the Iberian powers. The Spanish, in particular, expended considerable effort to gather information about Cartier's expeditions. The questions asked of the French fishermen in the one document—date of departure, destination, number of ships, ports they entered and why, what activities they undertook—reveal an overriding Spanish concern with protecting their hold on the riches of the West Indies and Mexico.

Although this book is exemplary as a presentation of primary sources, there are several minor deficiencies. The lack of an index makes the search for specific subjects more difficult. One loses the intricacies of the geographical references because of the large scale of the single map; an additional detailed map or two would allow the reader to follow the various routes with greater precision.

The University of Toronto Press has produced a book that should become the standard primary reference in English for studies of Cartier and early French exploration in Canada. The lack of typographical errors attests to the thoroughness and care that went into the preparation of this volume. Beyond the opening essay, which demonstrates the trend of certain recent historiography, Cook wisely lets the documents stand on their own. Through these records we hear the distant, distinctive, and often discordant voices of the Indians and the Europeans who confronted one another across a cultural divide in North America.

P. Nick Kardulias
Kenyon College

The Wind in a Jar. By John Farella. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1993. 164 pages. \$22.95 cloth.

I find it unfortunate that Alice Kehoe has recommended against this volume in the October 1993 issue of *Choice*. There she complains that John Farella employs "a casual, colloquial style" to "ruminate . . . on experiences as an ethnographer on the Navajo Reservation" in "a sort of bildungsroman" which rejects "a rigorous scientific methodology for ethnography."