

UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

HYDERABAD - AFTER THE FALL - KHALIDI,O

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9f4790zn>

Journal

Pacific Affairs, 62(4)

ISSN

0030-851X

Author

Leonard, K

Publication Date

1990

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

new Shii and Awadhi elements which emphasized their independence from Delhi.

Fisher repeatedly makes the point that the culture of the Awadh court bore little relevance to its hinterland. The cultural aspirations of Awadh's rulers effectively cut them off from the territory under their control, and when they renounced Mughal sovereignty in 1819 they severed links with the one real source of legitimation which the mass of the local population recognized. As the Awadh court gradually isolated itself from its subjects, the East India Company intensified its thrust for power, adopting much of the symbolic practice of local rulers, until its authority came to rest "not in the approval of the Padshah but rather on a broad and powerful constituency within Lucknow and Awadh," something which the Padshah distinctly lacked.

As a study of the ideological underpinnings of the state of Awadh during a crucial phase in the development of northern India as a whole, *A Clash of Cultures* contains a great deal to interest and challenge its reader. Unfortunately, from time to time, it is not possible to escape the feeling that the information being provided does not quite match up to the significance assigned to it. Perhaps the title itself helps to create this occasional sense of disappointment: often the message which comes across more strongly is one of conflicting loyalties with the Awadh court playing its position off against a whole range of different challenges and challengers. All the same, the work throws valuable light on both the way in which northern India shifted into a new era and the dynamics of one of its "intermediary" states. For this achievement alone, it deserves its place alongside other exciting new works dealing with other aspects of the same period.

University of London, Egham, England

SARAH ANSARI

HYDERABAD: After the Fall. Edited by Omar Khalidi. Wichita (Kansas): Hyderabad Historical Society Massachusetts (distributed by South Asia Books, Columbia, Missouri, U.S.A.). 1988. xiii, 219 pp. (Illus.) US\$20.00, paper. ISBN 930811-02-X.

THIS PAPERBACK BOOK consists chiefly of reprints of important articles or book extracts concerned with the Nizam's state of Hyderabad after its incorporation into India via a military operation in 1948. Three pieces have not been published before, most significantly excerpts from a post-1948 report on atrocities committed against Muslims in Hyderabad State. The final two pieces are also new, a provocative essay about the contemporary sociopolitical situation in Hyderabad by Usama Khalidi and a fine bibliographic essay by the editor.

On the whole, the reprints are well chosen and it is good to have them together in this volume. Before commenting on each piece, let me remark on other aspects of the publication. The table of contents lists the pieces by number, with title and author; the copyright acknowledgements appear in

another place, with the publication information following the number (but without author and title). On the first page of each piece, title and author appear but not the number or the publication information, so that one must go from the first page of each piece to the table of contents to find out the number and then to the numbered acknowledgements to ascertain the date of publication, etc. This is cumbersome and could easily have been handled more conveniently.

Then we have photographs, the cover one marvelous but unidentified, and some of the others featuring individuals or things not focused on in any of the articles. Finally, we need a map to accompany the second piece about the military operations.

However, Khalidi's ongoing effort to save Hyderabad State and historical materials about it from neglect is welcome. His introduction presents two views of Hyderabad, one which argues that Hyderabad was as good a state as any Muslim kingdom and better than most (he asserts that it was the most important area for Urdu literature in the subcontinent). His second view argues that Hyderabad was a relic of the past which could not survive. Khalidi hopes these writings will help readers arrive at a mature judgement, perhaps one which at least celebrates the culture of the former state.

W.C. Smith's classic article "Hyderabad: Muslim Tragedy" sets the context, and details on the Five Day War from Mir Laiq Ali's book show the terrible ineptness which led to the state's swift downfall. Clyde Eagleton's 1950 piece on Hyderabad's case before the U.N. Security Council strikes me as no longer of interest (Smith's footnote 16 on page 22 covers it all). A few pages from Zubaida Yazdani's book on the Seventh Nizam present the arrangements made just after the surrender, and then Khalidi presents his coup, excerpts from a report of atrocities against Muslims published here for the first time. Unfortunately he gives no indication of which fragments were in English and which he translated from Urdu, or of how these fragments fit into the report as a whole. These pages read like raw data and one is unsure how to evaluate them, or how the authors, Pandit Sundarlal and Qazi Mohammad Abdulghaffar, evaluated them for that matter. The authors said they were on a goodwill mission on behalf of Prime Minister Nehru, but this was disavowed by Vallabhbhai Patel and their report was buried (a copy does survive in the Union Home Ministry but Khalidi did not have access to it, apparently). A nostalgic piece by Zahir Ahmad shows the old aristocrats overwhelmed by their new circumstances, and then we get two articles by Ted Wright about the Majlis Ittehad-ul-Muslimin revival and the inflammatory result of using modern judicial procedures to settle the Dar-us-Salam property dispute in 1963. Next, Rashiuddin Khan argues that socio-economic, political and cultural conditions of the Muslim community declined in the 1950s and 1960s. Ratna Naidu follows with a focus on Bidar and finds a similar situation, but she raises the important questions of how far the pattern differs from that prevailing before 1948 and to what extent discriminatory practices of the majority community can explain Muslim backwardness. Despite Khalidi's introductory praise for Hyderabad

culture as a melting pot, his emphasis and that of most contributors is on Muslim culture, Muslim society. Yet the final overview by Usama Khalidi sets a very different tone, firmly fixed on integration and equality within Andhra and Indian society. The second to last substantive piece, by Akbar Ahmad, takes a somewhat similar view, criticizing visions restricted to Muslims. "Muslim destiny is tied directly to the larger issues confronting Indian society," he says. So the volume is schizophrenic, the two views contending within it, but it is interesting reading.

University of California, Irvine, U.S.A.

KAREN LEONARD

SOUTHEAST ASIA: Past and Present. By D.R. SarDesai. Boulder (Colorado): Westview Press. Second Edition. 1989. 366 pp. (Maps, Tables.) US\$45.00, cloth. ISBN 0-8133-0445-8; US\$19.95, paper. ISBN 0-8133-0446-6.

THOSE who teach introductory courses in the history of Southeast Asia will be familiar with the problems posed by the selection of a suitable text. For too long the choice has lain between D.G.E. Hall's authoritative *A History of South-East Asia* (1955; 4th ed., Macmillan, 1981) and shorter works, such as Lea E. Williams, *Southeast Asia: A History* (Oxford, 1976) or Milton Osborne, *Southeast Asia: An Introductory History* (Allen and Unwin, 1979). The first, with its scholarly discussion of ancient dynasties, overwhelms the tyro; the others, sound as their interpretations are, inadequately cover the precolonial period, or adopt thematic approaches which omit too much factual information. The first edition of SarDesai's work (1981) sought a balance between early and modern history, and to avoid the twin pitfalls of excessive detail and superficiality. In striving after a synthesis of the entire history of so extensive a region, SarDesai had a prodigious task. Understandably, perhaps, he was only partly successful, with the paucity of precolonial sources and the abundance of documentation for later periods again imposing a "moderncentric" if not Europe-centred perspective on the work. The book also suffered from errors of fact and awkwardness of style.

In the second edition, valuable summaries of each of the four parts into which the work is divided ("Cultural Heritage," "Colonial Interlude," "Nationalist Response," and "Fruits of Freedom") have been added; the first chapter now includes a brief discussion of the origins and essential characteristics of Hinduism, Buddhism and Islam. The section dealing with nationalist movements has been compressed and the final section extended to take note of major developments since 1981. In this, the last part, a section headed "End of the Ne Win Era" has been added, perhaps prematurely, to the chapter on Burma. A useful chronological chart has been appended.

Unfortunately, recent scholarship challenging old assumptions concerning the migration of people into the region — ignored in the first edition — has still not been taken into account. Regrettably, misprints and other errors also remain uncorrected; thus, Thailand's present king is still identified,