The recent cycle of reprints of Sioux texts from the first decades of this century, to which *Wigwam Evenings* belongs, certainly is providing us with a fuller array of sources and is making hard-to-get editions more available to the public, but we must be able to maintain some expectation that the new editions will be faithful to their prototypes and, ideally, even increase our appreciation and understanding of their place in Native American literary experience and scholarship.

R.D. Theisz
Black Hills State University

The Zuni Man-Woman. By Will Roscoe. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1991. 328 pages. $24.95 cloth.

This book is a significant contribution to the study of Zuni history, as well as to research on gender role variance and sexuality in American Indian cultures. Roscoe, who edited *Living the Spirit* (1988), a valuable anthology organized by the intertribal Gay American Indians organization, has now produced an intensive study of the berdache role in Zuni culture. The illustrations alone are worth the price of the book. Roscoe begins with a general background on Zuni culture and the complementary nature of gender roles among Pueblo societies. Following the same approach as Paula Gunn Allen in *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the Feminine in American Indian Traditions* (1986), Roscoe points out the high status and economic independence of Zuni women. In this matrilineal and matrilocal society, women owned their own houses and food stores, marriage was not ceremonialized, children belonged to the mother rather than the father, and women were free to choose their sexual partners without economic or moral compulsion.

In this gender egalitarian and sex-positive context, males who wished to participate in women's work, to take on aspects of women's social roles, and to engage in homosexual involvement with men were not stigmatized. Since women were valued, a male who dressed and acted like a woman would not be "lowering himself" from masculine status. Instead, such males were accepted as *lhamana*, the Zuni word for the berdache gender role. The body of Roscoe's book is devoted to We'wha (1849-96), certainly the most famous berdache in Zuni history. Unfortunately, Roscoe did not do intensive fieldwork at Zuni, and he only briefly mentions other

male *lhamana* since We'wha. Also, he barely touches on the "girl-man" *katsotstsi* (pp. 27-28, 158), the masculine female counterpart of the male berdache. Much more research is needed on Native American female gender variance and female-to-female sexuality.

We'wha, the main focus of Roscoe's book, remains to this day a prominent Zuni culture hero. In 1885, impressed by this berdache's skills as an outstanding potter and weaver, pioneer anthropologist Matilda Coxe Stevenson brought him to Washington, D.C. for a six-month visit. We'wha was photographed by Smithsonian Institution photographers as he demonstrated various Zuni craftworkings, and his art remains today as part of the Smithsonian collections. Accepted as a "Zuni princess," We'wha passed as a woman in Washington social circles and, with Stevenson's assistance, was quite a hit with the political elite. We'wha even had an audience with President Grover Cleveland. Roscoe points out that We'wha's sale of pottery and textiles created an important economic base for Zuni artisans in the twentieth century.

Although We'wha went to Washington as a cultural and economic representative of his people, with a desire to cement peaceful relations with the United States government, he was involved in 1892 in standing up to United States interference in Zuni affairs. The issue was the Zuni fear of witches. Roscoe presents an interesting analysis of witchcraft trials as Zuni's major crime control mechanism and shows how the fear of witches functioned to keep people socially cooperative: "Those who enjoyed less social or economic success were discouraged from harboring divisive resentments or jealousies for fear of the charge of witchcraft, while the more successful families were concerned lest they become the object of a witch's envy. So they, too, strove to be kind, generous, and humble toward others" (p. 104). In defending this practice, We'wha bodily threw the investigating United States Army officer out of the house of the Zuni governor and barricaded the door. For this resistance, We'wha spent a month in jail. Though dressed in women's clothes, We'wha was recognized by the Zuni as the strongest person in the pueblo.

In 1896, after overworking himself in preparation for a major Zuni ceremonial, We'wha died of heart failure. His death caused universal regret in the pueblo and led to recriminations and further accusations of witchcraft and still more army intervention. With the suppression of witchcraft trials since 1896, the Zuni have felt defenseless. Freed from the fear of being accused, many Zuni have formed factions within the pueblo.

White authorities did more than just suppress witchcraft trials, however. In order to take more control over Zuni, they also made efforts to suppress native sexuality. Officials complained of "sexual immorality" in ceremonies, in antics of the sacred clown dancers, and in the social acceptance of the berdache (pp. 115, 170). Building on the work of Francisco Guerra in *The Pre-Columbian Mind* (1971) and of this reviewer, Roscoe points out that the suppression of sexuality is a major theme in the history of Indian-white relations. From the Spanish in colonial Mexico to the United States Bureau of Indian Affairs in the 1900s, officials have attempted to impose Western Christian taboos on native cultures that saw no sinfulness or shame in the pleasures of sex. Roscoe points out the sexual aspects involved in the 1920s BIA campaign against Indian dancing and describes the efforts of John Collier (who had been influenced by the sexual liberationism of the Greenwich Village bohemian scene) to protect native rights to the sexual values implicit in their native religions. For the Indians, sex was valued not just for reproduction but also because it promoted close social bonding between individuals. In this context, it is easy to see how native people can accept homosexual behavior as part of the natural variation of human sexual desire.

Roscoe skillfully integrates his historical research in archival sources with Zuni ethnography. He cites important archeological evidence (pp. 24-25) indicating that the berdache tradition is an ancient one among Native Americans. His detail on the berdache character in the Zuni origin myth is valuable, but his analysis based on Jungian psychology needs to be condensed. He agrees with the theoretical approach of this reviewer in *The Spirit and the Flesh: Sexual Diversity in American Indian Culture* (1986) that the berdache role is not the same as transsexualism but is a combination of both masculine and feminine aspects into a distinct, alternative gender role. Roscoe wisely avoids defining berdache as "a traditional gay role"—a description he previously favored—but he does point out, and rightly so, that social constructionist, postmodernist writers have gone too far in denying any similarity between a berdache identity and a gay identity among Indians today.

At this point, we need more intensive, fieldwork-based studies of berdaches in other tribes and especially of female gender variance. Still, while I dislike Roscoe's use of the hierarchical "third gender" label, berdache scholars seem to be in basic agreement that, rather than being a "gender-crossing" transvestite or

transsexual, berdache is an alternative gender role and/or a combination/mixing of masculine and feminine aspects in one androgynous person. Writings on the American Indian berdache now posit it as the world's most prominent example of the different ways that societies organize gender, beyond the "two opposite sexes" of Western thought.

The newest trend in berdache studies is the discovery that many other traditional societies around the world have accepted such alternative gender roles; see, for example, Serena Nanda, *Neither Man Nor Woman: The Hijras of India* (1990). As more cross-cultural research is being done in the fields of sexology and gender studies, it is becoming obvious that American Indians may be more typical of human acceptance of homosexuality and gender variance than the rigid condemnation offered by Western culture. Rather than a marginal status, the berdache role "ensured the representatives of diversity a place in the middle, as valued participants" (p. 214). Such social acceptance is of more than academic relevance. Roscoe asks "whether men and women today can ever achieve mutuality and wholeness as long as men who manifest qualities considered feminine, and women who do the same in male realms, are seen as deviants to be criminalized and stigmatized. Fear of being associated with this deviant status stands before every man and woman who would seek psychic integration" (p.169). Roscoe concludes that the berdache provides a model of "gender reconciliation that Western societies can no longer afford to ignore" (p. 169). For pointing out a cross-cultural relevance in this aspect of American Indian studies, Roscoe deserves thanks.

Walter L. Williams
University of Southern California

Landmarks of Healing: A Study of *House Made of Dawn*. By Susan Scarberry-Garcia. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. 228 pages. $24.50 cloth. $13.95 paper.

The majority society's failure to understand or appreciate historical and cultural contexts has afflicted Native Americans since first contact, and the affliction continues. Native Americans have been and are thought of mainly in the past tense, or tribal distinctions are ignored, or contemporary plights are the main news.