

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Métis: Past and Present. (Special Issue: Canadian Ethnic Studies/Etudes Ethniques au Canada Vol. 17, No. 2). Edited by Thomas Flanagan and John Foster

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9m97n0fp>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 10(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Long, John S.

Publication Date

1986

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

sential justice of the Havasupai cause, and realized the underlying agreement of the conservation ideal with a tribe that would adopt the motto, "Where people and nature are one."

Historical and contemporary photographs enrich Hirst's book, although they are crowded together on a few pages in a chaotic arrangement that sometimes detracts from the impact they would have had by themselves. Also, they deserve captions and credits, which are provided only for a few. The short bibliography supplements that in the Whiting volume, although neither is complete. Anyone interested in twentieth-century Native American Indian history needs to read this book, and the Havasupai Tribe is to be commended in sponsoring the work of a competent historian.

There are few points of direct comparison between the two books, but one that catches the reader's attention has to do with the meaning of the word "Havasupai" (*Havsuw 'Baaaja*) itself. Whiting announces that it means "the people who live at the place which is green," while Hirst assures us that it means "the Blue Creek people," even though the subtitle of his book perpetuates the more poetic translation which has entered the literature: "People of the Blue Green Water," a conscious echo of Charles Cadman's "Land of the Sky-blue Water." Whom should we trust, the linguist or the man who has no doubt asked the people themselves? In most ways, as when the books talk about traditional land use on the plateaus, they support one another admirably. Both are attractive books with readable type and few errors. In spite of the great number of works available on the tribe, each of them performs a service not provided by any other volume. They belong together on the reading table of anyone who is concerned with the Havasupai and their home in the canyon and on the plateau.

J. Donald Hughes
University of Denver

The Métis: Past and Present. (Special Issue: Canadian Ethnic Studies/*Études Ethniques au Canada* Vol. 17, No. 2). Edited by Thomas Flanagan and John Foster. Toronto: Canadian Ethnic Studies Association, 1985. \$7.00 Paper.

The Métis are people of mixed Indian and non-Indian ancestry. Métis Louis Riel, a leader of the 1869–70 Red River and 1885 North-West rebellions, was executed at Regina (Saskatchewan) on November 16, 1885. This volume marks the centennial of Riel's death and a re-awakening of scholarly interest in the Métis.

In 1981 Chicago's Newberry Library held a first conference on the Métis in North America. The conference honored Marcel Giraud, author of the pathbreaking volume *Le Métis canadien: son rôle dans l'histoire des provinces de l'Ouest* (1945), and brought together twenty-six American and Canadian scholars. The subsequent publication of *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America* (Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S. H. Brown, eds., 1985) and the announcement of a long-awaited English translation of Giraud's work (*The Métis in the Canadian West*, George Woodcock trans., 1986) were evidence of a burgeoning literature concerning the Métis. A special issue of *The Canadian Journal of Native Studies* (1983) published several papers from the Métis Symposium held in Winnipeg, Manitoba in 1982.

The volume under review contains eight original papers. Six of these focus, like Giraud, on the Métis in western Canada. One examines the remarkable career of a western Métis who emigrated to England at the age of twenty. The other analyzes Canadian government policy making.

In October of 1869 Riel and other Métis stopped a survey party. Rupert's Land, the Hudson's Bay territory, was being transferred to Canadian jurisdiction. The following month they seized Upper Fort Garry and, later, formed a provisional government. Negotiations led to the Manitoba Act of 1870, the creation of a new province and the seeming protection of Métis landholdings. In "Persistent Settlers: The Dispersal and Resettlement of the Red River Métis, 1870–85," P. R. Mailhot and D. N. Sprague have made a detailed comparison of the landholdings of two groups of mixed ancestry—the French Métis and the English Métis (which they call Métis and Native English)—and the incoming Canadians. The former were mainly laborers, who used the river-front acreages for gardening. But this "ownership" was not recorded in the land register. An 1871 Order in Council permitted transfers of "apparently vacant land" to the newcomers, and provided no protection to the old inhabitants. Some 59% of the Métis land, and 47% of the Native English land holdings proved

to be "somehow invisible to the land surveyors" (p. 4). The Manitoba Act notwithstanding, most of the Métis and Native English were dispossessed of their river front lands and moved further north and west. This set the stage for the rebellion of 1885 on the South Saskatchewan River when they were betrayed by Canada a second time.

Glen Campbell shows Riel's shifting feelings for his people, the French Métis (Campbell's "mixed bloods"), by examining his poetry in "Dithyramb and Diatribe: The Polysemic Perception of the Métis in Louis Riel's Poetry." The Métis are viewed as an impediment to Riel the student, when he is unable to find a wife or a job in Montreal. In 1870 a jubilant Riel, having established the provisional government, idolizes the Métis and their heavy drinking. Finally the prophet Riel extolls the virtues of the Métis and the prospect of a new nation in the North-West.

Historians have argued that men of mixed ancestry were generally unable to rise into the higher ranks of the North American fur trade (or, for that matter, the missionary world) in the second half of the nineteenth century. Barry Cooper examines the very successful career of a prominent and atypical Métis in "Alexander Kennedy Isbister: A Respectable Victorian." Isbister is known to historians as a leading critic and former employee of the Hudson's Bay Company in the 1840s and 1850s. Cooper describes the activities of this "mixed-blood" ("one-quarter Cree") in English educational reform as an author of textbooks and most notably as Dean of the College of Preceptors. Isbister's case shows that there were isolated Métis individuals who were able to excel despite the limits set by Victorian racist views.

The Alberta government established the Ewing Commission in 1934 and later created the Métis Betterment Act (1938) which resulted in Métis agricultural colonies within that province. Ken Hatt examines the Commission testimony in "Ethnic Discourse in Alberta: Land and Métis in the Ewing Commission." The Commission was limited from the outset by its chairman's opinion that "it will not get us too far to harp on what has happened in the past" (p. 70). Hatt finds that pathological orientation dominated the discussions. Land was seen as the remedy for problems in health, education and general welfare. At the same time, land was variously conceived by witnesses. Some, like Métis spokesman Jim Brady, favored the development of cooperatives.

Church leaders saw the land solution as a means of paternalistic protection of a helpless people. Government officials and politicians favored land as a means of rehabilitating those whose traditional means of subsistence was doomed. Hatt shows that each of these three orientations encompassed a different definition of the Métis, and each envisaged a different means of overall administration: a provincial Métis organization (close to what we might call Native self-government in Canada today), the church, or government bureaucracy. Hatt concludes that the Ewing Commission served to absorb and transform Métis protest in the 1930s.

Sally Weaver examines "Federal Policy-Making for Métis and Non-Status Indians in the Context of Native Policy" in a case study of the Consultative Group on Métis and Non-Status Indian Socio-Economic Development from 1978 to 1980. (Non-status Indians lost Indian legal status, e.g. through marriage with non-Indians, or never had such status although they are not Métis.) Weaver describes and analyzes the operations of this group and succinctly explains several factors responsible for its failure as a policy-formulation group. She concludes: "Until a locus of responsibility for the Métis is established in government, and staffed with people who are sensitive and knowledgeable about the Métis and empowered to deal with the issues, unproductive and discredited approaches to [Métis and Non-Status Indian] policy will continue" (p. 98).

In "Mary Anne's Dilemma: The Ethnohistory of an Ambivalent Identity," Trudy Nicks discusses the changing Métis identity and its implications for collections and exhibits of museum material culture. In the early 1970s Mary Anne (a pseudonym) sold her "Cree" crafts to the Provincial Museum of Alberta. By the 1970s, Mary Anne was selling "Métis" artifacts, evidence of a new identity. Nicks provides a description and longitudinal analysis of the Native people now living in the Grand Cache area of Alberta and their recent identification as Métis. She cautions that artifacts associated with the Red River Métis have become widely adopted as part of a pan-Métis identity; as symbols they are "widely recognized and positive in affect" but "not necessarily historically accurate" (p. 112).

Irene M. Spry has edited "The 'Memories' of George William Sanderson 1846-1936." Sanderson was an English-speaking

"Halfbreed," born at Port Nelson on Hudson Bay and later raised at Portage la Prairie where "Buffalo meat was our chief article of food" (p. 119). He trained briefly as a miller, but instead became a trader and later a farmer. Sanderson's autobiographical anecdotes provide an important contribution to our understanding of the social history of the western Métis in the late 19th century. Included is a detailed account of his experiences during the 1870 rebellion at Red River.

Joe Sawchuk discusses the effects on Métis and Non-Status Indian organizations of the recent (1982) recognition of the Métis in Canada's Constitution. Sawchuk finds that a government-imposed identity has "subverted a significant political alliance between the Métis and non-status Indians" (p. 144).

The editors provide a brief introduction, and this issue also includes reviews of eight books dealing with the western Métis.

This volume's focus on the western Métis belies their geographic extent and complexity, and it is unfortunate that two of the authors chose to perpetuate the term "mixed blood" and the notion of a blood quantum. Preoccupation with biology or folk biology distracts us from more important issues: the Métis are peoples with histories and cultures. Nevertheless, this collection is essential reading for any student of the Métis past and present.

John S. Long
Muskegog Cree Council

Big Bear. By Hugh Dempsey. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. 227 pp. \$22.95 Cloth.

With this volume Hugh Dempsey, author of an earlier work on Crowfoot, has made another contribution to native and western Canadian historiography. Big Bear, as he is one of the more intriguing figures of the late fur trade era, has long deserved attention by a scholar of Dempsey's calibre. This work is more, however, than a portrait of an individual life. Dempsey places that life in its rich historical environment through a reconstruction of the era from the days of buffalo plenty, through treaty