

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

An Ethnography of Santa Clara Pueblo, New Mexico. By W. W. Hill.
Edited and annotated by Charles H. Lange.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9s99q8dp>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 8(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Authors

Jacobs, Sue-Ellen
Naranjo, Tito E.
Naranjo, Tessie

Publication Date

1984-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

An Ethnography of Santa Clara Pueblo, New Mexico. By W. W. Hill. Edited and annotated by Charles H. Lange. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982. 400 pp. \$35.00 Cloth.

In part a general ethnography is intended to present a cultural portrait of the community where the anthropologist has resided and conducted research. It is a descriptive account of the life and material culture of a community that covers a defined period of time and should be useful for cross-cultural understanding of human diversity and similarity for the generation of testable hypotheses within social science and for ethnohistorical, reconstructive historical and other purposes by the community described. The degree to which general ethnographic research can achieve these goals depends on several factors including but not limited to 1) the length of time, range and depth of participation by the anthropologist in community life, 2) the opportunity to verify community members' verbal accounts of and explanations for sociocultural activities, and 3) the value attributed to the research by the community. Even when all factors operate favorably the final ethnography can be no more than a portrait of a slice of time in the life and memory of select individuals. This selected portrait can be matched to others and in the long run provide a composite picture that may approximate reality for the community.

Based largely on interviews with nearly 80 Santa Clarans, supplemented by some published sources as well as important correspondence and notes from other anthropologists who had conducted research near or within Santa Clara Pueblo, W. W. Hill drafted a number of chapters for a book that he was unable to complete before his death in 1974. Charles Lange's work on the manuscripts and field notes of W. W. Hill has led to an ethnography of Santa Clara Pueblo, New Mexico that is rich in detailed information. Lange assumed the formidable task of checking the manuscripts, adding additional information and finally editing and annotating this classic ethnography.

The style of ethnography, rarely published in the past three decades, follows a formula intended to comprehensively cover sociocultural beliefs and practices, technology and material culture of a community. The outline of this ethnography of Santa Clara Pueblo follows the classic model with the following chapters: Geographic Setting; Prehistory and History; Property and Ownership; Agricultural Economy; Preparation of Food and

Diet; Nonagricultural Economy; Material Culture; Life Cycle and Social Organization; Political Organization; and Ceremonial Organization. Each chapter has carefully thought out sub-divisions. There are four appendices (five Santa Clara genealogies; the Santa Clara Constitution of December 14, 1935; Roy A. Keech's 1937 accounts of the Rainbow Dance and the Blue Corn Dance held August 12, 1937), a Tewa/Spanish/English glossary and a brief bibliography and index. In addition, a Tewa Phonetic Table and Explanation by Winter Laite is included in "Acknowledgments;" 1950s aerial and earlier archival photographs from diverse sources compliment those made by Hill; and Hill's granddaughter, Cynthia Nufer, produced 44 line drawings from his original sketches and paintings.

All three reviewers consider this book valuable for a variety of reasons. Our overall consideration is that it is an important contribution to ethnography of the Tewa world and will serve as a basic resource for scholars interested in culture change, art, ceremony and material culture of the Tewa. However, if it is to serve that purpose, it *must* be used in conjunction with other critical sources (to be discussed below). Some of the strengths of this book are related to the detail of information that can be used to demonstrate continuity and change in 1) specific land, water and other natural resource usages, 2) preparation of certain foods, including some specific aspects of breadbaking, 3) pottery making styles, weaving techniques and other arts and craft work, 4) some aspects of sodality and general community rituals, 5) aspects of intertribal and other interethnic relationships, and more. When so much is covered in such detail, however, it is easy to find factual errors and errors of misunderstanding owing to the absence of a good cross-sampling of respondents, the absence of a comparable data base or even selective neglect of related documents and other sources.

One of the most troubling misunderstandings in the book is Hill's characterization of women's statuses and roles at Santa Clara. He applies a value judgment that in Sue-Ellen Jacobs' experience reflects neither the symbolic nor actual importance of women in the Tewa world. For example, in the discussion of the chapter Agricultural Economy he writes that, with few exceptions, "female participation in agriculture consisted of occasional help in planting and such marginal aspects of harvesting as husking and winnowing" (24), yet as he develops the scenarios for the full process of farming (from opening the ditch in the spring

to soil preparation, planting, weeding, harvesting, processing and storing food) reference is made to work women and children do along with men. What seems to be meant here is that, while women and children (of both sexes) participate in production activities, men are held responsible for production, but it does not follow that women's work was marginal. On page 169 he states that "Women were considered second-class citizens at Santa Clara Pueblo," yet this is qualified over and over with, for example, reference to the range of status options open to women, the expressed value placed on childbearing and rearing, the importance given to the economic aspects of pottery making, and the role of women in ceremonials and other rituals. Hill may simply have not been told enough details about women's roles and statuses during his interviews and may not have had the opportunity to observe that women also engage in rituals associated with their work (e.g., food preparation, pottery making) as do men (e.g., farming, hunting), and thus he was led to misunderstand the importance of Santa Clara women.

Tito Narano notes that a closer examination of kinship terminology, especially the ubiquitous term *Jia* or "mother," would have clarified the importance of literal and symbolic importance of females:

Literal Meanings	Symbolic Meanings
1. <i>Jia</i> = biological mother	1. <i>Jia e</i> = two male caciques or moiety leaders
2. <i>Jia</i> + given name = focal and community mothers who were at heads of kinship affiliations, economic units and socialization units.	2. <i>Jia e</i> = sacred stone fetishes
3. <i>Jia</i> = term of respect for elderly females.	3. <i>Jia</i> = two supernaturals under the lake of emergence
	4. <i>Jia e</i> = ears of corn representative of supernaturals
	5. <i>Jia</i> = Earth

The whole of Tewa religious belief is infused with the ceremonial-religious use of *Jia* and *Jia e* (translates as "little mother") terminology. Seemingly the female qualities of loving, nurturing, forgiving, fertility, stability, continuity and more are reiterated literally and symbolically on a daily basis in the Santa Clara so-

ciety where men function in the facade of secular government and society memberships. The foundation is certainly female.

Other value judgments or misunderstandings occur when Hill compares technologies and aspects of material culture. For example, while he notes the many animals acquired by hunting, he states, "The practical aspects of hunting were poorly developed at Santa Clara" (48). Tito Naranjo observes that the hunter in Santa Clara was held in high esteem. Hunting was regulated as part of life cycles and seasonal activity seen only in balance as part of the whole in the pueblo. Hunting of *P'o Kanu* or sacred game animals was partly regulated by religious beliefs about animals in relationship to seasons and animal life cycles and to aspects of social organization such as, the Hunt Society. During the time period covered by Hill, the Hunt Society was a political rather than strictly functional hunting sodality; however, both tribal and individual hunting were regulated and organized by Society and Tribal sanction, a point to which Hill alludes.

Although a wide range of flora (pinon nuts, various berries, leaves and roots) are listed as dietary staples, Hill considers gathering to have been inconsequential. Tessie Naranjo notes that there is still a lot of gathering of spinach, onions, asparagus in the spring, mushrooms and pinons in the fall and regular gathering of medicinal herbs.

Hill also may not have had the opportunity to observe the difference between the way kinship organization is described and the way it is played out in everyday life, since he did not fully participate in the round of everyday life at Santa Clara when conducting his research. Indeed, Lanfe emphasized Hill's "detachment" from Santa Clara life and Hill describes the interview settings at several points in the chapters he wrote before his death.

The discussions of moiety affiliation and organization require careful attention and should be read (as indicated in Richard Ford's 1984 review article in *American Indian Art Magazine*) only after reading Alfonso Ortiz' *The Tewa World*. The same must be said concerning the chapters on Political Organization and Ceremonial Organization; the latter chapter will be enhanced by a prior reading of Gertrude Kurath and Antonio Garcia's *Music and Dance of the Tewa Pueblos*. For the section on childbirth, it would be useful to do a prior reading of Sophie B. D. Aberle's "Child mortality among Pueblo Indians" and "Frequency of

pregnancies and birth intervals among Pueblo Indians" in the *American Journal of Physical Anthropology*, volume 16 and "Frequency of childbirth among Pueblo Indians" in *The Anatomical Record*, volume 32. C. Edward P. Dozier's "The Pueblo Indians of the Southwest" in *Current Anthropology*, volume 5 is important reading for general issues regarding theory, method and results in Pueblo research.

Although Hill seems to have been attuned to the need to protect respondents from positive identification, and thereby uses numbers rather than names to indicate the sources of his information, there are still instances where individuals' names do appear. This may have been done to authenticate certain statements, but, given the serious rifts within the community at large, it might have been more prudent to protect the anonymity of the respondents and their families. On the other hand, if the book manuscript was presented to community members for review prior to publication, and named individuals (or their offspring) had a chance to comment, they may have approved the publishing of names. This would be consistent with the American Anthropological Association's "Statement on Principles of Ethical Responsibilities."

Tito Naranjo notes that Appendix A, containing the five Genealogies of Santa Clara, is of immense value to tribal members because of Pueblo values concerning lineage reckoning, Hill's data on marriage and intermarriage with outsiders, his realization that Santa Clara was composed of basically five families in 1940, and more. Both Naranjos note that to some Santa Clarans Hills' symbols after names are quite decipherable with reference to moiety affiliations, intermarriage with specific other tribes and races, sex, etc. Moreover, symbols should not be decoded and published, for one may let out "skeletons in the closet." Unfortunately, the format for inclusion of this valuable data, which was repeatedly cut, detracts from its usefulness as a handy mapping of lineages. Correction of names in reference to individuals, spelling, inclusion of deletions or blanks were necessary for accuracy. The genealogies raise many questions, for example, from where and when did long standing Spanish surnames such as Sisneros, Naranjo, Chavarria, Baca, Padilla and others arrive and what happened to the Cajetes, Canjubes and others? The genealogies were seemingly done from 1939 to 1940, judging from exclusion of individuals born about 1938 and after.

Pronunciations, spellings and meanings needed greater attention throughout the book. Tito Naranjo notes that Winter Laite, who prepared the phonetic table and explanation, recommended that native speakers of Santa Clara be asked to pronounce Tewa words and names so that inaccurate spellings, pronunciations, and interpretations could be avoided. Examples of errors include the following: Hill gives variants of spelling and interpretations for the name of Santa Clara Pueblo, an important gesture in a work of this kind. Many pronunciations and one translation, "where the roses grow near the water," are given for *Khap'o*, the Tewa name for Santa Clara. However, *Khap'o* translates as "song water," meaning "singing water." Tessie Naranjo suspects that, when Hill refers to the tea given to parturient women as *koyaya* (127), he is recording a San Juan Pueblo Tewa pronunciation, since *kojaja* is the more accurate spelling for Santa Clara's dialect.

The ethnography by Hill and Lange is presently in disfavor at Santa Clara Pueblo because the value on secrecy is still operational. However, both Naranjos suspect that in the future it will, along with Ortiz's *The Tewa World*, assume parallel importance of a secular nature equal to the oral and "rain god" tradition of the origin myth. It is the first written, primary base of knowledge for future generations of Santa Clara people. All scholars interested in the American Indians of the Southwest will find this a valuable addition to their libraries.

Sue-Ellen Jacobs
University of Washington

Tito E. Naranjo
New Mexico Highlands University

Tessie Naranjo
University of New Mexico

Indian and Jesuit. A Seventeenth-Century Encounter. By James T. Moore. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1982. 267 pp. and xii Appendices, Notes, Bibliography, Index. \$12.95 Cloth.

The study of Jesuit missions to the Amerindians continues apace without producing much in the way of deeper insights or more critical appreciation. Professor James T. Moore's study shares many of the unstated doctrinal positions of these early Catholic