Title
A Novel Standardized Rubric for Medical Student Emergency Medicine Oral Presentations

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9sw6c48v

Journal
Western Journal of Emergency Medicine: Integrating Emergency Care with Population Health, 20(4.1)

ISSN
1936-900X

Authors
Reynolds, C
Fisher, K
Fairbrother, H

Publication Date
2019

License
CC BY 4.0
goals included enhancing understanding of the promotions process; improving knowledge of the required educational dossier elements; heightening awareness of the characteristics of a strong dossier; and expanding the number of emergency medicine (EM) dossiers ready for submission.

**Curricular Design:** We developed a novel format using adult learning theory principles, and team-based and flipped-classroom strategies. Workshop preparation began with brief readings, review of portfolio templates, and document gathering (eg, curriculum vitae [CV], learner evaluations). Monthly two-hour peer-led workshop topics included an introduction to the promotion process; CV preparation; developing an educational portfolio and teaching philosophy; documenting teaching roles in course and faculty development, medical education, and curricular affairs; learner and peer-teaching evaluations; letters; documenting scholarship; and portfolio appraisal. Each session included review of the month’s topics and materials, example sharing, discussion and structured time for dossier-preparation work.

**Impact/Effectiveness:** Ten EM academic-track faculty were eligible to participate. Following session one, two faculty determined that they did not meet promotion criteria and four noted that their body of scholarly work needed further development; all identified specific areas needing enrichment. The remaining four faculty participated in the full program. At completion, two participants had full, submission-ready dossiers. One had a near-complete (since submitted) dossier, and one participant chose to delay submission. All gained understanding of the process, dossier components, characteristics of a strong portfolio, and were able to discern their readiness for advancement. All reported that the program was useful and enjoyable. In sum, peer-mentored academic promotion workshops are an effective way to enhance the dossier-preparation process.

**A Novel Standardized Rubric for Medical Student Emergency Medicine Oral Presentations**

Reynolds C, Fisher K, Fairbrother H / McGovern Medical School at the University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston (UTHealth), Houston, Texas

**Background:** Emergency medicine (EM)-specific oral presentations differ from general oral presentations in length, focus, and structure. Although we teach medical students to present differently in the emergency department, there is no established rubric for grading EM-focused presentations. We present a novel rubric for use in EM, derived from a published, validated rubric used in other medical specialties.

**Educational Objectives:** Our goals were to provide a novel grading rubric for EM-specific medical student presentations, designed to specifically assess for length, focus, and structure; and improve standardization of oral presentation grading and feedback.

**Curricular Design:** In 2014, Lewin et al. introduced the Patient Presentation Rating tool – a validated rubric for...
grading medical student presentations created by a group of medical educators across many core specialties. The tool is comprised of 18 items divided into six sections, with an overall rating at the end. According to the original study, the tool had high inter-rater reliability, and a randomized controlled trial performed during a third-year pediatric clerkship showed that the intervention was significantly better than unstructured presentation feedback. We used this validated tool as a framework to create a rubric for EM-focused oral presentations using established EM guidelines. The critical elements of an EM oral presentation, as established by Davenport et al. in “The 3-Minute Emergency Medical Student Presentation: A Variation on a Theme,” were built into our novel rubric. Following the tenets of the published EM literature, our rubric has an emphasis on pertinent information, a focused exam, concise summary without unnecessary information, and an assessment and plan that provides a differential diagnosis and addresses the most important issues.

**Impact/Effectiveness:** This rubric was used in our study of medical student presentations, “Teaching and Evaluating Medical Students’ Oral Presentation Skills in Emergency Medicine,” which documented an improvement in oral presentations after fourth-year medical students used a formalized self-directed curriculum. We anticipate that this rubric will be incorporated into EM clerkships, improving educators’ ability to grade and provide feedback on medical student oral presentations. In the long term, this rubric will allow for standardized evaluations of students from different backgrounds and medical schools.

**Emergency Medicine Residents as Mentors: Toward a Curriculum on Mentoring**

**Parekh K, Lei C, Brumfield E / Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Nashville, Tennessee**

**Background:** Mentorship is critical in all stages of career development. Emergency medicine (EM) is increasing in popularity as a specialty choice, which increases the need for emergency physicians who can mentor medical students pursuing careers in EM. Students have traditionally sought mentorship from EM faculty. However, students are not directly exposed to EM during the clerkship phase of the curriculum, limiting their interaction with EM faculty and making early mentor identification difficult. Simultaneously, while residents are expected to be educators, mentoring is often not explicitly taught or practiced. Thus, we created a resident-student mentoring program for students exploring careers in EM.

**Educational Objectives:** Our aim was to develop a resident-student mentoring program to provide senior medical students advice and support as they consider a career in EM and apply to residency, while providing EM residents a formal opportunity to develop mentoring skills.

**Curricular Design:** Interested senior medical students were assigned a volunteer senior resident mentor. Residents and students were introduced via e-mail. Contact information and mentoring program goals and expectations were provided. Residents were given core articles on mentoring. Residents and students attended two group events to discuss mentoring and pursuit of an EM career. Each dyad also arranged individual meetings.

**Impact/Effectiveness:** Of 26 residents, 25 (96%) volunteered; 15 residents and 15 students participated in the program. After the 2016 Match, participants completed surveys regarding their experiences: 6/15 (40%) residents and 10/15 (67%) students completed the survey. All (6/6) of the residents agreed or strongly agreed that “I enjoy being a mentor” and all (6/6) would recommend the program to a colleague. Of the nine students surveyed, eight (89%) reported they would recommend the program to other students. The mentoring program was feasible; students did not overwhelm residents with requests and students found residents welcoming and easy to contact. Both groups enjoyed the program. Further development of the program includes a formal curriculum on mentoring, relation of program participation and resident job satisfaction, and expanding to junior medical students.

**Table:** Comparison of resident and student responses regarding mentoring activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Resident Response (%)</th>
<th>Student Response (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The amount of contact (either in person or via phone, text, etc.) was</td>
<td>Too little</td>
<td>5/6 (83)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just right</td>
<td>1/6 (17)</td>
<td>7/10 (70)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too much</td>
<td>0/6 (0)</td>
<td>0/10 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of group activities was</td>
<td>Too little</td>
<td>3/6 (50)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just right</td>
<td>3/6 (50)</td>
<td>8/10 (80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too much</td>
<td>0/6 (0)</td>
<td>0/10 (0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>