

UCLA

UCLA Previously Published Works

Title

Fragile Elite: The Dilemmas of China's Top University Students by Susanne Bregnbæk. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2016. 184 pp. \$24.95 (paper). ISBN 9780804797788. \$85.00 (cloth). ISBN 9780804796071.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9v7474pd>

Journal

Comparative Education Review, 62(1)

ISSN

0010-4086

Authors

Hu, Die
Rhoads, Robert A

Publication Date

2018-02-01

DOI

10.1086/695807

Peer reviewed

Autoethnography and the Other is a significant contribution to academia as it addresses the ongoing debates on what makes some forms of research and pedagogical processes more legitimate than others. Spry provides critique as well as concrete and grounded ways in which decolonizing, radical, transgressive, and performative methodologies can be utilized to redefine academic inquiry. Spry writes, “The unsettled-I does not seek or settle for simple connections, comparisons, or communions with Inappropriate/d Others” (33). She reminds us once again that embracing complexity and the challenges it poses for us to transform ourselves and academia is a fight worth fighting to realize the multitude of utopian performatives to bring forth sustained social transformation.

FADIA HASAN
Trinity College

Fragile Elite: The Dilemmas of China's Top University Students by Susanne Bregnbæk. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2016. 184 pp. \$24.95 (paper). ISBN 9780804797788. \$85.00 (cloth). ISBN 9780804796071.

Susanne Bregnbæk's ethnography, *Fragile Elite: The Dilemmas of China's Top University Students*, explores the collegiate lives of students at China's top two universities—Tsinghua University and Beijing University. Bregnbæk carried out her fieldwork in 2005 and 2007 and briefly again in 2012. The book includes narrative data primarily from interviews with Chinese university students. The theoretical framing of her study centers on the “Oedipus Project”—“the universal existential need to establish some degree of separation from the will of parents and, by extension, the will of the state” (3–4). Hence, a good deal of her analysis focuses on the challenge students face in the “struggle between parental determination and self-determination” (38). Consistent with her theoretical frame, Bregnbæk argues that students at China's elite universities suffer from the pressures of a “double bind” (15) caused by the tension between self-sacrifice and self-realization, all the while under enormous stress imposed by parents and a paternalistic state.

A key facet to the argument in *Fragile Elite* is that student stress and anxiety are rooted in the contradiction between Chinese traditionalism associated with filial piety and more emergent values and norms linked to rapid modernization. Students interviewed for the study grew up in the context of the nation's one-child policy (originating in 1979 and phased out in 2015). Hence, this generation of students not only has the burden of establishing their own careers but they also must concern themselves with one day providing for their parents. Whereas in other parts of the world multiple children might share such duties, China's one-child policy has resulted in a lone child typically assuming this enormous responsibility. Knowing that they will someday be dependent on their only child, parents often have great expectations for their educational and career attainment. As Bregnbæk writes, “The parents have sacrificed so much in order for their children to have a different and better life that they cannot bear the prospect of their sacrifices not paying off, or not leading to social mobility for the next generation” (39).

Furthering the stress students feel is the reality that China's modernization project requires educated citizens willing and able to relocate and in some cases uproot family ties. This proves especially challenging for a student with rural roots, who, as Bregnbæk explains, sometimes feels "like an outsider struggling to be accepted as an equal," while dealing with "a feeling of inferiority" and "a sense of having to change one's sense of self" (87–88). The educational quest and career pursuit is exacerbated by intense competition among peers for admission to and success at top universities such as Beijing and Tsinghua. High-achieving Chinese students thus are likely to face the stressful dilemma of deciding between their individual dreams and interests and those that may best serve their parents' needs.

Another facet to Bregnbæk's argument is the reality that party-state control partially regulates elite students' minds and actions, ultimately limiting their autonomy in identifying and choosing desired academic and career pathways. Bregnbæk notes, for example, that students regarded joining the Chinese Communist Party as a pathway for self-development rather than a civic or political choice "to make sacrifices to the country" (82). She further explains that as students experience corruption and opportunism tied to party membership, they report feelings of disillusionment; they lose faith in the ideals of party membership and public service and instead become enticed by party membership as a vehicle for attaining social status and financial well-being.

Bregnbæk also includes an important analysis of *suzhi jiaoyu*, a notion of education arising in the 1980s from foreign influence such as that of the United States and focused more on "competence education" and less on "test-based education" (103). The goal is to encourage "all-around development" (106) or what might be termed well-rounded students. Relative to higher education and universities such as Beijing and Tsinghua, *suzhi jiaoyu* is likely to be associated with liberal and/or general education as well as extracurriculum activities. The problem, as Bregnbæk points out, is that opposing influences in the Chinese educational system tend to limit the impact of *suzhi jiaoyu*. One example is the reality that test-based education continues to hold sway. Another limiting force is the ongoing control over education by the party-state. A third barrier to *suzhi jiaoyu* is the incredible pressure students feel to select majors more likely to lead to lucrative careers so as to best support their parents.

The fact that Bregnbæk focused her attention on students' lives and sought to uncover the sources of student stress is noteworthy, especially in light of increasing cases of student suicide at Chinese universities, a reality first noted by Bregnbæk in the book's introduction and then emphasized in chapter 6, "Success, Well-being, and the Question of Suicide." Her accounts of elite students and their frustrations, contradictions, and feelings of depression and disillusionment help capture how the complex dynamics between parent and child and between authoritarian control and individual autonomy influence students' perceptions of themselves and their futures. Nonetheless, the portraits Bregnbæk offers of Beijing and Tsinghua students are to some extent incomplete, as she partially acknowledges: "It is possible that I have been drawn more to the problems and contradictions that people struggle with than to stories of success. So it is appropriate to mention here that some students do appreciate *suzhi jiaoyu* courses and manage to find a balance between work and play, duty and leisure, and are relatively satisfied with their situation" (133).

Although the *Fragile Elite* offers a significant contribution to the comparative education literature and is well written and provocative, the book could potentially benefit from a wider range of student voices, especially in terms of including more students who encounter joy in their learning experience at an elite Chinese university. There are also other pressures besides those linked to parents and a controlling state that could add greater depth to the students introduced throughout the book—such as a variety of college-age concerns that arise among student populations (e.g., dating, managing conflicts with classmates, dealing with difficult professors). A summary of methodological choices (perhaps as part of an appendix) would also have been quite helpful, as it is difficult to get a clear sense about facets of the study, such as the nature and characteristics of the overall sample of students involved in interviews.

Another modest criticism is that the cultural, historical, and political differences between the two universities could have been further developed. Much has been written about both universities and some of that literature could have been used to capture key differences and add greater nuance, especially in terms of the author's framing of the two universities as extensions of the party-state authoritarian control. Such nuance would add to a deeper understanding of differences and similarities in the student experience at Beijing and Tsinghua.

All in all, the *Fragile Elite* makes an important contribution to a growing body of research addressing the complexities of the Chinese educational system, including the nation's colleges and universities. Bregnbæk's account of students' experiences at Beijing and Tsinghua is a must read for anyone seeking a deeper understanding of collegiate life in China, albeit in the context of the nation's two most elite universities. Further, her arguments offer insight into the complex pressures young people face in China as a consequence of the nation's one-child policy and rapid modernization.

DIE HU

University of California, Los Angeles

ROBERT A. RHOADS

University of California, Los Angeles

Managing Universities: Policy and Organizational Change from a Western European Comparative Perspective edited by Ivar Bleiklie, Jürgen Enders, and Benedetto Lepori. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017. 329 pp. \$99.99 (hardcover); \$79.99 (ebook). ISBN 978-3-319-53865-5.

Managing Universities: Policy and Organizational Change from a Western European Comparative Perspective is the final outcome of an international collaborative and comparative research project, Transforming Universities in Europe (TRUE, 2009–12). The project comprised 25 researchers from several social science disciplines in eight European countries. This book is the collaborative product of over 19 team members who are at different career stages.